From Fact to Folk:
Women in the Waverley Novels

Michelle Raye Williams

Ph. D.
The University of Edinburgh
1997

I declare that the work contained herein has been researched and written entirely by me.

Michelle Raye Williams
20 February, 1997

Table of Contents

Thesis Abstract

Despite developments in feminist theory and women's studies, Sir Walter Scott's representations of women in the Waverley novels have not attracted significant critical attention. The ways in which Scott constructs his female characters and the ways in which he uses them in the development and resolution of his plots has been largely overlooked, perhaps on the assumption that Scott's concern with the domain of history implies the narrative centrality of his male characters, and that his female characters offer little for analysis.

In the range of representations of women in his fiction, Scott had to achieve the complex task of constructing characters who seem appropriate to the historical era he is presenting, while also subordinating them to the requirements of contemporary conceptions of feminine behaviour. Scott's female characters are constructed in an awareness of societally-dictated and class-based constraints on women's behaviour. The freedom of action and of speech allowed those female characters is dependent on their socio-cultural environment and on the literary tradition on which Scott draws for his model of particular types of the feminine. To facilitate analysis, Scott's female characters are here divided into groups which reflect age, class, and type distinctions: Queens, Ingenues, Lasses, Older Women. The problems that these representations posed for Scott and the resultant developmental resolutions are analysed across the range of the Waverley novels.

The queens provided Scott with characters whose identity was given by history and who had to be integrated into Scott's emplotment of the historical. This potential for female activity presents a potentially threatening model of femininity relative to the expectations of Scott's contemporaries. Scott defuses this threat by the emphasis given the selection of historical materials, and by their placement in generic structures.

Scott's ingenues appear at first to be characters whose narrative purpose is to be moral paragon for, and in the end, dutiful wife to the hero. Certain of the ingenues reflect perceptions of middle to upper class standards of feminine conduct found in Scott's society. Others attempt to integrate this class-based standard of feminine passivity with the older paradigm of Scottish female autonomy reflected in the ballad culture. Despite the complexity generated through these paradigmatic interactions, the activity of these characters remains centred on the domestic concerns sanctioned by the conduct book view of femininity.

There are certain ingenues whose participation in the political, public events of their respective novels has the potential to dissociate them completely from the standards of femininity found in the conduct book paradigm. Scott here emphasises that their participation is the result of familial allegiance: they are caught up in a double moral schema and their defiance of the conduct book mode of feminine behaviour is justified by the fact that they act out of duty.

Those characters I have termed the lasses have greater freedom of voice and action than do their upper-class counterparts. The novels present this freedom as a function of their socio-economic status, and derive its presentation from the models of female autonomy in the ballad tradition. Where appropriate, these characters are Scots speakers, and the orality and autonomy identified by historians as typical of lower-class Scotswomen of Scott's society is reflected in them.

The older female characters are the last inheritors of an older form of Scottish femininity, marked by a greater degree of autonomy than that which developed concurrently with class identities in eighteenth-century Scottish society: they operate as symbols of the older Scotland which is being eradicated by the process of anglicisation resulting from union. The lack of restraint with which the older women of the upper classes are presented, when compared with the ingenues, implies class and age limits to

autonomous female activity. The power of self-definition and self-direction among these characters is constructed through modes of conduct presented in folk literature.

The Heart of Midlothian is Scott's most gynecentric novel, centring on the female, domestic concern of infanticide. The development of modern Scottish society is seen to rest in the translation of male virtues into the realm of the feminine, and in the development of a version of the feminine which is closely integrated with the traditions of Scottish religion and Scots law.

Scott's association of ballad culture with a specifically Scottish, gynecentric social construct is seen in his representations of women in the Waverley novels. Application of this cultural paradigm to his female characters allowed Scott to address the cultural tensions in his society through his fiction.

Acknowledgements

Works such as this are never conceived in a vacuum. Thanks are due many for time given freely to help clarify the ideas presented here. Most particularly, my thanks to Ann Schlossman and to Caroline Jackson Houlston whose conversation convinced me that I made sense to others working on Scott's women and orality. Professor Ian Campbell suggested the idea from which resulted this thesis. His provision of a complete edition of Scott, as well as numerous secondary texts made the research and writing much easier. Dr. A. G. Watt gave freely of his time to proof-read and to comment, and of his energies to motivate. For friendship unceasingly given, my thanks to Donna Rodger, Fiona Stephen, and Hazel, Craig, and Calum Redpath. Dr. Murray G. H. Pittock had faith in, and continued to have faith in, this thesis and in its author when few others did. Dr. Cairns Craig took on the unenviable task of supervising this work with great good humour, patience, and perception. Colin and Rosemary Fleet provided a home from home, and 'parental' support without fail. Finally, inadequate thanks are due Preston, Sharon and Heather Williams, who endured my fits of temper, my doubts, and the telephone bills with infinite patience, understanding and love.

Note on Texts

All textual references to Scott's works, unless otherwise specified, are to the Centenary Edition; Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886. My decision for making use of this edition is undertaken in the knowledge that the passages quoted may be less applicable as the Edinburgh edition is published. Given that the misconceptions of Scott's female characters I am endeavouring to correct are based upon the Magnum edition and its subsequent reprints, I feel justified in making use of the Centenary edition. All references made to the text are parenthetic; the first reference in each section preceded by title reference. Abbreviations for the titles of the Waverley novels cited are as follows:

Waverley = *Wav*

Guy Mannering = *GM*

The Antiquary = *Ant*

Old Mortality = *OM*

The Black Dwarf = *BD*

Rob Roy = *RR*

The Heart of Midlothian = *HM*

The Bride of Lammermoor = *BL*

A Legend of Montrose = *LM*

Ivanhoe = *Iv*

The Monastery = *M*

The Abbott = *Ab*

Kenilworth = *K*

The Pirate = *P*

The Fortunes of Nigel = *FN*

Peveril of the Peak = *PP*

Quentin Durward = *QD*

St. Ronan's Well = *SRW*

Redgauntlet = *R*

The Betrothed = *Bet*

The Talisman = *T*

Woodstock = *Wstk*

Chronicles of the Canongate = *CC*

The Fair Maid of Perth = *FMP*

Anne of Geierstein = *AG*

Count Robert of Paris = *CRP*

Castle Dangerous = *CD*

Introduction

This study of the female figures in Scott's novels takes as its point of departure the fact that there exists no survey of the women comparable to Alexander Welsh's *The Hero of the Waverley Novels*. Some recent feminist criticism has focused attention on women characters, but these studies primarily follow Welsh's location of Scott's value-system in a British rather than a Scottish or North British context. In addition, studies such as Diane Elam's or Merryn Williams's focus primarily on the heroine within the context of romance: on the relationship between a specific generic tradition and the ways in which this is adopted for gender purposes. These approaches have not been satisfactory as a means of accounting for the full range of Scott's female figures or for the complexity with which he uses them to represent the conflicts of Scottish and British social and political life in a variety of historical periods. Williams, in particular, omits several groups of Scott's female characters, whose presentation and generic origins challenge many of the assumptions about Scott's presentation of women in terms of class and culture.

This study of the female figures in Scott's fiction seeks to rectify the critical neglect which has assumed that Scott's fictionalisations of history impose on his female characters the role of subsidiary players who can be understood only through the male characters of the novels. Scott uses the female characters as a significant locus of values and as a significant source of critical perspectives which often challenge the values and perceptions of the leading male characters. Scott's consciousness or otherwise of the challenge to patriarchal values which these gynecentric value systems present is not the issue. Scott, through his female characters, constructs alternative value systems which, even if defeated or made redundant by the historical process, reveal the alternatives between which human beings, in any period of history, have had to choose.

Women, of course, cannot be allowed to escape the constraints of historical possibility: Scott's presentation of them is limited by the information available to him through the fledgling discipline of (social) history. This information would also be circumscribed by

the increasingly marginalised role of women in Scottish society in the eighteenth century, for history, as a discipline, 'is produced as man's truth, the truth of a necessarily historical Humanity, which in turn requires that "women" be outside history, above, below, or beyond properly historical and political life.'[1] The discipline of history has been, until very recently, defined as public masculine history, with the result that women's history becomes that which is not included in patriarchal history: it is the domestic, the private world. Scott reveals or discovers the fact that there is an alternative history, lived through his female characters, which is in profound conflict with the values of the history which justifies his male characters and dominates the narrative strategies of his novels. Scott's female characters demonstrate that Scottish women's history is different from the history that has been lived by women elsewhere: whether Scott was conscious of it or not, the Scottish tradition provided him with alternative versions of female conduct which had to be integrated into his novels and which provided a source of inner conflict with which the novels have to engage and, if possible, resolve. Applying the discoveries of 'women's history' to Scott's novels reveals the internal conflicts of the structure of the novels, conflicts deriving from the nature of Scott's source materials which, to the extent that they are oral, derive in large measure from women's culture. Through this structural tension in his work, Scott reveals the potential for an alternative to the patriarchal vision of history which was the consensus of his own times.

The fact that the social structure of Scotland gave a very different importance and value to women's rights than that of England, meant that Scott, as a lawyer, had to engage with a very different conception of female rights and expectations than he would have had he been an English author. Awareness of the special circumstances of Scottish popular tradition and of Scots law gives a very different significance to apparently minor characters who play a crucial role in the resolution of the events of the novels. John O. Hayden's anthology, *Scott: The Critical Heritage*, and Hillhouse's *The Waverley Novels and Their Critics*, provide evidence that critical misperception of Scott's socio-cultural referents is not

---

[1]Christina Crosby, *The Ends of History: The Victorians and "The Woman Question"*, (London: Routledge, 1991), p. 2.

new: approval of the more demure heroines; incomprehension of the serving lass as more than a delightful rustic foil for the heroine; praise of Scott's portrayal of Queens Elizabeth and Mary; and omission of the older women of both classes unless their actions directly affect the hero, predominate. Rarely do these early critics comment upon the participation - direct or indirect - of Scott's female characters in the events (historic or fictional) of their respective novels except in relation to their male counterparts. In failing to take account of these aspect of Scott's novels, such interpretations diminish the complexity of Scott's constructions, both in the use he makes of the specific sociological features of the Scottish context and the ways in which he challenges the ideologies of his own time.

It is my assertion that Scott's novels present a far more complex understanding of the social and cultural forces defining the place of women within the societies he described than has previously been credited. Close reading of the texts, when considered in conjunction with the evolving concept of femininity in Scottish society during Scott's lifetime, demonstrates an awareness of differences in acceptable female conduct defined by class, by national identity and by generation. These can be used either for purposes which are specific to the construction of historical location within the novels or to provide alternative centres of value from which to show the limitations of the ruling values of the existing society. Scott's understanding of the real social and cultural position of women within the societies he described, and the uses to which he put those, have been undervalued by previous critics. Scott's awareness of the evolution of Scottish society from a culturally Scottish, communal structure to an anglicised, 'North British', class-based structure, an evolution which had profound consequences for the roles of women in Scottish society, is only part of a more complex use of the female figure as a source of alternative values to those asserted by the patriarchal society to which Scott, explicitly, is committed. Where this work differs most from prior surveys of Scott's work is that women are the primary focus of the criticism rather than being discussed in relation to other aspects of Scott's work. Scott's women are seen not as a reflection of categories already established in and through the male characters but as the

locus of alternative conceptions of history and alternative value systems which Scott uses in his explorations of the weaknesses and the limitations of the societies which he dramatises.

To facilitate this comparative discussion, I have chosen to divide Scott's female characters into the following groups: Queens, Ingenues, Lasses, and Older Women. My reason for so doing is to provide a framework which will allow for detailed textual analysis as a means of demonstrating the complexity of presentation within - and differences of presentation between - the different groups. My chosen means of reassessing Scott's presentations of women in his novels is not by the imposition of external theories but through detailed close readings of the text; delineating subtle differences within these groups of characters and situating them within evolving traditions of feminine discourse to which Scott had access. My intention here is to consider Scott's women as the vehicle through which he addressed the tensions inherent in Scottish and British society, tensions which were reflected in changing cultural expectations of female conduct.

I must here emphasise that I am not undertaking an ideologically feminist criticism of the novels of Walter Scott. The categories into which I have placed Scott's women are quite deliberately reflexive of male perceptions of womanhood: virgin/mother/crone and madonna/whore, for example. These are categories in the representation of the feminine which existed in Scott's society and on which he could draw in the construction of his characters. Scott's awareness of general historical developments can be seen, I want to argue, in his very specific awareness of the situation of women in the evolution of Scottish society. In particular, it is the case that women had a much greater autonomy within Scottish society than it seems that they had in English society: the loss of that female autonomy through the anglicisation of Scottish society after the Union of Parliaments presented both a means for Scott to evaluate the benefits and the losses associated with Scotland's situation in that Union, and a vehicle for the dramatisation of the social impact of the development of a modern society out of a traditional, 'folk' or 'oral' culture.

There have been two major traditions of Scott criticism, both of which inform my readings of Scott's presentations of women in the Waverley Novels but both of which I want

to reorientate in terms of a reading of the novels focused primarily on female characters. The first is that which concerns itself with Scott's historiographic practice: since Lukács's work re-established Scott as one of the foundational figures of the European novel, Lukács's focus on Scott's grasp of the development of history has been the dominant mode in which Scott's fiction has been read. Criticism that follows in this tradition tends to see as Scott's major achievement his presentation of a class-based, economically-defined society and the conflicts in it which lead towards the fulfilment of history in the society of his own time. Scott's ability to dramatise historical developments which were themselves to become the central explanation of the development of modern society is the underlying justification of this mode of approach to Scott's fiction. In this tradition of Scott criticism, both literary critics and cultural historians view Scott's works as a dramatisation of the interaction of what we would today term history and sociology: Scott's novels reveal the sociological bases which determine the developments of societies as they move towards modernity. In this context, the failure to deal with female characters is symptomatic of the assumption that women's experience has played no significant part either in the development of modern society or in the definition of that development.

The second important tradition of Scott criticism is that which analyses Scott's works in terms of generic issues. Increasingly, Scott's novels have come to be seen as negotiations between traditional genres (primarily associated with feminine writing) and the development of a new genre ('the historical novel') which makes the novel available as a form for masculine consumption. Scott as 'transitional' figure between an eighteenth century tradition of feminine writing (the 'domestic', the 'gothic', the 'romance') and the development of a nineteenth century 'realism' ('historical', 'political', 'sociological') which is essentially masculine, has provided the focus for much effective analysis. This study attempts to build on both of these traditions by focusing on the ways in which specific modes of historical understanding of women (particularly as related to the autonomy of women under Scots law) contributed to Scott's construction of his characters and narratives, and by showing the ways in which Scott uses particular 'female' genres (the 'ballad' and the 'conduct book') as sources

from which to construct his presentation of female identity.

Despite the apparent gender basis of much of the argument that has engaged Scott critics over the past twenty years - there are many works which address the issue of women *and* Scott - there are few which address the issue of women *in* Scott. A seemingly pedantic distinction, it is a significant one; each of the major studies of Scott, as I will demonstrate, addresses aspects of genre and gender as found in the Waverley novels, but despite their theoretical sophistication, fails to engage with the fundamental socio-cultural influences on the presentations of gender in the Waverley novels.

One of the most influential studies in recent Scott criticism is Judith Wilt's *Secret Leaves*, which explores competing 'modes of thought'[2] in the Waverley novels as a means of suggesting how they provide the basis for the structure of the Victorian novel. In so doing, I would suggest that she here makes Scott a proto-Victorian, a good son of Britannia, with little consideration given to the Scottish cultural tensions which gave rise to the mimetic conflicts in the Waverley novels described by her as 'the victory of...male rationality and textualised language, over their progenitors, female enchantment or mystery and performative speech.'[3] In her explorations of the conflict between these gendered modes of discourse, Wilt's psychoanalytic reading of Scott highlights these tensions without providing evidences of the crisis of identity which made '"Scots"...in the novels and in Scott's own time, an oral-poetic language under racial and political economic siege, [which] is compromising itself into text to preserve its existence.'[4] This elision of the context, except in such asides, is what distinguishes Wilt's articulations of gender and language from my own. In her discussion of female usurpations of masculine authority, Wilt notes Scott's 'disclaimers' of the sincerity of Norna's return to society as Ulla Troil; notes Jeanie's 'mental reservation' in her interview with Caroline; and notes the feminising of the Jacobite cause in *Redgauntlet*[5] without considering the greater participatory role given women in Scottish society which might have contributed to

---

[2]Judith Wilt, *Secret Leaves: The Novels of Walter Scott*, (London: University of Chicago Press, 1985), p. 14.
[3]Wilt, p. 17.
[4]Wilt, p. 82.
[5]cf. Wilt, pp. 116-129.

Scott's unease with these presentations. As I will demonstrate, such gendered actions are products of the Scottish context of their creator: the anglicisation of Scottish society at the end of the eighteenth century, marginalised and indeed feminised[6] women more noticeably than in English society at the same time. This elision of Scott's Scottishness serves also to undermine somewhat Wilt's analysis of Scott's historiographic practice. Here again, the reader is presented with analysis of Scott without an explanation as to why he presents the past as elegy.[7] I would suggest that Wilt's omissions are highly significant - that in this study, I, like Scott, am attempting to complete the gaps in the narrative.

Like Wilt, Ian Duncan's study, *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel: The Gothic, Scott, Dickens*, places Scott in the tradition of the development of the British novel. In his preface, Duncan identifies Scott's historiographic and novelistic practice as a transmutation of feminine romance to masculine modes of discourse. In his reclamation of Scott's place in the development of the novel, Duncan acknowledges Scott's Scottishness, yet does not fully articulate the differences this might have made in Scott's need to legitimate the illegitimate, feminine discourse of the novel.[8] As with Wilt, this omission of explicit Scottish sociologic support for his theoretic analysis of primary texts is where Duncan's treatment of Scott differs most from my own. There does not exist a gynecentric tradition of Scott criticism on which I can build, as Duncan has done, to allow for elision of and allusion to both the critical and historic contexts on which he has drawn in his analysis.[9] Duncan's work has validity as a theoretically influenced study of the development of the novel. The purpose of the present study, however, is to contextualise one aspect of Scott's work as a means of

---

[6]Here, as elsewhere, I follow contemporary practice in differentiating between the female and the feminine. For eighteenth century equivalence of the terms, cf. Mary Poovey, *The Perfect Lady and the Woman Writer*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1981) pp. 6, 15, and 30.

[7]cf. pp. 153-55.

[8]If one considers the need for legitimation, and affirmation as Britons, seen in Scottish writers and politicians in the period in question, this cultural difference should be acknowledged more fully in Duncan's presentation of Scott's place in the development of the British novel. cf. Ian Duncan, *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel: The Gothic, Scott, Dickens*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992), pp. 8-15.

[9]However, such allusion occasionally carries the 'Britishisation' of Scott too far. Referring to Scott's 'other' careers, Duncan tells us that Scott 'rose discreetly from solicitor's son to barrister, county magistrate and Clerk of Session.' (p. 55) Only the last of these titles is the appropriate Scottish one: Writer to the Signet, advocate, and Sheriff are correct.

enabling such specialist readings of the subject in the future. To apply Duncan's foregrounding of the theory of generic development to the present study would dissociate it from its socio-cultural context. As a result, the subjects of this study - representative Scottish women - would be further marginalised: negative gender and cultural associations would be augmented by the illegitimacy of female romance tropes.

Greater balance of cultural context with discussion of the masculinisation of the genre is achieved by Ina Ferris, in *The Achievement of Literary Authority: Gender, History, and the Waverley Novels*. Her demonstrations of the receptions given Scott's work do much to re-establish his place as innovator in nineteenth-century developments of the novel. Careful analysis of eighteenth and nineteenth century reviews demonstrates the associations between the fictional and the feminine in the minds of the male reviewers. The acknowledgement of the differences between male and female modes of discourse and the recognition by Scott and his contemporaries of the legitimacy of the one, and the illegitimacy of the other, is of particular import for the present study's consideration of the place of the oral tradition in Scott's works. 'If the writing of the lower-class men is a form of roguery, that of women of any class is a type of prostitution.'[10] Here again, however, we see the issues of gender and genre, rather than gender in genre. 'My concern...is less with the representation than with the function of gender, specifically with the ways in which gender-constructs inform and maintain the distribution of genres...at a given historical moment.'[11] Ferris's demonstration of the authority of Scott's fiction, the reclamation of the genre from the female, is a persuasive one. Were this study concerned with Scott's portrayals of women as part of the development of the novel, rather than with the representation of gender in Scott's work, Ferris's study would be central to my analysis. Instead, her work is secondarily important; informing my analysis of Scott's appropriation of a marginalised woman's genre in his presentations of women who, by allegiance, class, and/or age are themselves marginalised.

---

[10]Ina Ferris, *The Achievement of Literary Authority: Gender, History, and the Waverley Novels*, (London: Cornell UP, 1991), p. 29.
[11]Ferris, p. 4.

Fictional representations of woman are the also focus of Mary Poovey's *The Perfect Lady and the Woman Writer* and Judith Lowder Newton's *Women, Power and Subversion: Social Strategies of British Fiction.* Both authors discuss the power of female sexuality, and the threat to the masculine status quo that this represented. However, their socio-cultural referent is that of England in the late eighteenth century: as such, their discussions of normative female behaviour are of direct applicability only to my analysis of the 'North British' ingenues. In addition, they concentrate on women writers of the period, demonstrating subversive tactics of narrative practice. Poovey's introductory chapter on the Proper Lady, contextualising the conduct literature of the age and demonstrating its pervasiveness in contemporary perceptions of femininity, provides a critical basis from which to approach Scott's ingenues. I would suggest that the subversive tactics of the novelists discussed by Newton are also used by Scott as a means of circumventing female action which is inappropriate under the standards of 'North Britain'. I utilise the vocabularies of both critics in the present study to demonstrate the socio-cultural alignment of certain of Scott's women with the standards of feminine passivity which Poovey and Newton survey in their work. However, it must be stressed that the primary narrative purpose of the subjects of their study was different from that of Scott: the society they are discussing was not in the same state of class and cultural flux.

Nancy Armstrong's *Desire and Domestic Fiction* also surveys the rise of the feminine woman, and the suppression of female desire in British society. Armstrong's assertion that conduct literature did not develop concurrently with social perceptions of the 'proper lady' and their attendant class associations indicates most clearly the indirect applicability of such materials to the present study. If Armstrong's assertion that the conduct book serves to indicate the presence of a class identity prior to the mid-eighteenth century is in fact accurate, I would suggest that this identity existed only in English society. As I will discuss in the following chapter, Scottish traditions of female social autonomy began to change with the development of New Towns and the rise of a leisured professional class. In view of the disparities between Scottish and English social constructs, I would suggest that the 'threat' of

female sexuality and its attendant power was not perceived in the same manner during the period of Scott's lifetime.[12]

This study is 'historicist' in orientation but it is not concerned primarily with the history that has defined previous historically focused interpretations of Scott: it is concerned instead with the unexpressed history of women's experience in Scotland, and with the ways in which this is reflected and constructed by Scott in his presentation of 'history'. Although focusing on certain 'generic' issues related to the transmission of feminine experience, this is primarily a historical analysis of Scott's work, or, rather, an analysis of how Scott's understanding of history and of his historical sources is revealed by his work. It is my contention that Scott's perceptions of the Scottish past were important not only in his conception of the workings of history but in his development of cultural paradigms of female conduct, which in turn acted as an indicator of the general development of society. It was in women's conduct in particular that the changing nature of Scottish society, its gradual anglicisation after the Union, was most marked, and it was through Scott's presentation of women that the tensions and contradictions of Scottish history could be most fully dramatised. The traditions of criticism which regard the female characters as largely subsidiary to male experience miss one of the central points of Scott's presentation of the process of historical development that took Scotland from a largely 'oral' and 'traditional' culture to a modern and developing one. Traditional criticism has seen these transitions modelled primarily in terms of class relations: I will suggest that the presentation of gender is as important to the ways in which the narrative of historical development is presented in Scott's fiction.

Socio-historical analysis of Scott's work has been substantial over the past half century and is perhaps best exemplified by Robert C. Gordon's introductory chapter to his *Under Which King? A Study of the Scottish Waverley Novels*. He points out, quite rightly, that in our criticisms of Scott's flaws - his sloppy construction, excesses of antiquarian

---

[12]cf. Nancy Armstrong, *Desire and Domestic Fiction: A Political History of the Novel*, (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987), pp. 88-95; Judith Lowder Newton, *Women, Power, and Subversion: Social Strategies in British Fiction, 1778-1860*, (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1981), pp. 2-10; Poovey, pp. 2-10 and 15-23. Wilt, pp. 116-129, provides an overview of examples of female power in Scott.

commentary, etc. - we have lost sight of Scott's strengths - the mimicry of his narrative voice, the strength of dramatic presentation and pace in his best works. While terminologically reflective of its age, Gordon's recognition of the dualities of Scott's life and work serve as basis for the polarities I discuss in the following chapters. The recognition of the presence in Scott's life of two types of orality, 'a popular oral literature, and [that of his] legal activities...in which judgment depended on oral teśtimony' while significant, remains for purposes of this study, incomplete.[13] What Gordon does not recognise, and what I intend to demonstrate, is that these 'oralities' in Scott's life are divided along gender lines: the former remains a female and therefore illegitimate, genre, while the latter is possessed of the (male) authority of the law, and the legitimacy of the record - a record not insignificantly rendered into English. His repeated discussion of those characters who are, and remain, outside the law establishes the pattern I discuss in the context of unfeminine attachment to causes. Gordon's discussion here contextualises my analysis of those characters whose continued attachment to a cause renders their continued participation in their society unacceptable.

When Gordon discusses Scott's female characters, however, it is always in the context of their relationship to the men, or to the male-directed events of the novel in question, rather than in their own right. It is here that Gordon and I diverge; his critical attention is focused on Scott's treatment of the resolution of the masculine political conflicts of Scott's fiction, while mine is on the treatment of the feminine, cultural, tensions in the narrative. For, as I shall demonstrate, the female characters in the Waverley novels do exist outwith their relationships with their male counterparts and the political domain. Given that women, and women's orality, are themselves outside the law, independent action on behalf of an equally illegitimate cause distances these characters still more from the arbiters of their novel's social norms.

Gordon's socio-historical analysis of Scott's novels was extended by Graham McMaster in *Scott and Society*: he locates Scott's fiction in the social norms of late

---

[13]Robert C. Gordon, *Under Which King? A Study of the Scottish Waverley Novels*, (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1969), p. 7.

eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Edinburgh and traces the interaction between 'the ...systems...of a personal fictional language with the changing perception of, and response to, a world that was itself being subjected to violent and far-reaching changes' quite explicitly.[14] This articulation of the relationship between Scott's social reality and his fictional constructs is also central to my analysis. In addressing Scottish society of the period covering Scott's lifetime, McMaster provides a sense of the changes in that society which in part gave rise to the dichotomous nature of Scott's writings, but he does not engage directly with the changes in this society as they impacted upon the female, domestic sphere. As with the relationship between the fictional constructs and Scott's own society, attention must be paid to the relationship between the changes in the public and in the private spheres of that society. As I will demonstrate, Scott's articulations of both relationships are particularly apparent in his female characters. I have difficulties accepting the justifications for McMaster's division of the Waverley novels into five groups because of his seeming reluctance to acknowledge that the societal degeneration presented by Scott was that of Scottish as well as of North British society. With the establishment of cultural and political rule from London, Scots of the professional classes increasingly thought of themselves as 'North Britons' rather than 'Scots'. This rejection of a national identity also had an effect on those Scots who did not interact directly with England, for their language and way of life were discredited; necessity making them North Britons rather than Scots.[15] Despite my misgivings, his schema nevertheless emphasises the interaction of Scott's own society with the historic societies he created.

Much of Scott's treatment of history and a cultural identity is the result of his intellectual involvement with the thought and practice of the Edinburgh literati of the previous two generations. The work of contemporary historians on Scott's place as inheritor of their ideas and practices is of particular use in contextualising his synthesis of cultural paradigms in the presentation of his female characters. Scott's treatment of these 'Scottish' and 'North British' cultural referents as endpoints on a spectrum, and his placement of his female

---

[14]Graham McMaster, *Scott and Society,* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981), p. 4.
[15]See my discussion in chapter one, below, for elaboration of this changing social context.

characters along that spectrum according to class, age, and political affiliation is a reflection of his appropriation of Enlightenment social thought for his fictional constructs.

In *The Rise of the Historical Novel*, John MacQueen states that lags such as that between the date assigned as the end of the Enlightenment and the 1814 publication of *Waverley* are:

> by no means infrequent in literary history. [...] Such delays may result from the intrinsic difficulty of new ideas, or simply from the fact that ideas have not yet become fashionable. In particular, some other intellectual influence may have served as an effective hindrance to the introduction of concepts which now, with the advantage of hindsight, are seen to be more important.[16]

The delay to which MacQueen refers allows not only for contemporary reassessment of these ideas, but also for their synthesis and adaptation by future generations. MacQueen's analysis of Scott's works places them in this post-Enlightenment context, demonstrating in the first instance the influence of Humean thought on Scott's characterisations. For Scott, the primary concern in the portrayal of character was:

> manners - not the chronicling of external peculiarities of speech and behaviour, but a study of human understanding, passions, and morals as these had been shaped and directed into action by circumstances, particular beliefs, family, companions or surroundings.[17]

While MacQueen then continues this analysis as it applies to *The Heart of Midlothian* and *Old Mortality*, it is my assertion, particularly in chapters three through six, that this study of manners on Scott's part is applicable to his female characters as a whole, and not just to the one who happens to be the hero of the novel in which she features. Finally, MacQueen returns to the theme of old/new dichotomies on which the schema of the present study is centred, suggesting that this too is a legacy of Enlightenment thought found in Scott's works.

Marinell Ash also approaches Scott within the context of his relationship with Scottish history, but takes him as her starting point. Rather than blame Scott, in *The Strange Death of Scottish History*, for what Stevenson would later term 'tushery and tartanry', she seeks to prove that Scott's understanding of 'the past and the historical needs of early nineteenth

---

[16]John MacQueen, *The Rise of the Historical Novel, The Enlightenment and Scottish Literature*, vol. 2 (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1989), pp. 8-9.
[17]MacQueen, pp. 33-4.

century was clear, and on the whole correct.'[18] Only the first chapter of this work addresses what Ash terms Scott's 'historical worlds', although the remaining chapters demonstrate Scott's legacy in Scottish historic practice - the establishment of what is now the Scottish Record Office, the Bannatyne Club, and Tytler's histories. For purposes of this thesis, it is Ash's recognition of the tensions I have termed old/new Scottish/North British, and oral/literary, within Scott and within Scott's Scotland, which are most relevant. Of further significance to the discussion which follows is Ash's lucid presentation of the synthesis of antiquarian and historian in Scott's practice. I would suggest that the practices of antiquarian and historian are demonstrated most particularly in those female characters for whom Scott had historical writings on which to base his characterisation - the Queens: in their presentation, we see the effect of Scott's synthesis of his perceptions of feminine conduct with the material found in the historic writings. She suggests that because Scott wrote when history was becoming less philosophic and more fact-based and analytic, but prior to their total dissociation, that he integrated these historiographic practices as his successors could not.

Of particular use in establishing what historic practice was prior to Scott's synthesis of antiquarianism and philosophic history is Colin Kidd's *Subverting Scotland's Past*. In addition to establishing the context of Scottish national myth in the early eighteenth century, and its legacy to the later eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Kidd neatly summarises the ideologic trends of the varied philosophies. In his study, Kidd pays the antiquarians of this period more than lip service, and discusses briefly the establishment of a chair in Rhetoric and Belle Lettres at Edinburgh University. What Kidd terms 'Scottish historical sociology', takes as its:

> main features [...] an emphasis on conjectural methods where historical evidence was obscure, scanty, or unavailable; [...]; a sensitivity to the interaction of the histories of manners, economic practices, laws, beliefs and institutions; and 'philosophical history', including not only a detached concern for the narrations of cause and effect, but also the aims of moderation and the eschewal of partisanship in historical writing. Related to this aversion to historical dogma was an ideological emphasis on social order and stability,

---

[18]Marinell Ash, *The Strange Death of Scottish History*, (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1980), p. 10.

> derived [...] in large part from rejection of a native political culture associated with armed resistance and religious fanaticism.[19]

The concerns Kidd attributes to the Enlightenment sociologic whigs can be seen repeatedly in Scott's work. As chapters three through six demonstrate, these tenets of moderation and social conformity are evident in those characters whose gender places them outside the margins of masculine, documentary history.

Like Marinell Ash, Kidd approaches Scott from the perspective of the historian rather than that of the literary critic. Both therefore are particularly effective in providing a context for Scott's methodology outwith that of the history of the novel. Both Ash and Kidd touch on Scott's placement along the evolutionary spectrum of history as a discipline. Kidd, however, more effectively and succinctly highlights this other aspect of Scott's historiographic practice which encouraged creation and presentation of characters across the social spectrum. This so-called 'romantic' historic practice was marked by a shift towards:

> unmediated historical sources such as ballads, coins, medals, songs and artefacts of all kinds. An important aspect of this movement was the lexicographical drive to capture the vividness and variety of the historic Scots tongue.[20]

We here see the context for Scott's unique historiographic practice. His source materials were as diverse as MacQueen suggests, his attitude to Scotland's past (and future) a positive one, and his presentation of that history an amalgam of eighteenth-century philosophic history and an increasingly romantic history which emerged in the early years of the nineteenth-century.

The union of generic and historicist issues I am using in the present study has, therefore, been central to much Scott criticism and goes back to Georg Lukács's, *The Historical Novel*. From its beginning, however, that tradition, whatever its strengths in analysing processes of social change in the Waverley novels, has been peculiarly blind to the role of women, in part because it did not sufficiently appreciate the distinctions between Scottish and English social history. While Lukács's analysis of Scott's integration of 'local

---

[19]Colin Kidd, *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish whig historians and the creation of an Anglo-British identity, 1689-c. 1830*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993), p. 115.
[20]Kidd, p. 251.

colour' and 'world-historical change' parallels what I term the interaction of the 'domestic' and 'political' realms of Scott's narrative, Lukács's articulation of the typicality of Scott's characterisations has never been extended to Scott's female characters.[21] As I will discuss, Scott's resolution of cultural tensions through his fictional women is a demonstration of what Lukács terms 'not the concentrated essence of some particular trend, but...the way in which the trend arises, dies away, etc. [...] The novel aims at showing the various facets of a social trend, the different ways in which it asserts itself, etc.'[22] Scott is able to utilise typical women as an embodiment of these socio-cultural changes because they are, in Lukács's terminology, 'maintaining individuals'. 'The closer the 'maintaining individuals' are to the ground, the less fitted they are for historical leadership, the more distinctly and vividly do these disturbances make themselves felt in their everyday lives, in their immediate, emotional responses.'[23] The individuals closest to the ground are those who are at the greatest remove from the political circles of the novel's social construct: for Scott, it is his female characters who maintain the social structure, and who serve as a vehicle for the articulation of non-political social change in his fiction. Scott gives women a place in his fiction which they have been denied in a tradition of criticism that has done most to re-establish his reputation: this study aims to redress the critics' neglect of what Scott's texts show to be a fundamental preoccupation of his historical imagination.

---

[21]cf. Georg Lukacs, *The Historical Novel*, (London: Penguin-Peregrine, 1969) pp. 32 ff.
[22]Lukacs, p. 164.
[23]Lukacs, pp. 45-6.

Chapter 1:

From Fact to Folk:
Contexts For This Study

Scott's utilisation of his fictional construct as a means of mediating political conflict is integral to analyses of Scott's presentations of history. I would suggest, however, that this political rationalisation is effected exclusively through his male characters. In the (fictionalised) historic events of Scott's novels, women play a secondary role, facilitating, but rarely participating in, that action. However, when the narrative is centred upon the cultural tensions, it is his female characters through whom he effects some degree of balance between competing forms of culture. These cultures are, as I will demonstrate, indicative of the changing socio-cultural role of women within the Scottish society of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

Through Scott's fiction, we can see the complexity of socially-determined codes of female conduct in a rapidly evolving society. The 'unofficial' nature of women's history dictates that this context must be demonstrated through a survey of trends found in historic writings, rather than through explicit reference to those writings. The events and socio-cultural referents which are its constituent parts are found on the margins, if at all, of (male) history. The resultant difficulties inherent to the study of women's history are exacerbated when that women's history is that of Scotland's women.[24] Many of the gender-specific socio-historic surveys of the roles of women in seventeenth, eighteenth and early nineteenth-century society focus on the society of England.[25] No matter how much the professional and landed classes of eighteenth-century Scotland saw themselves as North Britons, the

---

[24]In the cases of the non-Scottish fictional characters this extends to women created from their creator's Scottish context and social referents.

[25]cf. Alice Clark, *Working Life of Women in the Seventeenth Century*, (London: Routledge, 1919; repr. 1992); Lawrence Stone, *The Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800* abridged, (New York: Harper & Row, 1979); Bridget Hill, *Women, Work, and Sexual Politics in Eighteenth-Century England*, (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989).

structures of their social milieus were, and remained, distinct from those of their southern counterparts.

Scottish society in the last quarter of the eighteenth century did, however, undergo changes comparable to those of English society during the same period, in terms of what was perceived to be acceptable behaviour for members of that society.[26] Much of what is known about women's roles and status within Scottish society has been developed as an aspect of specialised socio-historic study rather than as part of a gender-specific study like those of Davidoff and Hall, or of Alice Clark. Because of Scotland's distinct legal system, specialist studies of English society which survey the period of the settings of the Waverley novels, like Lawrence Stone's *The Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800*, are inapplicable to the present study: Scott's legal and cultural referents were those of Scotland. In the absence of a variety of Scottish women's histories, it has been necessary to survey trends in specialist studies which demonstrate the evolution in women's roles in the Scottish society of Scott's lifetime.

With the exception of personal correspondence and household compt books, the documentation of women's lives for the period in question will likely derive from female interaction with a male world. Such interaction, outwith that which occurred as a result of domestic duty, would have been the result of a violation of expected female behaviour. Consequently, such records can be utilised only to illustrate the changes in what was considered to be normative female conduct in Scottish society for the period in question. The trends in female conduct noted in specialist historical writings on the period are reflected as paradigmatic perceptions of womanhood in women's literature from that period. These

---

[26]For English social change as relates to women, see Lenore Davidoff and Catherine Hall, *Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class 1780-1850*, (London: Hutchinson, 1987). An overview of Scottish social changes in the period can be found in: R. A. Houston, 'Women in the Economy and Society of Scotland, 1500-1800', in *Scottish Society*, ed. by R. A. Houston and I. D. Whyte, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989), pp. 118-147; Stena Nenadic 'The Rise of the Urban Middle Class', in *People and Society in Scotland, Vol. 1, 1760-1830*, ed. by T.M. Devine and Rosalind Mitchison, (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1988), pp. 109-126. Of particular import to this study is Elizabeth C. Sanderson, *Women and Work in Eighteenth-Century Edinburgh*, (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1996). Sanderson's work confirms for Scott's social milieu many of the socio-cultural trends discussed in the following pages.

cultural paradigms reflect not only the change in perceptions of femininity during Scott's lifetime, but class-based cultural referents of expected female conduct for that period. The evolution in national perception from Scottish to North British had a significant effect on normative female conduct such that female autonomy, as reflected in the older Scottish ballad tradition, gave way to the passivity and submission found in the conduct literature of the period.

It must be noted that this cultural context is not exclusively that of Scott's lifetime. Social changes such as those surveyed below developed over a comparatively long period. An individual's socio-cultural points of reference are not solely the product of his or her lifetime, but result as well from those with whom the individual comes into contact during that lifetime. I propose, therefore, to take as Scott's referential period, 1740-1832[27], the period that encompasses the last of the Jacobite Risings, and its resultant political and cultural changes, including the adoption of a 'North British' political and cultural identity by the middle- and upper-classes through the deliberate distancing of the specific political and cultural identity associated with 'Scottish' Jacobitism. Through politically-motivated development of social identities, Scottish society divided along lines of class, gender, and age and specifically Scottish cultural referents were retained primarily by the marginalised - the lower classes, women, and the aged.

Central to this evolution in cultural identification was the rapid increase in and self-awareness of the urban middle class: if in 1760 'there was no tangible sense of class in Scotland', by the 1830s 'the language of class was well developed in Scotland...the middle class had evolved a sense of identity and collective solidarity.'[28] The evolution from an inclusive and communal to an exclusive and selective identity, marked in Scotland by the construction of 'New Towns' (that of Edinburgh by no means the only one), was accompanied by a related increase in female leisure; the resultant passivity, I would suggest, served to

---

[27]*The New Female Instructor, or Young Woman's Guide to Domestic Happiness*, (London: Thos Kelly, 1834; repr. London: Rosters 1988), was published outwith this period. I would suggest, however, that it reflects the socio-cultural environment of the last years of Scott's lifetime and is, therefore, applicable to the present study.

[28]Nenadic, pp. 118-19.

undermine the tradition of female autonomy found in earlier Scottish society. Class identifiers such as the separation of home and work impacted upon a Scottish society in which a cultural norm of female autonomy associated with 'Scottishness' conflicted with the passivity expected by the new, middle-class 'North Britons'.

One indicator of this trend toward female passivity in Scottish society is the adoption on marriage of the husband's surname. Among the Edinburgh middle classes, this practice was being adopted by the end of the seventeenth century, and was the norm by the end of the eighteenth.[29] Within marriage, whether regular or irregular, the legal rights of women were an interesting combination of second-class status and property rights. Under Scots law, wives were entitled to a portion of the conjoint fee (the equivalent of the English jointure) either in money or in kind, for maintenance for themselves and their children should they be predeceased by their husband. According to Marshall, wives in the seventeenth century were viewed, whatever their legal status, as partners.[30] Household linens, lintels, and silver bear the initials of both spouses, while contemporary paintings place them side by side. Wives were frequently named executrices of their husbands' estate, trustees for their minor sons, and agents in their husbands' absences.[31] All such arrangements had to be formally declared, however, for a woman lost all legal right to identity and property at the time of her marriage. Her husband could not, however, dispose of her paraphenalia (clothes and jewels), nor could he sell her heritable or moveable property without her consent.[32]

Despite the adoption of 'British' standards of normative behaviour by the Scottish middle classes, marriage in Scottish society differed markedly from its English counterpart. Irregular marriage was still recognised in Scotland throughout the eighteenth century; indeed, the incidence of irregular marriage increased during the period, due in part to the religious

---

[29]Houston, p. 139.

[30]I would suggest that this attitude toward the individual identity of married women is reflected in the retention of the family name subsequent to marriage. The rise of the New Town, and of its related domestic culture did create a corresponding subsumation of female identity into that of her husband.

[31]cf. Marshall, pp. 88-95, 145.

[32]Houston, p. 129.

upheavals resulting from the Jacobite risings.[33] Mitchison and Leneman suggest that the passage of Hardwicke's Marriage Act of 1754, which gave rise to English elopements to Scotland, may also have contributed to the increase in irregular marriage for Scots, their participants seeing it 'as a means of rejecting existing norms and regulations without incurring a reputation for criminality'.[34] The statutory penalties for irregular marriage, (fines, imprisonment, withholding of tocher or inheritance) were not enforced after the dissolution of the Scottish Privy Council in 1708, and this, coupled with the loss of control of the Kirk over communal morality would also have contributed to the rise in irregular marriages in the period in question.[35] Mitchison and Leneman quite convincingly argue that the rise in irregular marriage was not indicative of a sexual revolution in Scottish society during this period. They posit instead that it may have been fashionable to do so; given the facility for the regularisation of such marriages by the Kirk session, and the failure of the rate of irregular marriage to continue to rise in the nineteenth century, this seems quite plausible.[36]

The late-eighteenth century saw a distancing, if not rejection, by the middle and upper classes of Scottish society of purely 'Scottish' cultural norms. The greater power held by women in Scottish marriages until the late eighteenth century is confirmed by Rosalind K. Marshall's analysis, in *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080 to 1980*, of the background to Scots law and marriage custom, which shows a decrease in female participation in what came to be considered as 'male' domains in that period. Integral to Marshall's work is the recognition that class interaction in Scotland, while on the decrease, was a significant feature of Scottish society through much of the eighteenth century. As a result, she suggests, there is, prior to the end of the eighteenth century, less disparity

---

[33]cf. Rosalind Mitchison and Leah Leneman, 'Irregular Marriage', chapter 4 in *Sexuality and Social Control :Scotland 1660-1780*, (Oxford: Blackwell, 1989), pp. 99-133. Here, they provide a succinct summary of the types of legal marriage in Scotland for the period in question.

[34]Mitchison and Leneman, p. 109.

[35]ibid., pp. 103, 172. Rosalind Marshall discusses the tensions between parents in the eighteenth century who believed in marrying for financial and familial reasons and their children who placed greater emphasis on love matches. Marshall, pp. 179-88.

[36]ibid., pp. 131-33.

between the actions of upper and lower class women than existed in other countries with a longer tradition of urban life.

Among the lower classes in Scottish society during Scott's lifetime, the level of female participation in the workforce did not decrease, although the value given their work, and the types of work considered to be acceptable did. Female agrarian workers continued to be a vital part of the workforce in Scotland through the nineteenth century, although the nature of their work changed significantly with changes in farming methods.[37] Many farm labourers were hired on condition of spousal contribution, and colliers were required to provide their own bearers - usually their wives and daughters.[38] Their economic contributions were central to the family's survival: even if women's contributions were designed to augment those of their husbands. Such paradoxic economic interdependence is addressed by Scott in his portrayal of *The Antiquary*'s Mucklebackit family.

Ian and Kathleen Whyte's work on female mobility demonstrates that '[w]ork as a farm or domestic servant for a period of years during adolescence and young adulthood would have been the normal experience for most women in Scottish rural society during the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries'.[39] These young women were considered as part of the household in poll tax records, and given the disparity in male/female wages these workers would have been fully aware of their dependence on their employer for their survival.[40] Scott's female domestics, such as *Old Mortality*'s Jenny Dennison or *The Antiquary*'s Jenny Rintherout, are representative of the economic in(ter)dependence of such women in Scottish society.

---

[37]Houston, pp. 120-21, states that '[i]n 1871 26 per cent of the total permanent agricultural workforce in Scotland was female, compared with only 6 per cent in England'. The advent of the heavier scythe and the two-horse plough meant that women were 'reduced to menial tasks such as weeding and hoeing, ... gathering and stacking or required to leave the agricultural labour force for rural domestic industry, factory work or urban domestic service.'

[38]op. cit.

[39]Ian D. and Kathleen A. Whyte, 'The Geographical Mobility of Women in Early Modern Scotland', in *Perspectives in Scottish Social History Essays in Honour of Rosalind Mitchison*, ed. by Leah Leneman, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), pp. 83-106.

[40]See my discussions of the differing levels of independence and action in 'Lasses', chapter five below for examples of Scott's awareness of the dependent, limited autonomy of such women.

Scott was aware of the legal prohibitions on single women and male unfreemen renting premises and running businesses in Edinburgh; his tradeswomen in *The Heart of Midlothian* are married and/or in 'female' trades.[41] The increasing reduction in women's work opportunities throughout the eighteenth century is seen not only in the constraints placed on working women's opportunities discussed above, but also in the increasing regulation of traditionally female activities. Midwifery and healing became masculine provinces with the rise of the colleges of physicians and surgeons in the eighteenth century. As early as 1641, the surgeons of Edinburgh petitioned to bar women from practising surgery.[42] While Marshall notes that the number of women in trade had increased markedly during the eighteenth century, her discussion of female commercial opportunities as evidenced by the contents of the 1824 *Edinburgh Post Office Directory* fails to emphasise that the second and third most common occupations for women (after keeping lodgings) were dressmaking and millinery; all three occupations fit neatly with an increasing feminisation of socially-acceptable conduct for women of the upper classes.[43] While Marshall's census of the 1824-5 *Directory* does include other trades, the majority of them are related to female, domestic areas of life. Those which do not fit this mould are quite likely instances where women inherited the business from their husband, and did not actually participate fully in the running of it.[44]

Contemporary awareness of the increasingly constrained nature of women's roles in the developing class structure of Scottish society can be seen in Henry Grey Graham's anecdotal *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, which specifically addresses changing perceptions of Scottish womanhood. He cites Miss Mure, who describes ladies prior to 1730 as "'indelicate and vulgar in their manners, and even after '45 they did not change much and were indelicate in married ones." She speaks of young ladies in the

---

[41]Houston, pp. 132-33.

[42]cf. Houston, p. 139 and Marshall, pp. 223-29.

[43]Marshall notes that there were 'forty-two milliners as such in the [1824] *Directory*.' (p. 236) Henry Grey Graham, citing Ramsay's *Scotland and Scotsmen*, informs us that '[i]n 1750 there were only six milliners in Edinburgh.' *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, (London: A & C Black, 1901; repr. 1928), p. 73.

[44]cf. Marshall, p. 240; Houston, p. 144. Sanderson discusses the active role of women in business in eighteenth-century Edinburgh society, noting that 'until thorough research has been done into the subject of withdrawal of middle-class women from work it should not be taken for granted that they withdrew as quickly as their English counterparts' (p. 135).

boisterous merriment of a marriage or christening getting "intoxicated".'[45] Noting the linguistic shift from Scots to Scots English during the eighteenth century, Graham tells us:

> Englishmen found Scots ladies charmingly frank and natural, and more intelligible than their elders, as they gave up broad Scots words and retained only the Scots cadence; but certainly the former school of gentlewomen was far more picturesque and more quaint, more interesting to look at and more entertaining to listen to....they punctuated their caustic sayings with a big pinch of snuff and sometimes they confirmed them with a rattling oath. But, for all, they were as upright as they were downright; their manners were stiff as their stomachers, and their morals as erect as their figures...[46]

Grey Graham's anecdotes demonstrate contemporary awareness of a shift in Scotswomen's conduct from a rigidity of manner and verbal freedom to a greater freedom of manner and verbal reticence. I would suggest that in a society with increasing expectations of feminine passivity, the rigidly codified conduct and accompanying verbal freedom of this 'Scottish' referent could pose an overt threat to that 'North British' standard of passivity. Scott's perception of this evolution in female conduct is represented in the generational divisions of Scott's female characters. In Lockhart's *Life*, a letter from Miss Keith of Ravelston to Scott relates her experience of this change in female deportment:

> Take back your bonny Mrs. Behn, and if you will take my advice you will put her in the fire; for I find it impossible to get through the first novel. But is it not an odd thing that I, an old woman of eighty and upwards, sitting alone, feel myself ashamed to read a book which sixty years ago I have heard read aloud for the amusement of large circles consisting of the first and most creditable society in London?[47]

These freely-spoken older women of Scott's social class would have been Scots speakers and the class-based perceptions of the (un)acceptability of Scots speech during his lifetime is noted by Scott in an 1823 letter to Constable:

> Scotch was a language which we have heard spoken by the learned and the wise and the witty and the accomplishd and which had not a trace of vulgarity in it, but on the contrary sounded rather graceful and genteel. You remember how well Mrs Murray Keith - the late Lady Dumfries - my poor mother and other ladies of the day spoke their native language [...] But that is all gone and the remembrance will be drownd with us the elders of the existing generation and our Edinburgh - I can no longer say our Scottish

---

[45]Graham, p. 75.
[46]Graham, pp. 76-7.
[47]quoted in Graham, p. 76.

> gentry - will with some study speak rather a worse dialect than the Newcastle and Sheffield riders. So glides the world away.[48]

This recognition of the passing of Scots speech from middle-class social acceptability is the result of the anglicisation of that portion of Scottish society. There was, in the eighteenth century, a 'prestigious form of Scots...(possibly one which was Edinburgh based), a *regional Scottish standard* and not the 'refined' London form of speech which many Scottish grammarians [...] were promoting as the form of language quite appropriate to the educated and professional classes.'[49]

At one spectrum in this linguistic debate were those who felt that the establishment of an English Academy, modelled after that in France, which would standardise language use throughout Britain. Among the strongest advocates of this establishment were men of letters such as 'Smollet, Kames, Hugh Blair, Adam Smith, and Hugh Robertson', and the writings of Hume and Boswell were, as is well known, purged of Scotticisms.[50] Interestingly, these individuals would have been among the most literate in their society, and as Scots speech became increasingly associated with the less literate, lower classes, the bias against it may reflect class bias as much as concerns over 'Britishness'. Eighteenth century scholars recognised the existences of regional and social varieties of language, as well as the need for standard orthography in part as a means of uniting Scotland and England into Britain.[51] 'Throughout the eighteenth century, attitudes to the Scots language, both from English and Scottish writers range from the downright condemnatory through the apologetic, to the patronising.'[52] Despite this, however, 'there remains a perceptible sense that something has been lost under the pressure of the tide to abandon the vulgar Scotch vernacular for some regularised English model.' Contemporary articulations of the identity crisis that such might

---

[48]quoted in Charles Jones, *A Language Suppressed: The Pronunciation of the Scots Language in the 18th Century*, (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1995), p. 20.

[49]Jones, p. 19.

[50]Jones, p. 2. I would suggest that this attempt to attain a British linguistic norm is another aspect of the socio-cultural division I term Scottish/North British.

[51]Jones, pp. 4-6.

[52]Jones, p. 12.

cause between written English and oral Scots have particular relevance to the linguistic polarity established in the present study. Henry Mackenzie's complaint that:

> [w]hen a SCOTSMAN therefore writes, he does it generally in trammals. His own native original language, which he hears spoken around him, he does not make use of; but he expresses himself in a language in some respects foreign to him, and which he has acquired by study and observation.

is, according to Charles Jones, 'fairly typical'.[53]

R. A. Houston, in *Scottish Literacy and the Scottish Identity: Illiteracy and Society in Scotland and Northern England, 1600-1800*, notes a related form of this linguistic transition: from an oral culture to a literate one. The oral still had a place in portions of Scottish society, because literacy was not yet widespread. The 'forms which written language took were not derived from majority parlance but from those with social and political influence.'[54] Women, who had little legal identity, whatever the social reality, would hardly have been likely to have influenced or to have been immediately influenced by, this evolution. He notes that the slower rate of female literacy would have contributed to the greater importance of '[s]peaking and hearing [rather] than reading and writing' for women in Scotland during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.[55] More important for my analysis of Scott's uses of an older, Scottish oral tradition in his presentations of women, Houston notes:

> At the same time the older generation would preserve oral forms longer than the young during periods of improving literacy levels, and with the demise of more egalitarian and communally oriented local communities in favour of socially polarized ones, oral forms would become concentrated in the lower social groups. The status of the perpetuators of the oral tradition would decline as literacy became the province of the upper sections of society and of men...[56]

This relegation of the acceptability of the oral to those who are marginalised in Scottish society first by their gender, and second by their class would do much to explain Scott's direct, overt associations of it with older women and women of the lower classes.[57]

---

[53]Jones, p. 13.

[54]R. A. Houston, *Scottish Literacy and the Scottish Identity: Illiteracy and Society in Scotland and Northern England 1600-1800*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985), p. 203.

[55]Houston, 1985, p. 201.

[56]ibid.

[57]For specific discussion of Scott's uses of Scots and period language, see Graham Tulloch, *The Language of Walter Scott: A Study of his Scottish and Period Language*, (London: Deutsch, 1980). Tulloch's analysis makes clear Scott's perceptions of language as associated with specific aspects of his class and historic constructs.

The changes in Scottish society delineated in those few historical works which address the role of women confirm patterns which can be seen in two types of female 'literature' in the period - the conduct book and the ballad. The former was clearly written for women, while the latter was also a predominantly female genre. What will be of concern in this study is the manner in which Scott's fiction uses these paradigms to represent class- and generationally-based dichotomies in Scottish society.

The nature of conduct literature reflects the increasingly domestic, and inactive, centre of women's lives.[58] This change in the contents of a conduct book also reflects the formation of middle class identity; wives of manufacturers, who would have assisted in the business a generation before (and who may have assisted in their father's businesses as children) were now having to learn as adults the business of domestic leisure.[59] It must also be noted that these works neither reflect male idealisations of female conduct nor idealisation by Scottish authors of English mores. The overall uniformity of their contents, I would suggest, reflect expected standards of female conduct for members of the middle and upper classes (such as they were) during the period of Scott's lifetime.

Establishing a standard of normative female conduct for those women whose socio-economic status precluded participation in events and activities which would readily be documented is, of course, difficult. References to the demeanour of such women that do exist are found in the correspondence of their social superiors, individuals who are hardly likely to appreciate the effect on female conduct of the socio-economic realities of lower class life. For Scott the lack of 'source' materials for such women's lives led him to utilise the Scottish ballad tradition as a paradigmatic referent for his representations of lower class women. The associations of the oral with the lower classes, in addition to the bowdlerisations of the more 'inappropriate' or 'unladylike' actions of the ballad heroine lead me to suggest that the genre reflects a perception of the behaviour of women of the lower

---

[58]cf. Mary Poovey, 'The Proper Lady', Chapter One in *The Proper Lady and the Woman Writer: Ideology as Style in the Works of Mary Wollstonecraft, Mary Shelley, and Jane Austen*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1984), pp. 3-47.
[59]cf. Davidoff and Hall, pp. 279-312.

class in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries which is seen in Scott's work. Further to this is the attitude of the collectors of these songs that their work was preserving a passing language. It seems to me that the Scots speech and cultural associations of many of Scott's lower class women, in conjunction with what we know of eighteenth century debate over the place of Scots in Scottish society make the song tradition, like the conduct books, a key cultural referent on which Scott could draw for the construction of lower class women characters.

If the ballad collections of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries are sometimes dubious records of a female oral tradition, the fact of their existence illustrates the popularity of a tradition which both reflected and influenced perceptions of female identity. Motherwell's collection, in particular, confirms the centrality of the ballad to women because he, unlike other collectors of Scott's lifetime, retained textual integrity, and credited his sources.[60] The significance of this practice cannot be underestimated, for it demonstrates an admittedly atypical recognition of the validity of this mode of discourse. Unlike Scott's *Minstrelsy*, where texts were transmitted second- and third-hand, and where original, written compositions were submitted, Motherwell's work is first-hand fieldwork, recording a tradition as it was, rather than as it 'should have been'.

Scott himself, in an 1825 letter to Motherwell, admitted that:

> I think I did wrong myself in endeavouring to make the best possible set of an ancient ballad out of several copies obtained from different quarters, and that, in many respects, if I improved the poetry, I spoiled the simplicity of the old song. There is no wonder this should be the case when one considers that the singers or reciters by whom these ballads were preserved and handed down, must, in general, have had a facility from memory at least, if not from genius (which they might often possess), of filling up verses which they had forgotten, or altering such as the might think they could improve.[61]

---

[60] Through comparative uses of variants in Child's collection, this problem of textual accuracy can be somewhat circumvented. While allowing for interaction between collectors, and the intertexts between collections, I would suggest that a multiplicity of textual variants - from both published and manuscript sources - demonstrates contemporary popularity and widespread dissemination of the ballad in question. Where possible, ballads for which there is a variant found in Motherwell's collection will be used as a means of further safeguarding textual integrity.

[61] *The Letters of Sir Walter Scott*, 12 vols, ed. by H. J. C. Grierson, (London: Constable, 1935), IX, pp. 101-2.

This change of heart on Scott's part represents, I would suggest, a recognition of the validity of the original transmitted material, and of the oral as a mode of discourse. Both approaches remain valid for consideration of balladic parallels in Scott's creations of fictional women, for each reflects the social context of the age. The potentially less legitimate texts of the 'corrected' collections, as well as the fakesong included therein demonstrate *perceptions* of oral culture, and the subject matter of that culture. The transcribed transmissions of Motherwell portray the actualities of that culture and its contents.

A certain distancing by the collectors of these songs from their socio-cultural origins must be acknowledged. Dianne Dugaw, in *The Warrior Woman and Popular Balladry*, notes a shift in the actions of the heroines of broadsheet ballads at the end of the eighteenth century comparable to that discussed above. Because certain of these ballads were fact-based, the resultant presentation of their heroines is the result of popular conceptions of female motivation and action. The increasing 'feminisation' noted by Dugaw toward the end of the eighteenth century is paralleled by Scott in his application of the ballad paradigm to his presentation of the ingenues as opposed to their lower class, and scotophone, counterparts.

Further evidences of class-based contexts of the ballad tradition can be seen in a comparison of the corpuses of Mrs. Brown of Falkland and Agnes Lyle of Kilbarchan. David Buchan, in *The Ballad and the Folk* demonstrates through analysis of the structure of a number of Mrs. Brown's ballads, that these were not rote-memorised pieces, but were highly structured compositions; ideas were repeated, keywords used to trigger the patterns which structured the verse, so that each orally recreated version was slightly different from its predecessor. There are problems in assuming that Mrs. Brown was not working, at least in part, from memorised versions of the songs but Buchan's analysis nevertheless demonstrates both the extent to which these songs had permeated all classes of Scottish society, and the fluidity in their composition which was dependent upon oral transmission. This orality, he suggests, is something which Scottish society was losing through the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries.

It was this assumption of an oral-formulaic method of transmission which prompted William Bernard McCarthy to undertake a comparative study of the Lyle and Brown corpuses. Through structural analysis of Lyle's songs, and comparison with those of Mrs. Brown, McCarthy demonstrates the uses of alliteration, numeric structuring, and formulaic journeys by both women. Where Lyle differs is in the presentation of class and/or rank in her ballads. Raised in the Southwest of Scotland, where the memory of the Covenanters was still powerful, the heroes and heroines of Agnes Lyle's ballads are 'young' this and 'fair' that rather than the lords and ladies of the upper-middle class Mrs. Brown.

However, the diverse social status of Mrs. Brown's informants is reflective of the pervasiveness of these songs throughout Scottish society. Mrs. Brown, when Anna Gordon, was taught these ballads by an aunt, her mother, and household servants; surely the former two would not have taught them her were their contents considered inappropriate knowledge. Yet, by the time of their recording in the *Minstrelsy*, she was sufficiently conscious of possible societal disapproval to request her anonymity.[62] I would suggest that this self-consciousness is further evidence of the distancing of 'Scottish' cultural referents by the middle- and upper-classes by the end of the eighteenth century.

Despite this distancing, those singers like Mrs. Brown who learned at least some of their corpus orally do demonstrate evidences of the uses of the interchange of formulae in their performed variants of song. The associations of orality with women's discourse, and of recreative ballad culture with women discussed above, may be anecdotally supported through the work of Helen and Keith Kelsall on the family of the first Earl of Marchmont. George Home, a cousin, kept a *written* record of the titles and tunes of songs he would play informally with friends. While the Kelsalls were able to identify these songs with contemporary manuscript sources, they found that 'only one of those positively identified in the present investigation was found to be still alive even a generation or two after the

---

[62]David Buchan, *The Ballad and the Folk*, (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972), pp. 72-3.

notebook was complied'.[63] They suggest two reasons for this lack of transmission: that their compiler and his friends were 'at the wrong social level, or in the wrong age-group, to...play the role of links in a chain of oral song transmission' or that the songs themselves 'lacked [...] the particular qualities essential to long-term survival'.[64] I would suggest, given what we know of Mrs. Brown's sources, as well as Scott and Hogg's female sources, that it may be both the gender of the source and the nature of the music. The Kelsalls research demonstrates quite clearly that many of the songs in Home's list were fakesong; their original composition was not only written, but was also not conducive to formulaic transmission, they reflect a masculine rather than feminine mode of discourse.[65]

'It would be wrong to suggest that the voices of ballad women precisely mirror the voices of real women in early modern Scottish society. [...] it is impossible to know [...] whether these [ballads...] were intended as realistic, idealised or didactic. Nonetheless, there is a certain amount of evidence suggesting that the ballads [...] are, in part at least, a woman's genre.'[66] It is in this vein that I am utilising ballads as socio-cultural paradigms of Scott's portrayals of what I have termed the older women and the lasses. Taken in conjunction both with what we know of Scott's class-based cultural biases toward his ballad sources and with what we know of Scott's own awareness of the disparity between the Scots spoken by his mother and her contemporaries and that spoken in the early nineteenth century, it seems to me a likely basis for the cultural perceptions of such women seen in the Waverley novels.

Because the iconography of Jacobite song carries with it different connotations of female behaviour than do other ballads, a brief discussion of Jacobite women - balladic and actual - is necessary to contextualise Scott's portrayals of Jacobite women. The woman who

---

[63]Helen and Keith Kelsall, *Scottish Lifestyle 300 Years Ago: New Light on Edinburgh and Border families with a New Chapter on Music Making*, (Aberdeen: Scottish Cultural Press, 1993), pp. 40-74, (p. 73).

[64]ibid.

[65]While many of the songs collected in the eighteenth century were broadside ballads, the extant variants of such ballads demonstrate their conduciveness to oral transmission and adaptive recreation.

[66]Jean R. Freedman, 'With Child: Illegitimate Pregnancy in Scottish Traditional Ballads', *Folklore Forum*, 24 (1), 1991, pp. 3-18, (p. 7).

leaves behind her material possessions, and the social status and respectability they symbolise, for her lover is a familiar ballad motif.[67] As with other cultural referents, the Jacobites appropriated this image for propagandistic purposes, making her lover a Jacobite highlander.[68] The union here is not an idealised one, as in the Irish Jacobite tradition of the *aisling*, but is instead sexual and fruitful. Scott is careful to distance his fictionalisations from overt female sexual or political activity. In so doing, he ensures that his Jacobite ingenues remain more representative of the conduct-book-based standard of feminine passivity than of balladic and/or historic perceptions of female Jacobite activity. Scott surely was also aware of female activity on behalf of the Stewart cause. In addition to Flora MacDonald, whose assistance in Charles Edward's escape has been immortalised in this century in the 'fakesong', 'The Skye Boat Song', I would suggest that the activity of two other women for the Jacobite cause may have influenced the manner in which Scott presented the behaviour of his Jacobite women. The first of these is 'Colonel' Anne Mackintosh, whose husband was a Captain in the British army. Despite this, she raised and led her husband's clan for the cause, and was imprisoned with her mother-in-law in the tolbooth in Inverness following the defeat of the Jacobite army.[69] The second, an Aberdeenshire woman, Chris Guthrie, poured boiling water into her husband's boots to prevent him from going to fight for the Government.[70] Given this level of activity in Jacobite women, it is not unlikely that much of the 'forward' behaviour in Scott's fictional Jacobites has its basis in these balladic and historic referents. However, Scott was writing at a time when Jacobitism had been elegised by Lady Nairne and others, and rendered a nonviable, minority uprising in the pages of recorded history. In his presentations of Jacobite women, we see the tensions in Scott's work between a Scottish past, and a North British present.

---

[67]cf. *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, ed. by Francis J. Child, 5 vols, (New York: Houghton, Mifflin, 1882-89; repr. New York: Dover, 1965), IV, pp. 216-30 and 255-275; V, pp. 115-20.

[68]cf. Murray G. H. Pittock, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present*, (New York and London: Routledge, Kegan Paul, 1991), pp. 43-4.

[69]cf. William Donaldson, *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity*, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), p. 60, for representation of Colonel Anne in song.

[70]I am grateful to Murray G. H. Pittock for this information.

When, in my analysis of Scott's work, I refer to his social context, it is this transition from perceptions of middle- and upper-class standards of conduct as Scottish to (anglicised) North British to which I allude. As I have discussed, one aspect of this change with which Scots concerned themselves, and of which Scott was clearly aware, was the transition from Scots to Scots English among the educated classes. When I utilise the terms 'Scots' and 'English' as presented in the Waverley novels, it is to this linguistic evolution - and contemporary perceptions of this evolution - that I refer. I am not suggesting that what Scott wrote was 'Scots', but rather was Scotticé, and intended as an indicator of social class and/or of association with Scotland's past. The same, in the social context discussed above, holds true for his use of 'English'; it can not be said to resemble the Scots English used by Scott and his contemporaries, but is instead intended as an indicator of placement along the historic and cultural spectrum. A final note on terminology must concern itself with 'history'. Unless specifically qualified with reference to the development of the discipline of history, 'history' will refer to the facts relative to the events Scott is relating in a given novel. When I am referring to the events *as presented by Scott* in his fictionalisation, I will qualify it as: fictionalised; Scott's elisions; or most commonly, as the novel's history.

Chapter 2:

Historic Hints: Scott's Queens

'Scott hardly ever failed in painting kings or peasants, queens or peasant-women. There was something in the well-marked type of both to catch his imagination, which can always hit off the grander features of royalty, and the homelier features of laborious humility.'[71] Scott has never lacked critical praise for his presentations of royalty in the Waverley novels. What is interesting about the plaudits given his queens is, however, that specific attention is paid only to the 'cousin queens', Mary Stewart and Elizabeth Tudor. Little mention is given to *The Talisman*'s Queen Berengaria, to *Count Robert of Paris*'s Empress Irene, or to *Anne of Geierstein*'s Queen Margaret. These omissions are perhaps understandable as the novels in which they feature are among the most flawed of the Waverley novels. The omission of *The Heart of Midlothian*'s Queen Caroline from such critical attention is, however, less comprehensible. When she is discussed by the critics, it is not as a power-broker in the London society of the 1730s, despite the fact that this is how Scott portrays her. Instead, in specific discussion of *The Heart of Midlothian*, she is seen merely as the source of the King's justice, as demonstrated through her interview with Jeanie. Critical presentation of Caroline centres on her relations with other characters in *The Heart of Midlothian* or on her place in the more general category of 'Queens' rather than as a character in her own right.[72]

The omission of Caroline from specific discussion of Scott's queens occurs, I would suggest, because she is a queen consort rather than a queen regnant. As such, she is not expected to be a powerful individual in her own right; the social position she occupies, and

---

[71]'R.H. Hutton, Scott as Man of Letters', in *Scott: The Critical Heritage*, ed. by John O. Hayden (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970), pp. 481-98 (p. 494).

[72]Graham McMaster, in *Scott and Society*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981), pp. 127-35 discusses Caroline as instrument of the King's justice. Harry E. Shaw's *The Forms of Historical Fiction: Sir Walter Scott and His Successors*, (London: Cornell UP, 1983), p. 231, mentions Caroline in relation to Jeanie's ascent of the social scale as she seeks justice for her sister.

the privileges which accompany it are hers through marriage only. This limitation on the power of the queens consort cannot be overemphasised. Despite the great increase in status and in authority within their respective societies which accompanies marriage to the king, any independent actions taken by the queens consort must remain at the very least, somewhat circumspect. In the end, they are not possessed of the ultimate political authority within their society, and remain subject to it (in the form of their royal spouse) if to no other. The exception to this, as is the case with Caroline, is if they have been given authority (albeit one limited by the constraints of constitutional monarchy) by their spouse. It is important to remember, however, that even this authority is temporary and limited in reach.

Such limitations of power clearly do not affect the queens regnant. They occupied, within the political worlds of their respective ages, a place which was traditionally that of a man. With the title came the power reserved for a man by that same tradition. Contemporary accounts of the early years of Elizabeth's reign, for example, indicate a great discomfort with the very idea of an unmarried woman occupying the throne of England. The 'tentative and conditional nature of many of the [coronation] pageant verses suggests that [...] the citizens of London were deeply worried about female rule.'[73] This concern was not limited to the masses, for John Aylmer, Bishop of London, wrote to Knox arguing that 'the government of England is a combination of monarchy, oligarchy and democracy; therefore, "it is not in England so daungerous a matter, to haue a woman ruler, as men take it to be. For ... it is not she that ruleth but the lawes" (sigs H2v-3v) - and the officers who implement the laws are all men.'[74] Whatever the contemporary opposition faced by the queens regnant, the fact remains that they did act in what was traditionally a male domain, and did so upon their terms rather than on those imposed upon them by society.

The distinction between queen consort and queen regnant becomes particularly important when considering the effect Scott's reliance on documentary source materials had on his presentation of women in the Waverley novels. More so with this than with any other

---

[73]Helen Hackett, *Virgin Mother, Maiden Queen: Elizabeth I and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*, (London: Macmillan, 1995), p. 48.
[74]Hackett, p. 49.

group of female characters, we must concern ourselves with the relationship between what Scott knew and what Scott created for his characters. Unlike his fictive females, each of these characters was a participant in the historic events around which Scott constructed his novels. There was some written record of the behaviours of these characters; Scott could not as readily impose the accepted standards of late eighteenth and early nineteenth century conduct upon these women as he could upon his fictional characters. Due consideration must also be given the historiographic practice of the age: extrapolation of facts and educated guesswork were normative practice. Taken in conjunction with the novelistic license claimed by Scott when criticised for fictionalising history,[75] this has the potential to give rise to characters whose presentation adheres neither to the historical nor to the cultural referents used by Scott in their creation. What must be borne in mind as analysis of Scott's presentation of these historic figures occurs, is the extent to which anachronistic or otherwise historically inaccurate conduct conflicts with the novel's presentation of history. Is Scott able to balance his fact-based source materials with the requirements of his plot, or does he present characters who are neither historically nor fictionally integral?

The issue of actual knowledge on Scott's part creates a further problem where criticism of the queens is concerned. The novels which are among Scott's least popular, and considered by many to be the most flawed, are those set in the comparatively distant past. Documentary evidence of this age, given both the nature of monastic record-keeping and the loss of such records, is, and will remain, less than complete. It was only with the activities of such organisations as the Bannatyne Club that such documents became accessible to scholars and to antiquarians. It is important to remember, however, that such documentation provided a picture of the past which was as incomplete as the formalised historic practice which it was meant to serve. As a result, I would suggest, Scott was forced to complete these presentations with his own societal referents: while not wholly at odds with historic

---

[75]See *The Talisman*, pp. 1-6, and *Kenilworth*, pp. 1-5 for specific responses by Scott to such criticisms.

practice in his day, it serves to highlight the ways in which Scott balances fact(s) and fiction(s) in his portrayals of the Queens.

Those who had begun to establish some degree of historic practice in the mid-eighteenth century were the Edinburgh literati. As their influence on Scott is well documented, this discussion will serve merely to highlight the primary effects had by their historiographic practices upon the Waverley novels and their author.[76] Colin Kidd describes these individuals as 'sociological whigs [who] were temperamentally and intellectually inclined to shun dogma.'[77] Given this, it is not surprising that the Scott protagonist walks a path of moderation. More significant to the Scott scholar is the concern of the Enlightenment historians with 'the interaction of manners, economic practices, laws, beliefs and institutions [...and] an ideological emphasis on social order and stability, derived [...] in part from rejection of a native political culture associated with armed resistance and religious fanaticism.'[78] This is a characteristic feature of the Waverley novels. Scott demonstrates, time and again, that the past is a road which leads to the present. This present is a British one: Scot and English united; extremes of national identity based on cultural and racial referents repudiated in favour of an often anachronistic Union[79].

Scott's views on the presentation of history are effective for his wholly fictional characters precisely because those characters are nothing but fictional constructs - malleable to the constraints of history and authorial purpose. Those characters who are historic personages are, however, less easily bent to Scott's needs. Not only is he constrained by the events of recorded history for the plot's outcome, but he is also constrained by the fact that this individual's life is also a matter of record; there can be no marriage where marriage did not happen, for example. He was not, however, hampered by a lack of knowledge, given the

---

[76]In addition to Colin Kidd, John MacQueen's *The Rise of the Historical Novel*, (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1989), pp. 30-34, contains useful discussion of the influence of the Edinburgh literati on Scott's works.

[77]Colin Kidd, *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish whig historians and the creation of an Anglo-British identity, 1689-c.1830*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993), p. 109.

[78]Kidd, p. 115.

[79]Examples of this include: The *Talisman*'s Anglo-Scots alliance through the marriage of Edith Plantagenet and Kenneth, *Ivanhoe*'s Norman-Saxon union of Ivanhoe and Rowena, and the Jacobite-Hanoverian marriages with which *Rob Roy*, *Waverley*, and *Redgauntlet* end.

contemporary 'emphasis [placed] on conjectural methods where historical evidence was obscure, scanty or unavailable.'[80] The educated guesswork of the antiquarian all too often took the place of fact to serve Scott's purposes.

In some instances where Scott was forced to engage in conjecture, he was able to draw upon his own experience with women of the lower and upper-middle classes and minor nobility as an aid in character development. When his documentary evidence became sparse, Scott could not rely on any personal experience with queens to augment their characterisations. Without a clear and detailed presentation of these individuals in the historic records available to him, Scott crafted fictionalised queens whose actions are based on an exaggerated view of feminine behaviour as he knew it.

Queens Consort

Foremost among these characters verging on caricature, is Richard's consort, Berengaria. Mills's *History of the Crusades*, which Scott consulted in writing *The Talisman*, contains only four references to Berengaria. The character constructed by Scott appears as infrequently in the novel as she does in his source. Instead of participating fully in the events of the novel, either those events of history or those of Scott's creation, Berengaria is a mere foil: she serves either to demonstrate the more virtuous (and anachronistic) qualities of the novel's heroine, Edith Plantagenet, or to humanise her impetuous and violent husband.

Berengaria is first seen by the reader as the author of a mischief designed to humiliate Edith. The damage done by the actions of the 'thoughtless but good-humoured princess of the House of Navarre' (*T* 148) to the reputations of her victims is greater than she had imagined. Both Edith and Kenneth are put at risk: the former because 'it was only in behalf of those of fair reputation and honour, that the knight was compelled by his principles to draw his sword; all others were without the pale of chivalry'[81] and the latter because of the consequences attached to his dereliction of duty. More importantly, however, this action

---

[80]Kidd, p. 115.

[81]Charles Mills, *The History of Chivalry or knighthood and its times*, 2 vols. (London: Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1820; repr. 1825), I, p. 233.

precipitates the loss of the English standard, and with it, the symbolic assertion of Richard's supremacy.

Scott's Berengaria is little better than a spoilt child who fails to consider that there are others affected by her actions. In presenting her in this manner, Scott demonstrates that the tenets of courtly love precipitated many irrational actions - actions which are anathema to his post-Enlightenment standards of behaviour. Through his presentation of Berengaria, Scott underscores the great disparity between the conduct of the Crusaders and of individuals of his own age. Berengaria clearly belongs to the chivalric tradition, in which the power a lady holds over her knight is sufficient to direct his actions. '[T]he heart even of a lion is made of flesh, not of stone; and, believe me, I have interest enough with Richard to save this knight.' (149)

Berengaria never develops beyond this level of conduct. While she is in control of each of these situations, it is not a method of control Scott admires. While the personification of chivalric ideals of femininity, her 'every motion, step, and look, bespeaks her very woman', Berengaria's power is not governed by logic, but by emotion and impulse. (246) Scott's narrative commentary on her appearance and character subsequent to this episode indicate his disapproval of such personalities.

> She was by nature perfectly good-humoured, and if her due share of admiration and homage (*in her opinion* a very large one) was duly resigned to her, no one could possess better temper, or a more friendly disposition; but then, *like all despots*, the more power that was voluntarily yielded to her, the more she desired to extend her sway. (170, emphases mine)

Because she is Richard's consort, Berengaria can indulge herself in pranks such as that which nearly cost Kenneth his life. She does not need approval for or sanction of her actions from anyone except Richard. Given her mastery of 'the usual arguments of tears and sighs', she is more than capable of keeping Richard from using 'the restraint of lawful authority' on her. Indeed, Scott tells us that when faced with Berengaria's tears, Richard was 'reduced to the defensive'. (211) While this lion-taming does serve to domesitcate Richard, making him more appealing to Scott's audience, it has little other purpose. It is important to remember that the idealised role of women in chivalric society was that of moral arbiter.

Berengaria's actions, as presented by Scott, are intended to highlight the progress made both by women and by men from the irrational, emotionally governed past to the rational present.

Berengaria has no role in *The Talisman* beyond those of foil to Edith and 'the chastening influence of feminine gentleness and tenderness'[82] on her husband. She is not, however, the selfless Angel that the more cloying ingenues are. Instead, she is the representation of the female aspects of chivalry and/or romance: weak to Richard's strong; as impetuous as Richard (although this manifests in Berengaria in domestic rivalry rather than in diplomatic conflict); beautiful but utterly lacking in intellect; and concerned only with her needs. Having little evidence of the real Berengaria, Scott must construct a character bearing her name, whose existence is defined by the same terms established by Mills - as 'Richard's wife' alone. In so doing, I would suggest, Scott anachronistically imposes his society's expectations of upper-class female conduct upon his fictionalised representation of Berengaria. Her self-centredness is at odds with the self-lessness which the 'good wife', whose identity originates wholly through her husband's social position, should possess. Berengaria uses the position given her through her marriage to fulfill her desires, with little thought for those for whom that same position gives a duty of care.[83]

This juxtaposition of source material and cultural paradigm also affects the presentation of *Count Robert of Paris*'s Empress Irene. Again, Scott was working with historic documentation which portrayed his character entirely in terms of her relationship to her spouse - indeed, were it not for her marriage, Irene (like Berengaria) would not merit a place in the historic record. Here, however, his reliance on documentary source material seems to be a cursory one. Scott does not take into account any of the indications given in *The Alexiad* of the partnership which Anna Comnena claims existed between Irene and Alexius. Despite the fact that, according to Lockhart, Scott made use of it as a source for his

---

[82]Mills, I, p. 257.

[83]cf. Nancy Armstrong, 'The Rise of the Domestic Woman', in *The Ideology of Conduct: Essays in Literature and the History of Sexuality*, ed. by Nancy Armstrong and Leonard Tennenhouse, (New York and London: Methuen, 1987), pp. 96-141 (p. 97) for discussion of eighteenth-century perceptions of the corruptive nature of aristocratic desire.

final novel there is little indication of the woman Anna Comnena at one point compares to Athena.[84]

This vacuous characterisation is attributable, at least in part, to Scott's post-stroke condition. Faced with source material such as *The Alexiad*, he was attempting to imitate the tone of that narrative as a means of representing the lives of his historic characters. Had Scott been in full possession of his faculties, it is likely that he would have recognised Anna's style as precisely that, and at the very least, would have diluted it to the less prolix tone of *Ivanhoe*'s Wardour St. English. Because he was not, however, *Count Robert of Paris*'s Empress Irene, for the most part, remains the doting consort of Anna's narrative (seen in Scott's eyes as a dutiful helpmeet rather than as a full partner), and not the woman who plotted to secure the throne for her daughter rather than for her son as described by Gibbon.[85] The disparity of presentations of Irene in the reference materials Scott used makes his Empress Irene an interpretation of these sources in light of his own perceptions of 'wife' and 'woman', rather than a synthesis of contradictory sources.

Scott's Irene is consistently seen in relation either to her spouse or to her daughter; her narrative identity being imposed from without. Her intelligence, or lack thereof, is set against Anna's abilities. Irene, 'like most mothers who do not possess much talent themselves, and are not very capable of estimating it in others, was, nevertheless, a great admirer of her favourite daughter's accomplishments, and ready to draw them out on all occasions'. (*CRP* 67) Scott never permits Irene to be other than a sycophant in her relationship with and support of Anna. Alexius's reaction to Irene's effusive praise of their daughter's history serves to indicate to the reader both the validity of the narrator's estimation of Irene's abilities, and the appropriation of power by Irene as a result of her marriage:

> Now the Emperor Alexius Comnenus had the same feeling with many an honest man in ordinary life when his wife begins a long oration, especially as the Empress Irene did not always retain the observance consistent with his awful rule and right supremacy, although especially severe in exacting it from all others, in reference to her lord. Therefore, though he had felt some

---

[84]Anna Comnena, *The Alexiad*, trans. by E.R.A. Sewter, (Harmondsworth: Penguin Classics- Penguin, 1969), p. 110.

[85]Edward Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, 7 vols. (London: Methuen, 1901), V, p. 228.

> pleasure in gaining a short release from the monotonous recitation of the Princess's history, he now saw the necessity of resuming it, or of listening to the matrimonial eloquence of the Empress. (67)

Alexius's exasperation with his wife notwithstanding, there are no indications in the text of Irene's feelings toward her husband. As a result, the 'bitterness in her looks and accent, which only long-concealed nuptial hatred breaking forth at once could convey' which appear when she accuses her husband of hypocrisy in his intended treatment of their ambitious son-in-law are at odds with her presentation to this point. (283) I would suggest that this volte-face comes about because Scott felt obligated to include those aspects of Irene's character which were explicitly indicated in *History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, but were hardly alluded to in *The Alexiad* and was unable to reconcile the two by any other means.

Unfortunately the average reader does not read fiction with one eye to the disparities among source material. This scene, and Irene's private interview with her daughter which follows it, underscore Scott's inability to create powerful fictionalised women without multiple, diverse, and concurrent source materials on which to base atypically feminine characterisations. Rather than following Gibbon's narrative, in which Irene pits daughter against son for political advantage, Scott makes Irene's actions against the status quo and for her daughter of the private, domestic world of embittered wife and mother:

> The Princess [Anna] was astonished to perceive that her mother was acquainted with the purposes, even the most private, which her father had formed...during this emergency. She was ignorant that Alexius and his royal consort, in other respects living together with a decency ever exemplary in people of their rank, had sometimes, on interesting occasions, family debates, in which the husband, provoked by the seeming misbelief of his partner, was tempted to let her guess more of his real purposes than he would have coolly imparted of his own calm choice. (331)

Here, we see the synthesis of source material and social referent. Scott's Irene is presented as hating her husband, rather than acting for herself or for her daughter to a political end. In the interview with Anna, Irene begs her daughter to forgive her husband; appealing to 'the feelings of a woman', and reiterating anachronistic, eighteenth-century, views of woman as

emotionally influencing man's conduct.[86] (329) Having failed to reconcile what seem to be contrasting historic vignettes, Scott resorts to the expected wifely and motherly behaviours of his own age and adds yet another fragment to his characterisation.

As Berengaria and Irene demonstrate, Scott did rely upon the available historic record for his portrayals of queens consort. However, such reliance seems to have hindered his ability to craft characters whose presentation was both true to that record and to the needs of his plot. Berengaria is presented merely as Richard's wife, and that social position serves to justify her foolhardy actions. Her power over her husband's heart will safeguard her from the only authority in her society greater than her own. Because the records indicate nothing about Berengaria other than as relates to her spouse, Scott was safe in crafting her strictly in the mould of 'Chivalric Queen'. He can not here be accused of imposing expected female behaviour to suit his fictional needs onto what is given him in the historic record. Even making allowances for the effects of Scott's dubious health on his skills, the same cannot be said for his portrayal of Irene. Faced with seemingly conflicting sources, Scott relies on both to create a consort who is publicly sycophantic and privately disgusted. When he has to depart from either of these, Scott falls back upon the codes of conduct for women of his own society (presented in appropriately archaic English), and in so doing creates a characterisation at odds with both historic and contemporary referents.

The queen consort whose presentation creates the least tension between fiction and history, between plot and sources, is *Anne of Geierstein*'s Margaret of Anjou. This may in part be because her involvement with the novel's plot is minimal. Unlike Berengaria's, it does not touch upon the romance, but remains confined to the involvement of the novel's protagonist with the figures and events of history. As a result, Scott here need not concern himself with the woman behind the queen. Its success is also attributable to the fact that Scott wrote the 'novel [...] at a time when circumstances did not place within my reach the stores of a library tolerably rich in historical works, and especially the memoirs of the middle

---

[86]cf. Armstrong, p. 129. I will discuss this paradigm of conduct at greater length in chapter three, below.

ages.' (*AG* 1) He did not have to contend with conflicting data and could create a Margaret who was a synthesis of tradition and documentary history. She is, therefore, the product both of Scott's memory and of his imagination. As a result, the synthesis of historic knowledge and social perceptions of this queen consort is entirely Scott's, rather than, for example, that of Mills and Scott, or of Gibbon and Scott.

Because she is 'Queen of England, in which [she has] not an acre of land, and cannot command a penny of revenue', Scott's Margaret of Anjou can also be a character in his novel. (414) She, unlike the consorts discussed above, has earned her place in history as something other than 'wife of', and Scott is able to use this autonomy in his portrayal of her. As a result, she is less uni-faceted than the other consorts - she is angry, grieving, and scheming by turns. Each emotion, given the melodramatic tenor of the novel, is appropriate to the given stimulus. Scott takes care to emphasise that hers is a character formed by adversity:

> the dauntless widow of Henry the Sixth, who so long, and in such desperate circumstances, upheld by unyielding courage and deep policy the sinking cause of her feeble husband; and who, if she occasionally abused victory by cruelty and revenge, had made some atonement by the indomitable resolution with which she had supported the fiercest storms of adversity. (316)

More important for this characterisation, Scott makes Margaret aware of her political motivation (a motivation which, while admirable, was hardly feminine), and of the cost of the single-mindedness on the individual who holds the office of queen.[87]

Twice, Margaret questions her constancy of purpose in view of her losses. In the first instance, she reminds Oxford that:

> I am no longer the same firm and rational being. The feverish character of grief, while it makes one place hateful to me, drives me to another in very impotence and impatience of spirit. ... Can one who has been deprived of the richest kingdom of Europe - one who has lost hosts of noble friends - one who is a widowed consort, a childless mother - one upon whose head Heaven hath poured forth its last vial of unmitigated wrath can she stoop to be the companion of a weak old man... (318)

---

[87]Note here the differences in presentation of Margaret's political involvement, and that of Irene. I would suggest that because Margaret's actions are motivated, in part, by the contract between monarch and people, Scott does not subvert her behaviour with anachronistic concerns of feminine behaviour as he does with Irene, pp. 50-1 above.

Despite this self-remarked change, Margaret's concerns turn from her own sorrow to the political climate of Europe. In giving this dialogic summary to Margaret and Oxford, Scott demonstrates Margaret's subsumation of the needs of the woman into those of the queen desirous of regaining her kingdom. While this desire remains constant in Margaret until her death, the second instance of self-doubt, while reminiscent of the first, takes on a different tone. 'Margaret, whose resolutions were once firm and immovable [...] is now doubtful and variable as the clouds are drifting around us.' (398-9) While the filial penitence which follows is at odds with her earlier dismissals of her father's worth, it does follow a logical pattern. 'I spurned [...] what he, in his mistaken affection, had devised for means of consolation. [...] so gentle is René's temper that even my unfilial conduct will not diminish my influence [...] I have thought on the offences I have given the old man, and on the wrongs I was about to do him.' (399) Although Margaret's self-doubt is couched in relation to what I would suggest is an unfeminine rejection of her father's consolatory actions, the language Scott uses in its presentation is significant. René is 'gentle', and his affection 'mistaken'; the representative of both monarchic and paternal authority is presented as more feminine than his daughter. Even in familial relations, it is Margaret, rather than her father, who is possessed of a traditionally masculine character.

It is Margaret the power-broker of history who dominates this presentation of a queen-consort. Even in those passages which address her unfilial behaviour, she remains aware of the political ramifications of her actions. Only the coincidental arrival of her nephew, who is not incidentally René's legitimate patrilineal heir, prevents Margaret from persuading her father that 'to Burgundy you resign Provence' - a resignation which will garner Margaret Burgundian support. (415) Scott captures this Machiavellian aspect of her personality, making his Margaret of Anjou a character who both recalls the historic Margaret and meets the needs of his fictionalised plot for a tragic figure. Because Scott's Margaret is the product of history as recalled by Scott - that is, Scott's perceptions of historic writings - rather than of direct consultation of documented, referenced history, she is perhaps closer to a fictional

character than the other, fictionalised consorts who are products of historic referents juxtaposed on socio-historic conceptions of womanhood.

Queens Regnant

Where sufficient documentation existed to support extended, fictionalised characterisations, Scott was able to craft historically-based characters who were sufficiently complex and complete by the standards of the realistic tradition, as to appear 'real'.[88]

> [I]n relation to women of a rank more fascinating to Scott, and whose inner character was perhaps on that account less familiar to his imagination, *grant him but a few hints from history*, and he draws a picture which, for vividness and brilliancy, may almost compare with Shakespeare's own studies in English history.[89] (emphasis mine)

Those monarchs who have consistently earned the praise of critics for their life are precisely those of whom Scott had those hints: James VI and I, Charles II, Mary of Scotland, Elizabeth I.[90] The first two monarchs on this list are, of course, outwith this study. It is therefore to the cousin-queens that our attention turns.

It must be stressed yet again that these characters are *fictionalised* rather than fictional. Scott could no more give Queen Mary a victory over Murray than he could marry Queen Elizabeth and Robert Dudley. What interests us is Scott's portrayal of these women as women as well as queens - the conflict that exists between the private, feminine and public, masculine aspects of their lives. Is Scott able to make these characters participants in the constructed, fictionalised society of their respective novels, or do they remain, like the queens consort, outside the plot's action because of an authorial inability to integrate fiction and history in his historically-based characters as he does in his fictive constructs?

In *The Abbot*, I would suggest, Scott succeeds admirably in this integration. The character 'Mary Stuart' comes across as the complex individual found in the historic record.

Francis Hart quite rightly notes that Scott presents his reader with:

---

[88]cf. Baruch Hochman, *Character in Literature*, (Ithaca, NY and London: Cornell UP, 1985), pp. 59-72.

[89]Hayden, p. 494.

[90]Shaw's discussion of *The Fortunes of Nigel* addresses Jamie Saxt, while Charles is mentioned in McMaster, pp. 135-47. Mary and Elizabeth feature in most analyses of *The Abbot* and *Kenilworth*; of particular note are Shaw, and Hart.

> the phenomenon of Mary in varied roles as problem, as symbol of guilt, as romantic legend, as political obstacle, as political ideal; and finally, at the center of this fusion of historic reality, personal imperative, and romantic legend, we confront the woman, pathetic, noble, dangerously compelling, yet tragically aware of the fatality of her power.[91]

Melodramatic though the description of this woman seems, Hart has neatly synthesised Scott's characterisation of Mary. She is all of those roles. The strength of this characterisation rests on its diversity - a diversity which unites the 'purposes of fiction' with the historic record. I would suggest, however, that Hart's description of Scott's Mary Stuart demonstrates, by omission, the reason for the successful 'fusion of historic reality, personal imperative, and romantic legend' with 'the woman'. Scott's Mary is no longer possessed of the masculine role of monarch which, as I will demonstrate, complicates the presentation of Elizabeth of England.[92] It is important when considering Mary's multiplicity of roles in *The Abbot*, to remember that there existed parallels to those perceptions in the histories on which Scott drew in his creation of Mary.

The so-called 'Marian Controversy' which dominated eighteenth century Marian historiography reflects the polarised perceptions of Mary as papistic whore, or wronged figure of romance which we see in Scott's presentation. The crux of this scholarly debate centred upon the Casket Letters; which either proved Mary's complicity in Darnley's murder, or exonerated her because the documents were forgeries. Scott's sympathies for Mary are allied with those of David Hume and William Robertson rather than with the Marian apologists, Walter Goodall and William Tytler. While able to pity the woman, he was unable to judge her innocent of the crimes of conspiracy and murder. Like Hume and Robertson, Scott emphasises Mary's beauty and youth, but also is quick to emphasise the 'one circumstance which blasted all these promising appearances, and bereaved Mary of that general favor which her agreeable manners and judicious deportment gave her just reason to

---

[91]Francis R. Hart, *Scott's Novels: The Plotting of Historic Survival*, (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1966), pp. 195-6.

[92]cf. Judith Wilt, *Secret Leaves The Novels of Walter Scott*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1985), pp. 110-115. Wilt's discussion of Mary's gender-based powerlessness influenced my own. However, Wilt does not acknowledge the influences of history and of historic writing in Scott's presentation of Mary Stuart.

expect. She was still a papist.'[93] While the indictments of Hume and Robertson of the Protestants for the 'injuries which they had [...] offered the queen'[94], are also severe, I would suggest that this is the result of offended 'enlightened sensibilities', over the actions taken by these men in their dealings with their Queen, rather than of any genuine sympathy for Queen Mary. Scott's ambivalent portrayals of religious extremists on both sides of this conflict, I would suggest reflects not only the influence of his sources, but his own biases against religious extremists of any type.[95]

Unlike Goodall and Tytler, who with the other Marian apologists believe Mary innocent, Hume and Robertson believe wholeheartedly in Mary's complicity in Darnley's murder. According to Robertson, 'every other action in Mary's life could be justified by the rules of prudence or reconciled to the principles of virtue, this fatal marriage [to Bothwell] would remain an incontestable proof of her rashness, if not of her guilt.'[96] It is not insignificant that Scott omits Mary's third marriage from *The Abbot*. He must continue to present Mary as deserving of the (misguided) loyalty of her supporters, and the inclusion of her third marriage would only serve to underscore her 'guilt'. For, despite the best efforts of the Marian apologists, Scott believes Mary guilty. 'I cannot think of any biography that I could easily do ex[c]epting Queen Mary and that I would decidedly not do because my opinion in point of fact is contrary both to the popular feeling and to my own.'[97] However, she remains the focal point of the novel's history, and to condemn her outright would undermine the validity of her supporters' actions on her behalf. What we see in Scott's presentation of Mary is the tension between historic writing and the legend of Mary - between popular 'history', and authoritative documentary evidences.

---

[93]David Hume, *The History of England, from the Invasion of Julius Caesar to the Revolution in 1688,* vol. 5 (London: A.J. Valpy, M.A., 1834), p. 36.
[94]William Robertson, D.D., *The History of Scotland*, 3 vols. (London: Strahan and Preston, 1806), II, p. 243.
[95]James Hogg, *Anecdotes of Sir W. Scott*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack, (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1983), pp. 37-8. Hogg tells us that Scott 'was no religionist. He dreaded it as a machine by which the good government of the country might be deranged if not uprooted.' (p. 37)
[96]Robertson, p. 219.
[97]H. J. C. Grierson, ed., *The Letters of Sir Walter Scott*, 12 vols. (London: Constable & Co. Ltd, 1936), X, p. 483.

It is without question that the Mary of Scotland portrayed by Scott is a manipulator of persons and scenarios. The diversity of roles presented as Mary's in *The Abbot*, as identified by Hart, adverts to this. Her manipulations are not, however, Machiavellian in nature. They are those of a femme fatale rather than of a statesman; Scott ensures, as I will demonstrate, that Mary's justifications for her behaviour remain those of feminine amusement rather than of political manoeuvrings. She may, to her supporters, still be queen regnant, but even for them, her reign is in ebb, and she as a result is an entirely 'feminine' creation. Scott's description of her is indicative of this, as it is quite reminiscent of that given his ingenues - an unattainable feminine ideal:

> ...eyebrows, so regularly graceful, which yet were saved from the charge of regular insipidity by the beautiful effect of the hazel eyes which they overarched, and which seem to utter a thousand histories [...] the mouth so well proportioned, so sweetly formed, as if designed to speak nothing but what was delightful to hear - the dimpled chin - the stately swan-like neck... (*Ab* 223-4)[98]

This extensively detailed description emphasises Mary's beauty rather than her intelligence or her abilities as a monarch. It is a description that Scott includes after repeatedly emphasising that its inclusion is unnecessary. Why does he do so, when it is supposedly irrelevant - given that 'faithful tradition has made each reader familiar' with each characteristic? (224)

I would suggest that in stressing her physical beauty, Scott is attempting to build sympathy for Mary the woman because he is unable to do so for Mary the queen. To craft a story around Mary during the events of her reign would force Scott to address Mary's inadequacies as a monarch directly.[99] By focusing on a time in Mary's life when she had been stripped of power and title, Scott is able to treat her as a romantic figure deserving of pity for the wrongs she suffers. Unlike other of his wronged women, however, Scott should not need to circumvent unfeminine words or actions on Mary's part. Whatever her status in

---

[98]Note the similar salvation from insipidity found in the features of Edith Bellenden (*OM* 32) and Rowena (*Iv* 53).

[99]Here again, I would suggest, we see the tensions between Scott's fictional purposes and the historic writings on which he would have based his portrayal. No mention is made of Mary's library at Holyrood, or of her patronage of the arts - the latter at least an acceptably feminine activity at the time Scott wrote. In beginning his story subsequent to Mary's imprisonment at Lochleven, Scott reduces her to a position of dependence resulting from her foolish, emotional, and irrational choices of spouse, religion, and advisors.

the eyes of the novel's political factions, she was/is a queen regnant, and remains possessed of the freedoms that this position entails.

It is interesting to note that Scott is continually reminding his reader of Mary's uses of so-called womanly characteristics. Whenever commentary is made on Mary's actions - at the time of her abdication, in her dealings with Roland, and subsequent to her escape from Lochleven - it is on the actions of a woman rather than those of a queen. Not all of these actions are worthy of praise, however. In fact, the first characteristic of her personality on which Scott touches is her 'superiority in that species of disguised yet cutting sarcasm with which women can successfully avenge themselves for real and substantial injuries.' (224) Mary is, in Scott's view, a typically female cat. He also takes great pains to underscore the frivolity of the entertainments with which she amused herself at court, but does so in a manner which entirely subverts Mary's credibility as a ruler. Having failed to move the counsellors, particularly Lindesay, with her retort that the troubles in Scotland are due more to the 'turbulent, wild, and untameable dispositions' of the Scots than to any actions on her part, Mary attempts to remind him of times past, when the 'Master of Lindesay was then my friend.' (240-1) Her actions as monarch cannot stand, in Scott's construction, on their merits, and she must therefore use feminine flattery to achieve her ends.

As with other of his female characters, Scott's opinion of Mary is given in narrative commentary on her character and actions. Interestingly, he only offers such comment upon those events in her life at Lochleven Castle for which he has documentation rather than on the day to day occurrences in the plot. It is as if, for those scenes involving Mary that are wholly supposition on Scott's part, he is free to treat her as any other character. She remains consistent to those aspects of her character, and/or behaviours for which Scott had documentation during this section of the novel - true to her Catholicism, contemptuous of Lady Lochleven, mourning for the life she has lost and may never again have. As with other, more fictional, characters, Scott offers indirect commentary on Mary through the commentary of other characters. The picture that emerges remains one of a vivacious, witty woman who

lacks the sensibility to curb her tongue and is possessed of the self-centredness of a spoilt child.

In many respects, this is what Scott's Mary is. Her whims were indulged, and she in turn indulged the whims of those closest to her. Scott quite skilfully allows Mary herself to emphasise this aspect of her personality. Rebukes 'by the stern preachers of the Calvinistic heresy' have as little effect on Mary as the 'fierce countenances of my nobles averted from me [...] because I mixed in the harmless pleasures of the young and gay, and rather for the sake of their happiness than my own have mingled in the masque [...]'. (345) The portrait Scott paints of Mary is that of an inept woman who has no real understanding of the duties and responsibilities of monarchy.

Because of this, she remains a pawn in the machinations of the lords of Scotland. Mary's comment at the time of her abdication that she has not inherited her father's sword is the most telling comment made upon her lack of strength - as defined by the society of her age. Incapable of defending herself, she must needs rely upon others for that defence. This weakness, for weakness it is, relegates Mary to the traditional, secondary role of woman despite her position as queen regnant. Both factions are willing to concede that the Queen has relied on the advice of others in her reign to the extent that decisions that should have been hers are the result either of the 'suggestion of bad counsellors' or of the 'counsel [...] of slaves and sycophants'. (242-3) In either instance, it is clear that Mary's reliance on the guidance of others has hindered her in the discharge of her duties as queen. In Scott's mind, this is where Mary failed as Queen of Scots. Her femininity, however charming and delightful it may have been, was a greater hindrance to her as Queen than it was an asset. Those qualities which charm and delight even those who believe her guilty would have served her far better in the traditionally female role of consort. This feminine dependence on others can be seen in the last, in Scott's presentation of her escape from Lochleven. Despite her awareness of 'all the evils like to arise to herself and him [George Douglas] from the deep enthusiastic passion of this youth; [...] her feelings as a woman, grateful at once and compassionate, prevented her assuming the dignity of a Queen'. (405) Mary has learned

nothing from her imprisonment and abdication. Her femininity remains her dominant quality even with the knowledge that it is this which, ultimately, causes much of her trouble.

In narrating the events subsequent to her flight from Lochleven, Scott continues to portray Mary as a weak woman rather than as a strong Queen. She remains ruled by her emotions throughout the remainder of the novel, and is at one point upbraided by the Abbot to '[b]e a Queen, madam, and forget that you are a woman'. (424) She does not, however, and her grief on the death of George Douglas prompts Scott to comment directly on this aspect of her personality for the first time: '[...] the Queen, whose heart was of that soft and gentle mould, which *in domestic life*, and with a more suitable partner than Darnley, might have made her happy [...]'. (430, emphasis mine) I would suggest that here we see Scott's belief that for a woman to fulfil successfully the demands of a position that is a traditionally male one, she must subdue those aspects of her nature which are feminine. Failure so to do will result, Scott seems to say, in the ruler being ruled, and the country being upset by the resultant power vacuum.

In emphasising Mary's femininity and inability to rule without being swayed by the opinions of others, Scott reliance on the histories of Hume and Robertson in the presentation of Mary's guilt is clear.[100] His belief that her abdication was, from the perspective of an 'Enlightened', rational present, the best course of action for the nation reflects the belief that the present is the result of humanity's progress from the irrational to the rational. The conjecture in which Scott engages emphasises these 'irrational', and therefore feminine, aspects of Mary's character; following contemporary historiographic practice, he takes what is known (those events on which he offers narrative commentary) and builds on it to develop a characterisation of Mary that is consistent with the source materials on which he relied in that construction.

This emphasis on feminine characteristics is not a consideration in the world that Scott has created for *Kenilworth*'s Queen Elizabeth. Unlike Mary Stuart, Elizabeth is not a

---

[100]Note the parallels between the predominance in Hume and Robertson's presentations of Mary's Catholicism and self-absorption and Scott's presentation. See notes 21-2 and 24, and my analysis, p. 58 above.

monarch without a throne, and Scott is quick to underscore the fact that she is a figure of power rather than of romance. Instead of commenting on her physical appearance, as he does with the majority of his female characters - regardless of rank and/or age - Scott's first mention is of Elizabeth's methods of governing. Though he does attempt to subvert his admiration of them with mention of her 'female caprice', there can be no doubt that her method of 'governing by factions, so as to balance two opposing interests, and *reserve in her own hand the power* of making either predominate, as the interest of the state [...] might finally determine' was successful (*K* 161, emphasis mine). Scott is aware that in so doing, Elizabeth did not allow these favourites to usurp the power that was rightly hers. There is silent condemnation of Mary of Scotland in his comment that while 'frequently giving way to the weakness of favouritism' Elizabeth was able 'to prevent most of its evil effects on her kingdom and government'. (161)

When he does introduce Elizabeth to the action, Scott merely sketches her physical description rather than providing an explicit portrait as he does with Mary. The fact that Elizabeth was forty-one at the time of the entertainment at Kenilworth may be one reason Scott avoided such description - a rival to Amy's youth she is not. I would suggest, however, that his reasons for doing so are due in no small part to the nature of the novel. As an Elizabethan pastiche, the events of Elizabeth's reign - the details of the historic record - are not the centre of *Kenilworth*'s plot. The characters therein, the Queen included, are not part of the story of, for example, the Armada but *are* the story. Elizabeth's role is that of the Virgin Queen rather than that of Elizabeth Tudor and it is as such that Scott describes her person: 'Elizabeth [was] then in the prime of womanhood, and in the full glow of what in a Sovereign was called beauty, and who would in the lowest rank of life have been truly judged a noble figure, joined to a *striking and commanding physiognomy*'. (173, emphasis mine). Here again, it is important to note that Scott's choice of phrase is unusual. The words 'striking and commanding' are not traditionally associated with women. Scott is consciously stressing the fact that Elizabeth is an atypical woman.

Elizabeth, present or no, is the locus of power in the world of *Kenilworth* It is interesting to note the manner in which Scott subverts the strength of this altogether 'unfeminine' woman. The narrative distinctions made by Scott between Elizabeth Tudor, who is subject to Leicester's flattery, and Queen Elizabeth may also be reflections of the dichotomy found in Elizabethan source materials between the monarch's corporal body and the body politic.

> The tone of the parliamentary petitions to the Queen to marry illustrates the contradictions between attitudes to her as an icon and as a woman: her subjects idealised her in panegyric as a wonder and a marvel, but when it come to petitioning her on this subject, Members of Parliament could become remarkably patronising.[101]

In his portrayal of Elizabeth's relationship with Leicester Scott's own gender biases come to the fore. Here, we see Elizabeth the woman rather than the Queen. Citing 'those who watched at some distance', Scott portrays a woman like any other. Elizabeth is no longer the fierce monarch who declared that 'I will have [...] but one mistress, and no master'. (189) Instead, 'there was a timid disposition to withdraw from her companion, which external gesture in females often indicates exactly the opposite tendency in the secret mind' subsequent to her sylvan interview with Leicester. (377) Elizabeth's iron will causes her to reject Dudley's suit, and declare that 'I must be the mother of my people. Other ties that make the lowly maiden happy, are denied to her Sovereign'. Yet, she speaks with 'broken accents', and 'stood gazing after him [Dudley], and murmured to herself [...] "Elizabeth must be the wife and mother of England alone"'. (378) While Scott bases this scene on the contemporary observations of 'courtiers and court ladies', he concedes that their 'conversation [...] has not reached us in detail.' (377) As a result, what is given us in this conversation is based wholly on Scott's augmentation of the record - it is fictionalised history, designed to increase the tensions in his created love triangle. In presenting this vignette, Scott demonstrates here his own bias, that Elizabeth, while aware of her potentially tenuous political position should she marry, is a woman like any other, and that she pays a personal price for the 'unnatural' decision she has made.

---

[101]Hackett, p. 73.

Subtle though this authorial commentary is, Scott is able to impose somewhat his value system (and, by implication that of his society) on the supposedly unnatural standards by which Elizabeth rules herself. Despite the existence of documentation to which Scott had access, and despite the fact that the legend of Gloriana was as well known as that of Mary Queen of Scots, Scott is compelled to make his readers aware of Elizabeth's femininity (despite the fact that at forty-one, and in the 'prime of womanhood' she is hardly the ingenuous character he presents). Her role in the schema of *Kenilworth* is more than that of the cameo appearances made by historic figures in other of the Waverley novels. As a result, this scene is not as smoothly integrated into his historic construct as other of his fictionalised histories. It is at odds with the personae of Elizabeth as Gloriana and Astraea on which Scott has drawn in his presentation of her character thus far, and undermines his fictionalisation of Elizabeth Tudor.

Elizabeth's histrionics on the revelation of Leicester's marriage are the ultimate in stereotypic female behaviour. They are also totally at odds with the iron will and control that Scott's Elizabeth has hitherto displayed. That she, who remembers her royal prerogative so far as to speak in the royal 'we' when dealing with the public, has forgotten her demeanour to such an extent that 'a tear *actually* twinkled in her proud and angry eye', is an uneasy balance between woman and queen. (443, emphasis mine) She is both woman scorned and Queen deceived, and must be rebuked by Burleigh for her inappropriate rage. Only his paternalistic warning that she is being less than discreet as regards her feelings for Dudley prevents her from 'betray[ing] to the public the affront and the disappointment, which, alike as a woman and a Queen, she was so anxious to conceal'. (444) Her interrogation of Leicester, which Elizabeth undertakes because she was 'barred from every other and more direct mode of revenge' and her subsequent public humiliation of him: 'My Lord of Leicester's stolen marriage has cost me a husband and England a King. Now is not this too insolent, that I could not grace him with a few marks of court-favour, but he must presume to think my hand and crown at his disposal?', prompt Scott to offer narrative commentary that she was 'as

skilful in that female art of vengeance, as she was in the science of wisely governing her people'. (445-6, 448)

Elizabeth's role in the schema of *Kenilworth* presents a further problem for Scott. She is, within the society Scott has created, too public a figure to permit any aspects of her relationship with Leicester to impinge upon her position as Queen. The anachronistic treatment of the events of Elizabeth's reign further interferes with this persona of 'Elizabeth as Queen', for historically, the Amy-Leicester-Elizabeth triangle did not occur as Scott presents it. In juxtaposing Amy Robsart's murder with Elizabeth's visit to Kenilworth, Scott is forced to apply aspects of Elizabeth's character to a fictive construct of individuals and events. In removing these vignettes from their contexts, Scott also eliminates much of their relation to other of Elizabeth's behaviours. In Scott's hands, she becomes a pastiche - neither wholly Queen, nor wholly woman - but is instead all that Elizabeth 'should' be.

And that is precisely why Scott feels the need to feminise his characterisation of Elizabeth. Taken as she appears in the pages of history, Elizabeth is a threat to the status quo of his society. Powerful, more masculine than feminine, most assuredly not in need of male support or advice merely because she was female, this character has the potential to alienate a readership whose perceptions of acceptable female conduct are in direct opposition to what is found in Elizabethan source materials. In this instance, because of the wholly fictionalised nature of *Kenilworth*'s history, Elizabeth Tudor is a female character like any other. Any attempts Scott makes to ignore or to gloss over that fact cannot detract from her gender. Unable to draw on personal experience for a portrayal of the private Elizabeth, Scott is reduced to the typical female behaviours of tears and pique. It is a part of what he knows of women and it is part and parcel of his portrayal of Elizabeth.

By imposing contemporary value judgements on Elizabeth, Scott uses a self-subverting pattern of female behaviour which, as we will see, he uses for his voiced ingenues. Here is a strong, capable, vocal woman who has the right, because of the social position she occupies, to be as she wishes to be. There is no reason to undermine this strength of character, for as a queen regnant, Elizabeth, in her society, possesses the power

to dictate what is and is not acceptable behaviour for herself and for other women. Nevertheless, Scott feels it necessary to remind his audience that she was a woman as well as a queen, and in so doing undermines his fictionalisation. In permitting the Queen to mock Dudley as she does, remaining at Kenilworth 'for the sole purpose of mortifying and taunting the Earl of Leicester' Scott once again reminds his reader that there is a price for being a powerful woman, regardless of her social status. (448) Whether this is in fact true in the case of Queen Elizabeth is not important. What matters is that it is true for Walter Scott's character of Elizabeth in the pastiche of Elizabethan society that is *Kenilworth*. Scott's respect of historic truth reached only so far as the parameters of good storytelling would permit.

This must never be forgotten when considering Scott's queens. Whatever their basis in fact, they serve a purpose in the novels in which they feature that is different than that served by their male counterparts. Where the kings and princes are largely public figures, with little life outside their official role, the queens consort afford us a glimpse of the personal side of the lives of royalty. They serve as a means of bringing larger-than-life individuals to an approachable size. Those queens consort who appear in the Waverley novels without their spouses demonstrate to the reader the price that the use of such power exacts from the domestic, feminine natures of royal women. The presentation of Margaret of Anjou as a 'dethroned Queen, a widowed spouse [...] a childless mother' underscores the unorthodox, and therefore unfeminine, emphases in the lives of such women. (*AG* 399)

Such manipulation of the queens regnant is not as successful. Mary Stewart is shown by Scott to be a flighty woman whose ineptitude as a monarch is due largely to her 'feminine' characteristics. The loyalty she inspires is that of romance rather than of the healthy respect and fear one should have for a monarch. Rather than admire her for the genuine belief she harboured both in her divine right to reign and in the teachings of her faith, Scott chooses to paint her as a fickle flirt who is doomed to fail - and more importantly - to take her adherents with her. Mary remains, in Scott's portrayal of her, a woman first and a monarch second. The resultant portrait is, not surprisingly, one of romantic imaginings rather

than of historic realties. Because she has become a character in the novel, rather than 'an index or summation of historical forces'[102], Scott is free to treat her thus. The reader has no opportunity to judge Scott's ability to craft a queen regnant of Scotland, for she has been stripped of the authority of monarchy and is instead another in Scott's long list of dependent noblewomen whose spirit must be apologised for rather than accepted.

Elizabeth seems to cause Scott more problems than does Mary, due in no small part to the different narrative technique used in *Kenilworth*. Here, Scott is portraying a monarch who happens to be female. Rather than apologise for her lack of strength, Scott seems to feel the need to feminise Elizabeth for filling a traditionally male role without reliance on masculine help. He can admire the monarch while underscoring the fact that in a personal life *of his creation*, she remains a typical woman, acting and reacting as such. Unfortunately, in so doing he creates a character who is neither true to historic reality nor to his fictionalisation of that character. Scott continually differentiates between the Queen and the woman, as though the concept of an independent, female Queen is impossible to grasp - whatever the historic record may state.

It may be that this is, in fact, the difficulty with Scott's portrayal of queens as such. However well Scott understood the games of society in which women were able to act openly in certain settings, and discreetly in others, he had no knowledge of the woman who had sufficient power in her own right to act as she would when she would. Mary Stewart became a personality for Scott rather than a pastiche because she fulfilled the traditional female roles of wife and mother and had ceded her position of power. She was a weaker personality than Elizabeth, far more susceptible to the factionalism that destroyed her reign. Elizabeth remained problematic for Scott because the record attests to her understanding of the politics of rule. What Scott attributed to feminine machinations was in fact the manoeuvrings of a shrewd politician unwilling to allow herself to become the pawn of the political factions in her society.

---

[102]Shaw, p. 157.

Scott's queens demonstrate most clearly the advantages and the disadvantages of his dependence upon his documentary source material. Berengaria, for whom Scott had limited information as a result of her absence from the political stage except as 'wife of', was inserted in the plot when a 'queen' was needed, rather than as an example of female mannerisms or dress during the Crusades. When he was forced to reconcile conflicting, and scanty source material, Scott again was not wholly successful. Irene becomes a character whose justifications for her actions reflect Scott's contemporary bias; a composite of Anna Comnena, Gibbon, and early nineteenth-century determinants of 'femininity'. Margaret of Anjou's success as a character is due, I would suggest, to two things: her limited involvement in the fictional story, and Scott's lack of documentary evidences to augment her creation. The latter permitted Scott to take a 'telling hint' and create a character, rather than report to his reader a series of facts about Margaret's life and actions. Elizabeth Tudor as a 'character' is difficult to accept, for Scott's reconciliation of woman and monarch is as condescending in its attitudes as those of her ministers who desperately wanted a married monarch fulfilling the roles of wife and mother. Interestingly, only Mary of Scotland succeeds as woman and as queen. Scott is able to reconcile these roles because Mary was effectively impotent - her power was non-threatening, and her means of control those of woman.[103] How Scott balances the realities of acceptable female behaviour and historic accuracy with the needs of his storyline is the concern of the next chapters. Is he able to create young women whose conduct strikes a balance between the ideal of the conduct book and the probable requirements of daily life, or does he swing too far in either direction creating colourless heroines or caricatures of hoydenish behaviour?

---

[103]cf. Newton, pp. 1-11.

Chapter 3:

Perfect Ladies or Headstrong Hoydens?

Scott's uses of documentary source materials often came into conflict with contemporary expectations of female conduct, producing tensions both in the constructions of character and of plot resulting from an attempted reconciliation between the purposes of history and the purposes of fiction. 'Women's history', as demonstrated in the analysis of Scott's presentation of 'historical' women, is not found in the records of 'events', but is instead found in letters, compt books, court records (as examples of anomalous behaviour), popular literature, and the like. The majority of these source materials would not, of course, have been available to Scott, so that in the construction of his female characters he had to utilise contemporary class-based paradigms of female conduct. It is easy for the twentieth-century reader to forget that married women in England and Wales had no property rights, were unable to initiate a divorce action, and would not gain custody of their children in the event of divorce.[104] While Scottish society was, and indeed remains, to some extent distinct from those of its southern neighbours, the increasing anglicisation of that society resulted in an appropriation of Anglo-British manners by the nobility and professional classes, and a retention of Scottish manners by the labouring classes, contributing to the dichotomy

---

[104]Scots law, of course, was and remains distinct from English law. For more detailed discussion of the greater privileges granted women under Scots law, and their correspondingly greater participation within Scottish society, than the survey presented in chapter one, see: Rosalind K. Marshall, *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080-1980*, (London: Collins Sons, 1983), pp. 96-103, 195-201; Rosalind Mitchison and Leah Leneman, *Sexuality and Social Control: Scotland 1660-1789*, (London and New York: Blackwell, 1989), pp. 79-133; Ian D. and Kathleen A. Whyte, 'The Geographic Mobility of Women in Early Modern Scotland', in *Perspectives in Scottish Social History*, ed. by Leah Leneman (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), pp. 83-106; Christopher A. Whatley, 'The Experience of Work', in *People and Society in Scotland Vol.1, 1760-1830*, ed. by T.M. Devine and Rosalind Mitchison (Edinburgh: John Donald: 1988), pp. 227-51 (pp. 240-44); Alexander Murdoch and Richard B. Sher, 'Literary and Learned Culture', ibid, pp. 127-42, (pp. 131-3).

between old and new, reflected along both generational and class lines.[105] This schema results in association by Scott of his female characters with paradigms of conduct which reflect this perceived social change: the older women of the lower classes are wholly associated with a Scottish society which is passing, or past; their upper class counterparts, while not necessarily Scots-speaking, are nevertheless ideologically based in that past era; the younger women of the lower classes are placed, by both type of speech and action, in the ballad tradition; while the upper-middle to upper-class young women, who are in the main, meant to assume a role in the 'new' society left at novel's end, are anglophone characters. Consequently, Scott's younger women of the upper classes will be subject to the externally imposed standards of this 'new' society; standards of behaviour which can be found in the conduct books and the fiction of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Where such characters' actions oppose this standard of femininity, Scott, as I will demonstrate, utilises the paradigm of the ballad tradition in their presentation.

This schema is intended to assist in the development of comparisons which will help to illustrate the complexity of Scott's female characters, rather than producing another reductionist and simplistic account such as that proposed by Alexander Welsh in *The Hero of the Waverley Novels*. While there is nothing 'incorrect' in his light/dark schema, it would appear that Welsh is taking this group of characters at face value, rather than examining them in as detailed a manner as he does Scott's heroes. Had he done so, I would suggest, he would have found that his so-called 'dark heroine' is as much anti-heroine as the 'dark hero' is anti-hero. Certainly, Welsh is not inaccurate in his cursory description of Scott's 'proper heroine [...]. Her role corresponds to that of the passive hero - whom indeed, she marries at the end of the tale. She is eminently beautiful and eminently prudent. Like the passive hero, she suffers in the thick of events, but seldom moves them.'[106] Despite the fact

---

[105]In addition to my discussion of this socio-cultural change, pp. 23 ff, above, cf. Marshall, p. 205; Henry Grey Graham, *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, (London: A & C Black, 1901; repr. 1928), pp. 73-7; R. A. Houston, *Social Change in the Age of Enlightenment*, (Oxford: Clarendon, 1994) provides an overview of this socio-cultural evolution.

[106]Alexander Welsh, *The Hero of the Waverley Novels*, (New Haven, CT: Yale UP, 1963), p. 71.

that Welsh presents this argument as though it applies equally to all Waverley heroines, three (Amy Robsart, Lucy Ashton, and Clara Mowbray) are wholly participant in the thick of events - it is their actions which precipitate the events in question. This trio also suffer that fate Welsh claims Scott does not bestow even on the dark heroine - 'sudden death'[107].

Welsh's framework clearly has only a limited applicability. The light/dark pairs are far outnumbered by the solitary 'heroiṅe': of twenty-seven Waverley novels, only *Waverley, Ivanhoe, The Pirate,* and *Peveril of the Peak* have true blonde/brunette pairs who are rivals in love. In each of these novels, the dark heroine is left alone at novel's end, a victim of her ideologic intransigence rather than of the off-putting 'intellectual [...] political [...] and sexual'[108] passions Welsh attributes to her. In addition, there are those solitary heroines possessed of all three of the dark heroine's passions who, almost in spite of their actions, marry the hero. Because of such exceptions to Welsh's categorisation, I prefer to use the term ingenue rather than heroine throughout this and the next chapter to describe those upper-middle to upper class young women of marriageable age who figure in the plot as the hero's potential spouse. To call these characters heroines gives them an identity based solely on their relationship with the hero, encouraging the critical marginalisation of Scott's female characters which I am trying to correct: continued use of the term would, in my opinion, perpetuate this.

Rather than adhering, with qualification, to Welsh's two category system based upon the manifestation of passionate extremes of behaviour and belief in the ingenue whose physical appearance is the darker, and therefore more sensual, I propose to discuss Scott's presentation of his ingenues through analysis of the impetus for their actions, and the degree of activity which they are permitted. Through a narrative survey, I believe Scott's awareness of the effect that the changes in late-eighteenth century Scottish society had on women's conduct will become apparent. This is not a system in which broad parameters determine which character resembles another. Instead, it is reliant on close textual analysis to

---

[107]Welsh, p. 77.
[108]Welsh, p. 77.

determine not only what Scott has done, but why certain courses of action are acceptable for some characters and not for others. I would suggest, as a point of departure, that the activities of this particular group of characters are as much products of and reactions to standards of behaviour imposed from without as they are precipitated by an awareness of and reaction to the historic events of the novel in which a given ingenue features.

Rather than embark on analysis of those ingenues who appear to be interchangeable, I will here discuss those whose conduct is at the extremes of inaction and action. In so doing, I hope to provide groundwork for later discussion of those ingenues whose actions do not follow such a clearly-defined path. Those characters who do fit neatly into Welsh's light category do not comment upon the historic events of their respective novels. Wholly passive, they appear to be, in many respects, what Coventry Patmore would later term 'The Angel in the House'. Any circumvention of social dicta is done very discreetly, and is undertaken solely to aid the hero in his endeavours. Even then, Scott is careful to describe the reluctance with which his ingenue acts to ensure that she is perceived to be ladylike. This group of ingenue is the least individual; the sum of her accomplished parts rather than a character who is participant in the fictionalised history Scott is relating in his narrative. It is here that we can see Scott's indebtedness to the conduct book paradigm; where female accomplishments are to be attained like so many items on a shopping list. Those whose actions are sufficiently overt and more importantly, self-serving, to require their permanent silence are divisible into two groups: those who express opinions, but do not act on them, and those who not only openly express opinions, but act on them in defiance of the conventions of their society. The former are allowed to live, albeit as exiles, for it is beliefs rather than their deeds which have alienated them from the normative standards of appropriate female conduct. The actions and the beliefs of the latter group of ingenues are counter both to the expectations of behaviour for a 'heroine' and for a 'young lady': it is this which removes them by death from the society they inhabit. Scott here is equally reliant on the paradigm of female autonomy found in Scottish folksong as on that of female dependence found in the conduct books, and as I will demonstrate, this at times gives rise to

narrative inconsistencies. Finally, there are those ingenues who, despite their expression of opinion and autonomous action, are able to assimilate into their respective societies at the novel's end.

In analysing the varying degrees of voice and action present among Scott's ingenues, it is important to remember the place of these characters in Scott's narrative structure. Their relationship with the hero represents a potential alliance of the novel's factions; a symbolic union to accompany the actual one. In presenting their speech as highly formalised English, I would suggest that Scott is here distancing them from any associations with a Scottish tradition of female activity. Those ingenues who realise their hoped-for union live subsequent to it, as I will demonstrate, according to the standards of the English conduct book - submissive, modest, and self-sacrificing. Those whose actions deny them a place as a 'wife' in Scott's united future, I would suggest, are more clearly products of an oral tradition which by the early nineteenth century was the perceived province of the lower classes, and therefore an inappropriate source from which Scott could draw to present his upper-middle to upper (ruling) class 'ladies'

Ladylike Silences

Like Patmore's 'Angel', the ingenues who neither express their own opinions, nor act overtly for their own ends, seem to have 'no story except a sort of anti-story of selfless innocence based on the notion that "man must be pleased; but him to please/is woman's pleasure."'[109] Such characters, who 'exist merely to fulfil the reader's expectation of what Scott called "wedding cake" he himself was unable to work up much interest in'.[110] Where he encountered difficulty with his ingenues was not in their creation, but in the tensions created because of his applications of multiple cultural paradigms to his narrative structure.

Actions of self-assertion are conveniently forgotten, apologised for, or performed so

---

[109]Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar, *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth Century Literary Imagination*, (New Haven, CT: Yale UP, 1979), p. 23.
[110]Edgar Johnson, *Sir Walter Scott: The Great Unknown*, 2 vols (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1970), I, p. 534.

circumspectly that only a close reading of the text reveals their performance.[111] A survey of popular fiction of Scott's lifetime demonstrates that he was not alone in his presentations of public female passivity, and narrative subversions of most female activity running counter to this norm.[112] Exploration of the age's widely-read conduct books reveals a consensus of opinion on the degree of modesty required in a young woman[113] *The New Female Instructor, or Young Woman's Guide to Domestic Happiness* advises that:

> There cannot be a more captivating or interesting object than a young girl, who, with *timid modesty* enters a room filled with a mixed company. The blush, which diffuses its crimson on her cheek, is not only the most powerful charm of beauty, but does honour to the innocence of her heart, and has a peculiar claim on the tender and generous feelings of every susceptible mind. Her artless confusion and retiring delicacy merit indulgence and demand universal respect. To insult or distress modesty is too commonly the degrading humour of unblushing vice.[114]

The presence of blushes in a Scott ingenue is not then an authorial device used when Scott was uncertain of an appropriate feminine response, but was instead the socially appropriate one. In requiring modesty in women, the authors of the conduct books created a means of silencing them. Certainly, there are those characters in Scott whose modesty keeps them silent, but as I will demonstrate, they are in the minority. Writing from a Scottish socio-cultural perspective, Scott was able to draw on a tradition of greater female autonomy as a means of circumventing somewhat the constraints of the perfect lady.

---

[111]cf. Judith Lowder Newton, 'Introduction: Power and the ideology of "Woman's Sphere"', in *Women, Power and Subversion: Social Strategies in British Fiction 1778-1860*, (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1981), pp. 1-22. Newton discusses here the strategies of subversion found in women's fiction for the period in question. I would suggest that much of her articulation of the tension between women's influence and the subversions of the power which accompanies this influence is applicable to Scott's ingenues. Here, the tension exists between two codes of female conduct: that of a past social and/or political milieu and that of the anglicised, North British society in which Scott lived.

[112]cf. Newton, chapters 1-3 for discussion of Burney, Austen, and Charlotte Bronte's subversions of their respective heroine's activities. Mary Poovey, in *The Proper Lady and the Woman Writer*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1984), analyses the strategies used to circumvent and to criticise societally-dictated female propriety in the works of Wollstonecraft, Mary Shelley, and Jane Austen. In particular, cf. pp. 42-47.

[113]cf. Poovey, pp. 3-9 and Armstrong, pp. 61-69 for discussion of the place of the conduct book in regularising female behaviour at the end of the eighteenth century.

[114]*The New Female Instructor, or Young Woman's Guide to Domestic Happiness*, (London: Thomas Kelly, 1834; repr. London: Rosters, 1988), p. 17.

The wholly passive ingenues are predominantly the conventional heroines of romance. They are extraordinarily beautiful and exist to ease the lives of the male characters with whom they interact. Annot Lyle, for example, has no function in *A Legend of Montrose*, except to appear when the text requires a female presence and to play her harp. At the novel's end, she is revealed to be the daughter of Sir Duncan Campbell, and a socially acceptable bride for Allan Mentieth, largely because a marriage is the most expedient way for Scott to bring together loose ends and feuding clans. Isabella Vere is disposed of by Scott in an equally arbitrary fashion. Admittedly *The Black Dwarf* is flawed, but its flaws are those of a truncated plot rather than the irreparable ones of Scott's final works. Had *The Black Dwarf* been longer, the hastily contrived marriage would still have begun; Isabella would have remained obedient to her father's wishes - placing her trust and fate in Elshie's hands - rather than flee an unacceptable fate as does *Quentin Durward*'s Isabelle of Croye.

While these ingenues are acted upon rather than acting in overt support for or opposition to one or the other faction presented in the novel in question, they do react to the effects such events have upon their world. This world is a limited one, centring as it does upon the female concerns of home and family. What must be remembered about such actions is that they are performed within the socio-historic context of a given novel as Scott understood it. The significance of that final clause cannot be sufficiently emphasised. As we have seen, when the author is comfortable with the historic events he is fictionalising, his characters will be less pastiche, and more representative of his perceptions of womanhood. The less comfortable Scott is - linguistically, socially, etc., with his created social milieu, the less integral the individual characters will be. Documentation of the actions of women within the confines of 'history' has been, until recently, quite limited. Unless a woman occupied a position of power which necessitated mention in 'the record' (for example, the queens discussed in chapter two) or, like Bess of Hardwicke, lived so contrary to every expected rule of conduct that she was noted as exceptional, women were excluded from histories. According to Christina Crosby:

> Producing "history" as the truth of man has very important social and political effects, for this project necessarily entails constituting various categories

> which relate to history in quite different ways. "Women" is such a category, *a collectivity that is positioned outside of history proper, identified rather with the immediacy and intimacy of social life*. (emphasis mine)[115]

First- or second-hand knowledge of the social life (which would have gone largely unnoticed by the official record) of a given era allowed Scott to circumvent the lack of documentation of women's participation in that society in the creation of his female characters. Without such knowledge, Scott was forced to utilise extensively the class-centred paradigms of conduct for his female characters which amalgamated the perceived with the conjectured. Given his extensive knowledge of the oral tradition, and his upbringing in an Edinburgh which was still largely Scots-speaking, it follows that the society he creates for the Anglophone, literate ingenues will be that with which he is personally least familiar.

Clearest demonstration of the integration of contemporary social paradigm and fictionalised history is found through analysis of the portrayals of Rowena and of Rose Bradwardine. Both blonde, obedient and beautiful, they seem, on initial inspection, to be an interchangeable pair. This is not the case. Rose, however insipid she seems, remains firmly rooted in the domestic world of *Waverley*, demonstrating Scott's ability to integrate the paradigm of the conduct book with his knowledge of female activity in Scotland's past. Rowena is a series of narrative contradictions brought about by Scott's attempt to amalgamate a chivalric ideal of womanhood with a novelistic heroine. The result is a construct of external perceptions rather than an integral character.

It is ironic to think that the extrapolation from medieval romance and the extension of the conduct book's guidelines on woman's duty in 'forming and improving the general manners, dispositions, and conduct of the other sex, by society and example,'[116] should form the basis of a tradition of fictional feminine behaviour for a century. One need only look at Dickens's heroines to see traces of Rowena's (and Scott's) legacy: Agnes Spenlow's self-sacrificing devotion and fidelity to David Copperfield, which is ultimately rewarded with

---

[115]*The Ends of History: Victorians and "The Woman Question"*, (London: Routledge, 1991), p. 2. cf. Marshall, p. 17.

[116]Thomas Gisborne, M.A., *An Enquiry into the Duties of the Female Sex*, (London: Cadell & Davies, 1797), pp. 12-13.

marriage; Esther Summerson's kindness to those less fortunate than she; and Mary Graham's enduring sweetness of disposition which survives all trials. The union of a chivalric, courtly tradition in which women were 'celebrated [...] as an ennobling spiritual and moral force'[117] with the conduct book regulated one of Scott's age resulted in a 'perfect' woman; whose perfection is in itself an imperfection. Rowena is something different to each person she encounters: the putative Queen of the Saxons, the beloved of Ivanhoe, Lady Bountiful, and a romantic rival.

Rowena's actions, with the exception of her defence of Ivanhoe's honour at the outset of the novel, are precipitated by expectations based upon these perceptions. Rowena, as Scott presents her, is without desire, except where her love of Ivanhoe is concerned. Only in those actions which relate to her identity as Ivanhoe's beloved - an identity, which, while self-constructed, is selfless - does Rowena demonstrate autonomy. The forwardness of her public defence of the disgraced Ivanhoe, 'I affirm he will meet fairly every honourable challenge', goes without effective reprimand because Cedric's misguided conception of Saxon succession has allowed her greater openness of speech than she might otherwise have possessed. (*Iv* 63) '[S]he had acquired that sort of courage and self-confidence which arises from the habitual and constant deference of the circle in which we move.' (224) Note, however, that Rowena's 'courage and self-confidence' are the result of others' perceptions of her status, rather than her own: what is emphasised is the extent to which Rowena's public demeanour is at odds with her personality:

> Her disposition was naturally that which phisiognomists consider as proper to fair complexions, mild, timid, and gentle; but it had been tempered, and, as it were, hardened by the circumstances of her education, [...] *Her haughtiness and habit of domination was, therefore, a fictitious character, induced over that which was natural to her.* (224, emphasis mine)

The characteristics of 'haughtiness' and 'domination', are directly opposed to those of the conduct book paradigm, in which 'modest reserve [...and] retiring delicacy which avoids the public eye and is disconcerted even at the gaze of admiration'[118] are the ideal.

---

[117]R. Howard Bloch, *Medieval Misogyny and the Invention of Western Romantic Love*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991), p. 195.
[118]'Dr. Gregory's *A Father's Legacy to His Daughters*', in *The Young Lady's Parental Monitor*, (London: Joseph Wenman, 1790), pp. 1-52 (p. 17).

Throughout *Ivanhoe*, there is a conflict between Rowena's public character and the passivity Scott claims as integral to her personality. When she appears with Cedric, the regal air required of her as the supposed Queen of the Saxons is uppermost in Scott's presentation of her. At the tournament at Ashby, she becomes in reality the Queen of Cedric's fancy. As Queen of Love and Beauty, she presides as 'temporary sovreign' over a chivalric mock-court - the only court over which she will preside. (131) Here, the role playing allows Scott to create a Queen whose power is as illegitimate as is that of the sovereign who crowns her. The extent to which Scott carries the artificiality of Rowena's 'reign' is most clearly delineated in Locksley's camp following the rescue from Torquilstone. She entreats her rescuers to think on her ability to provision them:

> If any of you should hunger, remember Rowena has food - if you should thirst, she has many a butt of wine and brown ale - and if the Normans drive ye from these walks, Rowena has forests of her own, where her gallant deliverers may range at full freedom, and never ranger ask whose arrow hath struck down the deer. (321)

The promised provisions are in fact Cedric's, and the freedom of the forests belongs to a pre-Norman age. Nevertheless, in the artificiality of Cedric's construct, Rowena believes herself able to make offers of help which may be materially impossible, but which emphasise her 'ladylike' character; something Scott does repeatedly. Through such narrative subversions of Rowena's activity, Scott emphasises that the power she possesses is a sham, thereby maintaining those aspects of her character which are integral to the nature of womanhood.

This kindness to those who are her social inferiors is also seen in Rowena's encounters with Rebecca. In the initial encounter, Rowena persuades Cedric to escort Isaac and Rebecca through the forest. Textually, there is little evidence to suggest that she accedes to Rebecca's plea out of any reason other than to be the Christian Lady: 'Jews though they be, we can not as Christians leave them in this extremity.' (190) This is the expected behaviour from one of her social position, ('in the exercise of charitable and friendly regard to the neighbouring poor, women in general are exemplary'[119]) and as such, is the course of action Scott has her take. The second of the two interviews occurs after Rowena's

---

[119]Gisborne, p. 221.

marriage to Ivanhoe. As the wife of Richard's courtier, she is now entitled to the regal air which was assumed throughout the novel. This does not, however, provide her with a corresponding increase in political awareness. Rowena fails to recognise the impossibility of Rebecca's continued residence in England, for in her domestically-centred life, her 'husband['s...] favour with the King' should be sufficient protection for even a Jewess. (464) This, and Rowena's subsequent failure to realise that Ivanhoe's position and the power which accompanies it remain insufficient protection for Rebecca against the intolerance of a society requiring adherence to its standards of belief and behaviour, underscores the extent to which Rowena's regal behaviour throughout the novel was assumed. Scott repeatedly demonstrates to his reader, directly and indirectly, that Rowena is a lady - by the standards of his own society and of the chivalric amalgam which is hers.

The only times Rowena deviates from these externally imposed standards of conduct are in actions related to or precipitated by her relationship with Ivanhoe. While Scott has no difficulty in presenting a persona which is publicly haughty and assertive, the lack of any overt expression of self-will, or of narrative sanction for such, in Rowena's romantic relationships, demonstrates the extent to which she remains a construct of masculine perceptions of femininity. Despite her assertion that 'she would rather take refuge in a convent, than share a throne with Athelstane, whom, having always despised, she now began, on account of the trouble she received on his account, thoroughly to detest', Scott reminds his readers that in such matters, 'even those females who have been trained up to obedience and subjection, are not infrequently apt to dispute the authority of guardians and parents'. (186) The effective repudiation of Cedric's constructed world, and of her own place in it, which this rejection of Athelstane represents, is glossed over by Scott. Rowena, in other words, is not being undutiful or headstrong, but is instead acting appropriately for her age and the situation at hand; a situation which is merely that of romance, and not a self-directed assimilation by a woman from a 'Saxon' into a 'British' world. The only *action* taken by Rowena at her own instigation is her meeting with the 'Palmer' requesting information about Ivanhoe. Scott allows the 'Palmer' to go unrecognised to continue the device of the disguised hero without

impediment. This is understandable, if we remember that Rowena is not essential to the progression of the plot. Her purpose is to be window-dressing; and is so to such an extent that Scott must explain away any initiative she does take. In so doing, Rowena remains an idealisation of womanhood, possessed of little or no personal identity, except that imposed upon her from without.

In the initial scenes at Tully-Veolan, Rose appears to be little more than the self-less 'block of wood in a pleated skirt'[120] she has been accused of being. She performs her father's bidding regarding the dinner arrangements, and does 'the honours with natural grace and simplicity.' (*Wav* 75) The following morning, she is seen presiding over a breakfast table. One can but wonder if there is anything else of which she is capable, but this is a question Scott quickly answers. Her father 'taught her French and Italian, [and] had endeavoured also to be her preceptor in music.' (92-3) She is possessed of all the accomplishments necessary for the eighteenth century lady she is meant to represent. Note the parallels between Rose's accomplishments, and those listed by Lady Pennington in a 1790 edition of her 'Unfortunate Mother's Advice to her Absent Daughters':

> *French* you ought to be as well acquainted with as with *English*, and Italian might, without much difficulty, be added. [...] Music and Drawing are accomplishments well worth the trouble of attaining, if your inclination and genius lead to either; if not, do not attempt them; for it will only be much time and great labour unprofitably thrown away; it being next to impossible to arrive at any degree of perfection in those arts, but dint of perseverance only, if a good ear and native genius be wanting.[121]

The literary and social tradition to which Rose belongs dictates that these are the means by which society will assess her. One is reminded of Emma Woodhouse's endorsements of her protégée's drawings, and of Mary's skill at the pianoforte in *Persuasion* as Scott trots out this laundry-list of linguistic and musical accomplishments which make up 'Rose Bradwardine'. Surely Scott was also aware of the schools for young ladies which appeared in Edinburgh at the end of the eighteenth century which taught needlework, music

---

[120]Ian M. Campbell, Personal Interview, 15 October, 1992.
[121]'An Unfortunate Mother's Advice to her Absent Daughters, in a Letter to Miss Pennington: By the Late Lady Pennington', in *The Young Lady's Parental Monitor*, pp. 53-111 (p. 70).

and languages to their pupils.[122] While a somewhat anachronistic reference, it is likely that Scott wanted Rose to be a highly accomplished, and therefore acceptable, bride for his hero.

On Waverley's arrival at Tully-Veolan, Rose is sent by her father to modify the dinner arrangements, an exit she makes 'demurely enough till she turned the first corner, and then ran with the speed of a fairy, that she might gain leisure...to put her own dress in order, and produce all her little finery'. (72) There is undoubtedly a touch of authorial paternalism in this description. I would suggest, given the emphasis placed upon female appearance by the authors of the conduct books, who advised their readers that men, 'are apt to judge of your characters from your dress. [...] vanity, levity, filthiness, and folly, shew themselves in nothing more'[123] that this, like the laundry-list of accomplishments which follows, is another means of indicating to the reader the civility and acceptability of the Scots, both in the mid-eighteenth and in the early nineteenth centuries. That Rose is not another idealisation of womanhood is demonstrated in her next appearance as mistress of Tully-Veolan. Rather than have Rose perform yet another socially correct duty, and continue attempting to engage Edward in conversation despite his taciturnity, Scott gives his reader a glimpse into a frustrated young mind: 'secretly wondering *that a scarlet coat should cover no better breeding*, she left him to his mental amusement'. (83, emphasis mine)

This fit of pique does not last, and 'poor Rose' begins to fall in love with Waverley. Rose now begins to display the initiative that provides her with a self-constructed identity rather than that of the Baron's daughter. As with Rowena, Rose's actions are precipitated by her increasing self-definition in relation to her beloved. As Flora so accurately predicts, she will 'see nothing and connect herself with nothing, but by him and through him'. (160) Unlike Rowena, Rose acts on Waverley's behalf (never for her own ends, for that would make her like the tragically defiant ingenues discussed below), participating fully in the development of the plot. It is Rose who proposes to rescue Waverley, and who bribes Bean Lean so to do. It is she, rather than Janet Gellatley, who creates the Highland subterfuge to keep Waverley

---

[122]cf. Marshall, p. 207.
[123]*The New Female Instructor*, p. 10

ignorant of her involvement in the escape. I would suggest that in giving Rose the creative power for these acts, the paradigms of the conduct book are being balanced against that of a Scottish (and in this instance, Jacobite) tradition of female activity.

To this point in his narrative, Scott has not undermined Rose's actions with commentary reminding the reader of their normalcy, or of the extreme circumstances under which Rose is acting. When Rose writes to the Chevalier, this changes. Such an 'unacceptably' bold action must be excused somehow, and Rose, we are told, 'subscribed her name, though with *reluctance and terror*.' (407, emphasis mine) Reluctance and terror because such overt initiative was not 'appropriate' behaviour for an eighteenth century spinster; particularly one whose conduct closely parallels the dictates of the conduct books. Here Rose is no different than other Jacobite women who flaunt conventional behaviour for the cause.[124] However, in her creation, Scott, despite the limited autonomy of certain of Rose's actions is unable in the end to deviate from the paradigm of the conduct book without qualification. Interestingly, in so doing, Scott not only glosses over an historic reality with which he was familiar, but ignores the balladic tradition as well. Given the sexual freedom of the heroine of a Jacobite ballad,[125] this is perhaps unsurprising. Rose's actions, have, after all been motivated by her love of Waverley - they are, in the end, selfless: her silence subsequent to her marriage marks 'relinquishment of power', and a corresponding self-lessness.[126] This need to counter Rose's actions on behalf of the cause first with a veil of secrecy, then with an acknowledgement of their rashness, and ultimately with her silence, demonstrates further the narrative tensions created by Scott's attempt to merge these traditions in the creation of his female characters.

---

[124]I refer specifically to Flora Macdonald, who aided Charles Edward in his escape to France, and to Colonel Anne Macintosh, who raised a regiment of clansmen for the Chevalier, despite her husband's status as a Captain in the British army.

[125]In addition to 'Highland Laddie', whose heroine rejects all but the 'Bonny Highland Laddie' who will 'Row me in his Highland plaidie' the Jacobite song 'My Love was Born in Aberdeen' tells us very specifically that its heroine will 'follow the lad with the white cockade'. William Donaldson, *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity*, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), pp. 56, 78. In each instance, the heroine leaves her comfortable life - and its constraints - for her Jacobite lad.

[126]Newton, p. 8.

The Silence of Difference

Certain of the ingenues who are permanently silenced by Scott never deviate from the norm of ladylike behaviour which regulates the actions of this group of characters. They wholeheartedly espouse a cause, and advocate its tenets, but confine their activities to advocacy; a passive embrasure of an ideology which will not put them at odds with the paradigm of feminine behaviour established by the conduct books. This is not to say that their involvement is half-hearted, or that they will abandon that cause as a means of maintaining their social position. It is the fact of their belief in a cause incompatible with the morés of the society established by Scott at novel's end which forces their silence through their removal from that society.

In associating them with a cause at odds with the normative behaviours of their social milieu, Scott need not use authorial commentary as a means of subverting their actions, as he does with Rose, or with the 'headstrong hoydens' discussed below. Their manipulations of scene and of the lives of others are done for a purpose; be it the Jacobite cause, or loyalty to a faith. While this obviates narrative tension, it is not conducive to sanction of this female power by a society which expects its middle-and upper-class women to concern themselves with the trappings of domesticity rather than those of statecraft. I would suggest that Scott's awareness of such societally-dictated standards of conduct is the reason that he ensures that Rebecca and Flora MacIvor, within the constraints of their beliefs, remain emblematic of feminine virtues. Had Scott associated either character explicitly with their balladic paradigms, they would have been too empowered to reflect contemporary perceptions of the femininity associated with their class.[127]

These two, it seems to me, were the characters Welsh had uppermost in his mind when devising his criteria of the brunette heroine. 'Her energies come up point-blank against

---

[127]Rebecca's balladic parallels are discussed below. Flora, whose very name evokes that of Flora MacDonald - and by association, that of the exiled Prince - might also be seen as the heroine of the 'lost lover' ballads. There are also the connotations of fertility, which are associated in Jacobite iconography with the Stewart kings. Her Catholicism, which is integral to Irish Jacobitism, also suggests the *aisling*. The tears 'of devotion or joy' with which Flora acknowledges the Prince's arrival, make clear the suggestion of Flora as Scotland, and emphasise her role as heroine of a 'lost lover' ballad.

reality. She has intellectual passion, but no books; she has political passion, but no cause; and she has sexual passion, but too much of all three for the wary passive hero to approach too near.'[128] Once again, however, there are exceptions to Welsh's rule. Flora's *current* intellectual passion is that of the oral tradition; a passion she has ostensibly cultivated because of her residence 'in the lonely regions of Glennaquoich, [where] she found that her resources in French, English and Italian literature, were likely to be few and interrupted.' (*Wav* 147) She is not limited in her intellectual passion by a lack of written culture. Nor is Rebecca, whose literacy is based primarily upon her knowledge of scripture rather than upon a knowledge of literature. Flora's regret when deprived of her cause is that she 'spurred his [Fergus's] fiery temper, and half his ruin at least lies with his sister!' thereby failing in her feminine duty of calming his passions rather than her own participation in the Forty-five. (426) Rebecca is not interested in the Norman-Saxon conflict of *Ivanhoe*; her strength of character comes from the fact that she is marginalised by the only cause to which she is devoted - her religion. Flora, for all her beauty, has effectively renounced all possibility of marriage to anything except her cause; despite Waverley's attempts, she is an unapproachable political nun, whose ultimate renunciation of the world is not at all at odds with the fervency of her belief. Rebecca is, however, possessed of the sexual passion Welsh attributes to the dark heroine, as one would expect of a literary Jewess. Contrary to Welsh's assertion, her sexual allure does not frighten Ivanhoe away: '[I]t would be inquiring too curiously to ask whether the recollection of Rebecca's beauty and magnanimity did not recur to his mind more frequently than the fair descendent of Alfred might altogether have approved'. (*Iv* 467) In each instance, Scott has opportunity to associate explicitly these ingenues with a behaviour which would place them in direct conflict with class-based expectations of femininity, and yet he backs away from any hint of the true orality of the lower classes, political activity, and sexual activity. While their associations with each of these 'unfeminine' standards serve as indices of their unsuitability for marriage to the hero, and participation in the 'new' society created by Scott at novel's end, Rebecca and Flora remain

---

[128]Welsh, p. 81.

distanced, and therefore 'ladylike' in their conduct. It must be noted here that Flora and Rebecca serve as alter egos for Rose and Rowena. The use of a pair of ingenues allows Scott to replicate certain of his heroine's actions and/or belief structures, without having to adhere exclusively to the paradigm of the proper lady.[129] In these pairs, we see treatment by Scott of more overt female support of the Jacobite cause, and of externally imposed female identity as 'other'.

Unlike Rowena, who can assimilate into the new Norman (and, to Scott, proto-British) society in place at novel's end, Rebecca remains set apart from that society by her Judaism. Those Christian males who established the standards of conduct for her society tolerate her presence within that society, provided she remains safely in the ghetto to which she has been assigned. Her unwilling involvement with the Templar forces Rebecca to step out of that niche; calling overt attention to the hypocrisy and brutality of the society on which she, by word and deed, had hitherto been able to comment circumspectly. Unlike Rowena, Rebecca does not identify herself through others' perceptions of her; her refusal to be self-less marginalises her still further. That the Jewess is the voice of Enlightened morality within the novel runs counter to the literary tradition of the avaricious Jew (from which her father undoubtedly comes). Rebecca is also not the seductress and murderess found in the ballad 'Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter' (C 155). She remains the moral constant within the world of *Ivanhoe*; which, with its usurping Regent, corrupt Templars, and disobedient sons, is hardly emblematic of an idealised, and expected, medieval morality.

Despite her criticism of a society of which she is not part, Scott does not subvert Rebecca's action because her commentary is directed at those aspects of her society which affect her life, rather than at aspects of that society of which she has no direct experience. Rebecca's rebuke of Isaac, however undutiful it may appear, as he laments over the loss of his monies to the Gentiles does not register, and indeed, 'only served to awaken new

---

[129]cf. Poovey, p. 43. This technique, widespread in the eighteenth century, was also used to 'explore, often through the characters of servants of lower-class women, direct actions forbidden to the more proper lady.' As I will discuss, in Scott, the presence or absence of a double has direct relationship to the social paradigm to which he adheres in his presentation of women.

subjects of complaint.' (117) Because this rebuke originates in her position as moral preceptress for her father (whose inattention keeps him true to type) it further emphasises Rebecca's refusal to create her identity based on the perceptions of others. This is again demonstrated through her return to Gurth of monies in excess of the cost of Ivanhoe's armour. Rebecca is possessed of the power of self-identification, and as such, she will act more overtly than does Rowena, whose identity comes from her relationship with others.

Rebecca's marginalised position within the society of *Ivanhoe* permits a degree of commentary not given other of the ingenues who are fully participant within and subject to the constraints of their respective societies. As an outsider, Rebecca is able to see and to assess situations clearly because she is not a partisan participant therein. It is for this reason that Scott places his criticism of the excesses of chivalric behaviour in her mouth; unlike other marginalised characters within the novel, she remains representative of Scott's perceptions of virtuous behaviour. Despite this, Scott gives her expression against the status quo in the course of a conversation she has with Ivanhoe while prisoner at Torquilstone. 'What remains to you as the prize of all the blood you have spilled, of all the travail and pain you have endured, of all the tears which your deeds have caused, when death hath broken the strong man's spear, and overtaken the speed of his war horse?' Ivanhoe's response, 'Thou art no Christian, Rebecca' only serves to emphasise her point about the blindness of the Crusaders and of their cause. (292) Because no one is present to overhear this conversation, Rebecca's differences of perception and the challenge it presents to the society in which she lives, are allowed to pass without incident. Privately expressed comment is acceptable, public action is not.

Her abduction by the Templar and its aftermath, draw public attention to Rebecca's differences. The 'keen [...and] sharp' wits with which she defends herself in a public forum, are not those of a proper woman. (233) Were she truly 'ladylike', Rebecca would have acted as does Rowena during her imprisonment - tears and vapours are the proper weapons of a proper woman, not words. Rebecca, when fighting for her life, abandons her submission to 'the evil circumstances in which she was placed as the daughter of a despised race, while

she felt in her mind the consciousness that she was entitled to hold a higher rank from her merit than the arbitrary despotism of religious prejudice permitted her to aspire to.' (230) Rebecca's public adherence to her creed/cause guarantees her fate. While her rational, moderate beliefs and their expression may embody certain feminine ideals, and garner sympathy, they have no place in the bigoted society to which she belongs.[130] Rebecca serves as an indicator of the progress made in society from the medieval to the early modern; she is the voice of reason in a world unable to hear.

Unlike Rebecca, whose commentary and actions are not intended to serve as a means to an end, Flora MacIvor is a wholly political creature. Meant to serve as a contrast to her brother, Fergus, whose devotion to the Jacobite cause is 'tinctured, at least, if not tainted, but the views of interest and advancement so easily combined with it', Flora's 'exceed[s] her brother's in fanaticism, [and] excel[s] it also in purity.' (*Wav* 146) Scott would have his reader believe that her devotion to the cause originates in a genuine attachment to the customs and culture of her clansmen: that it belongs wholly to the feminine sphere of the home and hearth. I would suggest that Flora, whose voice 'in urging any favourite topic, which she often pursued with natural eloquence [...] possessed as well the tones which impress *awe and conviction, as those of persuasive insinuation*', is as much a manipulator as is Fergus. (145-6, emphasis mine) The difference between the siblings is that Fergus need not make any attempt to conceal his plans and intentions, while Flora must, or risk being thought brazen and unladylike.

Flora's circumspection is particularly interesting when bearing in mind the extent to which female adherents to the cause flaunted convention during the Forty-five. In addition to those Jacobite 'amazons' mentioned in my discussion of Rose Bradwardine, above, there is Chris Guthrie, who poured boiling water into her husband's boots to keep him from fighting for the Government. On a less 'active' scale, there are also the ladies of Edinburgh, who attended Charles Edward's ball at Holyrood, and denied so doing when Edinburgh fell to the

---

[130]In the Magnum, Scott was forced to justify his reasons for not allowing Rebecca and Ivanhoe to marry. Thackeray, notably, attempted to rework the Rebecca and Rowena duo in his book of that name.

Hanoverians. However, I would suggest that Scott's reasons for effectively emasculating Flora are as determined by the time in which he was writing *Waverley* as with the paradigm which, for him, determined 'acceptable' feminine behaviour. Jacobitism, in Scott's day, was associated with Scotland's 'uncivilised' past, and therefore was distanced, rendered elegiac and associated with the socially marginalised: Flora's social class is at odds with these associations, and Scott's anachronistic dissociation of her from active Jacobitism ensures that she remain 'feminine'.[131] It must also be remembered that, subsequent to the Napoleonic wars, the francophile,[132] Catholic Flora would likely be viewed by the reader as less than moral, she would be seen, whatever her family's origin, as truly 'other', as a threat.

Close reading of the narrative demonstrates that this perception would not have been incorrect. The extent of Flora's ability to manipulate others is demonstrated most clearly in her choice of locale to reveal the meaning of Mac-Murrough's Gaelic verse to the very romantic Waverley. Rather than do so in her 'civilised' sitting room within the confines of the citadel, Flora leads Waverley to her natural retreat, where 'the seat of the Celtic Muse is in the mist of the secret and solitary hill, and her voice in the murmur of the mountain stream.' (154) Yet, this is a landscape augmented by Flora's hand, designed to 'heighten what she sees as the essential qualities of the scene. [...] in acting out her own fantasy she draws him further into the world of dream.'[133] In so doing, I would argue, she is fully aware of the seductive effect of the scene on Waverley; Scott too utilises the romance of this scene to sketch the fantastic and romantic aspects of the Jacobite cause for his reader, who sees the scene through Waverley's eyes. This Edenic scene represents the threat of female passion: it is Waverley's sexual attraction to Flora which prompts him to join the Jacobites. Fergus's approach makes it necessary for her to summarise those stanzas of the song which concern

---

[131]See my discussion of late-eighteenth and early nineteenth century treatment by the Scots of Jacobitism, in chapter one, above.

[132]The MacIvor siblings were anachronistically raised at St. Germain, despite the Stewart Court having left there after the 1713 Treaty of Utrecht.

[133]Jane Millgate, *Walter Scott: The Making of the Novelist*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1984), p. 49.

Edward, yet she somehow manages to sing the concluding stanzas, those most concerned with the call to arms, before her brother's arrival.

Here, we see most clearly Flora's place within the cultures of the Stewart cause. Like the Italianate Prince who came home, Flora views Glennaquoich and its culture as her own; her participation within Gaelic culture is, however, limited by the uses she is able to make of it. Even here, there is the imposition of the civilised onto the barbaric - Flora's drawing room contrasts with the masculine great hall, and the romance of the Highland scenery is augmented by Flora for effect. Flora is here poised between cultures, participant in the Gaelic world of Glennaquoich, she remains nevertheless the francophilic beauty of St. Germain who quotes Ariosto as readily as she does the bard Mac-Murrough. In this construction of Flora, I would suggest that Scott is attempting to find a balance between paradigms of female conduct. She is sexually alluring, yet sexlessly devoted to the cause. Her interest is appropriately self-less: Scott makes the nature of her devotion to the Jacobites before and after Culloden quite clear. In her interest in the oral tradition, we see this tension between paradigms most clearly, for Flora it is an intellectual passion: she learns the songs, she does not create them.

Flora's use of the oral tradition, which is her current intellectual passion, is a means to an end. There is never any desire on Flora's part to ally herself with an English Jacobite, whatever Fergus may desire. Were Flora concerned, as is Rose, only with the cause insofar as it affects her beloved, or were she as politically self-serving as is her brother, she would not discourage Edward's romantic interpretation of this tête à tête. She certainly would not do so if she were the personification of sexual passion Welsh believes her to be. The ruling passion in Flora's life is a political ideal; all others take second place to the advancement of the cause. This is undoubtedly behind her manipulations of Edward's emotions to achieve his political conversion. In urging him to 'serve your injured sovreign with effect, and stand forth, as your loyal ancestors, at the head of your natural followers and adherents, a worthy representative of the house of Waverley', Flora is undoubtedly aware that Edward will hope for 'ultimate success in case circumstances permitted the renewal of his suit.' (190-1) Scott

demonstrates the power female sexuality holds over men, and the threat that that sexuality represents. However, he does not make Flora a sexual, self-serving predator. As with the ingenues discussed above, Flora's identity is associated with something outside herself: the success of the Stewart cause.

While the purity of her devotion to Charles Edward and his cause is never in doubt, the fervency which accompanies it renders Flora as incapable as her brother of participating in the Hanoverian society which remains after Culloden. As long as that cause is in the ascendant, Flora is the accomplished, vivacious beauty ostensibly raised under the influence of St. Germain. She has been, throughout the novel, concerned with appearances, with seemings, with what-if's.[134] Faced with the reality of British society rather than ideal of Francophile Glennaquoich, Flora loses the source of the passion which gave her the colour and glamour which made her so attractive to Waverley. While still concerned with appearances (even when it is only Waverley to whom she will appear), the vanities which made Flora so alluring are gone: 'Her fine complexion was totally gone; her person considerably emaciated; and her face and hands as white as the purest statuary marble, forming a strong contrast with her sable dress and jet-black hair.' (425) Despite all that it has cost her, Flora will not reject the Jacobite cause, but regrets merely that she failed to see that 'it was impossible that it could end otherwise.' (426) She is as incapable in the face of its loss of devoting herself to another as she was when the Rising had just begun, and she tells Waverley that 'I will frankly confess, that it has so occupied my mind as to exclude every thought respecting what is called my own settlement in life.' (188) For Flora, the commitment she has made to the Jacobite cause is as strong as any marriage vow. Her constancy to that is what keeps her from becoming an 'unladylike' fanatic in appearance as well as in belief; however misguided, she is constant in her belief. Flora's retreat into a

---

[134]cf. Armstrong, pp. 70-71, 76-77 for discussion of the female body as ornamental reflection of social status. Armstrong notes that the authors of the conduct books do not approve of such vanity. I would suggest that here Scott is indicating to his reader Flora's unsuitability as a domestic woman in Hanoverian Britain: she is associated fully with a decadent aristocratic past.

convent, to a death-in-life through her renunciation of the world is the closest Scott comes to giving Flora the fate she, as an active Jacobite 'should' have met.

The Silence of Death

Where the convent-bound silenced ingenues differ from their doomed counterparts is in the extent to which Scott makes use of the more sexually forthright ballad paradigm in crafting these characters. The perception of sexual 'guilt' on the part of Amy Robsart, Lucy Ashton and Clara Mowbray by the representatives of a society in which 'it is as bad to appear wicked, as to be really so' [135] ensures that they will be unable to participate in a social construct where the paradigm of the conduct book holds sway. Their fates are not the result of circumvention of expected behaviours, for incarceration in Scott's continental convent serves as punishment for such transgressions. I would suggest that in creating this trio Scott allowed the balladic paradigm to predominate, and was as a result able to utilise the fate of the tragic ballad heroine to reconcile the historic record with his fictional purposes. In two instances, those of Amy Robsart and Lucy Ashton, the women on whom the ingenues were based died tragically; while Scott elides over those portions of the historic record which do not suit his purpose, he does not alter their fates to provide a novelistic happy ending. Because he starts with ingenues whose fate is predetermined, Scott in these instances does not have to subvert actions which would not , by the conventions of the novel and the society which gave rise to it, permit them the reward of marriage. Clara Mowbray is a different matter entirely. *St. Ronan's Well* is not subject to the same constraints as are *Kenilworth* and *The Bride of Lammermoor*, for Scott does not here have an historic framework on which to build his fictions. As a result, the 'new', British standards of the Well clash irreconcilably with the Scottish/balladic society of the Toun. Because it is intended to be a novel of manners, the knowledge of Clara's immorality - its appearance - must be judged by the standards of the Well rather than of the Toun. As those elements of Clara's life associated with the ballad paradigm, (sexual activity, troth plight, and incestuous marriage) occur outwith the chronology

---

[135] *The New Female Instructor*, p. 19.

of the novel, and because the twenty-four lines which explicitly delineate those elements were excised at Ballantyne's urging, I will not engage in further discussion of *St. Ronan's Well.* I will instead concentrate discussion of this group of ingenues on Amy and Lucy, for the actions taken which run counter to the 'expected' standards of feminine behaviour are explicitly delineated by Scott.

Amy Robsart's defiance of the conventions of polite society is a matter of perception. That she runs away from her father's house with a man is undeniable. What is significant, however, is that the true identity of this man, and Amy's marriage to him remain secret. Because of this, Amy is perceived by Tressilian as 'nothing but a thing to weep over'. (*K* 44) Vested with paternal (and by implication, societal) authority, Tressilian cannot conceive that Amy acted of her own accord. The language he uses in confronting Amy objectifies her. Her abductor 'stole thee from thy father's roof.' (46) Clearly, she has 'been bound by some spell - entrapped by some deceit - art now detained by some compelled vow.' (47)

Since she, as a woman, is perceived to be incapable of such self-interest, and 'can not, must not, and dare not' leave Cumnor with Tressilian, Amy *must* be Varney's prisoner. (45) From Tressilian's perspective, Amy's refusal to answer his question about her marital status is a clear indication of her guilt and sin rather than the insult to her character she perceives it to be. Amy's revelation that 'the poor Amy is now greater than she dare name' and that 'other and more equally binding duties' (as a wife) stop just short of breaking her promise to Leicester that their marriage remain secret. (45-6) Were Tressilian willing to hear what Amy tells him, rather than acting under his presumptions, he would see that she has removed herself from her father's authority, and is not therefore, neglecting her filial duty.

Amy and Leicester's clandestine marriage, as presented by Scott, is at odds with its historic basis. Amy's death did occur under circumstances like those Scott creates, but did so long before the entertainment at Kenilworth in 1575. She was also the acknowledged wife of Leicester; it was rumoured that he had Amy killed to enable him to be free to marry Elizabeth. Despite his awareness of these rumours, Scott consciously makes Leicester the:

> dupe of villains [rather] than the unprincipled author of their atrocities. In the latter capacity, which a part at least of his contemporaries imputed to him, he

> would have made a character too disgustingly wicked, to be useful *for the purposes of fiction*. (471, emphasis mine)

This awareness of the purposes of fiction is what prompts Scott to set Amy up as the fallen woman. What is important for women of her social standing is what they are perceived by society to be. She is not the heroine of a ballad, whose abandonment of her family and fidelity to her lover is rewarded by an elevation in social status, like Lizie Lindsay who is courted in 'grit povertie' with 'nae flattrie' by Donald MacDonald.[136]

Despite the fact that Amy is perceived by the arbiters of morality within her society to be a fallen woman, her departure from her father's home with Leicester is not, within the ballad tradition, a cause for shame. Her elopement with Leicester severed all ties with her father, and by implication with the society of which he is a part. In so doing, I would suggest, she perceives herself to be no longer subject to the standards of that society, but of that microcosm in which she is Countess Leicester. This elevation in rank, from 'the daughter of in impoverished and dotard knight...[to] the brightest fortune in England, or perchance in Europe' is reminiscent of that of the eponymous heroine of C 228, 'Glasgow Peggy'. (58) Like the heroines of other ballads in the 'Highland Laddie' tradition[137] Peggy's elopement with her laddie results in a rise in social rank; this ballad, however, specifies the extent of that elevation. 'Now a' that Peggy had before/Was a wee cot-house and a little kail-yairdie, but now she is lady of the whole Isle of Skye,/And now bonny Peggy is ca'd my Lady.' (E text)[138]

At Cumnor, where Amy meets Tressilian, she is the 'partner of his [Leicester's] dignity'; bonny Amy is indeed his Lady. (53) There, in her world, she is the Countess Leicester. As she begins to realise, however, this is not enough to protect her from society's perception that she is not. 'What signifies...that I have rank and honour in reality, if I am to

---

[136]'226. Lizie Lindsay', B text, in *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*., ed. by Francis James Child, 5 vols (New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 1882-98; repr. New York: Dover, 1965), IV, pp. 255-66 (p. 255). When individual Child ballads are referred to without quotation, I will cite them by number within the text. Quoted texts will be noted. Whatever the textual evidence of the ballad heroine's class, the genre was, as I have discussed in chapter one above, associated with a lower class orality (and associatively, illiteracy).

[137]In addition to 'Lizie Lindsay' and 'Glasgow Peggy' discussed here, cf. C 225 'Rob Roy' and C 227 'Bonny Lizie Baillie', Child, IV, pp. 245-54; pp. 266-70, for further examples of 'Highland Laddie' ballads.

[138]Child, IV, pp. 270-75 (p. 274).

live an obscure prisoner, without either society or observance, and suffering in my character, as one of dubious or disgraced reputation?' (261-2) This awareness becomes all the clearer when she receives Leicester's letter, urging her to appear at Kenilworth as Varney's wife. 'I would I were a man but for five minutes.' (267) As a man, she would have the freedom to do as she would; to come and go at will. I would suggest that this wish on the part of his ingenue is for masculine power; Scott here articulates his awareness of the powerlessness of women in his construct, yet adheres to the paradigm which dictates this female passivity.[139]

In encouraging his wife to agree to the continued concealment of their marriage, Leicester has broken his troth to her as surely as the heroes of C 73 and C 74: 'Lord Thomas and Fair Annet' and 'Fair Margaret and Sweet William'. While dishonourable in the extreme by the standards of the polite society which has judged Amy based on Leicester's deception, it is fatal by those of the balladic society on which Scott, in part, based their secret marriage.[140] Lord Thomas, like Leicester, takes the advice of others in making his decision to marry the 'nut-browne bride' rather than Fair Annet. In so doing, he chooses one who can bring him 'gold and gear' and 'oxen and kye'.[141] Once removed from Amy and Cumnor, Leicester 'forgot all that love had previously dictated, and saw nothing for the instant but the favour or disgrace, which depended on the nod of Elizabeth and the fidelity of Varney.' (196) The fidelity of Varney is, of course, non-existent. Amy is sufficiently aware of this to refuse to travel as Varney's wife, although Scott takes care to make her disobedience exceptional. 'I cannot put your commands, my lord [...] in balance with those of honour and conscience. I will NOT *in this instance*, obey you. You may achieve your own dishonour, to which these crooked policies naturally tend, but I will do nought that can blemish mine.' (394, emphasis

---

[139]See my analyses of Mary Stewart, pp. 58-63 above, and of Catherine Seyton, Isabelle of Croye and Diana Vernon, pp. 111-23 below for other expressions of Scott's awareness of the passive behaviour expected from women of a high social standing.

[140]While not applicable to English marriage at the time of Scott's writing, I would suggest that the public acknowledgement of marriage under Scots law may have been in Scott's mind when creating this Leicester-Amy-Varney triangle. Varney's claims, in conjunction with Amy's tacit confirmation of their 'marriage' would have been sufficient under Scots law for them to be accepted by society as married.

[141]Child, I, pp. 179-99 (p. 182).

mine) The irony here is that Amy's actions have already blemished her honour, for honour is in part the perception of others.

In his ingenue's capitulation, Scott demonstrates his society's belief in female self-lessness. It is important, I think, to note that Amy's only truly unfeminine, self-assertive (and balladic) act is her elopement with Leicester. Her other purported acts of female caprice are merely those of a wife desirous of recognition as such, and of the restoration of her reputation which the former will bring. In each instance of 'impatient folly', Scott takes care to underscore the fact that Amy has done what she has to regain her lost honour. (394) On three separate instances of what appears to be unfeminine behaviour, Scott emphasises the fact that she has not lost any of her femininity: when furious with Varney, she is still 'at once beautiful and fearful' (265); in the midst of her flight to Kenilworth, Scott takes time to comment that despite being spoiled as a child, '[t]he natural sweetness of her disposition had saved her from becoming insolent and ill-humoured' (298); and finally, during her defiance of her husband, she 'displayed, in the midst of distress and difficulty, the natural energy of character, which would have rendered her, had fate allowed, a distinguished ornament of the rank which she held'. (395) In each of these instances, it seems to me, Scott is endeavouring to demonstrate that despite her defiance of patriarchal authority through an action which demonstrates the sexual power of woman, Amy Robsart is, in the end, a self-less product of the paradigm of feminine passivity found in the conduct books. The tragedy of Amy's elopement and 'fall' is not the act itself, but is instead her betrayal by those who should, under either social schema, protect her. She is a victim both of the conventions of behaviour which allow a woman to be judged by social perception and of the balladic tradition of denial of a troth.

Another victim of the tensions between behavioural paradigms is Lucy Ashton. By the mid-nineteenth century, she had become one of 'three major Romantic images of the madwoman: the suicidal Ophelia, the sentimental Crazy Jane, and the violent Lucia'[142]

---

[142]Elaine Showalter, *The Female Malady: Women, Madness, and English Culture, 1830-1980*, (London: Virago, 1987), p. 10.

representing 'female sexuality as insane violence against men.'[143] She was, to the Victorian male, that most horrifying of women - the serpent which 'actually turn[s] out to reside within [...] the angel'.[144] This image continues to be found in criticism of *The Bride of Lammermoor* as recently as 1983, where Lucy is described by Harry Shaw as 'suddenly becom[ing] not a weak, pale, loving girl, but a harpy.'[145] By the traditions of the literary genre to which she belongs, Lucy 'should not' commit such an act. *The Bride of Lammermoor*, Scott's only Gothic novel, and its ingenue are as much products of the ballad tradition as of that of Gothic fiction. It is a failure on the part of critics to recognise this duality of origin which leads to a failure to recognise that Lucy herself is doubled.

Pliant, weak, and a dreamer, Lucy Ashton embodies the angel-woman of the Victorians' dreams. She seems, at first glance, to be merely the epitome of Welsh's light heroine among Scott's insipid ingenues. Scott describes her initially as 'soft, timid, and feminine.' (38) Subsequent descriptions of Lucy's thoughts and actions when alone as opposed to when in the company of others provides the reader with the initial clue that there is perhaps more to this girl than first indicated.

> Yet her passiveness of disposition was by no means owing to an indifferent or unfeeling mind. Left to the impulse of her own taste and feeling, Lucy Ashton was peculiarly accessible to those of a romantic cast. Her secret delight was in the old legendary tales of ardent devotion and unalterable affection, chequered as they so often are with strange adventures and supernatural horrors. This was her favoured fairy realm, and here she erected her aërial palaces. But *it was only in secret that she laboured at this delusive, though delightful* architecture.[...]
>
> But in her exterior relations to things of this world, Lucy willingly received the ruling impulse from those around her. the alternative was, in general, too indifferent to her to render resistance desirable, and she willingly found a motive for decision in the opinion of her friends, which perhaps *she might have sought for in vain in her own choice*. (38, emphases mine)

In describing Lucy Ashton thus, Scott is providing an indication to the astute reader of the oppositions at work in this novel. Unlike other of his ingenues, whose allegiances are to one or the other of the factions at work within their respective tales, Lucy emblematises conflicts

---

[143]Showalter, p. 14.
[144]Gilbert and Gubar, p. 29.
[145]*The Forms of Historical Fiction: Sir Walter Scott and His Successors*, (London: Cornell UP, 1983), p. 220.

between cultural paradigms which existed in the personalities of Scotswomen such as Mrs. Brown of Falkland.

Given the dominance of the old tales in Lucy's private world, the appearance of Edgar Ravenswood is something out of Lucy's girlish fantasies. His appearance, seemingly from nowhere, marks him as 'otherworldly'. Like the heroes of ballads such as 'Tam Lin' (C 39), or 'The Elfin Knight' (C 2), his appearance is unheralded: 'a shot from the neighbouring thicket' is the first indication given the reader and the Ashtons that there is anyone else in the wood. (52) Scott's knowledge of the ballad tradition is such that he could not have been unaware of the sexual connotations of this meeting in the greenwood. The balladic heroine who returns from a greenwood tryst with a babe between her sides is a familiar motif. While Scott will not cross this line, he does make it apparent that Edgar Ravenswood is, to Lucy's tale-filled mind, where her future lies.

> She had never happened to see a young man of mien and features so romantic and so striking as young Ravenswood; but had she seen an hundred his equals or his superiors in those particulars, no one else could have been linked to her heart by the strong associations of remembered danger and escape, of gratitude, wonder, and curiosity. (59)

Lucy's fidelity to Edgar or to her image of Edgar, despite the opposition of her family and the prophecies surrounding his, marks her as a descendant of the tragic ballad heroines Fair Janet and Jeanie Gordon. Both remain true in spirit to their beloved despite being forced by what Jack Truten terms the 'self or pelf-concerned father'[146] into marriage with another. Janet is destined for an 'auld French lord'[147] while Jeanie declares that she will die rather than be bedded by the 'bowed on the back and thrawin on the knee'[148] Lord Saltoun.

In a novel as reliant upon the Gothic and the balladic as is this one, that Lucy, like these heroines, is doomed is clear from the outset of the novel. Two things prevent her from being merely a stuffed dummy who is moved from scene to scene as it suits the author: the awareness given her by Scott of the sub-text of situations resulting from her role of passive

---

[146]Jack Truten, 'Folklore and Fakelore: Narrative Construction and Deconstruction in the Scottish Novels of Sir Walter Scott', in *Scott in Carnival*, ed. by J.H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1994), pp. 122-31 (p. 129).
[147]'64. Fair Janet', Child, II, pp. 100-11 (p. 104).
[148]'237. Lord Saltoun and Auchanachie', Child, IV, pp.347-50 (p. 347).

observer within her family, and her attempts to remain true to her troth with Ravenswood. The former is the aspect of her personality which makes Lucy the ideal heroine of a Gothic romance. Scott could have subjected his character to all matter of ordeals; ordeals endured patiently, tearfully, and tremulously while awaiting rescue by the hero. To a certain extent, Lucy is used in this manner, but the balladic aspects of this novel make the ordeal atypical of the Gothic novel. The torture originates, not with a procuress or corrupt guardian, but with her mother: one who, by the standards of Scott's day should place the welfare of others above her own interests. Ballads such as 'The Mother's Malison, or Clyde's Water' (C 216) or 'Rare Willie Drowned in Yarrow, or The Water o' Gamrie' (C 215) contain such cruel mothers, whose opposition to, and interference in their child's romance results in the deaths of both lovers.[149]

The impetus for Lady Ashton's treatment of her daughter, as I will discuss elsewhere, is due as much to the conflict within a Waverley novel between the old and the new as to specifically balladic allusions on Scott's part. To a parent as concerned with social standing as is Lady Ashton, Bucklaw's 'best establishment in the three Lothians' is infinitely preferable to 'a beggarly Jacobite bankrupt' despite his family's three-times intermarriage 'with the main stem' of the House of Douglas. (275, 220, 224) Lady Ashton has made a choice between the old schema of social status based on family connections, and the new one of establishment and appearance; she has rejected the suitor who, within the Waverley schematic is representative of Scotland for the one representing a future within Britain. Lady Ashton's ultimate lack of success with her daughter's advantageous marriage is equally dependent upon this duality. The 'private' Lucy has come to the fore; her daydreams of life as a heroine of romance are now reality. The opportunity for physical escape from her family is now the embodiment of the mental and emotional escape of her daydreams It is she who demands the right to contact Ravenswood to ask for release from their engagement, in a 'tone of obstinacy' which 'precluded the possibility of dispute'. (289) Lucy is fully aware of the extent to which her mother will take her manipulations. 'Alone and uncounselled I involved

---

[149]Child, IV, pp. 178-191.

myself in these perils - alone and uncounselled I must extricate myself *or die*.' (289, emphasis mine) Lucy here has established a self-constructed identity based on her desires: desires which according to the paradigm of the conduct book, she should not have.

It is her failure to extricate herself successfully from the conflict between old and new codes of conduct which prompts Lucy to abandon her dreams, and with them her true self, to the will of her family; or, more accurately, to that of her mother. Ravenswood's return prior to the completion of the signing of the marriage contract gives Lucy a means within the ballad tradition, to extricate herself. The hero of C 221, 'Katharine Jaffray', who is the bride's preferred suitor, gate-crashes the wedding, and abducts the bride.[150] This is not feasible, however, when the standards of polite, British society have gained the ascendant as they have in *The Bride of Lammermoor*. Lucy's rejection of Ravenswood (and all he represents within the oral, Scottish tradition) is as fatal as her revocation of their troth within the balladic tradition. As Gilbert and Gubar rightly note, it is 'the surrender of her self - of her personal comfort, her personal desires, or both - that is the beautiful angel-woman's key act, [...] it is precisely this sacrifice which dooms her to death. [...] For to be selfless is not only to be noble, it is to be dead.'[151] In the balladic tradition, it is not the abandonment of personal desire which brings about the death of a woman, but the revocation of her troth.[152] Lucy's self-less action has doomed her in either paradigm on which Scott drew. Having rejected her self-constructed identity, Lucy moves through the remainder of the novel preparing for her death. On more than one occasion, Lucy raises 'her hands to her neck' in search of her troth token, and 'mutter[s], in surprise and discontent, when she could not find it, "It was the link *that bound me to life*."' (303, emphasis mine)

---

[150]The C text of this ballad is taken from '"Scotch Ballads, Materials from the Border Minstrelsy" No. 30 Abbotsford. Sent Scott by William Laidlaw, in September, 1802'. The Structure of the relationship between the balladic lovers parallels those of *The Bride of Lammermoor*; the bride's preferred suitor comes 'Up thrae the Lawland border' while the choice of 'father [...] mother/An a' the rest o her kin' comes 'Out frae the English border'. Child, IV, pp. 216-31 (p. 220).

[151]Gilbert and Gubar, p. 25.

[152]cf. 'The Demon Lover' (C 243), 'Lord Thomas and Fair Annet' (C 73) and 'Fair Margaret and Sweet William' (C 74) for examples of broken troths and their fatal consequences. Child, IV, pp. 360-69; I, pp. 179-203.

As her place in the typology of the nineteenth century madwoman suggests, Lucy's tragedy is not that she has been victimised by another, but that she is the victim of her wilfulness. In the tradition of the literary heroine, Lucy is an example of what not to do; her defiance of her mother's dictates is an action which must be punished. The balladic tradition is equally consistent in its punishment of troth-breakers. The lack of an opposite for his ingenue and her inability to adopt the 'new' norms of feminine passivity within Scott's schema, makes Lucy Ashton's fate triply inevitable.

Headstrong Hoydens

At the opposite end of the spectrum from the wholly ladylike Rowena and Rose are those heroines whose actions are wholly autonomous and whose speech is too forthright to be feminine. They are the ingenues who are possessed of all three of the passions Welsh attributes to the 'dark heroine', yet who manage almost in spite of themselves to marry the hero at novel's end. Unlike the truly passive ingenues, who are aware only of the immediate results of their actions, these ladies, because of their overt and direct involvement in the novels' fictionalised histories, are cognisant of the long-term implications (for themselves as well as for others) of these actions. Catherine Seyton, Isabelle of Croye, and the 'hyper-masculine'[153] Die Vernon are such powerful female figures that they can only be constrained within the paradigms of the conduct book through flagrant narrative subversions of their actions. In these characters we see resourceful, self-willed balladic heroines onto whom is superimposed the dutiful, accomplished literary heroine of Scott's own society. It is the conflict of type which here concerns us: how can the narrative both present these figures of autonomous female action and ensure their eventual acceptance as socially respectable ladies?

Rather than undermine Catherine Seyton's actions through repeated self-reflection and/or penitence, Scott makes use of three separate techniques to counter her 'forward

---

[153]Robert C. Gordon, *Under Which King? A Study of The Scottish Waverley Novels*, (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1969), p. 81.

bearing.' (382) The first is that she acts as she does out of duty to her family and to her monarch rather than as the result of a wilful (and therefore self-serving and unfeminine) nature. 'I am wholly subjected to my father; and the poor Queen is, for a long time, more likely to be dependent on the pleasure of the nobles of her party than possessed of power to control them.' (387) Second is the predominant characteristic of that family. Lady Lochleven describes them as 'murdering Seytons', and it is she who alleges that Catherine's demeanour alone 'would have reminded' her of Catherine's family had she forgotten it. (382) Clearly, Catherine cannot be held responsible for her inherited disposition. Finally, Scott makes use of the dramatic device of the male twin. The most 'unfeminine' actions believed to have been performed by Catherine (the tavern brawl, flirting shamelessly with Roland at the fair) are the work of her twin brother, Henry. Catherine cannot be rebuked for forwardness of action when she did not act at all. In making repeated use of these three techniques, Scott negates the involvement Catherine has in the plot to liberate Mary. As I will demonstrate, she is presented, as is Roland, as a passive assistant to the machinations of the Marian sympathisers rather than as an active co-conspirator.

The loyalty of the Seyton, or Seton family to the Marian cause is well documented; both in formal histories, and in a particularly well-known ballad, 'Mary Hamilton' (C 173). In the ballad, one of the Queen's Maries, Mary Hamilton, is executed for infanticide. Her lament from the gallows tells us 'Last nicht there was four Maries./The nicht there'l be but three;/ There was *Marie Seton*, and Marie Beton,/And Marie Carmichael, and me.'[154] (A text, emphasis mine) Scott, I would suggest, is conscious of this balladic Seton, and avoids making use of the spellings of the surname found in collected versions of the ballad. More significantly, given the tradition of the Queen's Maries, Scott avoids calling his ingenue after one of the Maries, and indeed avoids all connection between his Seyton, and the Seton/Seaton of the ballad. I would suggest that this is due to a desire on Scott's part to avoid any show of immorality and prodigality on the part of his ingenue. Scott's feelings toward and perceptions of Mary Stuart's morality, as discussed in chapter two above, would

---

[154]Child, III, pp. 379-99 (p. 385).

have influenced any portrayal of a courtier. In addition, the class associations of the oral tradition for Scott and his contemporaries would likely have affected perceptions of Catherine's conduct had she been explicitly associated with a balladic, older Scottish paradigm of female conduct. The extent to which Scott emphasises both Catherine's absence from Mary's court in the time preceding her imprisonment at Lochleven (when Mary's 'decadence' would have been at its height), and her filial duty in serving Mary further lead me to suggest that this is the case.

This familial approval for her involvement with Mary's cause gives Catherine a certain amount of latitude in her criticism of both her situation and her captors. Her primary duty, Scott repeatedly has Catherine remind Roland, is to her Queen, and she will do what must be done to aid her whether it is judged proper or not. Interestingly, the only significant criticisms Catherine's behaviour receives in the course of the novel are from women - Lady Lochleven, and Mary herself. One must question the strength of either in a society in which female authority has been entirely negated through Mary's (forced) abdication. Lady Lochleven's censure, alluded to above, places the blame, if blame there is, for Catherine's behaviour with her family. The validity of this complaint is immediately called into question when Lady Lochleven's allegiances in the civil war are added to her personal animosity toward Mary. Lady Lochleven's biting reminders of Mary's fall and its causes do little to win the sympathy of a readership who expected women to 'beware of detraction, especially where your own sex are concerned.'[155] Mary, as head of the society of which Catherine is part, is a potentially more severe critic, for she is the arbiter of conduct for all within the court at Lochleven, and as such should not be subject to an underling's censure. Given Scott's lack of sympathy for Mary's frivolity, it is not surprising that Catherine in turn reprimands her mistress. Scott ensures that the reader is aware of its validity through presentation of Catherine's thought process: 'How deep must the love of sarcasm be implanted in the breasts of us women, since the Queen, with all her sense, will risk ruin rather than rein in her wit.' (360) Mary's realisation that Catherine is right, indicated by a public rebuke which is subverted by her

---

[155] *The Young Lady's Parental Monitor*, p. 19.

asking Catherine's forgiveness 'in a low whisper', emphasises Scott's reliance on his contemporary, class-based perceptions of female reticence. (360)

Scott further takes care to justify Catherine's behaviour by calling her by her full name to emphasise her typically Seyton characteristics. Early in the period of Roland's service at Lochleven, Catherine recognises that she has not only to 'contend both with my father's lofty pride and with my mother's high spirit [...] and so I am wilful and saucy...' but also with her striking likeness to her twin; their mother having 'alleged it as a reason for destining thee to the veil, that, were ye both to go at large, thou wouldst surely get the credit for some of thy brother's mad pranks'. (256, 383) Here, Scott is not only establishing his use of the device of the twin, but is reminding his reader of the fact that the impetus for Catherine's actions is not her own, but that of the family to whom she owes obedience. As a result, she is not self-serving, but is instead self-less: deferring her desire for Roland out of duty to her Queen.

Unlike in a playscript, or in the theatre, where the convention of the heroine playing a trouser role is accepted and expected, Scott never actually tells his reader that it is Henry rather than Catherine in the tavern or at Kinross. Roland's perception of the resemblance between the siblings creates significant generic tension for the reader; at sixteen, there should be no doubt either physically, or through conduct, as to which is Henry and which Catherine.[156] I would suggest that in so doing, Scott is attempting another means of doubling his heroine, avoiding associations with a lower-class paradigm, and recalling for his reader the class associations of the Shakespearean sibling pairs.[157] There is nothing incorrect in Henry's behaviour in the tavern or in Kinross, for as a male, Henry has far greater freedom of word and deed than does his sister. Despite the generic and socially normative denotations of this scene, Scott takes this opportunity to place another self-subverting rebuke

---

[156]'Sexual maturity at the end of the sixteenth century would likely have been somewhere around age 12-13 in a temperate northern latitude.' Preston P. Williams, M.D., F.A.C.O.G., Associate Professor, Obstetrics and Gynecology, University of Minnesota Medical School, Director, Maternal-Fetal Medicine, Director, Prenatal Detection Program. Electronic Mail correspondence, 16 January, 1996.

[157]Note however, that there is never any stated intent of doubling, as there is in the theatre. Nor does Catherine ape her brother's manner, as does Viola in *Twelfth Night*.

in Catherine's mouth. .'The circumstance does indeed little honour to my *rustic manners* [...] since those of a wild young man were so readily mistaken for mine. But I shall grow wiser in time; and with that view I am determined not to think of your follies, but to *correct my own*.' (385, emphases mine) Note that Catherine's manners are 'rustic', a word which to a contemporary reader would connote less polished, more common - that is, of the folk. Note also that these manners need to be corrected, a wish which Scott seems to negate by having his ingenue wish, within the same scene, for her brother's sex and privileges. 'I would I could be Henry, with all a man's privileges, for one moment - I long to throw my plate at that confect of pride and formality and ill-nature.' (387) Scott again subverts Catherine's wish for privilege, for she does not wish to defend her Queen militarily, but to strike out against Lady Lochleven; to take the cat-fight to a physical level.

Despite family loyalties and characteristics, and a twin brother in whose adventures Catherine participates vicariously, she remains feminine. Resourceful, perceptive and vocal as ladies should not be (but as rustic, balladic heroines are), she is ultimately bound by the conventions of gender and class from initiating any action of significance except deceptions ordinarily practised by women - feigned illness as a result of Dryfesdale's treachery, for example. When the escape of the Queen from Lochleven is effected, it is Roland who acts despite Catherine's advance knowledge and involvement; party to his plan, she does nothing but allow it to affect her. By remaining in attendance on the Queen, however, Catherine spares herself the fate of her fanatic brother. In the end, she confines herself to what is now the domestic, feminine world of Mary, and will be rewarded with marriage. It is interesting to note that Catherine, like Rose Bradwardine, is rendered mute subsequent to the defeat of Mary's adherents. With the loss of her cause, Catherine has no further need of her enthusiastic and impertinent voice. With its loss, I would suggest, Catherine returns to the domestic passivity appropriate to her gender and social status from which circumstances alone removed her.

'Circumstances' are also to blame for Isabelle of Croye's rebellion against authority in *Quentin Durward*. As a Countess in her own right, she is unique among Scott's ingenues.

As Countess of Croye, Isabelle holds a traditionally masculine position of public power within her society. One might therefore expect Scott's presentation of her conduct to be comparable to that of his Queens Regnant, who occupy similar societal positions of power. Isabelle's flight 'from the pursuit of a hated lover, the favourite of an oppressive guardian, *who abused his feudal power*' is appropriate under the paradigm of feminine behaviour which Scott used in his representations of women of Isabelle's class. It is not marriage itself from which Isabelle flees, but from her liege's abuses of power. However correct this may be from the standpoint of benevolent Enlightened society, it remains in defiance of 'the *law* of the country and the *feudal tenure* of her estates.' (112, 127, emphasis mine) By those laws - the code of conduct for all in her society - Isabelle's action is punishable within that social context.[158] As I will demonstrate, Isabelle's acts of self-assertion are insignificant in the masculine power structure of medieval France.

Isabelle remains a pawn in the political chess game of Louis of France and Charles of Burgundy, as presented by Scott. Her acts of independence are those of the feminine sphere of romance and domesticity, suited to an ingenue, rather than those of politics suited to a Countess. Isabelle's ultimate submission to Charles's authority demonstrates clearly that for Scott, the paradigm of feminine passivity predominated in his perceptions and representations of women of a higher social standing. Louis's denial of the presence in France ('he hath not publicly received these ladies, nor placed them under the protection of his daughters') and subsequent eviction from France of the Ladies of Croye serves as a signifier of the extent to which women are powerless within this male-dominated society. (110) The arbitrary manner in which Charles ultimately rejects Isabelle's decision to renounce her lands to the Burgundian crown, 'we mean better for you than you have devised for yourself', demonstrates that here power predominates over benevolence. (417)

Isabelle is fully aware that Charles's only legitimate interest in her is that of a feudal lord, and reminds him that '[i]f you deprive me of my lands, you take away all that your ancestors' generosity gave, and you break *the only bonds which attach us* together. You

---

[158]cf. Marshall, p. 20.

gave not this poor and persecuted form, still less *the spirit which animates me*.' (442, emphases mine) The extent to which defiance of one who is both liege and guardian opposes normative standards of feminine conduct is indicated through the metaphor Scott uses to nullify this action: 'The rage and astonishment of the Duke can hardly be conceived, unless we could estimate the surprise of a falcon, against whom a dove should ruffle its pinions in defiance.' (442) The image itself provides a sense of the inevitable futility of Isabelle's action. The connotations of a dove, a bird whose iconographic significance is of peace, acting against anything much less against a bird of prey, serves to undermine the significance of Isabelle's defiance. Scott here assures his reader that this final rebellion, like that at the novel's outset, is atypical behaviour for his dove-like character. It is the result of an unenlightened ruler's attempt yet again to dispose of her person and lands to further his political machinations.

In her flight from and defiance of Charles's tyranny, Isabelle gains nothing, for she remains his ward on her return to Burgundy. What is significant about Scott's presentation is not his character's failure to achieve independence, but that she remains constant in her desire to escape from another's autocratic control despite this failure. In this, she represents the midpoint between Catherine Seyton who remains dutiful to father and to Queen despite her desires, and Diana Vernon who never fully submits to patriarchal authority. Unlike either Catherine or Diana, Isabelle is endeavouring to free herself from unreasonable constraints on her person and life. In the self-assertion of these acts, she is like a balladic heroine who precipitates the events in which she participates.[159]

Scott is careful throughout to ensure that her conduct remains close to that of his upper-class paradigm. In her conduct toward Quentin, and in her reactions to danger, Isabelle is almost hyper-feminine. In Liege, for example, she reacts to the assault on the Bishop's Palace by praying rather than by flight, and must be rescued by Quentin: 'a female figure, which had been kneeling in agonising supplication before the holy image, now *sunk at*

---

[159]Such can be seen, for example, in the heroines of: C 9, 'The Fair Flower of Northumberland', C 39 'Tam Lin' and C 53 'Young Beichan'. Child, I, pp. 111-18; pp. 335-58; pp. 454-83. In each instance, it is the actions of a woman which precipitate the events of their respective ballads.

length on the floor, under the new terrors implied in this approaching tumult.' (272-3, emphasis mine) Her feminine vapours vanish with the necessity of the flight from Liege. As with other of his assertive ingenues whose conduct pushes at the parameters of ladylike behaviour, Scott allows Isabelle explanation, then self-containment of her 'masculine firmness'. (297) He further undermines his subversion by having this explained away neither to Quentin, nor to the sympathetic courtier, Crèvecoeur, but in confidence to another maiden:

> Necessity, [...] necessity, my friend, is the mother of courage, as of invention. Not long time since, I might have fainted when I saw a drop of blood shed from a trifling cut - I have since seen life-blood flow around me [...] yet I have retained my senses and my self-possession. - Do not think it was an easy task. [...] Were my situation one whit less perilous than it is - were I not sensible that *my only chance to escape a fate more horrible than death*, is to retain my recollection and self-possession - Gertrude I would at this moment throw myself into your arms, and relieve my bursting bosom by such *a transport of tears and agony of terror*, as never rushed from a breaking heart! (297, emphases mine)

Because this confession is oral, and made to another woman, it carries far less authority than it would if made to a man. Gertrude is hardly in a position to advise Isabelle on her feminine duty of submission, being not only another woman, but of a lower class than is Isabelle.

After her return to Burgundy, and submission to patriarchal authority, Isabelle continues to assert her desires, but now does do circumspectly. She reads the Lady Hameline's letter to her friends, but 'did not think it necessary to recite a certain *postscript*'; her sin, if there is one, is that of omission. Scott acknowledges the action without any attempts at subversion. Instead, the narrator praises 'female wit [which] seldom fails in the contrivance of means.' (449) Note the change in description - 'masculine firmness' has given way to 'female wit' - because Isabelle is acting discreetly and for the benefit of her future husband: her actions, while self-interested, are not selfish. In emphasising that the change in his ingenue's character is the result of the rejection of one gendered characteristic for the adoption of another, Scott demonstrates his awareness of female circumvention of expected passive behaviours.

The Scott ingenue whose presentation has provoked the most pointed critical comment since her 1817 appearance is *Rob Roy*'s Diana Vernon. Across more than 150

years of commentary, her Catholicism, Jacobitism, and 'coarse and unnatural'[160] behaviour are the critics' primary foci. In most instances, it is not any one characteristic to which they object. It is instead 'that Die is simply too much - a devout Catholic, a self-sacrificing daughter, an active Jacobite, an ambitious bluestocking, a transvestite, a huntress, a romantic social critic. [...] Perhaps because there is so much in her requiring expression, her volubility is overwhelming. It is also *hyper masculine*.'[161] (emphasis mine) In his 1970 biography, *Sir Walter Scott: The Great Unknown*, Edgar Johnson qualifies such sentiments: 'Not that she is really a hoyden: unlike some of the equally uninhibited heroines of Restoration comedy, *she remains a lady*, neither coarse in conversation nor unchaste in conduct.' [162] (emphasis mine) Scott's portrayal of Diana demonstrates the result of his primary reliance on the paradigm of the ballad heroine in the creation of a character who is associated through her social status with the paradigm of the conduct book. Those actions which are 'too much' for Gordon - dressing as a man, riding to hunt with her cousins, speaking freely about her life - are those of many ballad heroines. The heroine of 'Child Waters' (C 63), for example, dresses as a man to follow her lover to his home: 'She's clade hersel in page array,/An after him ran she.'[163] In his presentation of Die Vernon, however, Scott does not make use of the same techniques of containment, but instead allows Diana's actions during Frank's narrative remembrance to stand without either self criticism, or the commentary of an omniscient narrator.[164]

In his analysis of Diana, Johnson has articulated the reason behind the success with the public of the overtly active heroines such as Die. They do remain ladies; adhering to

---

[160]'Nassau Senior surveys the novels, *Quarterly Review* 1821', in *Scott: The Critical Heritage*, ed. by John O. Hayden, (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970), pp. 215-55 (p. 221).

[161]Gordon, p. 81.

[162]Johnson, I, p. 608.

[163]Child, II, pp. 83-100 (p. 88).

[164]Dianne Dugaw's *Warrior Women and Popular Balladry: 1650-1850* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989), discusses the power of these cross-dressing ballad heroines at length. Her comparison of the early 'Female Warrior' ballads with those of the early nineteenth century details the type of transformation Die Vernon undergoes in *Rob Roy*, 'The matter of fact and robust language of the earlier ballads [...] was replaced by a vocabulary and tone of increasing delicacy and constraint. [...] a transformation of the Female Warrior heroine [...] from a virago to a suffering helpmate.' (67)

those standards of behaviour associated with feminine passivity. *Rob Roy*'s narrator attempts to establish Diana within the tradition of female domesticity prior to his presentation of his tale. Exculpations of this character's conduct must be questioned given that the narrator is not the omniscient, neutral one of the other Waverley novels. Instead, *Rob Roy* is the reminiscence of its protagonist, Frank Osbaldistone, whose grief for his wife, ('You know how I lamented her; but you do not - cannot know, how much she deserved her husband's sorrow') is hardly likely to make his an unambiguous narrative voice. Wives deserving of their husband's sorrow will not have acted in a manner which could be considered 'unladylike'; 'dressing provocatively or immodestly', for example.[165] (*RR* 446) That Scott's hurried ending contains a nod of approval from the voice of the social norm, Frank's Protestant, Hanoverian father, serves briefly to absolve Diana for those activities Frank revealed were those of his 'deserving wife'. Despite her Catholicism and Jacobitism, Diana 'cannot but prove a good wife' because she has been 'so dutiful a daughter'. (446) In this one paragraph, Scott assures his reader that despite her actions, Diana is not beyond hope - she is sufficiently obedient to be forgiven her active Jacobitism, her Catholicism, and her outspokenness.

Even within the schema of active Scott heroines, Diana is unorthodox. Unlike Amy Robsart or Catherine Seyton, who merely wish in passing to be male and able to free themselves from the constraints placed upon their behaviour solely because of gender, Diana expresses her dissatisfaction with these constraints quite openly. It is, in fact, the first of three things for which she says she is to be pitied: 'I am a girl, and not a young fellow, and would be shut up in a mad-house, if I did half the things that I have a mind to;-and that, if I had your happy prerogative of acting as you list, would make all the world mad with imitating and applauding me'. Frank's quite logical reply is that this misfortune does afflict half the population, and that '"the other half" - "Are so much better cared for, that they are jealous of their prerogatives"'. (139) Not only does Diana here comment directly upon the inequality of the sexes to a man with whom she is merely acquainted, but she then rebukes Frank for

---

[165]Poovey, p. 20.

attempting to placate her by complimenting her on the status afforded her as a woman.[166] Significantly, there is neither narrative nor self-subversion in this scene. Diana is aware of her unorthodox behaviour, and comments upon it without excuses. This lack of moral judgement serves to indicate still further Diana's balladic roots. Had Scott intended her to reflect the conduct book paradigm, she, like the rebellious Lady Emily in Susan Ferrier's *Marriage*, would be criticised within the narrative by one whose moral standards are unquestionable.

When Frank refuses to take Die's advice and flee to Scotland, she accompanies him to the home of Justice Inglewood despite his intimation that 'it is not proper, scarcely even delicate, in you to go with me on such an errand as I am now upon.' (115) Such direct criticism of other of the assertive ingenues causes them to voice regret for their actions, or engage in other appropriately 'feminine' behaviour. The only textual indication that Diana felt Frank's rebuke is a 'slight blush crossing her haughty brow.' (115) As discussed above, there is much emphasis placed on the beauty of a young woman's blushes by the authors of the conduct books. That this blush is not of embarrassed modesty, but is instead of an anger to which Diana as woman and moral preceptress is not entitled by the standards of the conduct book, is indicated both by the location of that blush, and the adjective used to describe her brow. The matter-of-factness in Diana's ability to adapt, like a man, to the pressures and requirements of a given situation without concern for the strictures of her social position is more reminiscent of, for example, Suzy Pye helping her lover escape from prison and following him to Britain than it is of the heroine of a novel who swoons when events overwhelm her. Diana's highly unfeminine level of activity continues until she is again under her father's supervision. However, her defiance of normative feminine conduct continues, for she appears in 'such a masculine dress' -which *she* excuses by saying that 'things must be as they may.' (378)

---

[166]cf. Poovey, pp. 15-23 for discussion of eighteenth century views of female power, and male control of that power. I would suggest that this is to what Scott has reference in Die and Frank's discussion.

Diana remains unique among other ingenues whose actions are sanctioned by patriarchal authority, for she overtly defies society's conventions of female conduct in carrying out her filial duty. Her submission to her father's will creates narrative tension between the paradigms of female activity and that of passivity which appears unreconcilable. In Diana's circumvention of her father's authority, Scott resolves this tension somewhat. Rather than acting overtly, Diana utilises others as the agency of her desire, or waits until her father's death gives her autonomy to exercise her desire for freedom from the convent. What must be remembered when considering Scott's presentation of Die Vernon is that she is cognisant of and articulates her flagrant defiance of the conventions of patriarchal society, and is unconcerned about its inevitable consequences.

I would suggest that her incarceration in the convent at novel's end is an eventuality of which she has been aware since her first conversation with Frank. His description of those women placed in convents against their will, and Diana's reply to it are vaguely reminiscent of the dove/falcon metaphor quoted above. According to Frank, these women 'are like imprisoned singing-birds [...] condemned to wear out their lives in confinement, which they try to beguile by the exercise of accomplishments which would have adorned society had they been left at large.' Diana's response indicates both an awareness of herself and of her fate unusual in Scott ingenues. "'I *shall be*", returned Miss Vernon - "that is," said she *correcting herself* - "*I should be* rather like the wild hawk, who, barred the free exercise of his soar throughout heaven, will dash himself to pieces against the bars of his cage.'" (94, emphases mine) The change in tense, well before the most outré of Diana's actions, indicates her awareness, and pragmatic acceptance of her fate. Note too the genders of the songbirds and hawk. The former is clearly female, while the latter is male. The contrast between the two descriptions is both an indicator of Diana's individuality, and of Scott's awareness of the place held by women in his society. Diana, by her own admission, would have no tolerance for confinement, either within a convent, or within a society which demanded the free-flying hawk be a docile songbird. In creating Diana Vernon, Scott relied on the paradigm of the active ballad heroine. Her activity and articulation of her social identity associate her with an

oral tradition which, while a part of Scotland's Jacobite past, was in Scott's perception the province of the lower classes. Her social status dissociates Diana from the paradigm on which Scott relied in her creation: consequently, he must associate her with the standards of the conduct book, whatever narrative tensions it creates.

Unlike Austen's Elizabeth Bennet, or Emma Woodhouse, whose 'taming' is a gradual process, Diana's suddenly dutiful submission to male dominance is as abrupt as the novel's conclusion; and is equally unsatisfying. Unfortunately, Scott was as bound by the constraints of literary convention as are his ingenues by those of polite society. There is no Rose Bradwardine to Diana's Flora MacIvor who can provide an alternative, and more acceptable wife for his hero. Given that the alternative to marriage for an obedient Scott ingenue is one which Diana has deemed intolerable, Scott has no option open to him but the one he took. Diana's death subsequent to her childless marriage to Frank ensures that both she and those beliefs which are inconsistent with Scott's schema of a Protestant, Hanoverian, literate society will 'Die', leaving no legacy except an old man's memories.

There is great variety of presentation in the Scott ingenues who are found at the extremes of inaction and assertion. They are more than possessed of the 'glimmer of identity'[167] with which Mrs. Oliphant rightly credits them, and do not deserve the cursory inspection given them by critics who deem them 'either pink and white toys or hardish women of the world'[168]. As I have demonstrated, Scott had a greater understanding of the ambiguous position of women in his society than he has previously been credited with. Those ingenues at the extremes of action and inaction illustrate Scott's awareness of the expectations placed on young women of the upper-middle and upper-classes to adhere to a paradigm of feminine behaviour found in the conduct books.

In his presentations of Rowena and Rose Bradwardine, Scott relies wholly on the paradigm of the conduct book. As a result, Rowena is wholly self-less: her identity is the creation of others' perceptions of the social position she should occupy. With Rose

---

[167]'Mrs. Oliphant to the Defence', Hayden, pp. 432-39 (p. 435).
[168]'Scott As Man of Letters', Hayden, pp. 481-98 (p. 493).

Bradwardine Scott is able to refer to, if not utilise fully, the paradigm of the active ballad heroine, although he must elide the tradition of female Jacobite activity to ensure her acceptability as Waverley's wife. While giving Rose greater initiative, Scott ensures that her acts are performed for others: like Rowena, she is self-less.

Both Rebecca and Flora MacIvor are identified with a cause outwith those of the home and family which, according to the conduct-book's dictates, are the acceptable concerns of woman. Their loyalties to these causes represent a passion which is perceived as a threat to the male-dominated societies in which they live. Of the two, Rebecca's humanistic Judaism serves as criticism of Norman society, rather than as a threat to its continuation. That Flora is able to stay in England until after Fergus's execution is yet another elision of history by Scott in his presentation of Jacobite women. Unlike Rebecca, her creed is political. She must therefore be removed from the society to which she is not only a moral threat, but a political one.

Scott made the greatest use of balladic paradigm and allusion in his creation of Amy Robsart and Lucy Ashton. Because the women on whom these characters were based died tragically, Scott is able to deviate from the expected reward of marriage for the proper lady. Consequently, these characters can act selfishly. Scott need not subsume their identities in idealisations, or ideologies. Even here, however, the class-based expectations of feminine conduct which were part of his perception of womanhood predominate in the end.

This balancing act between paradigms becomes more difficult for Scott in his presentations of the most forward ingenues for whom he must either resort to devices like a twin brother or a sudden selflessness where self-interest was the rule to excuse such behaviour. Catherine Seyton is not only given a twin brother to do all that Scott believes inappropriate for a 'lady', but is deliberately dissociated from the Marian court as a means of ensuring perceptions of her moral integrity. Scott deliberately subverts Isabelle of Croye's actions throughout *Quentin Durward* until in the end, her masculine firmness cedes ground to feminine wit. Unlike the other ingenues, Scott never subverts Diana Vernon's actions. She

remains self-governed and self-directed throughout *Rob Roy*: her active Jacobitism allowing Scott to perceive her as aligned with the balladic paradigm of female autonomy.

Not every ingenue in the Waverley novels is either a list of accomplishments or a self-subverting participant in the events of the novel in question, and it is to this group of moderate ingenues that we will now turn.

Chapter 4:

Political Pawns, or Moderate Manipulators

As demonstrated in the preceding chapter, there are those among the Waverley heroines whose actions Scott feels the need to subvert as a means of ensuring their reflection of the paradigm of female deportment to which a woman of comparable class in Scott's day would have adhered. These obvious subversions indicate most clearly Scott's awareness of the constraints placed on female conduct by the changes in morés which resulted from the increasing anglicisation of Scottish society and the development of class identity within that society.

The parameters established by the strictures of the conduct books on appropriate feminine behaviour forced Scott to discover means of varying his characterisation(s) of the 'ingenue' within these external limits. Given such proscriptions, that comment by Scott which serves to invalidate the significance of an ingenue's participation in the events of the novel's history are as significant as the actions themselves, for they represent an awareness on the part of the male author (and narrative voice) of the indirect nature of feminine interaction with public, male society. However, Scott could not, and did not keep his female characters totally divorced from all contact with the male province of history. As I have discussed in chapter three above, this positioning does not ensure participation in events - Flora MacIvor's attachment to the Jacobite cause remains anachronistically intellectual, for example. What is of concern with the ingenues whose behaviour is neither the passivity of the conduct book paradigm nor the autonomy of the oral tradition is the extent to which their interaction with the novel's 'historic' events determines the balance Scott strikes between the female autonomy of the older tradition, and the female passivity of the new.

We have seen that fully autonomous action, motivated by individual belief, can lead to death or to an exile for the Scott ingenue. In the instances discussed in the previous chapter, those ingenues who are not given the traditional female reward of marriage either are firmly allied to their respective causes - above all domestic concerns - or undertake the courses of action they do out of a personal (and therefore self-serving, and unfeminine) motivation. The ingenues discussed here do not interact with the novel's historic events as a result of such motivations, however. Instead, their courses of action are determined by family allegiances and paternal decisions which place them in contact with 'events' rather than leaving them in their domestic place. Here too, we see the spectrum of covert/overt action which characterised the 'extreme' ingenues, although in this instance, the level of action/interaction with the novel's events has more to do with the nature of the character's relationship with the men whose allegiances bring the ingenue into contact with 'history' than with willing participation on the ingenue's part. Those moderate ingenues who are not willingly participants in the events in question act covertly to serve their own aims. In such cases, however, the figure of legitimate authority is aware of, and indeed tacitly approves of, such action and the ingenue's defiance goes unpunished. Those who are able to act overtly do so with patriarchal approval. When history trespasses on the domestic sphere, where female authority is unquestioned, the Scott ingenue is allowed to act; balancing between the paradigms of conduct book and the ballad in demeanour and action.

In addition to enquiring as to the means with which this group of ingenues interacts with the 'history' of their respective novels, it is important to determine the manner in which Scott presents such interaction. Are there instances of subversion, as with Rose Bradwardine's reluctant correspondence with the Chevalier, or does Scott allow the actions undertaken to pass unremarked upon? If this is the case, the question which logically follows is why Scott should adopt this narrative structure. Other characters of comparable age, class, and position within the schema of the novel are whitewashed by their creator into acceptability when they exceed the limits of expected feminine conduct. Do these ingenues'

actions remain entirely within the bounds of the conduct books' model, or has Scott here balanced idealised demeanour with circumstantially appropriate action?

I would suggest that the latter is, in fact, the case. In each instance, the society in operation within the novel has deviated from 'normalcy' through some form of unrest. The rules under which these societies operate are, therefore, suspended to an extent which allows greater freedom of voice and action on the part of the ordinarily subdued ingenues. What concerns us here is Scott's presentation of this suspension. Are the actions of the ingenues as their domestic worlds collide with the ordinarily male province of political upheaval such that they can return to full participation within that society when 'normalcy' is restored, or are they involved to such an extent that they are threatened with exile or death?

Political Pawns

Where Lilias Redgauntlet and Edith Bellenden differ from the 'conduct-book perfect', passive ingenues discussed in the last chapter, is in the awareness given them by Scott of the potential consequences of their action(s). Their actions are as circumspect as any of the wholly ladylike ingenues, but are not performed in isolation. Their willingness actively to enlist the aid of others to achieve their aims sets them apart. It is significant to note that this pair enlist only those whose loyalty (and, therefore, discretion) is unquestioned. Never do they place themselves in a situation which can be considered at all inappropriate: where such is a consideration, as I will demonstrate, they, and their creator, extricate themselves immediately. In so doing, Scott allows these ingenues to utilise their positions to effect, or to endeavour to effect, changes in those aspects of fictionalised history which enter their domestic sphere. Lilias's concerns are wholly for her brother, and Edith's are for her beloved; neither has the potential to ally the ingenue with a political cause such that she is unable to participate in the society created at novel's end.

Scott's presentation of Lilias makes her rejection of Redgauntlet's Jacobitism quite clear. In so doing, he subverts her most outré actions prior to their occurrence. There is no need to resort to devices such as Rose Bradwardine's 'fear and trembling' which accompany

those actions which are historically appropriate for a Jacobite; Lilias is living in a constructed society which views such actions as the norm rather than as the exception.[169] In this she is like Rowena, acting according to the morés of a man so enamoured of his political ideology that he has lost touch with the realities and expectations of his society. As a pawn in Hugh Redgauntlet's schemes, Lilias is forced to act in a manner which is as repugnant to her as it is to the normative realities outwith Redgauntlet's demneses. With the dissolution of her uncle's hopes for a Stewart restoration, Lilias is free to return to a 'real' society with whose moral standards her own are in agreement.

It is interesting to note that, unlike the heroine in the 'Highland Laddie' tradition, whose crossing of Forth and Tay, and departure from 'Dundee and Edinborrow' represents a rejection of Lowland, and therefore Hanoverian/Union life, Lilias's marriage to Alan, and the place within Edinburgh society which such represents finalises her repudiation of the Jacobite (and, within the Scott schema, Highland[170]) tenets of her family. While not explicitly referred to within the text, the inversion of the traditional journey, from England to Scotland (and within Scotland from Lowland to Highland), to one from Scotland to England serves further to underscore the futility of Redgauntlet's aspirations, and to validate Lilias's actions in defiance of them. Throughout the Scottish Waverley novels, Scott takes care to emphasise the positive qualities which Scotland and the Scots can contribute to Britain.[171] Redgauntlet's attempt to upset political stability is non-viable, and not what loyal Scots wish to contribute to British society; as demonstrated by the solitary adherence to the Prince by Hugh Redgauntlet at novel's end. I would suggest that this abandonment of the cause by all but the most fanatic is reflective of historians' elisions of the political efficacy of Jacobitism in Scott's day, rather than in the era of the novel's setting.[172]

---

[169]See my discussion of Jacobite women supra for clarification of this assertion.

[170]Among Scott's Jacobites, only Redgauntlet has no ties to the Highlands. His Jacobitism is Francophile, and in the political environment of the 1750's, far more treasonous. cf. Frank McLynn, *Crime and Punishment in Eighteenth Century England*, (London and New York: Routledge, 1989), pp. 123, 134, 156-63, 274.

[171]See my discussions of Margaret Ramsay, Meg Dods, and *The Heart of Midlothian*, pp. 160-8, 242-5, 247-77, below for expansion of this point.

[172]McLynn notes that Jacobitism was only one of two crimes of 'high treason' on the English statute books. This is hardly the non-threatening cause presented by Scott in *Redgauntlet*, whose adherents were a fanatic, two aged Catholic spinsters, and reluctant nobles.

Scott repeatedly ensures that the reader understand that Lilias has been 'obliged to move by the will of others, and to be in places which I would by my own will gladly avoid.' (*R* 139-40) Despite this established passivity, from her first appearance as the mysterious Green Mantle, Lilias's opposition to her uncle's attempts to gain control over Darsie is clear. I would suggest that Owen Dudley Edwards's assertion that 'there is little more to Lilias Redgauntlet than her green mantle, and the main value of that seems to have been to inspire John Buchan',[173] fails to take account of the older, Scottish, and Jacobitical traditions which Lilias's few actions invert and reject. It is not that there is nothing to Lilias Redgauntlet, but that what there is has to be an inversion, a negation of what she appears to be. For all that she seems to be an active Jacobite, Lilias privately rejects the tenets of her upbringing, and makes herself a North Briton:

> Freedom of religious opinion brings on, I suppose, freedom of political creed; for I had no sooner renounced the Pope's infallibility than I began to question the doctrine of hereditary and indefeasible right. In short, strange as it may seem, I came out of a Parisian convent, not indeed an instructed Whig and Protestant, but with as much inclination to be so as if I had been bred up, like you, within the Presbyterian sound of Saint Giles's chimes. (361)

In this statement, Scott ensures that he states explicitly that Lilias's decision to reject Catholicism and Jacobitic Divine Right is a reasoned one. More to the point, she is not adopting the Episcopalian, Tory sympathies of many Scots Jacobites, but is instead a Presbyterian and Whig. Scott uses Lilias's rejection of the Jacobite cause and its associations with Scotland's social past, to demonstrate the futility of this cause, and the character's narrative associations with Scotland's North British present and future.

In her recital to Darsie of the particulars surrounding her upbringing at her uncle's hands, Scott quite clearly illustrates Lilias's political awareness. She is not, like Flora MacIvor, a willing participant in the Jacobites' plots. Instead, she tells her brother, and the reader, of the 'romantic and resolved nature of his [Hugh Redgauntlet] character ...[and] of his rashness and enthusiasm.' (362) Her assistance in 'challenging' George III at his coronation is undertaken out of a 'presence of mind' which results from a conviction that

---

[173]Owen Dudley Edwards, 'Scott as Contemporary Historian', in *Sir Walter Scott: The Long-Forgotten Melody,* ed. by Alan Bold, (London: Vision Press 1983), pp. 65-90 (p. 79).

'disobedience on my part would lead to some wild explosion.' (366) Note the differences in description of Redgauntlet and his niece in this interchange. Redgauntlet is described in a traditionally feminine manner as romantic, rash and enthusiastic while Lilias is possessed of a rational presence of mind. She can be carried along by the Jacobites' plans, but I would suggest that because Lilias's character is in toto a deliberate repudiation of the 'expected' standards of feminine conduct for a Jacobite woman, she is not possessed of the nerve to carry out plans of 'too bold exertion'. (370)

Were she able so to do, of course, Lilias would be as extreme in her behaviour as are all of the silenced ingenues. It is not insignificant that Lilias's flight from the Fairfords' home in Brown's Square is entirely the result of her confusion of Alan and his father. The 'particular situation' which she describes is not her fear of Redgauntlet, for were that the case, she would never have attempted the meeting. (93) Instead, it is that she believes 'Mr. A Fairford [to have] the character of a respectable elderly man' and as such, her contact with him will not give the impression of flirtatiousness which her contact with his son does.[174] (92-3) This is the only action undertaken by Lilias which can possibly be considered unladylike, and much care is given by Scott to ensure that Lilias is recognised to be possessed of 'women's qualifications' such that '[t]here can be no fault found to her manners or sentiments'. (376)

I would suggest that Scott takes care to ensure that Lilias is appropriately qualified as a wife for Alan because she has been raised as an active Jacobite, and has, on one occasion, acted in a manner which cannot be excused either by her uncle's dictates or by knowledge of her relationship with Darsie. Going to Brown's Square unaccompanied

---

[174]The need for young women to maintain a delicacy in matters of the heart is one which is mentioned repeatedly in the conduct books of Scott's era. *The New Female Instructor, or Young Woman's Guide to Domestic Happiness,* (London: Thos. Kelly, 1834; repr. London: Rosters, 1988) makes explicit the point that the young lady must 'have a care on how you presume on the innocence of your first intentions'. (57) I would suggest that Lilias's flight is the result of such a presumption being found to be incorrect. cf. Mary Poovey, *The Proper Lady and the Woman Writer: Ideology as Style in the Works of Mary Wollstonecraft, Mary Shelley, and Jane Austen*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1984), p. 25; and Nancy Armstrong, *Desire and Domestic Fiction: A Political History of the Novel*, (New York and Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987), p. 66. Both authors note that modesty is central to a woman's character, Poovey noting that 'a woman's situation, her reputation, or her countenance could dramatically *mis*represent her character.'

(whatever the dictates of circumstance) has the potential to make Lilias unladylike in the eyes of the reader. The interference of her uncle in the familial concerns which should be Lilias's are what ultimately justify her deviation from the normative standards of feminine behaviour. Redgauntlet's usurpation of his nephew's rights, and his kidnapping of both niece and nephew make his authority over both void. Anything done by Lilias to safeguard, or to attempt to safeguard her brother is, by that same standard, justifiable: as her family's moral arbiter, it is her duty to keep him from their uncle's influence.[175] The political fanaticism of her uncle has impacted upon her world such that she is able to act for others, but she must remain passive - a pawn in his manipulations - to further distance herself from 'inappropriate' female activity associated both with Jacobitism and with a Scottish past. Despite Redgauntlet's lack of legitimate patriarchal authority over Lilias, Scott takes care that she articulates to Redgauntlet her appropriately feminine desire to 'be your attendant and your comforter in exile.' (446) Lilias's rejection of Redgauntlet's teachings, however passively rebellious, are a recognition of their invalidity. I would suggest that Lilias's desire to accompany Redgauntlet into exile which contravenes her stated opinions of him is a reflection of the tensions in Scott's characterisation of Lilias between competing codes of feminine duty: duty to patriarchy and duty to reason. In the end, it is the latter duty which predominates: the operative code of conduct for the society in which Lilias will be placed is that of reason. Scott repeatedly provides his reader with indicators of parallels between Lilias's actions and the paradigm of conduct-book femininity which sanctions female power over the family.

Unlike Lilias, Edith Bellenden's actions in the political arena are not the result of a rejection of archaic, fanatical tenets as a means to ensure the future of her family, but are motivated solely by concern for the man she loves. While such is precisely the motivation given the actions of the wholly ladylike ingenues discussed above, Edith differs from these characters both in the extent to which she makes use of others in facilitating her actions, and

---

[175]cf. Armstrong, p. 90 for summary and discussion of the pervasiveness, and awareness of the power given woman as man's moral arbiter in late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth century writings.

in the extent to which the participation of others ensures that she remains, to appearances at least, passive and genteel.

Often, Scott provides the first clues to a character's personality through physiognomy. With Edith, what he initially presents, and the actions he is later required to subvert, are wholly opposed to each other. Scott's description of Miss Bellenden is, as I have discussed elsewhere, remarkably similar to that of Rowena: 'cast of features, soft and feminine, yet not without a certain expression of playful archness which *redeemed their sweetness from the charge of insipidity* sometimes brought against blondes and blue-eyed beauties.' (*OM* 32, emphasis mine) This redemption should serve as notice to the reader that Edith's personality, while soft and feminine, is not restricted by these characteristics into a conduct book-based, romanticised version of womanhood.

Despite having given this notice to the alert reader, Scott still undermines the initiative given Edith by repeated fainting fits. I count at least four fits of vapours, all of them occurring after moments of emotional turmoil. While these can be construed as a mode of female empowerment through exploitation of expected feminine conduct, I would suggest that it is not, in this instance. Only one of the four serves to influence masculine conduct, while the other three are reaction to an emotional shock.[176] Rather than being a means of directing the course of events indirectly, I would suggest that Edith's emotional sensitivity has to do with the tensions between old and new social norms which result from the religious and political allegiances of the Bellenden family. Edith's Episcopalian practices mark her as a proto-Jacobite to a knowledgeable reader.[177] Scott must make her hyper-feminine to counteract those moments of potential action; Edith's upbringing in a matriarchal household of Stewart adherents associates her more closely with a tradition of female political activity than is advisable in one whose class associates her with the standards of the anglicised 'North Britain' of Scott's day.

---

[176]cf. *Old Mortality*, pp. 137, 149, 240, 367. Only that on p. 149 prompts Evandale's intercession with Claverhouse on Morton's behalf.

[177]cf. Murray G. H. Pittock, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity 1638 to the Present,* (London and New York: Routledge, 1991), pp. 1-24.

Scott takes care, however, that Edith's interaction with and manipulations of circumstance centre solely upon Henry Morton; in this she is like Rose Bradwardine, another potentially active Jacobite woman. Morton's arrest and confinement at Tillietudlem places his political activity under the province of Edith's domestic concerns. Edith's visit to the imprisoned Morton allows Scott the opportunity to demonstrate the political awareness of a range of people in the volatile society of 1679: the political and the domestic here interact. Note that while Edith resolves to visit Morton for 'if he should die, I will die with him' it is her maidservant, Jenny, whose statement of the political realities ('these are not days to ask what's right or what's wrang; if he were as innocent as the new-born infant, they would find some way of making him guilty if they liked') provides the impetus for Edith's resolution. (110) Note too that it is Jenny who reminds Edith of the limitations of her social position:

> *Our young leddy at the feet o' Trooper Tam [...] that will never do*; but what maun be maun be, and I'll never desert a true-love cause - And sae, if ye maun see young Milnwood, though I ken nae gude it will do but make baith your hearts the sairer, I'll e'en tak the risk o't, [...] but *ye maun let me hae my ain gate*, and no speak ae word[...] (110, emphases mine)

While an inappropriate action to take, Edith merely *plans* the visit to the prisoner. Jenny's rebuke, and subsequent acceptance of the responsibility for the situation, absolve Edith of any responsibility for the *action*. It is Jenny who flirts her way past Trooper Tam, and Jenny who suggests the means of effecting Morton's escape. Despite this, however, Scott states explicitly Edith's change of mood once in the room where Morton is held:

> Edith, as *if modesty had quelled the courage* which despair had bestowed, stood about a yard from the door, without having either the power to speak or to advance. All the plans of aid, relief, or comfort, which she had proposed to lay before her lover, seemed at once to have vanished from her recollection, and left only a painful chaos of ideas, with which was mingled a *little fear that she had degraded herself in the eyes of Morton by a step which might appear precipitate and unfeminine*. (114, emphases mine)

Edith has, until now, displayed the initiative of the ballad heroine,[178] while being prevented from acting by Jenny. I would suggest that even this initiative has the potential to alienate a

---

[178]cf. '53. Young Beichan', *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, ed. by Francis James Child, 5 vols (New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 1882-98; repr. New York: Dover, 1965), I, pp. 454-83, whose heroine aids Beichan's escape from her father's dungeon. Suzy has no Jenny Dennison to remind her of her place, and it is she rather than her servant who 'bribed her father's men/Wi meikle goud and white money/She has gotten the key o the prison doors.' (p. 464)

readership used to wholly passive maidens. The tensions between the need for female activity in the narrative, and the standard of passivity expected by Scott's audience produces a narrative of action by proxy.

Certainly, Scott ensures that the alert reader is aware of *Edith's* awareness of the potential for her actions to be perceived as inappropriate. Her letter to her uncle - a second indirect attempt to facilitate Morton's release - is filled with polite enquiries whose answers she knows, as a means to send her uncle word of Morton's arrest. 'The gout? why, she knows I have not had a fit since Candlemas - [...] Paduasoy and hanging-sleeves? why, hang the gipsy herself! [...] was it worth while to send an express and wake me at five in the morning for all this trash? - But what says her postscriptum?' (122) In seeking her uncle's assistance, Edith not only has returned to a traditionally female means of communication, but has placed the impetus for action in a man's control. In so doing, Scott contains any residual impression of unfeminine conduct in his characterisation of Edith.

This is not to say that Edith reverts to a lack of awareness of the politics of her age with Morton's removal from Tillietudlem. The continued impact of the masculine domain of politics and war on the feminine domain of the house, presented via the siege of Tillietudlem, gives Scott the means to present another facet of his fictionalised history. While Morton is effecting the evacuation of Tillietudlem, Edith has the opportunity to speak privately with him. Over the course of this discussion, she criticises the Covenanters for their actions, to the point of assigning blame to one side, 'the guilt must lie with them who first drew the sword; as, in an affray, law holds those to be the criminals who are the first to have recourse to violence.' (281) Here, we see Edith exhibiting a knowledge of the law which is highly unusual in a non-property owning woman. Scott never openly subverts this statement of guilt, however, for the politics of the age have impacted significantly upon Edith's domestic concerns, and she is entitled to some opinion thereof. However, I would suggest that Edith's relation of the rebellion wholly to its impact upon her family and upon Morton's character in and of itself allows this legal knowledge to pass without comment. The fact that this discussion presents the opportunity for Edith to criticise Morton for his participation (serving

the traditional, and acceptable, role of woman as moral arbiter) does undermine Edith's political commentary somewhat. Scott further subverts this by having his ingenue entreat her erring lover to '[lend] his efforts to restore the blessings of peace to his distracted countrymen, and to induce the deluded rebels to lay down their arms' after Morton has already pledged so to do. (282) Scott then discredits Edith's political knowledge still further by having her confess that she is 'but a girl [...] and I scarce can think on the subject without presumption.' (282)

At this point, I would suggest, the lady (and her creator) doth protest too much. She is hardly 'but a girl' as she claims. 'Civil feuds and domestic prejudices' affect Edith's actions throughout *Old Mortality*. (285) She, as I have demonstrated, acts and reacts according to these events because they have significantly involved her domestic world. In creating an ingenue whose actions are tempered by social position, but whose awareness of events and of their implications resembles that of an active ballad heroine, I would suggest that Scott has here begun to find a balance between the extremes of action and inaction, between the paradigms of the ballad heroine and conduct book ideal, discussed in chapter three. Edith's actions, like those of Lilias Redgauntlet, are driven as much by circumstance as by independence of belief. There are, however, those Scott ingenues whose actions, driven more by strength of will than by circumstance, are not subverted by their creator. It is these ingenues I have termed 'moderate manipulators'.

Moderate Manipulators

It is interesting to note that unlike other of the moderate ingenues, Julia Mannering has a potential rival for affections of the hero. To ensure her suitability as Harry Bertram's bride, Scott must therefore make her a rigid adherent to the conduct-book-inspired tradition of feminine behaviour, or subvert her actions to such an extent that they are all but forgotten. I would suggest that because Julia Mannering was not allied through her family to the Stewart/Jacobite cause, Scott did not have this subtext which he could utilise as a means of

circumventing the paradigm of female passivity.[179] This has a not insignificant effect on the modes of discourse employed by Scott for this ingenue.

Julia seems at first to be cut from the mould of the so-called dark heroine. Taking Scott's reliance on physiognomy as an indicator of personality, the reader is informed that Julia is possessed of 'piercing dark eyes [...which] corresponded with the vivacity and intelligence of features, in which were blended a little haughtiness and a little bashfulness, a great deal of shrewdness, and some power of humorous sarcasm'. (*GM* 138) More significant for our purposes is the fact that a description of Julia's character is given first by her father's friend, Arthur Mervyn. In his correspondence, the reader learns that: Julia is a headstrong young woman, 'passiveness [...] is no part of her character' and that in this she 'is very like a certain friend of mine; she has a quick and lively imagination, and keen feelings, which are apt to exaggerate both the good and evil they find in life.' (118-19) She is, in other words, more like her father than her mother, more like a man than a woman in force of will. In giving this description to a father-figure in discussion of Julia's affections, Scott negates much of the 'intentional impropriety' of Julia's trysts with Brown/Bertram. (117) After all, 'although parental authority can never be justified in constraining a daughter to marry against her will, there are many cases in which it may be justified in requiring her to pause.'[180]

Julia's secret contact with Brown/Bertram is further explained away by Scott using another standard complaint of the conduct books; the evils of novel reading. Interestingly, it is not Julia's consumption of novels which unduly influences her, but her mother's. The significance of this is clear - it is Julia's will more than her mother's indulgence in 'one species of writings which obtains from a considerable portion of the female sex a reception much more favourable that is afforded to other kinds of composition more worthy of encouragement'[181] which keeps her virtue intact. Scott's narrative asides on the subject of

---

[179]See my discussions of Lilias Redgauntlet and Edith Bellenden, above, and Alice Lee below, for analysis of Scott's balance between old and new norms of female behaviour. My discussions of Flora MacIvor, Catherine Seton, and Die Vernon in chapter three above discuss less balanced uses of these traditions in characterisations.

[180]Thomas Gisborne, M.A., '*An Enquiry into the Duties of the Female Sex*', (London: Cadell & Davies, 1797), p. 241.

[181]*The New Female Instructor,* p. 47.

Mrs. Mannering confirm Julia's 'natural good sense and principle' while underscoring Mrs. Mannering's 'folly' and errors in perception. (125)

It is, I think, not insignificant that Julia's greatest commentary on events in *Guy Mannering* comes through the correspondence she keeps with her friend Matilda. This is, after all, an acceptable literary mode of female discourse. As a result, Julia is given greater opportunity to affect our perceptions of her character than she might otherwise have been. Initially, those extracts do little but reinforce the impression that she is what Mervyn believes her to be; 'a simple romantic Miss'. (123) The self-recognition which occurs in her correspondence with Matilda is sufficient to demonstrate that, had she a cause other than her relationship with Brown/Bertram, she would be a dangerously headstrong woman indeed. Unlike Lucy Bertram, Julia does not leave the front of the house during the smugglers' attack, recognising that she has 'so much of his [her father's] own spirit, that I would look upon the peril which threatens us, rather than hear it rage around me without knowing its nature or progress.' (205) More significant to this self-revelation, and reader manipulation is her disgust over her role in Hazlewood's shooting.

The traditional literary female response to the reappearance of a lover[182] is one which Julia, in retrospect, views with distaste. 'My screams [...] only hastened the catastrophe,' she tells Matilda. Interestingly, Scott then has his ingenue compare her action to that of a child who, 'in heedless sport, put in motion some powerful piece of machinery [...and] is [...] astonished at the tremendous powers which his weak agency has called into action, and terrified for the consequences [...] without the possibility of averting them.' (210, 212) Julia's comparison is a significant one, for it places her firmly in the province of the helpless - the place where women were expected by Scott's society to be.

I would suggest that this expression of feminine helplessness is an attempt on Scott's part to counter both Julia's impetuosity and her otherwise forthright behaviour. With this ingenue, there is none of the retiring modesty which 'should' feature strongly in her

---

[182]Within the Scottish tradition, Lydia Melford's multiple sightings of Wilson/Dennison in Smollett's *The Adventures of Humphry Clinker* are clear parallels with Julia Mannering, as is her correspondence with a female schoolmate. However, the forthright nature of Miss Mannering owes more to the balladic rather than the literary traditions on which Scott drew.

character. Because this self-revelation and criticism comes in the course of her correspondence with another young woman, it is not given the weight it would be had it come from an omniscient, paternalistic narrator or been given as commentary to a male character. Further to this is the fact that there is not the same degree of involvement on the parts of Julia and her father with the events of *Guy Mannering* as in the other three novels I discuss here. There are no political allegiances to defy, and indeed, no tradition of female participation in support of such causes on which Scott could draw in creating Julia Mannering. She remains manipulative of others as they come into contact with her, but because the events of this novel - as they relate to the Mannerings - are largely those of romance, of domestic fiction, Julia does not take the initiative as clearly as does Alice Lee in attempting to affect events and persons outwith the immediate concerns of home and family.

Woodstock, while set at the time of the English Civil War, is a novel, I would suggest, which is as concerned with the issues of kingship and rule as are those Waverley novels which can truly be called Jacobite. The devotion of the Cavaliers to Charles I, as presented by Scott, is as extreme as that of the Jacobites to his descendants. In discussing Scott's presentation of Alice Lee, I propose, therefore, to associate certain of her actions with the Jacobite song tradition as a standard of feminine conduct on which Scott relied for presentation of his ingenues. It is known that many of the iconographies used in later Stewart Risings, and found in Jacobite song, first were used by Royalists during the Civil War and Interregnum.[183] I would suggest that many of the same excesses of female behaviour occurred in service to these earlier Stewarts, and that Scott was sufficiently aware of this to allow it to influence his presentation of Alice Lee.[184]

As with other of the active ingenues, however, Scott takes care that Alice Lee be presented at first as emblematic of filial duty and feminine delicacy:

> The young lady, by whom this venerable gentleman seemed to be in some degree supported as they walked arm in arm, was a slight and sylphlike

---

[183]cf. Murray G. H. Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth Century Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994), pp. 94-107.

[184]Lady Margaret Bellenden in *Old Mortality* and Edward Waverley's Aunt Rachel both tell tales - personal or familial - of female activity for the Royalist cause at the time of the Civil War.

> form, with a person so delicately made, and so beautiful in countenance that it seemed the earth on which she walked was too grossly massive a support for a creature so aërial. But mortal beauty must share human sorrows. The eyes of the beautiful being showed tokens of tears; her colour was heightened as she listened to her aged companion. (*Wstk* 29)

It is interesting to note, however, that Alice Lee's conversation with her father centres not upon the domestic concerns of home and family, but upon the political realities of the Civil War. Sir Henry Lee's headstrong support of the Stewart cause would see him fight for the right to retain that 'royal property under my charge', regardless of the consequences. (30) It is his daughter who reminds him that 'England will not long endure the rulers which these bad times have assigned her', and that 'the King is ere this out of their reach'. (30) It is not until her mention of her uncle Everard that Alice is forced by her father's displeasure to take 'a trembling and submissive tone' with him. (31)

I would suggest that Alice's submission has more to do with Scott's establishment of the tensions of an ill-fated romance between Alice and Mark Everard than with a need to undermine Alice's political understanding. It is significant that Alice's submission lasts only until defence of her uncle to her father is necessary. Then, she defends him 'with more spirit than she had hitherto displayed', and criticises her father's bigotry - 'would you but question your own heart, you would acknowledge - *I speak with reverence* - that your tongue utters what your better judgment would disown' - although Scott takes care to have Alice's rebuke be reverent, and therefore not unfeminine or shrewish. (32, emphasis mine) Scott takes care further to underscore this with Alice's accusation, 'with a voice animated yet faltering' that her father does her 'cruel injustice' to suggest that she would leave him. More significant still are Alice's confessions to her father that 'your way is my way, though it lead to ruin and beggary'; and that she is incapable of 'sacrific[ing] to that young man my duty to you [...] were I capable of such criminal weakness, Markham Everard were the first to despise me for it.' (33-4) While Scott ensures that Alice states that her allegiance and duty are first and foremost to her father, it is interesting to note that she also articulates her opposition to his course of action.

This choice of conversational direction is significant, for it establishes both that Alice's awareness of political reality is far greater than that of her father, and that he is, to all intents and purposes, sufficiently fanatic in his devotion to the Stewarts to be blinded to everything but their cause. I would suggest that the submission which Alice displays when her father's displeasure reaches its peak is in fact a political gambit, designed to allow her to retain control of the situation. In so doing, Scott accurately portrays the means used by women to circumvent those strictures placed upon their behaviour by societal expectations.[185] Note also that with the message from her uncle delivered, Alice is able to steer the conversation back to politics; her mention of Oxford sets her father's 'vacillating state of mind [which] was turned by a word to any new subject' to Oxford's fall. Alice next reminds her father that 'any stirring of the royalists at this unpropitious moment will make them deal yet more harshly with the University.' (35) This is hardly a woman who has remained unaware of politics outside her immediate world: it is always Alice who reminds her father of the effects of his imprudent desires.

Her resourcefulness is brought to the fore upon the return of her brother Albert to Woodstock. While Scott makes it appear that his ingenue's reaction to a face at the window is a unique reaction to the:

> danger from marauders in a disturbed country [...] the thought armed Alice, who was naturally high-spirited, with such desperate courage, that she snatched a pistol from the wall [...] and while she screamed to her father to awake, had the presence of mind to present it at the intruder. (240)

It is desperation which prompts this reaction rather than an unfeminine impulse, Scott seems to tell us. Yet, Alice is sufficiently aware of the state of the country that it is these external forces, as well as their incursion onto her domestic sphere, which prompts her to act and to scream for male assistance. Scott subverts his ingenue's control of the situation, but only just.

This toying with the bounds of female propriety, playing the paradigm of the conduct book against the tradition of female activity for the Stewart cause, continues throughout the

---

[185]cf. Newton, p. 9. She here notes that 'subversion, indirection and disguise are natural tactics of the resisting weak, are social strategies for managing the most intense and the most compelling rebellions.'

King's residence at Woodstock. Once, Scott describes Alice as believing that she has 'spoken too frankly and zealously *for her sex and youth*' and yet, he allows the speech to stand with no further criticism. (286) I would suggest that this is because she has been describing an ideal monarch - which Scott and his readers knew Charles II not to be. As Scott tells us, 'exaggerated or unappropriate praise becomes the most severe satire.' (287) This satire is continued as Alice touches briefly upon the King's morals, and leaves the room rather than listen to a 'discourse [not] altogether fit for her presence.' (289)

The parental disapproval of the King's character and conduct which arises from this inappropriate discussion is also that of the author. Having demonstrated that Charles's character is an immoral and self-centred one, Scott is able to give Alice, in the traditionally feminine role of moral arbiter, a great deal of expression in what is a chronologically earlier version of the Chiffinch episode in *Peveril of the Peak*. However, this episode differs in two main points: that the woman in question is loyal to the Stewart cause, and that because she is on her territory, rather than at the mercy of others, she need not rely on others for aid. Interestingly, Alice's initial rejection of 'Kerneguy's' proposition is based upon class issues. 'I am the daughter or Sir Henry Lee, sir; and you are, or profess to be, Master Louis Kerneguy, my brother's page.' (328) Note here the choice by Scott to invert the traditional formula of the 'Highland Laddie' ballads; the lady not only has no intention of going anywhere with this no-one, but reminds him of their places in their society as a reason for this rejection. The revelation that 'Kerneguy' is in fact the King does nothing to change Alice's mind. Morally, Charles is in the wrong to ask Alice to be his mistress, and Scott repeatedly provides the reader with textual indicators demonstrating his folly, and Alice's integrity. Alice 'appeared determined to hear with patience the suit of the lover - while her countenance and manner intimated that she had this complaisance only in deference to the commands of the King.' (330) She remains loyal to the cause, but not to the extent that she will be moved to 'an act of ignominious, insane and ungrateful folly.' (332) Charles's suggestion that she will betray him to effect her marriage to Everard, brings out in Alice her 'share of the hereditary

temperament of her family', and causes her at last to express that anger to which she as woman ought not give way.

> I have heard, *without expressing anger*, the most ignominious persuasions addressed to myself, and I have vindicated myself for refusing to be the paramour of a fugitive Prince, as if I had been excusing myself from accepting a share of an actual crown. But *do you think I can hear all who are dear to me slandered without emotion or reply*? (334, emphases mine)

Note that Alice's anger is not directed at the King's conduct towards her, but at his slander of others. This, in conjunction with Charles's improprieties, are enough to allow this action to stand on its own, but Scott very carefully ensures that Charles himself comments on Alice's 'real, disinterested, overawing virtue', as a means both of ensuring that reader perceptions of his ingenue's actions are not negatively influenced by her outburst, and of restoring somewhat the King's moral integrity. (334)

It remains Charles's cause to which Alice devotes herself, rather than the man. The extent of this devotion is most clearly seen when she risks her future with Markham Everard to preserve the King's incognito. Such a self-less action prompts speculation that had Scott utilised the blonde/brunette schema here, Alice's devotion to the Stewart cause would have been comparable to that of Flora MacIvor; and she would have shared the fanatic's exile. Note, in her rebuke of the King, the involuntary nature of Alice's words, and the explicit mention by Scott of her lack of restraint. '[T]he following words dropping from her mouth [...] in spite of feelings that would have restrained them - "Cold - selfish - ungrateful - unkind! - Woe to the land which" - Here she paused [...] then added "[...] shall number thee, or such as thee, among her nobles and rulers."' (355) By courtly convention alone, Alice overreaches herself, for as Charles's subject, and over something which does not centre on her domestic world, she ought not rebuke the King for his conduct. As a woman, she should not openly criticise a man, but should influence him discreetly.[186] Markham Everard's reminder that she has seen those closest to her 'take the field [...] without manifesting this degree of interest' demonstrates still further that Alice's action is extraordinary. (356) Despite such criticism, however, Alice tells the assembled that Charles's 'life and safety are, or ought to be, of more

---

[186]cf. Newton, pp. 2-5; Armstrong pp. 88-95; Poovey, pp. 2-10 for discussions of the increased perceptions of the power of female influence over male activity.

value to me than those of any other man in the kingdom - nay, in the world, be that other who he will.' (357) Such finally, proves too much for Alice, and the 'portion [...] of the lion-humour that was characteristic of her family' deserts her; Alice 'would have sunk to the ground'. (357-8) As with Edith Bellenden and Isabelle of Croye, Scott resorts to feminine delicacy when his ingenue oversteps herself; removing Alice from the action by a feminine response to an unfeminine act, he ensures that she is perceived by the reader to be ladylike.[187]

Such virtue is, of course, rewarded. On her return from escorting the King through the forest - an errand on which, Scott reminds the reader 'her father had despatched her' - Alice carries a letter giving Royal assent to her marriage to Everard. (413) While perhaps inconsistent with the historic reality, it does allow Alice Lee to walk a fine line between duty to her King, and duty to herself without betraying either. Because the most forward of her actions were undertaken in service to her father and others, she is allowed the ultimate feminine reward.

This selfless impetus for their actions is found in the presentations of all of the moderate ingenues. Scott ensures that their actions remain consistent with the standards of the conduct book but through allusion, and familial involvement in causes, recalls the more forthright actions of the ballad heroine. In each instance, as I have demonstrated, the commentary upon the more unorthodox actions of the ingenue indicate the extent to which the ingenue has stretched or exceeded the bounds of propriety. More significant, however, is the extent to which the familial allegiances of the ingenue in question affect her actions. Lilias Redgauntlet does as little as she does because her uncle's authority is illegitimate; she cannot act on his behalf without censure. Edith Bellenden is aware of the political realities of her day, and is able to comment on them because of her family's association with the Stewart cause: Scott's perception of her place in the novel's society prevents her from acting without assistance. Julia Mannering's wilful nature is tempered by the fact that its only outlet is that of romance - a traditionally female matter. As a result, her commentary is restricted solely to

---

[187]In this instance, as with Edith Bellenden's 'public' spell, Alice's action serves as the impetus for generous acts by men: Charles revealing his identity to preserve Everard and Alice's relationship; Everard promising not to reveal the King's identity because of the generosity of the King's act.

a domestic and feminine arena. Of the four moderate ingenues, Alice Lee is the most politically aware and active. Much of this has to do with the documented action of Cavalier (and later Jacobite) women. She can act as she does because of the direct interaction between the fictionalised history and the fictional domestic spheres which occurs in *Woodstock*. Where Scott has an historic tradition of female activity on which to draw he is able to strike a balance between the freedoms of the balladic heroine, and the letter-perfect subscriber to the conduct book.

While social class constrains Scott in the creation of his ingenues, it liberates him in the creation of his servant-lasses. Because they are not participant in the ruling classes of the unified constructed society presented at novel's end, they need not speak letter perfect English, nor do they faint or fear for acting rather than reacting. This is, as I will demonstrate in chapter five, as much a result of Scott's understanding of the economic realities of lower class life, as it is of a greater, and more overt utilisation of the ballad paradigm associated, in Scott's day, with women of these classes.

Chapter 5:

Economic Independence: Lasses, not Ladies

Like the ingenues, Scott's lower class lasses are rarely considered by critics to be of any individual significance. Jeanie and Effie Deans are, of course, exceptions to this - but as I will discuss, this is due to their centrality in *The Heart of Midlothian* rather than to critical desire of discussing Jeanie and Effie in terms of their social role. Owen Dudley Edwards quite rightly observes that:

> Scott's general testimony on women in the century or so before his time, that they are shadows save when they can dominate their menfolk, is a nice piece of observation. He certainly testified to the masculine eclipse of the female personality. Significantly, this eclipse is at its most considerable in the upper ranks: Meg Merrilies, Med [sic] Dods, Helen MacGregor, and even the housekeeper Alison Wilson in *Old Mortality*, are of much sterner stuff, a reminder that the *lesser the money the stronger the woman*[188] (emphasis mine)

However, Edwards's 'stronger' women are all older women - each in a position of power within her respective society. Ernest A. Baker remarks that Scott 'never failed to put life into those of the stamp of Cuddie's Jenny Dennison.'[189] True though this is, it is interesting to note that Jenny is not discussed by critics except in relation to Cuddie.[190] I would suggest that in giving Jenny identity only through her relationship with Cuddie, she has been relegated to secondary status. Despite this, the fact that she is singled out by name is, in and of itself, remarkable. Much more typical praise of Scott's presentation of the lower orders is that of Kurt Wittig: 'But there is no mistaking or forgetting Edie Ochiltree, Jeanie Deans, Andrew Fairservice, Cuddie Headrigg, Meg Merrilies, Elspeth Mucklebackit, Bailie Nicol Jarvie and a whole gallery of boldly delineated figures from among the common people.'[191] Here again

---

[188]'Scott as Contemporary Historian', in *Sir Walter Scott: The Long Forgotten Melody*, ed. by Alan Bold, (London: Vision Press, 1983), pp. 65-90 (p. 79).
[189]'The Scottish Novels', in *Edgeworth, Austen, Scott*, volume six of The History of the English Novel, (New York: Barnes & Noble, 1929; repr. 1969), pp. 144-75, (p.160).
[190]cf. Robert C. Gordon, *Under Which King? A Study of the Scottish Waverley Novels*, (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1969), p. 51.
[191]'High Water Mark: Walter Scott', in *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*, (Edinburgh and London: Oliver & Boyd, 1958; repr. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1972), pp. 221-38 (p. 227).

are two older women, the ever-present Jeanie Deans, and no mention of any other lower class women.

I would suggest that it is the critical perception of these characters as a lower-class, active double for the passive ingenue which has promoted this neglect. It follows that if the ingenues are perceived by critics to be interchangeable, then those who are their doubles will also be so. Contrary to this perception, and as with the ingenues, Scott created diverse, complex characters who are representative of Scott's socio-cultural perceptions of female behaviour, as discussed in chapter one above.

Much of Scott's representative presentation of women was based upon his perceptions of class-based standards of female conduct. The anglicisation and increased literacy of late eighteenth and early nineteenth Scottish society meant that an oral culture of female independence was perceived by Scott and his contemporaries to be the province of the lower classes. Unlike their upper-class counterparts, these women were full partners in the economic life of the family, supplementing their spouse's wages/income through domestic industry. Economic necessity dictated that adult children take up employment, either contributing to the family's income or ceasing to be dependent upon that income for survival.[192] Service was the primary option available to young women 'because of the impossibility of young unmarried girls setting up house on their own. This was frowned upon by the Church for moral reasons; young people were considered to require the supervision of their elders, whether parents or master and mistress'[193].

Although they were under the supervision of a master or a mistress, the fact remains that there existed for these women (presuming they were not seduced by a member of the household and turned out) the opportunity for a life which did not include marriage. Consequently, the young women of the lower classes were not taught the same standards of feminine conduct as their upper class counterparts; they contributed equally to the

---

[192]cf. Ian D. and Kathleen A. Whyte, 'The Geographic Mobility of Women in Early Modern Scotland', in *Perspectives in Scottish Social History Essays in Honour of Rosalind Mitchison*, ed. by Leah Leneman, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), pp. 83-106.
[193]Whyte and Whyte, p. 94.

household, choosing whom they would marry rather than marrying for alliance or social advancement. The factors which contributed to:

> the concept of a 'housewife' - cannot have existed, though for the growing urban middle and upper classes [...] it was gaining currency. For these sections of society, female leisure was increasingly an indication of a man's social status. For the lower orders it was an unthinkable luxury.[194]

Without the leisure which enabled female dependence on a male provider, the women of the lower classes maintained a degree of autonomy both before and after marriage. Failure to do so, under the economic conditions in which they lived, would result in poverty and a life of dependence on the parish. In Scott's presentation, economic necessity is the predominant factor which forces the lower class women to a degree of vocal pragmatism not displayed in their mistresses. 'Jenny [...] would fit well into Shaw's *Man and Superman* as an embodiment of the sort of feminine purposefulness that reduces 'ideas' to irrelevance, knows that 'it's maybe as well to hae a friend on baith sides"[195]. As Scott demonstrates, for such as Jenny Dennison, life does not mean dithering about principle, cause, or public perceptions of conduct. Being able to house, and clothe, and feed oneself and one's family takes precedence over idealism.

I would suggest that perception by nineteenth-century song collectors, including Scott, of the song culture as a female genre, coupled with the class biases of those collectors makes these songs an appropriate paradigm of female conduct for those women who were not included in the confines of the anglicising, feminising Scottish social construct of Scott's day. 'Anxiety about the behaviour of a 'peasant' culture led to a splitting of the image of the oral into a romanticised and idealised form and a demotion of the status of popular orality to be called 'illiteracy'.'[196] Regardless of the actuality in which knowledge of ballads cut across class lines, the biases of polite society associated such knowledge with the lower classes. Those ballads included in the *Tea Table Miscellany* were bowdlerised. Mrs. Brown was

---

[194]R. H. Houston, 'Women in the Economy and Society of Scotland, 1500-1800', in *Scottish Society 1500-1800*, ed. by R. H. Houston and I. D. Whyte, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989), pp. 118-147 (p. 122).
[195]Gordon, p. 51.
[196]Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth Century Scottish Fiction*, (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996), p. 23.

outraged that Scott would cite her as a significant source in later editions of the *Minstrelsy*, for such direct folk knowledge was not considered to be appropriate for a minister's wife. Scott's overt application of balladic schema to a 'heroine' scandalised Ballantyne, and prompted Scott's famous retort that if she (Clara Mowbray) were dressed in gingham, Ballantyne would not object to her conduct. Such collection, and bifurcation between the written and the oral created the perception that:

> The record is removed from the inaccurate recollection of the aged, and placed in a safe, tangible and imperishable form, which may be subjected to the inspection of various persons, until the sense is completely explained and comprehended, with the least possible chance of doubt or uncertainty.[197]

Scott's retort to Ballantyne is the most succinct example of the disparity which existed in the minds of the ballad collectors between the ballad heroine in her gingham and the fashionably gowned literary heroine. So pervasive is the association of the oral with the folk that little attention is paid the fact that, with the exception of the versions of ballads collected from the Southwest of Scotland and Appalachia, the majority of ballad heroines are either explicitly called 'Lady' or are the subject of textual references to clothes and property which indicate their rank.[198] The ballad tradition is replete with 'sexually proud and independent heroine[s]'[199] who defy authority figures, class lines, and gender roles to achieve life with the husband of their choice.[200] Given this, it should not be surprising that a society which was becoming increasingly more restrictive of female behaviour, would both elide over this reality, and bowdlerise the more explicit ballads. For a society which expected that 'ladies' would act according to the standards of the conduct book, it would likely have been infinitely more comfortable to associate both the origins and the heroines of popular

---

[197]Sir Walter Scott, *Tales of a Grandfather*, quoted in Fielding, pp. 52-3

[198]For discussion of the differences in the ballads of Southwest Scotland and Appalachia from those of the Borders and Northeast, see William Bernard McCarthy, *The Ballad Matrix: Personality, Milieu, and the Oral Tradition*, (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP, 1990). Ballads such as 'Lady Isabel and the Elf-Knight' (C 4), 'Lady Maisry' (C 65), 'Fair Margaret and Sweet William' (C 74) and 'Bonny Baby Livingston' (C 222) are examples of explicit and implicit presentation of the heroine's class status.

[199]Thomas Crawford, *Society and the Lyric*, (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1979), p. 23.

[200]cf. 'Young Beichan' (C 53), the so-called 'Highland/Beggar Laddie' ballads (C 226-28 and 279-80), and 'Child Waters' (C 63) for examples of these defiances.

song with those for whom economic necessity dictated 'unladylike' independence. Such changes in perception of the ballad tradition, and in the texts themselves, underscore the social upheaval in Scotland which is delineated by Scott through differences in speech and action based upon the age and class of his female characters. That Scott followed these perceived standards of female conduct in his fictional constructs is as much commentary on Scott's own age as it is elegy for what is passing or past.

By the early nineteenth century, the classes no longer interacted as in the past. Adoption of English standards - linguistic as well as social - created a division between the classes that was difficult to breach. That there remained greater class interaction between women at this time can be seen in part through the attribution of Mrs. Brown's ballads to an aunt and household servants. This should not be surprising, given that women did not move in the professional worlds of law, medicine, and the universities; worlds which, by the end of the eighteenth-century, required use at least of written English for advancement.

> Scots *felt* in Scots and *thought* in English. [...] Because their language was the language of feeling and their ethos exemplified the native outlook on life, the Scottish ballads provided - as works in English could not - aesthetic correlatives organically suited to the Scottish spirit and emotional constitution.[201]

Women were associated by the Enlightenment philosophers with emotion rather than with reason. Within such associations are the connotations of 'juvenile' as equivalent to 'emotion'. 'Children and their mothers, traditionally seen in terms of storytelling and oral exchange' became, in this increasingly literate and literary society 'suspect, as, increasingly, were servants who might threaten the literary education of young people by corrupting them with oral tales.'[202] Margaret Laidlaw's comment to Scott that in collecting her songs, 'ye hae spoilt them a' thegither. They were made for singing, an' no for reading; an' they are nouther right spelled nor right setten doun'[203] reflects this breach. It has become, by Scott's adulthood,

---

[201]David Buchan, *The Ballad and the Folk*. (London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972), p. 68. Buchan's articulation of this dichotomy echoes eighteenth-century awareness of this linguistic divide. See my discussion of Scots language in chapter one, pp. 30-2, above.

[202]Fielding, p. 24.

[203]Quoted in Mary Ellen Brown, 'The Study of Folk Tradition' in *The History of Scottish Literature, Volume Three*, ed. by Douglas Gifford, gen. ed. Cairns Craig, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988), pp. 397-409 (p. 404).

not only one of class, but of gender as well. In legitimising Margaret Laidlaw's songs through the authority of the printed word, Scott removed them from their female, oral, generative origins. His spoiling of the texts is not that they are textually incorrect, but that they are textually fixed.[204]

> If women had gained some literacy at school, the opportunity to use it as adults, and to enjoy the power and the status which it generated, was severely limited. At home, literacy diminished the influence of parents as schools and private reading endowed their children with skills and knowledge which they could neither control nor understand.[205]

I would suggest that here, the use of 'children' refers specifically to male children, particularly among the lower classes in the early nineteenth century. The control of the woman over the home would extend to her children while at home: for the period in question, those children who would remain 'at home' and under maternal influence rather than that of a schoolmaster, would most likely have been female. As a result, experientially based knowledge would remain a marginalised, female domain.[206]

It is in this group of characters that Scott's perception of the realities of lower-middle to lower class life is most evident. As with all characters in the Waverley novels, the dichotomy between youth and age, present/future and past is applicable. For the younger members of the lower-middle and lower classes, however, that present does not include a rejection of things Scots as it does for their upper-middle and upper class counterparts. It is important, however, to emphasise yet again that this is not necessarily an accurate presentation of a social reality. In associating Scots-speaking, forthright women with both older women and the lower classes, Scott takes care to foster the impression that 'the oral is locked into an idealised past of non-change, in contrast to the progress of the present'.[207]

---

[204]Chaucer's Wife of Bath articulates this in terms of 'Experience, though noon auctoritee/ Were in this world, is right ynogh for me/To speke of wo that is in mariage'. Her knowledge is firsthand rather than textually-based. Geoffrey Chaucer, 'The Wife of Bath's Prologue', in *The Riverside Chaucer*, gen. ed. Larry D. Benson, (Houghton-Mifflin, 1987; repr, Oxford: Oxford UP, 1989), pp. 105-16 (p. 105).

[205]David Vincent, 'The Decline of the Oral Tradition in Popular Culture', in *Popular Culture and Custom in Nineteenth-Century England*, ed. by Robert D. Storch, (London: Croom Helm, 1983), pp. 20-47 (p. 41).

[206]cf. R. A. Houston, *Scottish Literacy and the Scottish Identity: Illiteracy and Society in Scotland and Northern England, 1600-1800*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985), pp. 57-70 for discussion of lower levels of female literacy.

[207]Fielding, p. 55.

The simplistic analysis of a Waverley schema here again holds true: the Anglo-British future has no place in its ruling classes for the Scots speaker.

Based on consideration of the context for the ballad paradigm discussed above, those characters that I define as a 'lower-class lass' include: the serving-girl whose life is the active counterpart to her mistress's ideologically controlled one; the lower-class maiden encountered by the heroine who provides, by her words or deeds, a commentary on aspects of the heroine's life; the lower class lass whose function in the plot is incidental, but who nevertheless adds local colour to a scene; and, finally, she may be the novel's female protagonist. The last certainly includes Jeanie Deans, although I will discuss her in chapter seven, for as the protagonist of *The Heart of Midlothian* she should be considered apart. I instead have reference to two whose function within the schema of their respective novels is by my definition, technically that of the ingenue.

These two, *The Fortunes of Nigel*'s Margaret Ramsay and *The Fair Maid of Perth*'s Catherine Glover, act and react rather more like the 'lasses' than the 'ingenues'. Neither is a Scots speaker which does allow them, within Scott's construct, freedom to marry the hero. However, despite this English speech, they are not of the same class as other Scott ingenues, and much is made of their lack of social status. In addition to, or because of these socio-economic factors, these characters are freer in their speech and action than other ingenues. Many of their unorthodox actions, as I shall demonstrate, do have direct parallels in the ballad tradition.

Finally, it is important to note that the so-called 'lasses' do not play a significant role in the novel's events when the novel contains an upper-class ingenue who is in any degree active. There is no need for Scott to insert in his narrative a lower-class woman to provide female participation and/or comment when his ingenue is more capable - because of her position within the novel's society - of so doing. In those Waverley novels where there is a balanced presentation between mistress and servant, Scott, as in the dual ingenue books (in which, interestingly, there is no lower-class lass), makes use of two female characters to balance the literary and balladic or English and Scots aspects of society. Does this cause a

give and take between women of opposite classes in their displays of overt speech and action? Is this a reflection of the linguistic and cultural tensions extant in the Scotland of Scott's day between the oral and literary traditions - a conflict which, it has been argued enabled Mrs. Brown to be 'both literate and an oral composer. [because she has not] ceas[ed] to be re-creative along traditional lines and accepts the literate concept of the fixed text.'[208] I would suggest that Scott's 'equal time' presentation of these characters does all of these things. I would also suggest, however, that while underscoring contemporary associations of things oral with lower-class women, Scott here associates things Scots with positive (although feminine and therefore powerless) characters and actions rather than with negative ones.

Ingenue or Lass?

Like many Scott heroines, Margaret Ramsay is spoken of before she is given the opportunity to speak for herself. Her godfather, George Heriot, remarks that 'she is a dutiful girl to her godfather, though I sometimes call her a jill-flirt.' (*FN* 77) This simple aside is sufficient to provide the astute reader with the first indication that there is more to this young lady than to the average Scott heroine - Jinglin' Geordie would not call her something as potentially pejorative without good reason. It is the virtue of duty, particularly that given to men, rather than her flirtatiousness which is mentioned first in all such descriptions. As presented by Scott, Margaret's physical appearance (something which, given his reliance on physiognomy is never insignificant) further underscores this combination of feminine submission to duty and self-aware charm; 'about twenty years old, very pretty, very demure, yet with *lively black eyes, that ever and anon contradicted the expression of sobriety*, to which silence, reserve, a plain velvet hood, and a cambric ruff, had condemned Mistress Marget, as the daughter of a quiet citizen'. (92-3, emphasis mine) As Scott presents her,

---

[208]Buchan, p. 64. This also raises the problematic issue of transmission. I would suggest, however, that for the Scots speaker, creation and re-creation within that tradition is a less mechanical procedure than the conscious mingling of texts which contemporary singers utilise to achieve their desired effect.

Margaret adheres to the standards of conduct for her social position, as represented by her dress, but that adherence is in direct conflict with her self-image.

Scott underscores this duality still further by making his heroine fully aware of it. Margaret, in responding to Sir Mungo Malagrowther's baiting, 'simpered, bridled, looked to either side, then straight before her; and, having assumed all the airs of bashful embarrassment and timidity which were necessary, *as she thought* to cover a certain *shrewd readiness which really belonged to her character*.' (97, emphases mine) This is no Rose Bradwardine or Edith Bellenden, whose speech is guarded. Margaret's outspokenness places her with Die Vernon among Scott's heroines. Socially, however, she is no Die. '[B]orn within the sound of Bow Bell', Margaret is the daughter of an expatriate Scot, but a Scot who is a merchant (note the use of the adjective shrewd in describing Margaret) rather than a noble adherent to the Jacobite cause. (97) Such details are surely presented by Scott as clues to his readership that Margaret is socially distinct from the 'typical' heroine of fiction; she is not minor nobility, and while not 'lower class', she is hardly the equal of the man with whom she falls in love.

Although Scott makes much of her London upbringing, there is equal emphasis placed upon her Scottishness. I would suggest that this is as much to condone her outspokenness as to emphasise that her relationship with Nigel is appropriate in the context of the Scottish society in which they will reside. Scott takes care repeatedly to emphasise that Nigel is a Scot, whose home and future are in Scotland; he will not be involved in the political upheavals of the future Charles I's London.

The reminders Margaret is given about her own 'condition' come from women who are hardly appropriate role models of feminine conduct. (122) Dame Ursula is a gossip, a shrew and a master manipulator of people, and as such is anything but a credible voice of society's standards. It is as a response to her reminder of Margaret's social position that the reader is given an indication that the definitions of class in operation are not those of the standard Waverley novel. According to Margaret, her 'father's calling is mechanical [...] but

our blood is not so. I have heard my father say that we are descended, at a distance indeed, from the great Earls of Dalwolsey (sic)'. (122)

Dame Ursula's sarcastic reply, 'I never knew a Scot of you, but was descended, as ye call it, from some great house or other; and a piteous descent it often is - and as for the distance you speak of, it is so great as to put you out of sight of each other' is designed to put Margaret forcibly in her place, but it also points to the tensions between Scottish and English reckonings of 'worth' that reflect the anti-Scottish sentiment in London both at the time in which this novel is set and in the late eighteenth century. (122-23) Given that his hero and heroine are both Scots, as are the figures of authority within the novel's society, it is fair to say that Scott intends both that his reader think of Margaret's aspirations as other than foolish, and that they reconsider their own perceptions of Scots and Scotland.

This early in the novel, Scott has provided narrative indications that Margaret differs from the average literary heroine. She is associated, by social status and nationality with a Scottish ballad paradigm of independent young women who are self-aware and self-directed in matters of romance. Her lack of concern for Nigel's insolvency is reminiscent of the ballad heroine who loves a poor wanderer and is not concerned by his lack of material wealth[209]. The fact that this wanderer is a Lord serves as reward for the heroine's goodness: 'They gad on, and forder on,/Till they came to his father's haa,/An he knoked ther fue loudly/[...] Four-an-tuenty gentlemen/They conved the beager ben,/An as mony gay ladës/Conved the beager's lassie./[...] She came to gued by graid misguiding,/By the followuing of her laddie.'[210] Nigel's real status is, of course, known to Margaret from the beginning, but his precarious financial situation is not rectified until novel's end. To further underscore Margaret's socio-cultural differences, Scott does not subvert any of her speech or action with authorial commentary as he does with other heroines. When he does offer an extended commentary

---

[209]See my discussion of the 'Highland Laddie' tradition in chapter one above, for delineation of this tradition's characteristics. Interestingly, the concern of the heroine of 'The Jolly Beggar' C 279, A text, that the one she took for the 'leard of Brodie', really is nothing but 'the pore boddie' is what prompts her lover to slit his rags, revealing his identity as 'the braest gentleman that was among them a". He then rebukes her for her shallowness: 'Gin ye had ben a gued woman, as I thought ye had ben,/I wad haa made ye lady of castels eight or nine'. Here, desire for that material wealth prevents the happy ending. Child, V, p. 111.

[210]' 285. The Beggar Laddie', A text, Child, V, p. 117.

on Margaret's character, his negative comments are moderated by genuine praise of her nature:

> [Margaret]was a very frequent visitor at her godfather's, who was much amused by her childish sallies, and *by the wild and natural beauty with which she sung the airs of her native country*. Spoilt she was on all hands; by the indulgence of her godfather, and the absent habits and indifference of her father, and the deference of all around to her caprices, as a beauty and as an heiress. But though, from these circumstances, the city beauty had become as wilful, as capricious, and as affected, as unlimited indulgence seldom fails to render those to whom it is extended; and although she exhibited upon many occasions that affectation of extreme shyness, silence and reserve, which misses in their teens are apt to take for an amiable modesty; and, upon others, a considerable portion of that flippancy, which youth sometimes confounds with wit, Mistress Margaret *had much real shrewdness and judgment, which wanted only opportunities of observation to refine it-a lively, good-humoured, playful disposition, and an excellent heart*. (242, emphases mine)

The negative characteristics are, I would suggest more those of immaturity than of a genuine flaw in her character. Further to this, Scott brackets them with far more positive characteristics: her knowledge of the ballads of her 'native country' (which, based upon evidences of the delight they bring the Scot George Heriot, is Scotland), and her personality which, like those of the maidens of the airs she sings, is clearly balanced between the prudent and the playful.

The clearest demonstration by Scott of Margaret's balladic origins is yet to come. After Nigel's imprisonment, Margaret goes to the other of her confidantes, the Lady Hermione, to ask her assistance in effecting his escape. Hermione, too, criticises the girl for her 'misplaced love' and advises her to 'Seek a match among your equals [...] and escape the countless kinds of risk and misery that must attend an affection beyond your degree.' (249) Hermione is, in her own way, as inappropriate an adviser to Margaret as Dame Ursula. She too considers class divisions and reputation to be of utmost significance: concerns which, as I have discussed in the preceding chapters, are associated with the paradigm of the conduct book, rather than that of the ballads. As the reader learns, she was duped into a false marriage with an English lord, and her reputation is destroyed. While this is no fault of hers, and is ultimately rectified through the machinations of George Heriot and King James, she is like many an unfortunate ballad heroine whose lover's infidelity causes their

death(s).[211] Hermione; like Ursula, fails to understand that the Scottish manner of reckoning kinship does make Margaret's aspirations within the realm of possibility.

Hermione's failure to understand Margaret's action is perhaps the greater because she is descended from the house of Glenvarloch. Hermione, too, is a Scot. Because she 'had been educated with different feelings, and the traditions of the feuds and quarrels of my mother's family in Scotland, which were to her monuments and chronicles, seemed to me as insignificant and unmeaning as the actions and fantasies of Don Quixote', Hermione lacks the knowledge of the Scottish folk tradition which Margaret possesses, and which is the social paradigm around which Scott constructed the gender relations of *The Fortunes of Nigel*. (260) As a result, she is incapable of seeing the differences between her relationship with Dalgarno and that of Margaret and Nigel.[212] This failure to understand Scottish social contexts is what causes Hermione's death-in-life. Understanding of the interpersonal realities behind these traditions would have kept her from Dalgarno.

Margaret, having secured monetary assistance from Lady Hermione, now acts - without the proxies needed by other Scott heroines. Her plans go awry, and she is imprisoned with Nigel in the Tower. Even then, however, Margaret takes responsibility for her actions, 'I [...] have myself only to thank for my misfortunes'. (367) Nevertheless, this is not a ballad, and Margaret must display some semblance of regret for the totally unfeminine behaviour in which she has engaged. I would suggest that Scott is very deliberate in his choice of adjectives for Margaret's self-recrimination. 'I have been self-willed and obstinate - and rash and ungovernable'. (368) Each is, according to the conduct book tradition governing female behaviour (and Scott's presentation of other comparable characters), an utterly inappropriate one to describe feminine conduct. The tears and self-recriminations are,

---

[211]Note the description of Hermione's appearance, as 'deadly pale - there was not the least shade of vital red to enliven features [...]'; vital, of course, meaning 'living', and red the colour of blood as well as of passion. Further to this, 'Her dress was of pure white, of the simplest fashion, and hiding all her person excepting the throat, face, and hands.' White, while the colour of brides, is also and in this instance more significantly, the colour of the shroud. (104)

[212]cf. Buchan, *The Ballad and the Folk*, chapters 7 and 8, for discussion of the structure of romantic ballads. The Hermione/Dalgarno relationship is what Buchan terms a 'story of family opposition', while that of Margaret/Nigel is closest to that of the 'other love'. p. 84.

however, wholly out of character for the young lady whose resourcefulness has been sufficiently unusual to require, and to gain, authorial approval.

Unlike the ballad heroine, whose male disguise is not penetrated by the ballad hero, Nigel is aware that Margaret is playing a trouser role, but has not penetrated her disguise to the extent that her identity is known. Faced with male disapproval, Margaret acknowledges that she has 'suffered enough, and more than enough, by the degradation of having been seen in this unfeminine attire, and the comments you must necessarily have made on my conduct.' (377-8) However, Margaret does not regret that she acted, but that she has been unmasked, and made subject to Nigel's disapproval. For, when discovered by her godfather, Margaret, 'the natural vivacity of whose temper *could never be long suppressed by any situation, however disadvantageous*', defends Nigel's actions although she knows she 'should not speak'. (388, emphasis mine) Should not speak, I would suggest, because she is acting wholly inappropriately for a lady of her class within the structure of the London society she inhabits.

Yet, as previously indicated, she is not truly of that society. The society Scott has created in *The Fortunes of Nigel* is heavily divided between the Scottish and English factions of the court of James VI and I. Like the King, and Nigel, Margaret belongs to the *Scottish* community within London; a community based on Scott's perceptions of Scottish social identity. Consequently, she is less subject to what, within the Scott schema, are the restrictions of the conduct-book than she would be were she the daughter of an English merchant in London. The familiarity with which James is treated by his Scottish subjects, and the contempt in which he is held by his anglicised son Charles and Buckingham, are further evidences of the different codes of conduct in operation in the society to which Margaret belongs.

As a result of this dichotomy, Margaret's discovery by the King does not result in censure.[213] Instead, she is aided (although she does not know this) by the King. Her actions

---

[213]Scott was surely aware of the authorship of James V of 'The Jolly Beggar' and 'The Gaberlunzie Man'. This tradition of Royal involvement in the folk tradition, in addition to James VI's patronage of the Castalian Band, in all likelihood affected Scott's presentation of James's manipulation of the scene.

here receive the approbation of one who sets the standards of conduct for society, for he, like Margaret, does not belong to the 'fashionable' cliques of his son. James, emphasising his Scottishness, removes the only remaining obstacle to Margaret and Nigel's marriage. James's creator, in his Scottishness, gives the last truly Scots King the speech which sanctions all of Margaret's Scots pride:

> and you, my liege subjects of England, may weel take a hint from what we have said, and not be in such a hurry to laugh at our Scottish pedigrees, though they be somewhat long derived, and difficult to be deduced. Ye see that a man of right gentle blood may, for a season, lay be his gentry, and yet ken whare to find it when he has occasion for it. [...] We mention these things at the mair length, because we would heve you all to know, that it is not without due consideration of the circumstances of all parties, that we design, in a small and private way, to honour with our own royal presence that marriage of Lord Glenvarloch with Margaret Ramsay, daughter and heiress of David Ramsay, our horologer, and a cadet only thrice removed from the ancient house of Dalwolsey. (467-68)

Margaret, like the ballad heroines on whom she is based, gains everything in the end. Her actions, while somewhat scandalous in a literary lady, are in Scott's perception, appropriate to the daughter of a Scottish merchant; particularly a daughter who is raised fully conscious of her family's cultural traditions. She is placed in direct contrast to the Lady Hermione, whose ignorance of those traditions is the source of her dishonour and grief. Scott, through the character of Margaret, is taking a far greater pro-Scots stance than in other of his novels. Nevertheless, it is important to remember that Margaret is of both worlds: Scots in spirit and action, she is more significantly, born and bred within the commercial London in which Scotland's economic future is vested. As such, I would suggest, she represents the synthesis of Scottish and English which Scott advocates throughout the Scottish novels via the 'alliance marriages' he effects at novel's end.

There is no such sociologic duality in the world inhabited by *The Fair Maid of Perth*'s Catharine Glover. Her world as Scott presents it, is the Perth of the late fourteenth century. This explicitly Scottish context should allow Scott to utilise fully his Scottish socio-cultural paradigms in the creation of his characters. Instead, Scott resorts to the same type of hyperbolic medieval society seen in *Ivanhoe, The Betrothed*, and *Anne of Geierstein*. Ostensibly this is in part due to Scott's reluctance to utilise:

> the Lowland Scotch dialect now spoken, because unquestionably the Scottish of that day resembled very closely the Anglo-Saxon, with a sprinkling of French or Norman to enrich it. [...] supposing my own skill in the ancient Scottish were sufficient to invest the dialogue with its peculiarities, a translation must have been necessary for the benefit of the general reader. (*FMP* 14)

I would suggest that this reluctance is also due to the class associations of the 'Lowland Scotch dialect' in Scott's perceptions of Scottish society. What Scott presents in his characterisation of Catharine Glover is an idealisation of medieval womanhood, juxtaposed onto a tradesman's daughter who displays the initiative of the ballad heroine associated with Catharine's class. Despite his reluctance dialectically to associate his heroine with the lower classes, Scott's use of the ballad paradigm in her creation demonstrates further the reflection in his fiction of class-based cultural tensions in his society. In *The Fair Maid of Perth*, there is less narrative concern about the social status of the characters, than seen in *The Fortunes of Nigel*, which is perhaps indicative of the greater integration of class in Scottish society, as opposed to that of London. Despite linguistic indications to the contrary, Scott maintains a textual awareness of the fact that this Scottish tale has as its ostensible historic basis one example of the Highland/Lowland conflict around which Scott centres much of his Scoto-British formula. Ordinarily, this dichotomy would provide Scott with much local colour - colour which theoretically would extend to his non-noble heroine as it did to Margaret Ramsay.

Catharine appears to be, particularly in matters of romance, merely the typical Scott ingenue. Scott's initial description of Catharine, which, as I have argued, is an indicator of the social paradigm on which he relies, is that of a remarkably prudent young woman, aware of her role within her society. '[Catharine] showed no inclination to listen to any gallantry which came from those of a station highly exalted above that which she herself occupied; and though probably in no degree insensible to her personal charms, seemed desirous to confine her conquests to those who were within her own sphere of life.' (19-20) In further contrast to the robust (and social-climbing) Margaret, Catharine's 'beauty [was] the kind which we connect more with the mind than with the person, was, notwithstanding her natural kindness and gentleness of disposition, rather allied to reserve than to gaiety, even when in company with her equals.' (20) Despite such passivity and introspection, however, Catharine is

neither a silent nor a circumspect character. She holds and articulates quite emphatic views on her impending marriage, and on her religious beliefs. Admittedly, these are both stereotypically feminine concerns, but Catharine's overt expression of these views is atypical. She is an interesting study of tensions between paradigms of female conduct, for Catherine faints at the sight of blood, and is driven into a fever by the executions of the murderers of Rothsay, yet is resourceful enough to have devised plans of escape for Father Clement from Perth and for Louise the glee-maiden and herself from Falkland.

Despite the fact that Scott makes less overt use of the ballad paradigm in his characterisation of Catherine than he does with Margaret Ramsay, I would suggest that its use is as evident in the second of his merchant-class heroines as in the first. One of the first evidences of its use is seen in Catharine's reluctance to marry Harry Smith merely because her father wishes it. Her criticism of Harry's martial nature earns her a rebuke from her father, for her 'tongue wags too freely. Quarrels and fights are men's business, not women's, and it is not maidenly to think or speak of them.' This articulation of nineteenth century expectations of 'feminine' behaviour conflicts with Scott's use of the class-based ballad paradigm which includes greater overt female expression: 'if they are so rudely enacted in our presence, it is a little hard to expect us to think or speak of anything else.' (34) Scott here imposes nineteenth-century expectations of feminine conduct upon his medieval construct; in a culture as martial as that of the fifteenth century, women could hardly have been wholly isolated from warfare. I would suggest that his reasons for so doing are twofold: to dissociate his heroine further from her social class, and to offer moral comment on medieval 'barbarity' through the moral guide. Both strategies cause later narrative tension, as Scott's own class and cultural biases are reflected in his use of ballad formulae in the novel. Despite the anachronistic ideals articulated by Catherine, I would suggest that we see here Scott's awareness of greater female participation in the Scottish society of the past.[214]

---

[214]cf. Rosalind Marshall, *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080-1980*, (London: Collins Sons, 1983), pp. 17-60; Rosalind Mitchison and Leah Leneman, *Sexuality and Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780*, (London & New York: Basil Blackwell, 1989). While the latter is outwith the period of *The Fair Maid of Perth*, anachronism such as this make it clear that Scott is not drawing on fifteenth-century standards of female conduct in

This overt criticism continues until her father interrupts, not from fundamental disagreement either with Catherine's opinions, or with her expression of them, but because she is urging Harry to 'renounce the gainful trade in which he was held unrivalled, and which, from the constant private differences and public wars of the time, was sure to afford him a large income.[215] (38)

Catharine's request of Conachar for sanctuary for Father Clement allows Scott to rely overtly on the balladic paradigm in his presentation of this lass. Scott again utilises the tradition of the 'Highland Laddie' both through Catharine's journey to the Highlands to seek out the 'Laddie', and through the revelation of the Laddie's rank of clan chief. That is the extent to which the formula is used in *The Fair Maid of Perth*: an omission which, I would suggest, is to the detriment of the novel and of the characterisation of Catharine. Scott neither associates Catherine explicitly with Scottish cultural referents, nor with the paradigm of conduct book femininity; the class and cultural associations of these paradigms for Scott are again reflected in his characterisation. Catherine is simultaneously a novelistic heroine who faints at the sight of blood, and whose beauty makes her desired by all, and an outspoken resourceful ballad heroine who keeps her virtue intact by wit alone. Scott's attempt to utilise both paradigms of female conduct is again unsuccessful; without explicit use of one, and selective use of the other, (seen here through the absence of any dialect-speaking characters) his social construct, as I will demonstrate, becomes neither/nor, rather than a balance of the two.

Catharine could have gone to the Highlands with Conachar, willingly or unwillingly, for this would have been in keeping with the tradition to which Scott alludes with Conachar's reappearance as Eachin/Hector Maclan, chief of Clan Quhele. His statement that she 'regarded them [his clansmen] as if you were born to be a chieftain's wife' recalls Lizie Lindsay's change in status to 'great Macdonald's braw lady,/And will be to the day that ye

---

his portrayal of Catharine. See my discussion of changing views of feminine conduct in late eighteenth century Scottish society, in chapter one, above.

[215]This concern with 'income' is perhaps reflective of the growing concern with social status in Scott's day. In the turbulent times in which *The Fair Maid of Perth* is set, the income afforded the Smith would have been secondary to his martial abilities as a criterion for eligibility as a prospective husband.

dee'[216]. (186) In immediate deviation from the Highland Laddie tradition, Conachar considers the impending confrontation with Clan Chattan sufficient reason for Catharine to 'thus put off your Highland visit'. (187) Such reserve does not belong to the sexually frank Highlander of the ballads, but to the polite gentleman who partners the idealised woman of the conduct book. The fact that Conachar later asks Simon for permission to marry Catharine only underscores this tension between cultural paradigms. Given the structure of his plot, Scott could not draw further on the Highland Laddie tradition, for Catharine would have to reject her society for Conachar as does the heroine of these ballads. '[M]y daughter shall never wed, save in her own degree. Her heart would break amid the constant wars and scenes of bloodshed which connect themselves with your lot.' (359) To the burghers of Perth, Conachar's status as chief of his clan does not elevate him above their perception of him as a savage. I would suggest that Scott here allows nineteenth century ideas and prejudices to interfere with his presentation of historical circumstances.

The potential for internal, triangular, conflict such as that which exists in ballads such as 'Johnny Faa' (C 200), 'Lord Saltoun and Auchanachie' (C 239), or 'The Daemon Lover' (C 243) also occurs in *The Fair Maid of Perth*.[217] there is again conflict between the demands of a nineteenth century morality and the construction of an accurate historical context. It is clear from his presentation of Catharine that she is dutiful, and that she and Harry are 'meant' to be together; consequently, any tension within their relationship must come either from reservations on their part, or from external, unwanted, but nonetheless flattering attentions. In making Catharine wholly repulsed both by Conachar and by Rothsay, Scott does not maximise the possibilities which exist within either the Highland Laddie ballads, or those in which an upper-class male attempts to seduce, and/or succeeds in seducing a woman of a lower class. Given that the best outcome of such situations is that the woman becomes a pampered whore, and eventually if she's fortunate a wife, and the worst outcome that she ends up alone and with a bastard child to raise, Scott could hardly exploit this tradition to its

---

[216]'226. Lizie Lindsay', B text, Child, IV, p.258.
[217]Child, IV, pp. 61-71; 347-50; 360-69.

full.[218] He could, and did, utilise the ballad formula in which the woman outwits her putative seducer, emerging with virtue intact.

When Rothsay's unwilling guest at Falkland, Catharine manages to evade being made his mistress by verbal skill alone. Here again we see signs of the internal tension between the outspokenness which associates Catherine with Scott's perception of a lower class ballad paradigm, and the highly moral standards of a 'typical', conduct book associated, Scott ingenue. Rather than run from the Prince, she faces him down. First, Scott has Catherine appeal, in the 'feminine' role of moral preceptress, to his higher values: he will achieve nothing by 'means equally unworthy of knighthood or manhood.' (391) Having failed to make an impression on his chivalric standards, which as his response ['neither as a knight nor a man can I avoid accepting a defiance' (391)] indicates are non-existent, Catharine resorts to the weapon which in the ballad tradition is the only one which extricates maidens from such confrontations with virtue intact - her wits. To this point, Scott's presentation of Catharine has demonstrated his association of her with the conduct book paradigm of femininity; pleading with the Prince along the predictable lines of her virtue, his honour, her pledges to Harry, and the like. Now, in her threat to expose Rothsay's rejection of the chivalric code, which in effect represents an abrogation of his responsibilities as Prince of Scotland, she is on par with the heroine of ballads such as 'Riddles Wisely Expounded' (C 1) and 'The Elfin Knight' (C 2):[219]

> I would take the palmer's staff in my hand, and wherever chivalry is honoured, or the word Scotland has been heard, I would proclaim the heir of a hundred kings, the son of the godly Robert Stewart, the heir of the heroic Bruce - a truthless, faithless man, unworthy of the crown he expects, and of the spurs he wears. Every lady in wide Europe would hold your name too foul for her lips - every worthy knight would hold you a baffled, forsworn caitiff, false to the first vow of arms, the protection of woman, and the defence of the feeble. (392)

Note that the names on which Scott draws - Stewarts and the Bruce - are emblematic of the heights of Scottish valour. Textually, there is indication that Catharine's threat has an effect

---

[218]cf, 'Fair Annie' (C 62), Child II, pp. 63-83; 'Mary Hamilton' (C 173), ibid, III, pp. 379-99, and 'The Jolly Beggar' (C 279), ibid, V, pp. 109-16 for examples of women who lack the wit to attain marriage.

[219]Child, I, pp. 1-20. These ballad heroines meet verbal challenges, and through wit alone, retain their virginity.

on the Prince that is not entirely negative, for he 'looked at her with a countenance in which *resentment was mingled with admiration*.' (392, emphasis mine) While Rothsay does remind her of his position of social superiority, which should mean that she accords him the subservience that his position entails, she has outwitted him, and the follow-up to the threat of humiliation is a promise of glory if he would but 'reserve your time and your health for other and nobler pursuits.'[220] (392)

Verbal agility such as this, although in this instance centred upon the conduct book paradigm with its concerns of virtue, morality, and peace, is within the Waverley novels the province of those characters of the lower-middle and lower classes. For all that she has fainting fits to rival Edith Bellenden, Catharine Glover is not a typical Scott heroine. Her challenges to authority are overt. She is not reliant on others for help in executing her plans - *she* is the one who arranges Father Clement's escape, who feeds the Prince when he is imprisoned by Ramornay, and whose independence of religious thought leads her and her father into danger. As with all Scott heroines, she must marry at novel's end, yet when that marriage occurs, it is because *Catharine* has 'reflected that men rarely advance in civilisation or refinement beyond the ideas of their own age.' (457) It is this autonomy which in the end makes Catharine, despite the narrative tensions between paradigms of the oral and the literary, the Scottish and the English, a reflection of the balladic paradigm of female conduct.

Serving Lasses: The Ingenue's Opposite

Scott encounters no such linguistic dilemmas in his presentation of the remaining lower class female characters because none of the remaining characters in this group is the novel's 'heroine'. As a result Scott is not required by generic convention to make them either the adorer or the adored; the language used in their presentation is more prosaic, rather than an idealisation of love and romance. Unhampered by the constraints of what is and is not 'appropriate' for the fictional heroine who is representative of Scott's perceived young lady of

---

[220]The language used in this confrontation between a lecherous Stewart and a virtuous Scott woman is highly reminiscent of that used when Alice Lee reproaches Charles II in *Woodstock*. In both cases, Scott must retain some reader sympathy for his fictionalised Stewart.

the upper-middle to upper classes, Scott is able to present characters who 'do' without having either to present narrative circumvention of those actions or to contain them further through the more overt action of a male character.

These characters can and do fill a number of narrative functions in the Waverley novels. *Waverley*'s Alice Bean Lean is best remembered by the reader as the woman who returns Waverley's letters to him. In addition to her role as courier, Scott presents Alice in her Highland social context, and foreshadows what will be the Cuddie/Jenny relationship in hers with Evan Dhu. At novel's end, Alice has been taken out of the Highlands to safety and 'civilisation' by Rose Bradwardine, in whose service she now is. The potential, as is often the case with Scott's fictitious women, is there for Alice to be a far greater participant in the plot of *Waverley* than she is. Rose has no need of a rustic confidante, however, for Flora's more extreme actions and opinions serve to highlight Rose's worth. This pattern is established by Scott in *Waverley*, and continued throughout the Waverley Novels. Where a pair of ingenues exists, there is no need for a servant girl who, in many respects, serves as her mistress's tie to a passing or past mode of feminine conduct.[221] Alice, for example, only becomes Rose's servant *after* Culloden, and Flora's exile to France, make it possible.

On two occasions, however, the lower class maiden serves the opposite function in the heroine's life. Both *The Betrothed* and *Quentin Durward* have heroines who are in some way connected to the ballad tradition. In the case of Eveline Berenger, it is her belief in and sighting of the family ghost which place her firmly in the 'old' Celtic tradition rather than in the 'new' Norman future of her betrothed and her beloved. Isabelle of Croye's connection to the 'old' traditions is somewhat more tenuous, but equally valid. Her headstrong quest for the right to determine for herself whom she will marry and her willingness to renounce everything should she be denied that right, as discussed earlier, recall the sexually independent ballad heroine. Isabelle is also the subject of a Scottish prophecy involving the fate of the Durward family; something purely 'literary' ladies are not. This use of the ballad paradigm in the presentation of the ingenue makes it necessary for Scott to present the servants of these

---

[221]cf. Poovey, p. 43 for discussion of the lower-class double.

characters as pragmatic, 'modern' young women. Interestingly, both lasses are Flemish, and both the daughters of tradesmen. Scott is here making use of the stereotype of the Dutchman - pragmatic, phlegmatic, stoic - and transposing it onto female characters. *The Betrothed*'s Rose Flammock all but ridicules Eveline's vision of the ghost. *Quentin Durward*'s Trudchen, while undoubtedly attracted by the romantic aspects of Isabelle's flight, is nevertheless given:

> a long practical lecture [...] upon the folly of reading romances, whereby the flaunting ladies of the Court were grown so bold and venturous, that, instead of applying to learn some honest housewifery, they must ride [...] a damsel-erranting through the country [...] to the great danger of their health, the impoverishing of their substance, and the irreparable prejudice of their reputation (*QD* 298)

by her mother. When one considers Scott's belief in the tradition of the minstrel or bard as creator of the ballads, one appreciates that the romances in question are the *lais* of medieval France, rather than those of eighteenth and nineteenth century fiction. Despite this, for all the 'modern' features of these young women, particularly their rejection of romance, and tradesman father, one can but wonder how many of Scott's 'typically' Netherlandish characteristics can be traced to the broadsheet songs of the eighteenth century.[222]

Not all female servant/companions are as distinctive as Alice Bean Lean or the two Flemish girls. There are several serving-girls who are type only. They play no significant part in the development of the narrative, and do not provide significant commentary either upon developing historic events or upon the specific actions of their mistresses as presented by Scott. There is nothing technically incorrect about this. Scott is simply utilising a stock character who possesses a set of stock responses. They do not add any significant 'local colour' to the novel; they do not in any way serve to enlighten the reader to the customs and practices of a past age, or to the tensions extant between narrative paradigms. As a result, they are interchangeable at best.

What is significant about these characters, however, is the novels to which they belong. None of the Scottish novels (in which ingenue pairs are absent) lacks its memorable

---

[222]cf. 'Bonnie Highland Laddie', whose heroine rejects the 'Butter Box' for her 'Highland Laddie'. Quoted in Murray G. H. Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth Century Britain and Ireland*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994), p. 142.

lower class lass. The novels where the heroine has a servant and/or companion who does not stay in the reader's memory are all novels set outwith Scotland. This is a telling example of Scott's inability to create vivid female characters when he is unfamiliar with socio-cultural paradigms of female conduct for the locale and/or period in question. His maidservants in *Anne of Geierstein, Peveril of the Peak,* and *Woodstock*, are essentially the same basic character. They are loyal to their mistress over any other authority, escort visitors in and out of their mistress's presence, and serve as chaperone when the ingenue is being visited by the hero. They do nothing without being told, and that which they do is often an action which the ingenue in question is unable to execute (although she most likely was at least somewhat responsible for its creation) because of socially-imposed constraints on her behaviour.

There are those maidservants/companions whose presentation reflects Scott's perceptions of class-based standards of female conduct. I propose, therefore, to explore the portrayals of the five most distinctive. Not all of these characters are Scots. Not all of them are servants, in the true sense of the word. What they do have in common is an initiative and a freedom of movement that their wealthy counterpart lacks. What will need to be determined then, is in what manner the presentation of these characters reflects Scott's use of his paradigm of lower-class female conduct. These five are: Janet Foster (*Kenilworth*); Jenny Rintherout (*The Antiquary*); Louise the glee-maiden (*Fair Maid of Perth*); Mysie Happer (*The Monastery*); and Jenny Dennison (*Old Mortality*).

Janet Foster is the only character among the five selected serving girls whose presentation has no parallels with the oral tradition, and the paradigm of female conduct found therein. As a result, I would suggest, she is more readily cowed than the remaining four by those in positions of authority: a subservience arising in part from the self-serving nature of the conduct of her mistress, Amy Robsart. Structurally, there will be less need for the lass's assistance in circumventing societal constraints on feminine behaviour as delineated in the conduct books. Janet is not the vocal, headstrong young woman which, for example, Mysie Happer is. She is also the only character among this group of characters for whom Scott lacks any Scottish cultural referent: something which, as I have demonstrated,

affected Scott's ability to deviate from expected patterns of feminine passivity. Janet is also unique among this quintet in that she remains ultimately under patriarchal authority until her father's disappearance.

It is in the presentation of this relationship that the greatest contrast occurs between Janet and the other young women. While Janet serves Amy at Cumnor, she is still subject to her father's control. There are evidences that Janet is sufficiently aware of her father's avarice and hypocrisy that she does not obey him without question. However, the fact remains that she is not the overtly self-willed woman the others are. I would suggest that Scott's awareness of the relationship between female passivity and a lack of economic autonomy is reflected in his presentation of Janet, a presentation which is least reliant on the paradigm of lower class behaviour found in the oral tradition. Those actions she does undertake to aid Amy are not of Janet's instigation, but of Wayland Smith's. Because she lacks the physical independence of the other characters, (she has not 'left home') there is a corresponding lack of verbal independence. She, like all characters of this class, serves to some extent as a foil for her mistress. In a reversal of the passive heroine/active servant formula discussed by Poovey, Amy is the self-serving woman and her servant Janet is correspondingly subdued. I would suggest that Janet's passivity is, however, a reflection of her submission to patriarchal authority rather than a reflection of the primacy of the conduct-book paradigm in her characterisation.

Scott provides a description of Janet's physiognomy which emphasises 'the contrast which the extreme simplicity of her dress and the prim demureness of her looks made with a very pretty countenance and *a pair of black eyes that laughed in spite of their mistress's desire to look grave*.' (*K* 79, emphasis mine) These laughing eyes recollect Margaret Ramsay's, and the difficulty both have with conformity to the paradigm of female passivity is similar. For all its brevity, this description, and the interchange with Leicester which follows, provide the reader with a great deal of insight into Janet Foster. She is not the devoted Puritan that she appears to be. Her protestations against accepting the Earl's ring fool no one - Leicester remarks that her 'father is of the same congregation in sincerity.' (*K* 79)

Scott has already made the reader aware of Foster's pragmatic conversion to the Puritan tenets, and Leicester's jibe becomes a commentary on Janet's equally pragmatic, street-wise nature.

This awareness of the dichotomy between appearance and reality which Amy lacks is repeatedly displayed in Janet's dealings with her noble mistress. Wayland Smith's news that Leicester is to marry Elizabeth prompts Janet to remind her irate mistress these are, after all, 'pedlar's tidings', and therefore unreliable. (246) It is Janet who, after overhearing Lambourne's drunken ravings about poisons, believes Wayland's warnings, and ensures that Amy takes the antidote. Yet, she does so circumspectly, 'determined to keep secret from the Countess the dreadful surmises which she could not help entertaining.' (251) Her discovery of her father's treachery forces Janet to choose to 'act betwixt [her] duty to yonder unhappy man, and that which I owe to you.' (271) I would suggest that here, Janet moves from circumspection to overt activity because her father's treachery has rendered his authority over her void.

She leaves Cumnor to meet Wayland Smith, and to begin to effect Amy's flight. Upon her return, she finds her mistress swooning, believing herself poisoned by Varney. In what follows, we see the first direct evidences of Scott's use of the paradigm of conduct found in the ballad tradition. Having cajoled the Countess into believing herself fit for the journey, Janet next explains the manner in which the plans were laid, and the two prepare for Amy's flight. In giving Janet the knowledge of these plans, Scott provides reinforcement of Amy's orality, discussed in chapter three. Female orality, and its corresponding autonomy here predominate in Scott's characterisations.

Despite the predominance of female autonomy which results from male treachery and betrayal, Scott nevertheless inserts a narrative comment about the need for Janet's defiance of her father's authority: 'that anything short of the dreadful suspicions which the scene of that evening had excited could have induced Janet to violate her word, or deceive her father's confidence. But [...] she now conceived herself not only justified, but imperatively called upon, to make her lady's safety the principal object of her care [...]'. (278) I would

suggest that Foster's betrayal of his loyalty to Amy makes Janet's to her father void. As we have seen elsewhere, in the ballad paradigm of female conduct troths broken result in tragedy: Janet, alone among the inhabitants of Cumnor does not share this fate. Janet releases herself from her duty to her father, but it is for self-less, rather than selfish reasons.

Janet's concern for her mistress prompts her to question Amy about her destination; an act which earns her a rebuke from Amy for 'abus[ing] my situation, Janet, [...] and [...] forget[ting] your own.' Instead of staying silent and deferring to her mistress, Janet reminds Amy that hers is a secret marriage, so that 'the noble Earl [...] may preserve his court-favour [...] and can you think that your sudden appearance at his castle, at such a juncture, and in such a presence, will be acceptable to him?' (280) It is the maid who has accurately assessed the realities of the situation, and the mistress whose concern with appearance provides the impetus for her downfall. It is with this decrease in Amy's autonomy, that Scott realises Janet's potential representation of the ballad paradigm most effectively.

The Antiquary's Jenny Rintherout makes only one appearance in that novel as an individual (as opposed to 'Monkbarns's maid'), but it is worthy of note because it is an example of Scott's ability to express his standards of conduct for a working-class lass through dialogue. For the Scots-speaker, Scott's choice of name for Jenny serves to indicate her disposition. According to *The Concise Scots Dictionary*, Jenny's surname means 'a vagrant, roving person'[223], a definition that Jenny's explanation of her visit to the Mucklebackits confirms: 'Sae, as soon as our auld folk gaed to bed, I e'en snodded my head up a bit , and left the house-door on the latch, in case onybody should be wanting in or out while I was awa, and just cam down the gate to see an there was ony cracks amang ye.' (*Ant* 252) The real reason Jenny has come down to the Mucklebackits' cottage is to see if her lover, Steenie, is about.

Like the true ballad heroine, Jenny will go where she will, as she will. She will not be dictated to about her choice of lover, and retorts to Steenie's mother that she 'maun hae a

---

[223]*The Concise Scots Dictionary*, ed. by Mairi Robinson, (Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1985), p. 563.

man that can mainteen his wife.' (252) What follows the retort is a brief but effective summary of the greater importance of women in the Scottish lower-class family unit. What Jenny perceives as the slavery of the fishwives, is in fact the reality of their liberation - a liberation which gives them greater voice within and without their microcosm of society. '[C]a' the head o' the house slaves? little ye ken about it , lass. [...] them that sell the goods guide the purse - them that guide the purse rule the house. Show me ane o' yer bits o' farmer-bodies that wad let their wife drive the stock to the market, and ca' in the debts.' (252-3) Scott's inclusion of this interchange reflects his awareness of the differences in the role of women not only between classes, but also within classes.

The scene also emphasises the importance of the oral tradition as a method of historical 'record'-keeping. Old Elspeth, as the Countess Glenallan's former companion, is the source of all information on the Glenallans. She is the one to whom her daughter-in-law turns for the reason that the family is 'bury[ing] the auld carlin [...] in the night-time? - I dare say our gudemither will ken.' (253) The women learn from another woman the reason for the night-time burial, and are also given a glimpse into the recent history of the family with Elspeth's allusion to the Countess's betrayal of her son. I will discuss the centrality of old Elspeth's orality in chapter six, below.

With the arrival of the longed-for Steenie, Jenny once again takes centre stage, baiting the object of her desire because she is 'impatient of remaining so long unnoticed.' (258) This action, like Jenny's departure from Monkbarns's house, and serves to underscore yet again the class-based paradigm of female conduct in operation. Jenny's action provokes the 'suitable response of rustic raillery', and Scott begins to draw the scene to a close. (258) Given the tradition of the sexually independent ballad heroine, in conjunction with the association of orality and the lower classes prevalent in Scott's day, one can deduce what Scott means by 'rustic raillery'.[224] However, Scott ensures that his reader gets a further glimpse of the extent of rustic courtship, and of its disparity from non-rustic courtship, with the simple statement that 'Steenie, notwithstanding his preceding fatigue, had the gallantry to

---

[224]cf. Crawford, *Society and the Lyric*, pp. 16-52.

accompany Miss Rintherout to her own mansion, and *at what hour he returned the story saith not.*' (258-59, emphasis mine) Scott cannot be too explicit in his description, but an audience familiar with the ballads of rural courtship would, despite the literary English, certainly be able to draw their own (explicit) conclusions with ease.

The brief scene in the Mucklebackits' cottage serves to underscore Scott's perception of the differences between the haves and the have-nots in Scottish society. Jenny has the freedom to leave the house and visit her lover well after her employers are in bed because: she knows that the Mucklebackits lifestyle is not regulated by the clock, and, more importantly, because she has the freedom of movement given to one who controls the purse. Jenny is, chronologically, the first Scott lass whose conduct is a reflection of the ballad paradigm; independent, headstrong, and outspoken, she serves not as companion for but as contrast to Isabella Wardour's feminine passivity.

Unlike the other characters discussed in this chapter, *The Fair Maid of Perth*'s Louise the glee-maiden has no master to whose ultimate authority she must submit. Not surprisingly, such total independence makes her more resourceful than the other lasses. As Scott shows, it also puts her at greater risk. While there is no one to whom she is answerable, there is also no one to whom others answer for their treatment of her. As a woman, Louise does not bear arms; she is therefore unable to protect herself physically. I would suggest that in certain aspects of this characterisation, Scott's class and gender biases are apparent. His use of the ballad paradigm is indicated first through her profession rather than through narrative development. It is important here to remember Scott's own belief in the 'bardic' origins of the ballads he and others collected; as a practitioner of the 'Joyous Science', Louise is one such 'bard'. (*FMP* 121)

In addition to this nod to his belief in ballad-creation, Scott uses Louise as an indicator of his class based associations of female immorality with female orality. Through Louise Scott reminds his reader that the potential for something other than 'happily ever after' does exist in the ballads. The first textual indicator that the glee-maiden is less than gleeful comes, appropriately enough, through the song she sings in the courtyard: her 'inappropriate'

sexual activity is linked to her orality. Its subject is of love betrayed, innocence taken, and death longed for. Although the description of Louise's physical appearance indicates a frivolous minstrel, Scott takes care in the next paragraph to suggest that this is merely for appearance's sake:

> We have said the glee-maiden's manner was lively, and we may add, that her smile and repartee were ready. But her gaiety was assumed as a quality essentially necessary to her trade, of which it was one of the miseries, that the professors were obliged to cover an aching heart with a compelled smile. This seemed to be the case with Louise, who, whether she was actually the heroine of her own song, [...] showed at times a strain of deep melancholy thought, which interfered with and controlled the natural flow of lively spirits, which the practice of the Joyous Science especially required. *She lacked also, even in her gayest sallies, the decided boldness and effrontery of her sisterhood, who were seldom at a loss to retort a saucy jest, or turn the laugh against any who interrupted or interfered with them.* (129 emphasis mine)

Lacking in the boldness of her contemporaries, as envisaged by Scott, Louise is dissociated somewhat from the unladylike forwardness of her profession. As a result, Louise is more isolated than the 'life too irregular and precarious' which dictates that she is somewhat less than a 'creditable part of society' would ordinarily make her, for she is also isolated from the sisterhood of her discipline. (130) Incapable of the repartee which would enable her to evade Rothsay's advances, (which Catharine does possess) Louise finds herself the object of Douglas's wrath, and the passive centre of a quarrel between the two men.[225] To protect her from his father-in-law's brutality, Rothsay entrusts her to Harry Smith. The good smith, whose 'manly heart' will not allow a woman, whatever her profession, to be beaten by the followers of the Douglas takes her out of the monastery, preparing to set her on her way and dissociate himself from her. (139) I would suggest that in this objectification of Louise, Scott is attempting another dissociative tactic: her passivity here underscores the inherent modesty which Scott has already indicated differentiates her from her peers.

> Scott has made much, in narratorial asides, of the social stigma attached to Louise as a travelling minstrel. 'It may be here remarked, that it was impossible that this class of women, very numerous in that age, could bear a character generally respectable.' (129)

---

[225]Scott here again emphasises Louise's association with the ballad tradition, having Rothsay call her 'my nut-brown maid', an appellation which is also the title of 'The Nut Brown Maiden'. (131)

Although Harry's attitude toward his unwanted charge begins to change when she is 'in decent dress', he too reflects the prejudices of his age, telling Louise that they 'must part sooner than perhaps a light-o'-love such as you expected to part with'. (142-3) Here again, Louise does not respond as the bawd she is believed to be, and 'wept silently, [...] as one who *felt an insult which she had not a right to complain of.*' (143, emphasis mine) Harry still treats Louise as he believes her social position, or lack thereof, entitle her to be treated. Not until he sees her distress on believing herself abandoned is he at all kind to her. For a third time, Scott places Louise at a remove from the stigma associated with the cultural paradigm of conduct in which he quite explicitly grounds her.

As Harry begins to piece together Louise's story, the reader realises that she was, in fact, the subject of her song. She is not then, a light skirt, but one who has been wronged by a false lover. Hers is a ballad story gone wrong - hence her longing for death.[226] Pity for her prompts Harry to take her to his house, despite the risk to his reputation should he be seen with her. He then takes Louise's part against his housekeeper, making a point of telling the older woman that Louise 'is no leman of mine, nor of any other person that I know of', and that she is merely 'a poor broken-hearted thing, that, if she hath done evil has dreed a sore weird for it.' (153, 155) Note here Scott's use of the Scots 'weird' in place of the English 'fate'. This choice, for a novel so lacking in Scots is, I would suggest, a deliberate one, for the connotations are of destiny, and of preordination with supernatural overtones. In making Harry speak Scots in conversation with and in speaking of Louise, Scott, having made her morality explicit, associates her (despite her Mediterranean origins) with the Scottish ballad tradition.

Scott repeatedly emphasises Louise's inability to think on her feet. He does so yet again when the two women are imprisoned at Falkland. Scott takes great care to contrast the skills of his lasses, emphasising that Catharine is 'prompt and bold on occasions of moment, while yielding to her companion in ingenuity of resource on ordinary occasions.'

---

[226]cf. 'Fair Annie' C 62, 'Lord Thomas and Fair Annet' C 73, 'Fair Margaret and Sweet William' C 74, and 'Lord Lovel' C 75 for examples of this balladic type. Child, II, pp. 63-83; 179-213.

(399) In his presentation of the two women, Scott draws on the ballad paradigm of female autonomy, but is careful to dissociate both from the cultural expectations of immorality which are linked to it. Catherine is quick-witted, but associated with no overt female sexuality, while Louise's resourcefulness is that taught by necessity, rather than an inherent quick-wittedness which recalls the sexually active resourceful heroine of the ballads. It is this distinction, although a minor one, which in the end dictates Louise's fate. Lacking the boldness and wit necessary to attain the sexual reward of the ballad heroine, Scott places his glee-maiden under the protection of Henry and Catharine, as nursemaid to their child. While a deviation from Scott's established connections between this character and the oral tradition, it is, within the context of his sanitisation of that tradition apt. Louise's life as a glee-maiden has been such that she cannot marry without violating the expectations of female conduct of Scott's moral and enlightened readership. She has, however, done nothing within the context of the novel which demonstrates her immorality: her characterisation is therefore compromise between balladic autonomy and conduct-book dictated helplessness.

The Monastery's Mysie Happer is possessed of all the quick-wittedness which Louise lacks. It is not surprising that where Louise fails, Mysie succeeds and marries Piercie Shafton. Again, Scott gives his reader physical clues to his character's personality.

> The countenance itself was exceedingly comely - the eyes black, large, and roguishly good-humoured - the mouth was small - the lips well formed, though somewhat full - the teeth were pearly white - and the chin had a very seducing dimple in it. The form belonging to this joyous face was full and round, and firm and fair. (*M* 157)

This is no ethereal beauty who is only just spared the charge of insipidity. Note that the language used by Scott is highly sensual; in addition to their form, Mysie's lips are full. He very explicitly describes her dimple as 'seducing', and her form as 'buxom'. (157) As such, she is Mary Avenel's opposite; 'nothing, indeed, could exhibit a stronger contrast than the appearance of the two girls'. (163) This physical contrast, Scott takes care to explain extends to all aspects of their characters; Mysie, while not Mary's servant, is her lower-class double.[227] Mysie 'had dwelt too near the Convent to be altogether ignorant of the noble art of

---

[227]cf. Poovey, p. 43.

cookery', and she is fully capable of being left in charge of the preparations for the Abbot's dinner - unlike Mary, 'who was so brought up that she [Dame Glendinning] could entrust nothing to her care, unless it might be seeing the great chamber strewed with rushes, and ornamented with such flowers and branches as the season might afford.' (184) Mysie's upbringing has taught her those duties which under Scott's schematic of old and new marks her out as associated with an older cultural paradigm of autonomous female behaviour.[228]

Mention is made in Scott's initial description of Mysie of an aspect of her character in which 'Nature had mingled the good-humour with which she had endowed the damsel with no small portion of shrewdness' and her actions in effecting Piercie's escape bear this out. (157) Note that the same adjective is used to describe the Miller's daughter as was used by Scott in his description of Margaret Ramsay. Shrewdness, it seems, is for Scott associated with those women from trading families, a distinction which underscores his class-based perceptions of acceptable female activity. Mysie, who has been enamoured of the Euphuist since his arrival at Glendearg, has unwittingly overheard the conference between Piercie and Fr. Eustace regarding the duel with Halbert, and the assumption of Piercie's guilt. Her original purpose of escaping from the interior chamber without being discovered changes to one of rescuing Piercie. Scott describes Mysie as being:

> of a simple and affectionate, but at the same time an alert and enterprising character, possessing more than female strength of body, and more than female courage, though with feelings as capable of being bewildered with gallantry of dress and language, as a fine gentleman of any generation would have desired to exercise his talents upon. (310)

What is interesting about this description is that Scott is not in any way detracting from Mysie's femininity; exceedingly strong and clever, she is, nevertheless, as likely to have her head turned as the next woman. As with the 'hoydenish' ingenues, Scott here emphasises Mysie's femininity as a means of reducing the power of her upcoming action.

Unlike the ballad heroines, Mysie has second thoughts about the prudence of her plan. Her concern with her ruined reputation lasts only momentarily, but it is enough to

---

[228]cf. Rosalind Marshall, *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080-1980*, (London: Collins Sons, 1983) and Alice Clark, *Working Life of Women in the Seventeenth Century*, (London and New York: Routledge, 1919; repr. 1992) for discussion of the extent of female activity in the centuries prior to Scott's life.

ensure that any presumption by the reader of lower-class immorality is negated. With a glance in the mirror at 'a countenance and eyes, pretty and sparkling at all times, but ennobled at present with the energy of expression proper to those who have dared to form, and stand prepared to execute, deeds of generous audacity', Mysie's doubts disappear in the naive belief that her beauty and the debt of gratitude will be sufficient to close the gap between their ranks. Such an attitude could still be construed by the reader to be unacceptably bold, and in narratorial comment, Scott condescendingly poses a 'question which female vanity asked of fancy' to dissociate Mysie still further from the associations of immorality which accompany his use of ballad paradigm and formula in the action which follows. (310)

As in his presentation of Louise, this comment serves as a sop to the class and gender biases of his age, rather than a consistent application of the balladic paradigm of conduct to his character. The ballad heroine does not have second thoughts about the course of action she is undertaking. 'Young Beichan' 's Suzy Pye first '[...] bribed her father's men/Wi meikle goud and white money,/She's gotten the key o' the prison doors,/An she has set Young Bicham free.' Then, when he failed to return in the agreed-upon seven years, 'She's set her foot on good ship-board,/An turnd her back on her ain country.'[229] (A text) Once Scott has Mysie determine her course of action, like the ballad heroine on whose actions hers are modelled, she does not waver. The waffling which occurs prior to the escape is an acknowledgement of the cultural expectations of his readers rather than an unexpurgated application of the paradigm.

As in 'Young Beichan' above, or in 'The Fair Flower of Northumberland' (C 9) whose eponymous heroine steals 'her father's ring', 'much gold' and 'Two gallant steeds' prior to effecting the Scottish prisoner's escape, the escape itself is planned and performed entirely by a resourceful, autonomous woman.[230] It is Mysie who wakes Piercie, and tells him to 'be silent [...] for if your speech betrays that you are awake, my scheme fails utterly.' (313) His

---

[229]Child, I, p. 464.
[230]Child, I, p. 114.

dithering over which items of his wardrobe to take (an interesting reversal of gender expectations) prompts her to tell him 'in plain terms that he should either make up his baggage for the enterprise, or forget about it entirely.' (314) This is clearly no submissive lady concerned with society's expectations over situation-driven realities. Indeed, Piercie's only contribution to their escape, brought about by his 'desire that the great work of his liberation should [not] be executed without the interposition of his own ingenuity' gives away his identity and nearly gets the pair killed. (317)

Once free of the tower, Scott digresses from his balladic source material to offer commentary on Piercie's ignorance of 'those degrading and mischievous pursuits which are usually termed 'low amours'.' (320) Here again we see Scott's association of the oral tradition with the lower classes. Piercie's ignorance, which I would suggest Scott intends to be taken as part of the dichotomy between his presentation of English and Scottish society, prompts Piercie to leave Mysie on the road to her father's mill, rather than take her with him; it quite simply does not occur to the Euphuist that Mysie's action has cost her family and home. Once the all-too-courtly Sir Piercie asks 'the fair Mysinda to go along with him - "At least [...] until I shall be able to conduct you to a place of safety."' the ballad plot is back on track, and Mysie and her knight recommence their flight. (322)

Scott takes care here to remind his reader that Mysie was 'as bold and sharp-witted in some points as she was simple and susceptible in others' before informing us that she 'now took in some degree the direction' of their flight. (323) Scott again reminds his reader of Mysie's femininity: forward though her action may be, she is 'only' a woman whose head may be easily turned. On their arrival at the inn, it is Mysie who concocts a story about an escort given, a lame horse, and the desire to give her father's client the knight's business. She and Piercie are welcomed, and given the best fare the house has to offer. Having already subtly reminded his reader that Mysie's resourcefulness is class-based, Scott explicitly reminds his reader (and the increasingly attracted Sir Piercie) that Mysie is no heroine of pastoral. Serving Piercie was not 'taught her by Love, to serve the beloved only, but arose from the ordinary and natural habits of a miller's daughter.' (326) This realisation

brings Piercie's Arcadian fancies crashing down around him. He, Scott assures his reader, has no dishonourable intentions toward the girl, but is aware (at last) that 'there was something ridiculous in travelling the land with a miller's daughter behind his saddle, giving rise to suspicions not very creditable to either'. (327)

Having very honourably resolved to separate, Piercie finds that Mysie has already left him. Here again, Scott demonstrates Mysie's class-based resourcefulness. The cover-story she concocted would hardly have allowed for her continued presence at the inn whatever Piercie might believe. The reader familiar with the ballad tradition knows that there is no possibility of Mysie having gone home. This same reader knows that the next step the clever ballad heroine would take is to assume the guise of a boy. Mysie and her creator both know their ballads, for, as Piercie takes the road to Edinburgh, he is joined by a boy seeking 'service in some nobleman's family'. (329) Scott digresses from the ballad tradition here, for the discovery of the 'page's' identity occurs in the ballads after she has given birth to her lover's child.[231] Given the associations of the ballad tradition with immoral female conduct, Scott here has to deviate from his paradigm and acknowledge his society's expected standards of feminine conduct for working-class women. Such close adherence to his balladic paradigm of female conduct would be unacceptable in a genre increasingly associated with the middle class, polite society of which Scott was a part.[232] Scott contents himself with Mysie's explanation of how and where she came by her attire and horse, and her hope that she might continue to render the knight protections such as she has already given him.

Mysie's resourcefulness once again saves Piercie, this time from the English. Such resourcefulness is ultimately rewarded, although the reward comes with further humiliation for the knight. Not only has he been rescued by a maiden more than once, but his true

---

[231]In 'Child Waters' (C 63), Fair Ellen disguises herself as a pageboy to accompany Child Waters, and is not known by those in his hall to be a woman until she has given birth in the stables. Child, II, pp. 83-100.

[232]cf. Ina Ferris *The Achievement of Literary Authority: Gender, History and the Waverley Novels*. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1991), pp. 22-35. That virtue was rewarded while sexual activity punished in the literary world of the mid eighteenth century is seen most clearly in the fates of Pamela and Clarissa Harlowe.

identity as the grandson of a tailor is revealed for all to know. This social humiliation is a wholly literary touch on Scott's part, for the balladic hero does not ordinarily possess such a common heritage. Nevertheless, such ensures that Mysie remains firmly within her class when she is rewarded. Scott makes it clear that despite Piercie's assurances that 'the ceremonial hath been solemnly performed', the two will be married again, for 'it is always best to be sure.' (421). Here again, we see Scott making allowances for his audience, for as I have discussed in chapter one above, the declaration, under Scots law, legitimates Piercie and Mysie's marriage. In addition, the reader familiar with the ballad tradition knows that the quick-witted heroine always emerges as the bride rather than as the leman. There is, therefore, no reason either under the law of the land, or under the tradition on which Scott has drawn, for this second ceremony. However, it does serve as one more tactic of distancing Mysie's sexually-motivated autonomous action from the associative immorality of the cultural paradigm of female conduct on which Scott drew in her creation.

The lass who consistently garners the most approval from literary critics is *Old Mortality*'s Jenny Dennison. This is due to the fact that Jenny, unlike Mysie, is not presented as participant in a secondary plot which is an amalgamation of several ballads. Consequently, Scott need not dissociate her as he does Mysie and Louise from the associations of immorality which accompany his direct application of the ballad paradigm to their characters. Jenny's positive reception by the critics is related to the fact that in her characterisation, Scott has utilised every aspect of the paradigm discussed above. Like Jenny Rintherout, she is a linguistic product of Scott's perception of lower-class women: her Scots identifies her with her class, but does not marginalise her within her social construct. Unlike Janet Foster, whose characterisation is perhaps closest to the conduct-book paradigm, Jenny is possessed of the independence that comes with leaving her parents' home to enter service. Unlike Louise, Jenny is sufficiently resourceful and quick-witted to act as the situation warrants - without allowing rank or reputation to interfere with those actions. Finally, Jenny is possessed of the independence of action which characterises the ballad heroine, but is not, like Mysie Happer, an amalgam of features of that tradition.

Jenny's initial speech indicates her origins in the ballad paradigm, for she tells her mistress that she 'can sune learn wha he is [...] if the sodgers were anes settled and at leisure, for I ken ane o' them very weel - the best-looking and the youngest o' them.' (*OM* 109) Not only is the girl resourceful, but is sufficiently quick to have determined that the best source of information is a man who is interested in her. Jenny here makes full use of whatever is to hand - in this case herself - to gain the information desired by her mistress. Because Jenny's action is self-less, her use of her sexuality is not undermined by Scott; it is not a threat to her relationship with the power structure of her social microcosm because she uses it in the service of that power.

Jenny, as I have discussed in chapter four, initiates Edith's visit to Morton and makes her mistress promise to let her take charge of the situation, 'I'll e'en take the risk o't and try to manage Tam Halliday; but ye maun let me hae my ain gate, and no speak ae word'. (110) Manage Tam she does. It is not insignificant, given the association of the song tradition with women of the lower class, that Jenny announces her presence to Tam by 'taking up the tune which he hummed, she sung in a *coquettish tone of rustic raillery*.' (111) Having established the role Jenny is to play in this scene, Scott then takes her flirtations as far as he can without making his lass appear to be improper in her conduct. Note that Jenny holds out the promise of her sexuality, but never delivers what is offered. She denies him a kiss with 'a look and tone expressing just the necessary degree of contempt at the proposal', yet bribes him to gain access to Morton's cell. (112) One would expect this to occur, but the reasons Jenny gives for the bribe being a piece of silver rather than gold demonstrate to the reader where Jenny's priorities lie. Jenny's primary reason for silver being 'ower gude for the like o' him' is first that Trooper Tam 'disna care for the blink o' a bonny lassie's ee' and then that 'he wad think there was something mair in't than a kinswoman o' mine.' (113) Here again, Scott places the emphasis on Jenny's sexuality, but does not make her sexually active; rather, she is sexually attractive. When the bribe fails to have the desired effect, Jenny plays one lover against the other, mentioning the things that Cuddie would do for her without question. It

must be stressed that Jenny never makes the transition from flirt to lover - she uses her wits, but not her body to achieve her ends.[233]

The pattern established in this scene, of Jenny using her person to gain access and/or information for her mistress is one which continues throughout the novel. Jenny's concern is always for her mistress rather than for herself. This concern is not an idealistic one; keeping her mistress from hysterics, and starvation are Jenny's primary concerns. The fact that her life is made easier by a calm mistress and a full stomach makes her pragmatism that much more amusing. Amusing though it is, this is also a very realistic touch on Scott's part. Jenny belongs to that class of society which did not have the time to concern themselves with causes. The same impetus which prompts Cuddie to equivocate before the council prompts Jenny's much quoted comment that 'it's maybe as weel to hae a friend on baith sides.' The remainder of Jenny's pragmatic reflection underscores this: 'for if the whigs suld come to tak the Castle, as it's like they may, when there's sae little victual, [...] ou, in that case, Milnwood and Cuddie wad hae the upper hand, and their friendship wad be worth siller.' (241)

So it proves, for Jenny is able to trade on that friendship when the Tower has been reduced by the besieging Covenanters. Despite 'the thinness of the poor girl's cheek, and the sharpness of her features', which show the effects of the siege, Jenny has lost none of the confidence which characterised her earlier appearances. (272) She is still able to flirt with Cuddie, and remind Morton that her attempt to release Evandale 'wadna be the first time I hae dune my best to serve a friend in captivity'. (273) Jenny alone is sufficiently quick-witted to gain access to the Covenanters camp, and to talk her way out of a potentially dangerous situation. I would suggest that only Jenny could have done so, for she has the mobility of her social position which allows her to utilise her 'friend on baith sides'.

Jenny's success as a representative character is due in no small part to her relationship with Cuddie. The flirtatious bantering between the two is something that does

---

[233]The so-called 'riddling ballads' most clearly demonstrate the heroine's ability to keep her virtue by keeping her wits. cf. Child, I, pp. 1-61.

not occur in other lower-class pairs, and which could not occur among upper-class pairs. Here, there is a healthy sense of the sexual which comes, I would suggest, from the bawdier associations of the ballad paradigm. Drawing on his perceptions of female autonomy in this class, Scott makes Jenny the stronger of the two, and it is she who takes the lead in their relationship both before and after marriage. *She* contrives 'to make up her breach with Cuddie' after the siege of Tillietudlem, and she cannot resist reminding Cuddie of his brose bath to provoke him to take 'his revenge as rustic lovers are wont, and as Jenny probably expected.' (277, 283) What must be noted is that Scott again differentiates between the manner in which rustic lovers take revenge, and the manner in which non-rustic lovers so do. In presenting the Tam-Jenny-Cuddie triangle in opposition to the Evandale-Edith-Morton triad, Scott makes his perception of the distinction between socially-dictated behaviours most apparent.

Scott continues to portray the sexual undertones of Jenny and Cuddie's relationship after their marriage. The reader learns that 'Jenny has sae mony bairns'; 'a girl of about five years old [...] an infant in one arm, and with the other she smoothed down her apron, to which hung a chubby child of two years old [...and] a white-headed rogue of four years.' (353, 348-9) The reader also learns that 'the possession of an active and affectionate husband in her own proper right had altogether allayed her spirit of coquetry.' (370) Scott's syntax is interesting, for it is Jenny who possesses Cuddie, rather than being possessed by Cuddie. The results of Cuddie's 'activity' are obvious, and lead one to speculate that Jenny's marriage provides Scott with sanction for his use of the sexually-active aspects of the ballad paradigm which he has, until now, circumvented in his portrayals of the lasses .

Evidences of Jenny's continued practicality subsequent to her marriage are as numerous as those of her continued sensuality. She is still more astute than her husband, recognising Morton shortly after his arrival at Fairy-Knowe. When she finally reveals Morton's identity to her husband, she prevents him from going to his old master for 'if this marriage wi' Lord Evandale is broken off, what comes o'our ain bit free house, and the kale-yard, and the cow's grass? I trow that baith us and thae bonny bairns will be turned on the wide warld.'

(358) Ultimately, it comes down to the essentials for this peasant woman. Certainly, Miss Edith's happiness is also at stake in the dilemma of to tell or not to tell, but Lord Evandale's ability to provide for the 'leddies' and, more importantly, for the Headriggs is certain. That of Morton is not. It is clear whose case Jenny will therefore work to support.

As I have demonstrated, the lasses differ most from the ladies in that they are not required by their social position to act with any circumspection. Unlike the ladies, they do not need an intermediary to effect their desires. This self-sufficient attitude comes at least in part from a class-based economic necessity which dictates the full participation of all family members, irrespective of age or gender, in the income-generating work of that family. It is this attitude which Scott reflects in his presentation of the fishwives in *The Antiquary*, and it is one which never appears in his presentation of the ingenues, reliant as it is on a paradigm of female dependent conduct. Practicalities also dictate Jenny Dennison's silence on the subject of Morton's return, Louise the glee-maiden's unseemly wanderings, and Janet Foster's 'desertion' of her mistress. Remove the economic necessity, and the pragmatism becomes wilfulness. Margaret Ramsay, for example, dons breeches and attempts to effect Nigel's escape for the simple reason that she wants him as her husband.

Quick-wittedness is the characteristic which indicates most clearly Scott's use of a paradigm of female conduct found in the ballads in directing the actions of this group of characters. Interestingly, among the lasses, the most verbally agile are the most explicitly linked to this paradigm. In the ballads, it is the verbally astute woman who gains the 'happy ending', and so it proves with Scott. This repartee is often used by Scott as a means of dissociating the lass from the more sexually explicit connotations of her actions. Scott's narrative asides never subvert Jenny Dennison's retorts to Cuddie Headrigg and to Tam Halliday; Jenny not only receives the happy ending which is her reward, but through her repartee, provides the impetus to further the plot. Mysie Happer interjects comments to extricate herself and Sir Piercie from hazardous situations which in an ingenue would be inappropriately forward, and twice achieves marriage to a knight. Janet Foster's quick action

saves her mistress from poison, and liberates her from the dilemma of where her loyalties should lie.

All of these characters have unshakeable loyalties: either to a parental authority figure, or to an employer. I would suggest that many of the actions undertaken by the serving lasses which on their own could be construed by the reader as potentially immoral are allowed to pass without comment by Scott because they are undertaken out of duty to another. As in the ballads, each character is rewarded for this fidelity; with one exception, this reward is marriage. The exception among the lasses, Louise, was betrayed by a false lover, and even in the sexually-freer balladic formulae, marriage is not an available option for Scott to take. However, she is rewarded in a manner most appropriate to her status within the society of *The Fair Maid of Perth*, for she, through inclusion in Henry and Catharine's household, is given the social respectability which she lacked.

Scott's reliance on opposing paradigms of female conduct makes the class-based dichotomy between his lasses and his ingenues easily noted. The former, as I have demonstrated, are forthright, quick-witted, and possessed of an economically-dictated level of action not seen in the ingenues. Linguistically, they are, where appropriate, Scots speakers. Conversely, the ingenues do not speak or act independently without great authorial subversion. Their behaviour is circumscribed by the dictates of the conduct book, and however historically inaccurate, their use of English represents Scott's awareness of the associations of this standard of female behaviour with the anglicising professional classes of Edinburgh. In the end these differences in characterisation can be attributed to Scott's perceptions of class-based female conduct. This class-based distinction between predominating paradigms can not be so readily made for the older women. Because the Scots-English, old-new division in the Waverley novels also is made on generational lines, these characters, irrespective of class, are more closely associated with the standards of active female conduct found in the ballad paradigm than in that of the conduct-book's prescribed passivity.

Chapter 6:

Bags and Hags

Unlike those female characters discussed in the preceding chapters, these women are not differentiated in Scott's perceptions of female conduct by their social standing. Instead, they are distinguished solely along generational lines, for it seems to me that here we see that Scott's older woman as representative of a Scottish social schema exists irrespective of class lines. While the ingenues and lasses, as I have demonstrated, quite clearly originate in an Anglo-Scots-literary/Scots-oral cultural tradition, as reflected in the paradigms of the conduct book and the ballads, there is no such paradigmatic distinction made for his older women. They do not have the power given by Scott to his queens, for they remain, because of their gender, comparatively powerless within the political arena. However, their position as mistresses of homes (their own or that of a relative), or of businesses does give them certain autonomies which the ingenues and the lasses lack; it is important to note that while these autonomous actions occur in the female domain of the household, there is an interaction with the 'male' public arenas of politics which is absent in the ingenues. I would suggest that this distinction represents Scott's perception of the greater public power given women in a wholly Scottish social context. This is, then, a diverse cross-section of characters, including but not limited to: the mother-figures of the hero or ingenue; the family retainer who quite possibly occupied the role of lass in the older generation's youth; and the bawd (often a woman of business) who serves, through her immoral conduct, to demonstrate the moral integrity of the ingenue's society. The feature shared by these characters is their adherence to the past; to a standard of female conduct that by novel's end, is no longer viable. This does not necessarily mean that these characters are advocates of one or the other of the political policies of the novel's society, although that is occasionally the case. What is more likely is that these allegiances, as with

the majority of the ingenues and lasses are based upon but not limited by other, 'feminine' loyalties: religion, familial duty, and social expectations or morés.

Interestingly, when this advocacy of a political agenda does occur, it is likely to be affected less by current events, and more by those of the past. It is as unusual for an older woman in a Waverley novel to become actively involved in the contemporary events of the novel as it is for an ingenue or a lass. Here again, there is not the primary concern with the contemporary world-view that Scott presents in their male counterparts. Often, these loyalties when expressed are merely those of habit - they have no real impact on the events of the novel, and are portrayed by Scott as a nostalgia for a romantic youth. Female characters who are sufficiently participant in the politics of the novel to necessitate narrative explanation for their actions are here too the exception rather than the rule.

A further indication that these characters are aligned with a social construct which is passing/past is their use of oral tradition, of legend, and of Scots or vernacular English rather than the 'correct' speech of the ingenues and heroes. Theirs is not a knowledge found in books, but is instead that which has been learned and passed along. This use of story and legend is not limited to the lower class characters, although it is they whose use of legend makes explicit one or more subtexts within the plot. The upper-class characters' use of the oral tradition as teaching tool often takes the form of repetition of family legend(s). This may very well by an attempt by Scott to avoid any connection between his hero/ingenue and their families and an oral tradition which was increasingly perceived to be an illegitimate mode of discourse.[234]

Scott takes care to ensure that among his older women, the least active devotion to a cause, as with the ingenues, is found in members of the upper classes. These characters are as firmly allied to the past as their lower-class counterparts, but their adherence to that cause is elegiac, and therefore passive;[235] the social biases which affect Scott's application

---

[234]cf. Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth Century Scottish Fiction*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), pp. 23-29.

[235]I would suggest that much of this elegiac relationship to their cause, which is unilaterally Jacobitism, is due to Scott's own knowledge of Jacobitical women of the early nineteenth century. This sentimental attachment to a cause which is truly lost forever is most clearly seen in the works of Carolina Oliphant, Lady Nairne.

of cultural paradigm to the younger women impact equally upon his presentation of the older women. As I will demonstrate, this passive attachment, as with certain of his Jacobite ingenues, is anachronistic. When direct action is taken by one of this group, it is centred on the domestic sphere rather than on the public one, and as a result, less likely to be subverted by Scott. These women remain directly associated with the oral tradition to a greater extent than do their younger counterparts.

I would suggest that the balance between the paradigms of female conduct Scott strikes with these characters is an uneasy one. At times his knowledge of the social tensions at play in his text conflicts with his fictional construct, while at others he is able to balance the two with such skill that certain of his older women are in fact 'more truly representative of their background, and are a product of certain material and historical conditions'.[236] Rather than attempt to make overt connections between characters, as with the younger women, I hope instead here to demonstrate Scott's perception of the common socio-cultural background which exists in his representations despite the socio-economic difference which seems at first to divide these characters. Within this category of character, Scott draws on both paradigms of conduct discussed in the preceding chapters, and does not subvert his narrative structure or his characters' actions as he does with the younger women when those paradigms merge.

Incompatible Actions, Past Perspectives

'Elspeth Mucklebackit...is a fragment of the past atoning for the sins of the past, and her remarks offer a strange view of the traditional feudal virtues'.[237] When considered under Scott's own Enlightenment biases toward moderation and rationality, I would suggest that this perspective is far less strange than Gordon believes. The Countess Glenallan abused her servant's allegiance by involving her in Eveline Neville's death. That this blind fidelity to the

---

[236]Kurt Wittig, 'High Water Mark: Walter Scott', in *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*, (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1958; repr. Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1972), pp. 221-38 (p. 227).

[237]Robert C. Gordon, *Under Which King? A Study of the Scottish Waverley Novels*, (London: Oliver & Boyd, 1969), p. 36.

Glenallans exists long after Elspeth's service has ended is made clear by Scott throughout *The Antiquary*. Subsequent to his mother's death, Elspeth will still only reveal the truth to Earl Glenallan, as head of the family; all promises of silence made to his predecessor rendered void. 'But is she e'en ca'd to the lang account? [...] Then I'll unlade my mind, come o't what will.' (*Ant* 260)

The first inkling Scott gives his reader that Elspeth is possessed of greater knowledge than anyone, including her own family, suspects is seen in the Mucklebackits' discussion of the Countess's death. 'She kens mair about the Glenallan family than maist folk - the gudeman's father was their fisher mony a day' her daughter-in-law explains. (255) Yet the old woman's knowledge hints at her relationship with the family being more than that: 'if his father had lived they might hae been happy folk! But he was gane, and the lady carried it in-ower and out-ower wi' her son...'. (256) The wife of the family's fisher would not, even under Scott's perceived and constructed fluid Scottish social structure, have had sufficient contact with the family to know that the root of the family's unhappiness was the relationship between mother and son; and that the mother's actions were what precipitated this grief. The reason for old Elspeth 'kenning mair' than others, is revealed in her interview with the Earl. 'I was the favourite and confidential attendant of Joscelind, Countess of Glenallan. [...] I shared her regard for mony years.' (305)

As she recalls the events of twenty-three years ago, Elspeth's speech, interestingly, demonstrates:

> none of the verbiage or circumlocutory additions natural to those of her sex and condition. In short, her language bespoke a better education, as well as an uncommonly firm and resolved mind, and a character of that sort from which great virtues or great crimes may be naturally expected. (305)

In communicating the truth about Eveline Neville, Elspeth's speech becomes more lucid, her command of an oral mode of discourse the greater. I would suggest that Scott's biases about the inaccuracies, and inadequacies of a purely oral culture are made clear. While Scott here alludes to the power of folk knowledge, and gives Elspeth's speech greater social credence by reducing drastically the number of Scotticisms in it, I would suggest that class-based biases dictate this modification of her speech to place it at a remove from its Scottish

folk cultural origins, and its associated power. Her justification for hating Miss Neville, that she 'hated what my mistress hated, *as was the use with the liege vassals of the house of Glenallan*' contrasts greatly with her petty reason for hating 'Miss Eveline Neville for her ain sake.' (307-8, emphasis mine) That hatred is inspired by Eveline's treatment of Elspeth on the journey from England:

> during our whole journey, she *gecked* and scorned at my northern speech and habit, as her *southland leddies* and *kimmers* had done at the boarding-school, *as they ca'd it*...but let them that scorn the tartan fear the *dirk*! (308)

The increase of Scotticisms in Elspeth's speech, as opposed to Scots pronunciation, as well as her notation of difference between Scotland and England ally her and her actions with a past, Scots-speaking age. Scott's appropriation of balladic motifs of (believed) unwitting incest, and active maternal opposition to the marriage serves to emphasise still further his use of the oral tradition as an indicator of an age which is no longer viable.[238] The rise in Scotticisms in Elspeth's speech parallels the barbarity of her actions toward Eveline. In applying orality, and its cultural associations selectively to his characterisation, Scott indirectly demonstrates the positive side of anglicisation and a corresponding rise in female passivity in Scottish society.

Scott demonstrates the negative aspects of feudal Scottish female autonomy through Elspeth's acknowledgement that 'nae man parted frae his chief for love of gold or of gain, or of right or of wrang. The times are changed, I hear, now.' (309) Her time, and that of the Glenallans 'as I hae heard of in *my* day' is past. (310) Much is made of the fact that the Glenallans she served, and those who served them are no more. Such unthinking loyalty, which can cause so much damage, is no longer part of Scottish society as portrayed by Scott. Saunders and Maggie Mucklebackit lack the respect for Elspeth's 'auld-warld stories' and the authority of her knowledge, for 'there's nane here will think it worth their while to listen

---

[238]cf. 'Sheath and Knife' (C 16), 'The Bonny Hind' (C 50), and 'Lizzy Wan' (C 51). *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, 5 vols, ed. by Francis James Child, (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1882-98; repr. New York: Dover Publications, 1965), I, pp. 185-86; 444-49. All three ballads address incest. Only in 'The Bonny Hind' is the incest truly accidental. In 'Sheath and Knife' and 'Lizzy Wan', the woman is 'wi bairn to [...] her brother'. ('Sheath and Knife' B text, from 'Sir Walter Scott, from his recollection of a nursery-maid's singing'.) Child, I, p. 186. 'Clyde's Water' (C 216), in which the mothers of both lovers interfere in the relationship will be discussed fully in my analysis of Lady Ashton, below.

to him [Glenallan] or you either.' (303) The next generation believes neither in the legitimacy of orally-transmitted knowledge nor in the feudal structure of society. Interestingly, this is an attitude shared by Scott in this instance, for even Elspeth knows where the documented proofs of her story used to be kept.[239]

The obsessive guilt suffered by Elspeth Mucklebackit over an action motivated by an archaic allegiance is seen in another of Scott's older women. Elspat MacTavish's crime is far greater, however, for it is perpetrated on *her* only child, thereby violating her primary social duty as woman and mother. As with other of Scott's women, Elspat's physical appearance is the first indication of her disposition: 'There was in her countenance the stern abstraction of hopeless and overpowering sorrow, mixed with the contending feelings of remorse, and of the pride which struggled to conceal it.' Despite the relative neatness of her appearance, in her eyes 'shone the wild and troubled light that indicates an unsettled mind'. (*CC* 420) Her madness has resulted from the broken relationship through Elspeth's betrayal of mother and son; her punishment is to live with the realisation of her action.[240]

Despite the fact that 'The Highland Widow' is the story of a mother's betrayal of her child, Scott chooses a title for his story which emphasises Elspat's relationship with her husband rather than that with her son. Claire Lamont has suggested that it is this 'sense of a woman looking in two directions, to husband and to child, and imposing the loyalties of the past on the future' which runs throughout the story.[241] While it is precisely this conflict between cultural paradigms which causes such conflict within the story's title character, it is equally important to note that Elspat's allegiance to things past is, in fact, twofold. Not only was her husband 'out' in the Forty-five, but he was also, as Lamont rightly notes, 'a Rob Roy

---

[239]This need to document oral knowledge may be a result of the Ossianic debates; Scott addresses this issue in his discussion between Hector and Oldbuck in chapter 30. This need for documentary evidence is further emphasised by Scott when the scholar is twice proved wrong by oral knowledge. See my discussion of Griselda, below, p. 230.

[240]See my discussion of Amy Robsart and Lucy Ashton in chapter three, above, for further examples of madness resulting from broken troths.

[241]'Jacobite Songs as Intertexts', in *Scott in Carnival*, ed. by J.H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993), pp. 110-21 (p. 117).

figure.[242] Through his position as outlaw within their Highland society, Elspat is already marginalised.

> *She had not forgotten she was the widow of MacTavish Mhor*...She associated so little with others, went so seldom and so unwillingly from the wildest recesses of the mountains, where she usually dwelt with her goats, that *she was quite unconscious of the great change* which had taken place in the country around her. (423, emphases mine)

As a result of this adherence to her socially defined role of MacTavish Mhor's widow, and of her own ignorance of the changes in the world, Elspat betrays her son. In making such an explicit connection between his character and a way of life which no longer exists, Scott reiterates the contemporary place of women in Scottish society as 'those banished by gender from involvement in politics and economics and thus embedded in the Scottish past' while simultaneously recalling their socially-sanctioned activity in that Scottish past.[243]

Within the text, the emphasis placed upon 'female memory [...and with the need] to remember the past and thus refuse to compromise in the present' is even more striking when one realises that this story was originally transmitted to Scott by a woman.[244] '"The Highland Widow," was derived from Mrs. Murray Keith, and is given, with the exception of a few additional circumstances - the introduction of which I am rather inclined to regret - very much as the excellent old lady used to tell the story.' (344) Given Scott's well-documented recreation of song while compiling the *Minstrelsy*, his regret over the additions to Mrs. Murray Keith's tale demonstrates a greater appreciation of the power of the oral, as well as a class bias on the part of the author: this story is not the property of a Margaret Laidlaw but of a lady. Nevertheless, the focus remains a gender-determined one. It is the impact of events upon the home and family, the socially sanctioned female domain, rather than the impact of events on the society which are central to Scott's narrative. Rather than make the MacTavishes an example of the changes which occurred in the Highlands in the generation

---

[242]Lamont, p. 118.
[243]Caroline McCracken-Flesher, '*Pro Matria Mori*: Gendered Nationalism and Cultural Death in Scott's "The Highland Widow"', *Scottish Literary Journal*, 21.2, November 1994, (pp. 69-78) p. 72.
[244]McCracken-Flesher, p. 76.

after Culloden, Scott domesticises the tale; making it politically non-threatening, and emotively elegiac.

The same domestic focus is found in Scott's presentation of *Rob Roy*'s Helen Macgregor. Her relationship with a passing or past way of life is different from Elspeth and Elspat's, for *Rob Roy*'s 1715 setting allows Scott to utilise Scottish cultural referents of female activity more directly than he is able to do in those novels set during or after the Forty-Five. Her conduct within the context of the novel will not therefore come into conflict with that of her society with the same personal immediacy as does the conduct of those characters discussed above. Helen's masculine, politically-motivated actions are far more understandable when consideration is given to the actions of Rob's 'creditors, mair *especially some grit neighbours* o' his, gripped to his living and land; and they say his wife was turned out o' the house to the hill-side, and sair misguided to the boot.' (*RR* 294, emphasis mine) The treatment she receives at the hands of those who by Highland standards are meant to protect their underlings, turns Helen against them and against their way of life to a far greater extent than it does Rob.[245] This 'madness', or anger, may in part be attributed to the fact that the property which was destroyed is not technically part of Rob's domain, but Helen's. Her rape, in conjunction with the eviction, represents a total destruction of what Scott perceives to be her world. Consequently, Scott's articulation of Helen's interpretation of these as an attack on her first, and on the family second, is understandable: 'Ye have left *me* neither name nor fame[...]Ye have left *me* neither house nor hold, blanket nor bedding, cattle to feed *us*, or flocks to clothe *us* - Ye have taken from us all - all!' (342, emphases mine)

The co-equal partnership which Helen and Rob had prior to the eviction continues subsequent to it. The most brutal, and by association unfeminine and unacceptable, of Helen's actions are carried out in Rob's Highland domain. In his absence, she is in command, and her rules are those which must be obeyed. To underscore this appropriation of male authority, Scott informs his reader that Helen:

---

[245]By the standards of Scott's own post-Enlightenment age, this is also an anachronistic concern with the dissolution of society (and the social contract) as a result of increased capitalism. The fact that the Scotland of the first half of the eighteenth-century was perceived by many as the last bastion of such relationships makes this a still greater violation.

> wore her plaid, not drawn around her head and shoulders, as is the fashion of the women in Scotland, but disposed around her body as the Highland soldiers wear theirs. She had a man's bonnet, with a feather in it, and unsheathed sword in her hand, and a pair of pistols at her girdle. (342)

Helen, to the outsider, is Gilbert and Gubar's 'monster woman [...] who refuses to stay in her textually ordained "place"'.[246] To the inhabitants of her Highland world (a world which Scott portrays as increasingly at odds with those of the novel's other settings) her attire and conduct are appropriate. Her husband, who moves between the milieux of the novel with ease, recognises that her actions will deny her a socially-sanctioned role outwith his Highland domains: 'how could she bear to be removed from these scenes, where the remembrance of her wrongs is aye sweetened by the recollection of her revenge?' (401) While the society of *Rob Roy* is, like so many of Scott's societies, in flux, the changes which would eradicate Helen's way of life are not yet permanent. As a result, she is allowed to act within the context of that society, rather than be held up as a relic of a past age as are Elspeth and Elspat. Scott's choice of adjective for Helen's native Gaelic is most indicative, however, of the fact that this society will soon be no more. In calling Helen's speech 'poetical', Scott here alludes I would suggest to an Ossianic image of the Gaeltachd: a place where exploits such as the Macgregors' occurred so long ago that they are remembered only in the stuff of poem. (406) We see Scott's perceptions of female activity associated with female orality as part of an explicitly Scottish social construct which is no longer extant. In presenting this trio as he does, I would suggest that Scott associates their activity with a dangerous power.

The danger for others of misapplied female power is most apparent in Scott's presentation of the Nordic sibyls, Urfried/Ulrica and Norna of the Fitful Head/Ulla Troil. Like Helen Macgregor, this pair is also driven into a world of madness by a violation of a social compact; unlike Helen, they are the violators rather than the violated. As a result, they are virtually non-functional within the societies they inhabit, each recognising the Saxon or Norse gods of her ancestors rather than the Christian God of the novel's chronologic present. With

---

[246]Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar, *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*, (New Haven, CT and London: Yale UP, 1979), p. 28.

this rejection of their social role in the novel's 'present' comes a change in name which ostensibly reflects this adoption of the old ways. Ulrica, knowing how her fellow Saxons would believe that she 'lived to merit our hate and execration' as a result of her service to the Normans who killed her father, becomes Urfried. (*Iv* 255) Ulla Troil, believing herself a parricide, gives 'that name to the winds' and becomes Norna of the Fitful Head. (*P*446) Neither woman, however, is of sufficiently low social rank to possess the individual freedom necessary to establish readily their alternative identities. It is the repudiation of their societal identities as well as their individual identities which liberates them from their creator's class-based reliance on the paradigm of female behaviour found in the conduct book. This rejection of their social identities as ladies, not insignificantly comes about not only as a reaction to their circumstance but as a direct result of the deaths of their fathers. As I have demonstrated in chapters three to five, the presence of a male authority-figure restricts the actions of a young woman of any class, regardless of the paradigm on which Scott relies.

Ulrica's endeavours to undermine the unity of the Normans, while seemingly circumspect, do not remain within the confines of feminine passivity and asexuality. Instead, she plays upon the Normans' aggression, 'foment[ing] the quarrels of our foes, heat[ing] drunken revelry into murderous broil.' (256) Ultimately, she is responsible for the success of the siege of Torquilstone and the death of Front de Boeuf. Here, Norman society's perception of her as a wizened beldam, who is worthless because of age and because she is a Saxon and a woman, provides Ulrica with the means of achieving her goal of vengeance. Once this is achieved, there is nothing to hold her to a society to which she is unwilling to adapt. Her death in the flames of the turret makes this explicit, for her death-song is described by Scott as 'a war song, such as was of yore raised on the fields of battle by the scalds of the *yet heathen* Saxons.' (315 emphasis mine) Earlier, Scott has told his reader that Ulrica is Christian, so this contradictory comparison serves to underscore her association with a way of life which was pagan, vernacular, and oral rather than Christian, Latinate, and literate.

The Pirate is not set within a society for which adaptation to a new(er) way of life is essential to continued participation therein. Scott makes much of the traditions of the Shetlanders, and of their presence on a daily basis in the lives of an otherwise modern people. Because Scott is here working within a social construct in which the traditional folk culture is still active, he is better able to apply the associated paradigm of female activity to his characters. Instead of the Shetlanders adapting to a 'British' way of life, it is the outsider who must adapt to and respect this culture. In this context, it is Norna's change of name, and therefore of identity, which removes her from her society as her affair with Vaughn and their illegitimate child never could. Once she rejects the extreme folk ways which her supposed shame caused her to adopt, Norna can, and does, resume her place in the Shetland society of the novel's present.

Her manipulations of the lives of the inhabitants of her society which result from the erroneous belief that Mordaunt is her son do more to upset the status quo than did her relationship with Vaughn. Norna's greatest error is not her interference, but her inability to recognise her own child; this, I would suggest, is counter to expectations of maternal, feminine behaviour found in both cultural paradigms. When she is made to see that she has manipulated the wrong man, and harmed her son, '[s]he appeared deeply to repent of her former presumptuous attempts to interfere with the course of human events.' (456) More significant, however, is her refusal of 'the name Norna' and her insistence upon being 'addressed by her real appellation of Ulla Troil.' (455) With the resumption of this name, she repudiates the strict adherence to the old, mystic beliefs she held for some twenty-five years, acknowledges her error in their espousal, and is again fully participant in her society. Such an outcome is not possible for Ulrica/Urfried, both because of Scott's presentation, in *The Pirate*, of a society in which the folk traditions are integrated with the 'British' society of the novel's present, and because her sexual activity was not perceived by that society as a betrayal. Here, the sexual activity of the ballad, folk cultural paradigm, is not viewed as unacceptable within the social construct, and the sexually active woman is not considered an outcast because of her sexual activity.

Lost Causes, Domestic Losses

Each of these older women, who, like those discussed above, is placed by Scott across the social spectrum, espouses a system of belief which is no longer viable within Scott's construction of her society. Unlike the women discussed above, who are aware of their incompatibility with the 'new' way of life in operation in their society, none of this quartet recognises their social obsolescence. As a result, their interference in the lives of the younger characters of their respective novels represents an imposition of their socio-cultural standards with potentially serious consequences. When this is an attempt to restore the novel's hero to his birthright, there exist fewer obstacles to success, for these actions centre upon the domestic and feminine domain. When, however, such interference is the result purely of political (and self-centred) principles, there exists a criticism of their behaviour inherent in Scott's presentation.

The Abbot's Magdalen Graeme is the first of these older women whose excessive devotion to a cause is the result of her own system of belief. Little need be said about that belief, for Scott's treatment of Catholicism is well-known. What must be noted, however, is that while Magdalen is excessive in her Catholicism; of Scott's Catholic females, she is one whose adherence to the political faction associated with it is secondary. While Scott's criticism of the fanatic is clear in his presentation of Magdalen, I would suggest that the fact that her fanaticism is based on a faith - however misguided - does lessen the degree of that criticism. This may in part be due to the largely domestic base of sixteenth-century Scottish Catholicism; Masses said in the home fall under the direction of the mistress of that household.

Some of this excess is undoubtedly attributable to her position within the schema of the novel. As an older character, she is used by Scott to indicate to the reader the negative aspects of the passing way of life. She is representative of the excess of passionate devotion to something as irrational as religion. The extent to which she takes this devotion is demonstrated by Scott in his final allusion to Magdalen Graeme, who 'died at Cologne, in the

performance of a penance too severe for her age.' (*Ab* 440) This death, while liberating the hero from the last of his duty to his Catholic upbringing, also removes a character whose socio-cultural paradigm is at odds with Scott's constructed new culture, from the novel's Protestant society.

Like the other sibyls discussed thus far, Magdalen actively interferes in the life of her grandson, Roland. Because he is not illegitimate as was believed, his upbringing in Castle Avenel is that which he should have received. Her manipulations on her grandson's behalf restore the social balance that Julian Avenel's deceit had destroyed. The perception of Roland's mother by her society to be Julian's lover, rather than his wife, associates her actions and sexual conduct with the paradigm of the ballad heroine. It is appropriate that the rectification of Julian's betrayal of his son is performed by another whose conduct marks her as associated with a cultural past. In addition, this interference remains, despite its political nature, within the domestic sphere and as such, is appropriate action for Magdalen to take. It is not action on Roland's behalf which destroys the old woman, as with Elspat MacTavish, but her fanatic devotion to her faith; to a way of life wholly incompatible with the Protestant new order of James's minority.

All the women discussed thus far are described by Scott as unusually tall and masculine in appearance. I would suggest that this physical association of their activity with masculinity is an attempt on Scott's part to distance his cultural paradigm from associations with the feminine - as opposed to with the female. Meg Merrilies is another such virago. 'She was full six feet high, wore a man's great-coat over the rest of her dress, [...] and in all points of equipment seemed rather masculine than feminine.' (*GM* 30) Her masculine appearance is repeated by Scott whenever Meg 'will [...] not let things take their course, [...] but must always be putting in her oar in her own way.' (393) Meg's interference in the events surrounding the revelation of Harry Bertram's identity is not I would suggest, inappropriate when consideration is given to her position within Scott's social context of those events. As a Gypsy, Meg is culturally marginalised within the society of Ellangowan. This then creates a flaw in criticisms of Meg as an 'inappropriate' woman, for she need not adhere to, and should

not be judged by any but the Gypsy code of conduct. Under that code, she is indebted to the house of Ellangowan for the protection offered Meg and hers prior to the Clearance, and ultimately 'might be said to have died a victim to her fidelity to his [Harry's] person and family.' (409) By this same code of conduct, she protects those who are also devoted to the Bertrams, and brings about the downfall of those who are not.

However, Scott takes great pains to demonstrate that Meg is atypical among her race in her continuing fidelity to Ellangowan. The relationship between the Gypsies and Bertrams degenerates from Harry's infancy, yet Meg's solitary return to the woods for one last look before her exile is what prevents Harry's murder. Eighteen years later, her declaration of Harry's identity is what prompts popular acceptance prior to its legal recognition. Scott demonstrates the power of female folk knowledge over and above the proofs of documented evidence:

> Almost all of them, especially the aged men who had seen Ellangowan in his better days, felt and acknowledged the justice of Meg Merrilies's appeal. But the Scotch are a cautious people; -they remembered there was another in possession of the estate, and they as yet only expressed their feelings in low whispers to each other. (407)

Despite the tacit agreement that this is indeed Harry Bertram, it takes an impartial, and not insignificantly male witness to 'give fire to popular feeling'. Scott underscores male legitimation of female knowledge by making the women add their 'shrill acclamations to the general all-hail' only after the men have accepted him. I would suggest nevertheless that Scott's awareness of female association with folk knowledge and oral traditions is seen even here, for it is the women who are 'ever delighted with the marvellous'. (407)

Scott provides further evidence of his association of Meg with the older standards of female conduct as reflected in what I term the ballad paradigm through her extensive use of song, rhyme and prophecy as modes of discourse. She arrives at Ellangowan the night of Harry's birth to tell his fortune, and is supplanted by Mannering's astrologic, and therefore quasi-scientific and learned, prediction. When she does finally cast her fortune for the heir, it is through a spun thread (a clear association with the Thread of Life), and a four stanza verse. When the Gypsies are cleared from their community, Meg curses Godfrey Bertram by

name and by title, for both give her curse greater potency. 'Scott exploited the emotional value of place-names and their associations to the full, and he understood the powerful, almost hypnotic effect of resounding names (as in the curse of Meg Merrilies).'[247]

Because she is socially marginalised by gender and by race, Meg's words and actions are rendered less powerful within that social context than they might otherwise be. She is manic, and emotive, and Scott suggests, probably not sane. She belongs to a way of life that Scott has explicitly indicated no longer exists, and her actions are always legitimised by one who belongs to the new, learned, and male-dominated school. This fanaticism and rigid adherence to standards of behaviour which are no longer acceptable in a rational, scientific world make Meg's death inevitable. She has fulfilled her role within the society of the novel, 'if my curse brought it down, my blessing has taen it off!' (408)

Old Mortality's Mause Headrigg is, like the others, an extremist rather than a pragmatist who will at least compromise the old way of life with the new. However, Mause is unique among this group of characters in that Scott makes it clear that she was in her youth, the lass to Lady Margaret's ingenue. Interestingly for one of her class, Mause is not at all concerned with the practicalities of daily life. The fact that she 'canna prefer the commands of an earthly mistress to those of a heavenly master, and sae I am e'en ready to suffer for righteousness' sake' is what prompts Lady Margaret to evict the Headriggs midseason, causing them to lose all in their flit. (*OM* 77)

Mause's primary loyalty is to her Covenanting faith; a loyalty which serves as the impetus for the destruction of the relationship she and Lady Margaret share. Despite this, Scott hints at the fact that Mause is not so blinded by her fanaticism that she is not aware of the wrong she has done in keeping Cuddie away from the wappenschaw. As with other characters, her initial physical description provides as much indication of her personality and place within the society of the novel as does her opening speech:

> There was an air of consciousness about old Mause, as she rose from her wicker chair [...] not with the cordial alertness of visage which used, *on other occasions*, to express the honour she felt in the visit of her lady, but with a certain solemnity and embarrassment, *like an accused party on his first*

---

[247]Wittig, p. 236.

> *appearance in presence of his judge*, before whom he is, nevertheless, *determined to assert his innocence*. Her arms were folded, her *mouth primmed into an expression of respect mingled with obstinacy,* her whole mind apparently bent up to the solemn interview. (74, emphases mine)

Here, Scott indicates the conflict in Mause, and her stubborn adherence to an impractical creed which is the source of the Headriggs' difficulties throughout *Old Mortality*. He also here alludes to the relationship between Lady Margaret and Mause; their society is sufficiently fluid for the mistress to visit the servant as a means of 'hearing the news of the country and of the borough.' (74) In establishing this conflict between feudal loyalty and religious dogma, Scott demonstrates clearly what he perceives to be Mause's foolishness: she allows her involvement in the political world of Covenanting religion to take precedence over her domestic duties. After being reminded that she does not serve the Bellendens without material reward, Mause engages in a semantic argument with her mistress over the wappenschaw: 'but ilka ane maun walk by the light o' their ain; and mine [...] tells me that I suld leave a' - cot, kaleyard, and cow's grass - and suffer a', rather than that I or mine should put on harness in an unlawfu' cause.' (76) And so it proves.

Cuddie's reaction to his mother's confrontation demonstrates that Mause's tenets belong to a nonviable system of belief, which should be obsolete. Were they acceptable to the average Scot within the society created by Scott in *Old Mortality*, Cuddie would likely follow the teachings of his mother. His chastisement of her for a 'lang tongued clavering wife, as my father, honest man, aye ca'd ye!' further demonstrates to the reader both that Mause's attitudes are those of the few, rather than of the many, and that her neglect of her domestic duties for her participation in her public cause is nothing new. (78) Later, he 'stipulated with his mother, that he was to manage matters his own way; [...] "For getting a service, or getting forward in the warld, he could somegate gar the wee pickle sense he had gang muckle farther than hers, though she could crack like ony minister o' them a'."' (81) Cuddie's 'general inferiority of understanding' is sufficient to get them a position at Milnwood - until his mother opens her mouth to evangelise. (81) Once again, the Headriggs lose their means of support, and, given that they are to be taken to Claverhouse, probably their lives. By this point, Scott has made Mause's fervour a comic thread within the narrative as a means of

negating the threat to the extant power structure her beliefs represent. Cuddie turns her semantic games on her in an effort to buy time, and demonstrates to the reader the practical streak which saves his life (despite his mother's best efforts) on more than one occasion.

Mause's language is an interesting mixture of Scots and Old Testament allusion. Both, I would suggest, reflect references on Scott's part to the fact that Mause is associated with a socio-cultural paradigm which is obsolescent, and she will not long participate in her society. Scott emphasises this association by ensuring that Mause's fanaticism is always expressed verbally, and with reference to herself and her situation in life. In so doing, Scott domesticises Mause's involvement in the Covenanting cause, and associates its authority with a tradition of female orality which as a mode of discourse, is suspect in its legitimacy. This personalisation of the political reaches its comic height at Drumclog. She and Kettledrummle witness to their sufferings in a point and counterpoint which runs the gamut from the sublime to the ridiculous. Mause avows that she will 'testify against the backslidings, defections, defalcations, and declinings of the land' with the 'auld breath o' mine, and it's sair taen down wi' the asthmatics and this rough trot.' (160) Note here the mixture of Biblical and personal, a balance not seen in the male Covenanters, who refer to authority rather than to the traditionally female teacher, experience. The comedic elements in Mause's evangelising reach their height at the height of battle, Mause stands on 'the heath with her head uncovered, and her grey hair streaming in the wind' and pays no attention to the fact that as phlegmatic Cuddie observes, '[t]he whigamore bullets ken unco little discretion, and will just as sune knock out the harns o' a psalm-singing auld wife as a swearing dragoon.' (183-4)

Mause's fanaticism is as humorous as it is because she is a woman who lacks the social authority to participate directly in the political events of the rebellion.[248] She serves to underscore the absurdity of the extremists within the Covenanting faction; for whom the things of this world mean nothing, and who would impose their system of belief on others.

---

[248]This is a construction by Scott. Galt's *Ringan Gilhaize* presents a more sympathetic and balanced picture of the Covenanters.

Yet, unlike the other sibylline characters, she neither dies nor causes the death of another as a result of her fanaticism. This, I would suggest, is because Mause's son is fully aware of his mother's tenets and of the danger they present to his person. She has no real power within the society of *Old Mortality* because the religious beliefs she holds are established within Scott's construction of seventeenth-century Scotland as outmoded and absurd, and because her class is sufficiently low to prevent her imposing and enforcing the imposition of those beliefs on anyone else.

'Lady Bellenden and Mause Headrigg, despite their difference in rank, are examples of doctrinaire automatism; just as the one can easily be triggered into spouting Scripture, so the other one can be set off on the subject of King Charles's breakfast at Tillietudlem with such ease that the tag eventually becomes a bore.'[249] Lady Margaret Bellenden is as obsessive regarding her adherence to a passing way of life as are the so-called fanatics. Scott expects his reader to be aware of the fates of such adherents to the Stewart cause, and therefore makes Lady Margaret's reverence of the 'great Turkey-leather elbow-chair with the tapestry cushions', comic and harmless. (125) In so doing, Scott recalls others wholly loyal to the Stewarts whose reverencing of such artefacts marks a dangerous (but in Scott's day safely past) political allegiance. Note that here, as with Mause, Scott domesticates the political: the King's stop at Tillietudlem is reduced to an absurd story which centres around food and furniture.

Unlike Mause, however, Lady Margaret does have the advantage of social position in imposing her value-system on others. Her repetition of the tale serves to underscore the right that Lady Margaret has to the social authority she wields. The Bellendens have served their monarchs faithfully, and have been rewarded for that service. Consequently, Lady Margaret's imperious attitude when removing Mause and Cuddie and her willingness to help Bothwell are appropriate representations by Scott of female authority in a Scottish social past. The ignorance shown by Lady Margaret regarding Bothwell's position within the army is

---

[249]Gordon, p. 50.

a further reflection of her adherence to a code of conduct wherein birth and belief meant everything, and achievement and ability little or nothing.

I would suggest that Lady Margaret's abdication of authority to her brother-in-law at the siege of Tillietudlem is prompted by a desire on Scott's part to present an 'appropriate', albeit anachronistic, division of duties along gender lines. Here, we see the same class biases which contained the more active ingenues: despite Scott's perception of female activity in Scotland's past, he is unable to reconcile this with the contemporary, passive domesticity of women of his class. Major Bellenden has the experience to mount a siege, he, while not head of the family, is its senior male member, and most importantly, Lady Margaret's 'household [...] has [been] thrown into some disorder' by the arrival of Claverhouse and his men. (197) Scott ensures that she thinks first of those duties which are her concern as Lady of the Keep of Tillietudlem, and defence of that Keep is not among them. Scott underscores this by having Lady Margaret comment on the fact that she has 'fled twice from it in my days'; having little time to flee, she will stay and abdicate her authority to the Major. I suggest that this is an anachronistic manipulation on Scott's part, for the lady of 'Captain Car, or Edom o'Gordon' (C 178) predates Lady Margaret by a century, yet she also "'will not geue ouer my hous," she saithe,/"Not for feare of my lyffe;/It shal be talked throughout the land,/The slaughter of a wyffe."'[250] In making Lady Margaret passive, Scott again undermines the cultural paradigm of female activity found both in a Scottish past and in female supporters of the Stewarts.[251]

Should Scott's overt demonstration of Lady Margaret's prejudices be insufficient to demonstrate which paradigm predominates in her presentation, her language provides further support for her association with things past. Her English speech is sprinkled with Scotticisms, such as disjeune and umqhile; but these are archaic Scotticisms clearly

---

[250]Child, III, p. 430.

[251]In addition to those Jacobite women discussed in chapters one and three above, there is the wife of the minister of Kinneff, who hid the Honours of Scotland from Cromwell's army at the time of the Civil Wars.

belonging to a Scotland which in Scott's time, no longer exists.[252] More significant evidence of her adherence to the past in Scott's schema than her use of Scotticised English is Lady Margaret's use of broad Scots when she is with Mause, in direct contrast to the other upper/lower class relationships in *Old Mortality*. This quite deliberate use on Scott's part of an ideolect which in his day was associated with the lower classes in the construction of an upper class character underscores his appreciation of the linguistic and cultural shift occurring in Scotland during his lifetime.

If Lady Margaret must be 'punished' for her interference in Edith's life, and her inflexible attitude toward Morton, it is through the loss of her home and rights as 'Lady Margaret Bellenden of Tillietudlem'. However, the balance is restored with the revolution of 1688, and Morton's return. The restoration of the barony through the recovery of the deed is foiled by Burley, who 'effectually prevented [Morton] from rescuing the deed until it was fairly reduced to a cinder.' (410) However, the total balance in this world is restored with the deaths of Lord Evandale and Basil Olifant. Evandale's willingness to fight with Claverhouse for the Jacobite cause, and Lady Margaret's advocacy of him as Edith's husband, would have made her safely past loyalty to His Most Sacred Majesty an active one. The opposition of her personal enemy, Olifant, to that cause would have further allied her to it. Instead of an inactive woman whose past allegiances are no longer specifically operative, Scott would have been forced to make Lady Margaret overtly and actively Jacobite; no longer an example of things past but an active threat to the present power structure.

Nostalgic Adherences

The comparative activity of the women discussed above is what differentiates them from those characters whose loyalty to things past is due as much to tradition as to a genuine belief in their societal viability. They are secondary characters in their respective novels, and Scott's alignment of them with passing cultural paradigms is demonstrated equally through

---

[252]cf. Graham Tulloch, *The Language of Walter Scott A Study of his Scottish and Period Language*, (London: Andre Deutsch, 1980), p. 316.

narrative commentary as well as by character activity. Their secondary role within the plot means that Scott can present their association with a social paradigm of female activity nostalgically, for they are not foregrounded in a manner which will make their actions a threat to the society in which they are participant.

Edward Waverley's Aunt Rachael is the person who has been primarily responsible for filling her nephew's mind with the romantic exploits of his ancestors. Note that Scott places these stories far enough in the past to avoid any association with the family's more recent Jacobite activity. As a result, they are politically neutral. They are also highly romantic, and associated with the feminine and fictional. In Aunt Rachael, Scott again presents a woman as transmitter of lore and legend, but in this instance, it is a genre which remains domestically centred. Her narrative is not, despite the family's political affiliation, seen by Scott as threatening to his construction of Hanoverian Britain. Miss Rachael's belief that 'idleness is incompatible with reading of any kind, and that the mere tracing the alphabetical characters with the eye is in itself a useful and meritorious task, without scrupulously considering what ideas or doctrines they may happen to convey,' further dissociates her from a tradition of book-learning, and underscores the illegitimacy of her orality. (*Wav* 35)

In presenting Aunt Rachael as a somewhat romantic spinster whose values are more associated with the days of her youth - a youth which, not incidentally coincided with the Fifteen - Scott, I would suggest, is eliding the probable reality to suit his purposes. '[S]he was the fair Mrs. Rachael in the year of grace seventeen hundred and sixteen.' (72) Through the Baron's recollections of his first meeting with the Waverleys, Scott underscores the fact that with the exception of Sir Richard, the family are Jacobites. However, he also seeks to dissociate his hero's family from this political association, creating an anachronistic view of English Jacobitism.[253] That Rachael places Edward's verse on Mirkwood Mere in her 'commonplace book, among choice receipts for cookery and medicine, favourite texts, and

---

[253]cf. Frank McLynn, *Crime and Punishment in Eighteenth-Century England*, (London and New York: Routledge, 1989), pp. 156-63 and Murray G.H. Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994), pp. 94-132.

portions from High-church divines, and a few *songs, amatory and jacobitical, which she had carolled in her younger days*', indicates the distance from which she regards her Jacobitic youth. (46, emphasis mine) Given Scott's extensive knowledge of song, one cannot help but ask if these amatory songs were not also encoded Jacobite verse. This is unimportant given that Rachael has saved the songs, but I would suggest that their place in her commonplace book indicates that they are mementoes only rather than important political statements.

Like Aunt Rachael, Mrs. Bethune Baliol is a Jacobite by habit rather than by active support. This is due more to when she is known to Chrystal Croftangry (1826) than to a rejection of her political allegiance to the Stewarts. Unlike Aunt Rachael, Mrs. Bethune Baliol is a Scottish Jacobite, and in the Scott schema, as well as in the public perception, an altogether more dangerous prospect. It is for this reason that Scott sets his *Chronicles* at a time when Jacobitism was truly a dead letter, after the visit of George IV to Edinburgh, and after the restoration of titles to the attainted nobles has begun. Had the narrative frame of these tales been set other than contemporaneously with their creation, Mrs. Bethune Baliol could not, given her background, have been a politically nonviable character, associated with things which are no more. '[H]er juvenile recollections stretched backwards till before the eventful year 1745; and she remembered the Highland clans being in possession of the Scottish capital, though probably only as an indistinct vision.' (*CC* 396) While I would suggest, given Scott's own vivid recollections of childhood, that he dissociates his character too much from the Edinburgh events of the Forty-Five, it is important that he do so given the traditions of female activity within the Jacobite movement. Were Mrs. Bethune Baliol not so young during the occupation of Edinburgh that its events are indistinct, it is likely that she would have been one of the Edinburgh ladies at the Chevalier's ball at Holyrood. Such is hardly conducive to political nostalgia, and character passivity. Scott's commentary on Mrs. Bethune Baliol's Jacobitism offers his most direct description of his perceptions of this habitual loyalty among the old Jacobite families that inhabit the pages of his novels:

> Mrs. Bethune Baliol did not like to be much pressed on the subject of the Stuarts, whose misfortunes she pitied, the rather that her father had espoused their cause. And yet her attachment to the present dynasty being very sincere, and even ardent, more especially as her family had served his

> late Majesty in both peace and war, she experienced a little embarrassment in reconciling her opinions respecting the exiled family, with those she entertained for the present. In fact, like many an old Jacobite, she was contented to be somewhat inconsistent on the subject, comforting herself, that *now* everything stood as it ought to do, and that there was no use in looking back narrowly on the right or wrong of the matter half-a century ago. (407)

Here, Scott anachronistically distances his character from unfeminine associations of political activity. In so doing, he ensures that she is dissociated from the paradigm of female activity he perceives as that of Scotland's past.

Other textual indications that highlight this distancing of Mrs. Bethune Baliol as representative of a past, Scottish socio-cultural tradition of female activity are her octogenarian status, the age of Bethune's Land and the contents of the property, and her mode of dress. Like her fidelity to the reigning house, her dress, while 'complying to a certain degree with the present fashion, had always a reference to some more distant period.' (403) Her speech, like that of Lady Margaret Bellenden, is that of a past era. Scott tells his reader that 'it seemed to be the Scottish as spoken by the ancient court of Scotland, to which no idea of vulgarity could be attached.'[254] (405) She is a hold-over from a past age, and with her demise, the manners of that age are lost forever.

The adherence to the Jacobite cause of *Redgauntlet*'s Arthuret sisters, like that of Hugh Redgauntlet, is based on a genuine belief in its political validity and viability. The level of activity they exhibit on behalf of the Cause is not the anachronistic dissociative passivity of other older Jacobite women. The sisters provide sanctuary for the purported Fr. Buonaventure until Redgauntlet gathers the Jacobite lords and the Prince is free to reveal his presence in England. They do Charles Edward the deference due their sovereign: 'the two ladies [...] dropped on either hand of the Father a courtesy so profound, that the hoop petticoats which performed the feat seemed to sink down to the very floor.' (*Red* 296) And yet, there is always an element of the farcical in Scott's presentation of the sisters which is absent from other of his Jacobite ladies.

---

[254]cf. Tulloch, p. 311.

I would suggest that this is deliberate on Scott's part. He undermines the potentially real threat of their Jacobite sympathies, by marginalising the sisters: making them walking stereotypes of Catholic devotion.[255] Their given names, Seraphina and Angelica, together with their constant ejaculations of saints names and lines from the breviary, make them comic figures. They are not intended to be representative of the 'good' aspects of Jacobitism some twenty years after the Forty-five. Instead, they, and Redgauntlet, personify the futility of the Cause - its true devotees are Catholic spinsters and fanatics: the one disempowered twice over, the other forced into exile because of his inability to change.

This is not the case with the Scottish Jacobites in *Redgauntlet*. Unlike the other Jacobite ladies, Seraphina and Angelica are English. Their adherence to the Cause is not based on national concerns, but on the irrational and feminine ones of religious faith. It is not insignificant that the Scottish Jacobites in *Redgauntlet* are far more dangerous and active than their English counterparts. Had Angelica and Seraphina been Scottish Jacobites, they might very well have represented Scotland herself, as does Flora MacIvor, instead of the barrenness of elderly virginity.

The only non-Jacobite in this group, Miss Griselda Oldbuck is another spinster who adheres to the fashions of a past age. Like Smollett's Tabitha Bramble, Miss Griselda is dressed in the manner of her youth: 'The elderly lady rustled in silks and satins, and bore upon her head a structure resembling the fashion in the ladies' memorandum-book for the year 1770. [...] An antique flowered silk gown graced the extraordinary person'. (*Ant* 54-5) She is a ridiculous figure, and consequently, a worthy target for her brother's verbal barbs. I would suggest, however, this association with social modes that are long past is more a result of her delusion that her unmarried status dictates playing the ingenue than of any genuine tie to a bygone age.

---

[255]In this, there may be allusion to seventeenth century feminist thought. Scott may have been aware of Mary Astell's advocacy of a female retreat, akin to a nunnery, espoused in *A Serious Proposal to the Ladies for the Advancement of their True and Greatest Interest*. Her political allegiances were such that it is possible that Scott had author and work in mind in creating the Arthurets.

Despite these broadly comic elements of her character, it is Griselda who tells Lovel of the haunted room, once again demonstrating Scott's awareness of women's knowledge of oral tradition. Griselda's Scots speech, in sharp contrast with her brother's English, further underscores Scott's perception of women's representation of a Scottish social context which is passing if not past. The fact that Monkbarns provides a 'rational' explanation of the events Grisel narrates emphasises further Scott's belief in the passing of folk belief and knowledge. When the reader remembers that Monkbarns is the same man whose knowledge was subverted by the memory one of the folk[256], the strength of the argument of the 'booklearned' is severely undermined, and Grisel's narrative given validity. (88)

Balancing Acts in Transitional Ages

The final sub-section of the older women to be discussed are those for whose characterisations Scott has relied neither on a modified paradigm of feminine passivity nor on the paradigm of female activity which he associated respectively with conduct of women in present and past Scottish society. Instead, these characters represent a balance between paradigms of conduct: participatory in the events of the novel, but not fully associated with the morés of its society. Interestingly, the social construct is not necessarily representative of anglicised, North Britain, for in three of the novels discussed below, *The Bride of Lammermoor*, *The Fortunes of Nigel*, and *St. Ronan's Well*, it is the manipulation and/or rejection of traditional 'Scottish' standards of conduct, and the imposition of 'North British' ones, which here represent corrupting, rather than progressive influence. It is Scott's assertion throughout the Waverley novels that the new 'British' society must integrate the best of the societies of Scotland and England. In these three novels, we see Scott's treatment of the attempted imposition of the negative aspects of English society on a morally integral Scottish, or Scoto-British one.

---

[256]I have reference to Edie's identification of the alleged praetorium as the work of himself and the 'mason-lads' some twenty years ago, pp 39-40.

Lady Ashton, alone among the older noblewomen, is a fanatic. There is much in her concern with social position, with an identity garnered by identification with others, which calls to mind Elspat MacTavish. Like Elspat, she is convinced of the rightness of her opinions, and will not be swayed in them by anyone or by anything. It is this characteristic which, in many respects, makes her, alone among the characters in *The Bride of Lammermoor*, capable of functioning in the new world that emerges at novel's end. This new world is not one which results from progress and education, however. Instead, it results through upheaval and usurpation; in Lady Ashton's case, her total appropriation of her husband's authority. For all her awareness and manipulation of the political realities of *The Bride of Lammermoor*, Lady Ashton is able equally to utilise the language and codes of conduct of the older, oral, and wholly Scottish world in which she originated, and in which her daughter and Ravenswood still move.

As has become evident through discussion of other of Scott's female characters, his initial descriptions of a character's personality and physique often provide important textual indicatiors of their paradigmatic associations. It is therefore significant that her social superiority to her husband is the first thing that Scott mentions, calling this 'an advantage which she did not fail to use to the uttermost, in maintaining and extending her husband's influence over others, *and, unless she was greatly belied, her own over him.*' (*BL* 28, emphasis mine) Scott is here describing a relationship in which 'female power is produced by an absence of patriarchy which it in turn reproduces'.[257] She observes the outward forms of wifehood and mother-love, yet is not 'mentioned in the terms of love or affection.' (29) However, these are externally imposed standards of behaviour which reflect the paradigm of female conduct associated with the conduct-book standards of feminine passivity. Given the emphasis Scott places on Lady Ashton's self-direction, and self-identification, I would suggest that she is in fact as closely associated with the balladic paradigm of female autonomy as is her daughter. She never loses sight of her self-determined goals, being

---

[257]Ian Duncan, *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel: The Gothic, Scott, Dickens*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992), p. 161.

described by Scott as a 'falcon [that never] turns his quick eyes from his destined quarry.' (29) Her publicly loving relationship with her husband rings 'false and hollow' to the close observer because she is not intended by Scott to represent the standards of spousal deference and devotion presented in the conduct books:

> There cannot, indeed be a sight more uncouth, than that of a man and his wife struggling for power [...] But the woman who can tyrannize over her husband, will generally betray the same disposition towards her children, her servants and her acquaintance. By all of these she may contrive to be feared; and, as it is probable that to be loved is no part of her ambition, she escapes the mortification of disappointment.[258]

Scott has quite clearly demonstrated Lady Ashton's illegitimate association with the standards of the patriarchal Britain under which she is endeavouring to operate. This 'unfeminine' personality is further emphasised by Scott when he informs his reader that Lady Ashton 'alone did not feel that distinguished and predominating affection, with which the rest of the family cherished Lucy.' (39)

The contempt Lady Ashton feels for what she perceives to be her daughter's weakness is the impetus for the tragedy that ends the novel. Lady Ashton's familial pride will not allow Lucy to marry one whom she deems beneath notice. There is no concern for her daughter's well-being, and despite Sir William's approval of Lucy's attachment to Ravenswood, (approval which, as head of the family should, under the cultural paradigm of the conduct book which Scott seems to suggest here predominates, carry more weight than that of his wife,) Lady Ashton treats his plans for his family with contempt:

> To the interest of your family I conceive you perfectly capable of attending [...] and even to the dignity of your own family also, as far as it requires any looking after - But as mine happens to be inextricably involved with it, you will excuse me if I choose to give my own attention so far as that is concerned. (219-20)

In this, Lady Ashton dissociates herself from the new world in which the property and political allegiances of Lucy's suitors are of paramount concern.[259] Here again, Scott emphasises

---

[258]Mrs. Taylor. *Practical Hints to Young Females, on the Duties of a Wife, a Mother, and Mistress of a Family*. Ninth Edn. (London: Taylor and Hessey, 1818), pp. 14-5.

[259]See my analysis of Lucy Ashton in chapter three, above, for discussion of Lady Ashton's concerns and possible balladic influences on her characterisation.

Lady Ashton's associations with a Scottish cultural paradigm of female autonomy.[260] She is a Douglas, and must command the respect due her. The Marquis of A-'s pointed reminder that she is descended '*from a younger branch* of the house of Angus, [...] and your ladyship [...] ought not to forget that the Ravenswoods have *thrice intermarried with the main stem*' serves to indicate to the reader that Lady Ashton is not possessed of the social standing she claims under either the Scottish or the North British social constructs here in operation. (223-4, emphases mine)

Her constant reminders of her heritage, and her use of her maiden name when responding to Ravenswood's letter 'Margaret Douglas, otherwise Ashton' are additional indications of Scott's associations of her with a past era when it was customary for women to retain their family name after marriage. (266) Further emphasis of Scott's association of her with a balladic paradigm comes in her use of the sibyl Ailsie Gourlay as a means to turn Lucy's mind against Ravenswood, and to Bucklaw. Ailsie makes use of the legends of the Ravenswoods to terrorise Lucy, as Lady Ashton knew she would. Interestingly, these tales never include those in which a young woman makes an engagement against the wishes of a parent, who then actively works to destroy one or both of the parties.[261]

This omission is deliberate on Scott's part, I would suggest, for ultimately, Lady Ashton resorts to the 'modern', patriarchal teacher of morality, the Kirk, in the form of the Rev. Mr. Bide-the-Bent, to achieve her aims. While wholly in agreement with Lady Ashton, he does feel sufficient sympathy for Lucy to agree to deliver a copy of the letter she sent Ravenswood (dictated by Lady Ashton) requesting to be freed from their engagement. In so doing, Scott would have his reader believe, Lady Ashton differs from those balladic mothers whose interference causes the death of one, if not both, of the lovers they have separated. In aligning herself with the Kirk, Lady Ashton repudiates the tradition of female autonomy to

---

[260]cf. p. 24 above for discussion of the practice of female retention of surname subsequent to marriage in Scottish society prior to the mid- to late-eighteenth century.

[261]cf 'The Mother's Malison, or Clyde's Water' (C 216), and 'Clerk Colvil' (C 42) for evidences of maternal opposition to a relationship, and to supernatural obstructions to true love, respectively. Child IV, pp. 185-91; I, pp. 371-89.

which she has hitherto resorted to achieve her end. She no longer is a Douglas, but an Ashton; a mother ostensibly concerned for the well-being of her daughter.

Her actions over the days from Lucy's betrothal to marriage demonstrate the illusory nature of this repudiation. '*Lady Ashton* was too deeply pledged to delay her daughter's marriage even in her present state of health.' (303) It is not Sir William whose pledges matter in this instance, but instead those of his wife. On the wedding day, 'Lady Ashton, making an apology on account of her daughter's health, offered her own hand to Bucklaw as substitute for her daughter's.' (309) In so doing, Lady Ashton usurps yet another role within the structure of her family, to achieve her ends.

The final assessment of Lady Ashton's character is given to two voices: Ailsie Gourlay, and the narrator. The former, as one might expect from a woman of her age and class, makes reference to Lady Ashton within the context of the folk tradition, stating that 'there's mair o' utter deevilry in that woman, as brave and fair-fashioned as she rides yonder, than in a' the Scotch witches that ever flew by moonlight ower North Berwick Law.' (307) The narrator records her fate in a tone that can best be described as ironic:

> Lady Ashton lived to the verge of extreme old age, the only survivor of the group of unhappy persons whose misfortunes were owing to her implacability. That she might internally feel compunction, and reconcile herself with Heaven whom she had offended, we will not, and we dare not, deny; but to those around her, she did not evince the slightest symptom either of repentance or remorse. In all external appearance, she bore the same bold, haughty unbending character, which she had displayed before these unhappy events. A splendid marble monument records her name, titles, and virtues, while her victims remain undistinguished by tomb or epitaph. (320-1)

The question which these issues raise is a simple one. Which assessment of Lady Ashton is the most accurate? Is she associated with the cultural standards of the new, 'British' society as represented by her position as Lady Ashton, wife of the Lord Keeper? Or, is she like one of the Scotch witches of North Berwick, associated with an older social paradigm in which she retains a degree of autonomy and power as Margaret Douglas? I would suggest that she is both. In his creation of Lady Ashton, Scott was hampered by class-based perceptions of ladylike conduct discussed in chapters one, three, and four above. This, the most balladic of Scott's novels in narrative structure, required a villain whose evil was inherent. Unfortunately

for Scott, these narrative requirements would mean creating a character wholly at odds with his and his society's preconceptions of upper-class feminine conduct. In attempting to balance Lady Ashton's character between cultural paradigms Scott creates instead a woman whose supposed usurpation of masculine authority renders her anomalous by the standards of the very society whose authority she usurps. Her awareness and manipulations of traditional Scottish cultural material, like the witchcraft used in the ballads, are ironically what allow Lady Ashton to attain that which will theoretically ensure her place in the 'new' world whose standards she defies.

Dame Ursula Suddlechop is the first among these characters associated primarily with the 'new' cultural paradigm presented by Scott in *The Fortunes of Nigel*. However, in this novel we are not presented with the predominance of an Anglo-Scots social construct over a Scottish socio-cultural referent. Mrs. Suddlechop is an active, autonomous powerful figure within the microcosm of London society which she inhabits. Her entrepreneurial schemes are associated by Scott with the decadent, 'new' society of Baby Charles and Steenie rather than with that whose morals are sanctioned by the Scots King James. This explicit cultural duality within the text, as I have discussed elsewhere, must be borne in mind when analysing *The Fortunes of Nigel*. Unlike other Waverley novels, in which the standards of the 'new' society are held up as rational, progressive, and with respect to his female characters, feminine and passive, this society is, according to Scott, corrupt, immoral and not to be sanctioned. Dame Ursley, Scott tells us, 'had been a pupil of Mrs. Turner, and learned from her the secret of making the yellow starch, and it may be, two or three other secrets of more consequence, though perhaps none that went to the criminal extent of those whereof her mistress was accused.' (*FN* 113) Given Mrs. Turner's undoubted guilt in Overbury's murder[262] the connotations of the immoral behaviour resulting from sexual control and power are clear.

---

[262]cf. William McElwee, *The Wisest Fool in Christendom The Reign of King James I and VI*, (London: Faber & Faber, 1958), pp. 222-4.

Scott indicates her corruption through a series of narratorial asides and allusions rather than through explicit narrative relation. The woman's 'face [was] *somewhat coloured by good cheer*' and her beauty was 'in the wane'. (115, emphasis mine) The physical image presented is one of a blowsy middle aged woman who likes her drink, and is well past her prime. A fondness for drink, while unladylike, is hardly sufficient justification for outright condemnation of Dame Ursley's morals. Her 'other services, more or less connected with the esoteric branches of her profession heretofore alluded to' are, however, sufficient cause. (114) Procuress for the well-to-do, she is hardly a fit confidante for the heroine of this tale. Dame Suddlechop's aspirations to the title of Mother Midnight provide the indication of the nature of those services provided. Her female power is not generative, but destructive; representative of a reclamation of female sexual gratification.

This facilitation of sexual self-indulgence marks Dame Suddlechop as of the new world of London; in Scotland at the time *The Fortunes of Nigel* is set, the infanticide law which condemns Effie Deans had yet to be passed. Ursula's failure to understand this communal aspect of the life of the Scottish community in London is, within the schema of this particular Waverley novel, sufficient to marginalise her totally. For here, Scott advocates a Scoto-British agenda rather than an Anglo-British one. Those unable to further this cultural agenda do not participate in the society left us at novel's end. Dame Ursula, like all who are condemnatory of the Scots nobles, leaves London, and 'end[s] her career in the *Rasp-haus* (viz. Bridewell) of Amsterdam.' (464)

While Dame Ursula's professional morality, or the lack thereof, is 'new', the role she plays within the community of which she is a part leads me to suggest that she is not the wholly self-serving creature that Baby Charles and Buckingham, who embody the immorality of the 'new' society, are. Scott subverts his description of the dissipated Dame Ursley by informing his reader that:

> Marriages, births, and christenings, were seldom thought to be performed with sufficient ceremony, for a considerable distance round her abode, unless Dame Ursley, as they called her, was present. She could contrive all sorts of pastimes, games, and jests which might amuse the large companies which the hospitality of our ancestors assembled together on such

> occasions, so that her presence was literally considered as indispensable in the family of all citizens of ordinary rank, on such joyous occasions. (113)

While not a creation based explicitly on the balladic paradigm of female conduct, she is nevertheless of the folk. In his presentation of Dame Ursley, Scott associates her with both socio-cultural paradigms in operation in this novel. She is participant in, but does not belong to the communal society which is beginning to deteriorate in Scott's version of James's London. Her class and gender, I would suggest, are what prompt this association of Ursula with those aspects of communal life which are associated with the family. In the end, however, it is the threat of female sexual power to that domestically centred construction which forces Scott to remove Ursula from that society.

Old Mortality's Alison Wilson treats Henry Morton with the same familiarity with which *The Bride of Lammermoor*'s Blind Alice addresses Edgar Ravenswood. Alison's 'family', unlike Alice's, has not lost its place in the hierarchy of the community and Alison has not, therefore, lost the social status which accompanies her association with that family. She lectures Henry on his appearance at the popinjay, the proper way to address her, and the great inconvenience he has caused by being out so late, 'with the tyrannic insolence of a spoilt and favourite domestic'. (*OM* 57) This is not, however, a condemnation of Alison's self-will, for in either cultural paradigm, 'the old domestic attached to a family, whose best days have been spent in faithful services, is a lovely character, and entitled to every indulgence.'[263] One such indulgence of Alison is the willingness on Henry's part to endure her harangues. Scott is quick to demonstrate to the reader that Alison's lecture is as much from habit as anything else, for she ends by allowing that she 'dinna think it's safe for young folk to gang to their bed on an empty stomach.' (59) Having been allowed the exercise of her power, Alison returns to her domestic concerns. As is often the case with Scott, a paragraph of narrative does more to provide a sketch of a character's character than do their actions throughout the novel. We learn from the narrator that Mrs. Wilson's:

> nocturnal harangues upon such occasions not unfrequently terminated with this sage apophthegm [sic], which always prefaced the producing of *some provision a little better than ordinary*, such as she now placed before him. In

---

[263]Taylor, p. 43.

> fact, the *principal object of her maundering was to display her consequence and love of power*; for Mrs. Wilson was not, at the bottom, an ill-tempered woman, and certainly loved her old and young master (both of whom she tormented extremely) better than anyone else in the world. (59, emphases mine)

The reality of Alison's position in the household is, Scott shows us, proportional to her maunderings of the night before. Harry's suggestion that he leave Milnwood to become a mercenary is met with disapproval on his uncle's part, but it is Alison who takes the traditional female role of mediator between the two men. She has the temerity to tell Milnwood that 'it's partly your ain faut. Ye maunna curb his head ower sair in neither; and to be sure, since he *has* gone down to the Howff, ye maun just e'en pay the lawing.' (71) Milnwood's chary response is met with the domestic's version of a wifely 'yes, dear'. Alison has no intention of adhering to Old Milnwood's limit - the difference, as she tells Harry, will come out of 'the butter siller'. (72)

In the absence of a Lady Margaret figure, Alison runs the household at Milnwood. As a result, she is possessed not only of the freedom of speech given a favoured domestic, but that of a woman acting within the confines of her societal position. When it comes to domestic matters at Milnwood, Alison is the authority; possessed of the rights and privileges thereof. She is not, however, representative of the conduct book paradigm of the woman in need of male direction. Instead, as the dictatorial and dialetical nature of her speech demonstrates, she is associated with the Scottish cultural paradigm of female autonomy. This is most clearly demonstrated in her bargaining session with Bothwell first for Harry's liberty, and then for fair treatment for him while in captivity. Milnwood's greed makes him incapable of parting with his silver, even for his nephew's sake. Alison takes matters into her own hands, retorting: 'Then I maun do it mysell, Milnwood [...] or see a' gang wrang thegither. - My Maister sir, [...] canna think o' taking back onything at the hand of a honourable gentleman like you; he implores ye to pit up the siller, and be as kind to his nephew as ye can...'. (96) However, Alison is not yet finished. It is she who evicts Mause and Cuddie from Milnwood, and who 'took an opportunity, unseen by the party, to slip into his [Harry's] hand a small sum of money.' (97)

Alison's *de facto* role as mistress of Milnwood, becomes, after Old Milnwood's death, *de jure*, for she is created life rentrix. Her pride has not changed with time, for she reprimands Morton (at this time unknown to her) for failing to address her as '*Mistress* Wilson of Milnwood.' (378) There are other changes in Alison's appearance, for:

> the features in which an irritable peevishness, acquired by habit and indulgence, strove with a temper naturally affectionate and good-natured - the coif - the apron - the blue checked gown, were all those of old Ailie; but laced pinners, hastily put on to meet the stranger, with some other trifling articles of decoration, marked the difference between Mrs. Wilson, life rentrix of Milnwood, and the housekeeper of the late proprietor. (379-80)

These superficial differences are sufficient to distinguish a spoilt servant with great authority from the mistress of Milnwood. Scott here subtly marks the distinctions between classes in his construction of this Scottish social context as being those of appearance, rather than inherent difference of character. This appearance as life-rentrix of Milnwood is Alison's final one of any significance in *Old Mortality*. She returns to her place as housekeeper to Mr. and Mrs. Melville Morton, and is kept busy year round preparing the great oak parlour for its one night of use. In alluding to this, Scott effectively pensions off Alison, for '[t]he preparing [of] the room for this yearly festival employed her mind for six months before it came about, and the putting matters to rights occupied old Alison the other six.' (422) She is given this inconsequential task because she no longer has a social role in the new, Presbyterian, world of the Melville Mortons. Her Scots speech and loyalty to old Milnwood's memory mark her as a character whose cultural milieu is past. Yet, because she was the hero's adherent, Scott cannot merely brush her aside as he does old Mause.

Like Alison Wilson, Meg Dods is an outspoken participant in the events of *St. Ronan's Well*. Unlike Alison, Meg is a woman of sufficient property that she acts on her own behalf rather than for a master; 'Meg Dods, when she succeeded to her parents, was a considerable heiress, and, as such, had the honour of refusing three topping farmers, two bonnet lairds, and a horse couper, who successively made proposals to her.' (*SRW* 13) It is not insignificant, I would suggest, that Scott draws a deliberate parallel between Meg and Queen Elizabeth. Meg is mistress of her small domain because she 'would admit no helpmate who might soon assert the rights of a master; and so, in single blessedness, and

with the despotism of Queen Bess herself, she ruled all matters with a high hand.' (13) Despite her fantastic appearance, she is not the virago Scott would, from the following description, have his reader believe her:

> Nature had formed honest Meg for such encounters; and as her noble soul delighted in them, so her outward properties were in what Tony Lumpkin calls a concatenation accordingly. She had hair of a brindled colour, betwixt black and grey, which was apt to escape in *elf-locks* from under her mutch when she was *thrown into violent agitation - long skinny hands, terminated by stout talons* - grey eyes, thin lips, a robust person, a broad, though *flat chest*, capital wind, and a *voice that could match a choir of fish-women*. (15, emphases mine)

Note, however, that Meg is 'honest' and 'noble' before Scott utilises any pejorative, unfeminine adjectives in his description.

I would suggest that the qualities of honesty and nobility which characterise Meg serve as additional indicators of the fact that Meg does not belong to the world of Spas, fashion, feminine conduct, and the ton. Her inn is no longer frequented by travellers; they prefer the hotel. Those who do frequent the inn are those who are more closely allied with the socio-cultural referents which mark Meg as part of a tradition of Scottish female autonomy which is passing, rather than of the 'fashionable' present: the 'Killnakelty Hunt, [...] a set of ancient brethren of the angle from Edinburgh, [...and] some ranting blades [...] members of the Helter Skelter Club, of the Wildfire Club, and other associations formed for the express purpose of getting rid of care and sobriety.' (17-18) Meg's associations with a society that is passing into memory is made explicit by Scott in the concluding paragraph of the chapter entitled 'An Old-World Landlady'. (7) There, he tells his reader that:

> about the period I mention, I should have been afraid to have rambled from the Scottish metropolis, in almost any direction, lest I had lighted upon some one [...] who might suspect me of having showed her up to the public in the character of Meg Dods. At present, though it is possible that some one or two of this peculiar class of wild-cats may still exist, their talons must be much impaired by age [...] (19)

There are other indications of Meg's adherence to a cultural paradigms of conduct which are no longer extant. First is her memory of Francis Tyrrel and his 'cousin', Valentine Bulmer. Her involvement with the two young men marks her as one who is a participant in the 'balladic' love-triangle which so troubled Ballantyne. The fact that she is Tyrrel's partisan

following his aborted duel with MacTurk, despite the ridicule of those at the Well is another. Most significant, however, is Meg's unwillingness to have anything to do with the Well and the new, 'polite' society it represents, or with anyone who does associate with its denizens. She is more than ready to evict Tyrrel, whom she likes, for 'gaun down and taking up with yon idle hare-brained cattle at the Waal'. (107), but 'think[s] the deil's in me too for thrawing him, sic a canny lad, and sae gude a customer'. (109)

That the Well and its inhabitants represent a 'new', 'polite' society and that Meg and the Cleikum Inn represent the 'old', 'primitive' society, is undeniable. I would suggest that for all that *St. Ronan's Well* appears to be a novel of manners, Scott instead advocates the validity and superiority of the Scottish cultural context of the Toun. It is not insignificant that Clara goes to the Aultoun in her madness, for her 'sin' is the result of circumstances that would affect a ballad heroine, rather than an Austenesque Lady Binks. The corruption of that 'new' society is absolute, for their petty vendettas are sufficient to destroy lives - quite literally, as Clara's madness and death, and Bulmer's death at the hands of Mowbray, show. The integrity and honesty that Meg represents has no place in this social construct. Yet, it is to that place of integrity (Aultoun) that Clara flees in her madness, and where she dies. It is also this place which survives the upheaval surrounding Clara's death and the revelations of her past involvement with Tyrrel and Bulmer. It, and Meg, survive because their way of life is not 'scandalised' by pre-marital sex, or by the interferences and machinations of the Hannah Irwins of the world. I would suggest that Scott here advocates this integrity; where appearances and realities are not at odds, and where fair play is paramount. Like Scots-speaking Meg Dods, the values she embodies belong to a Scotland that is, in Scott's day, past. However, at the time in which the novel is set, they were passing, but still very much part of rural Scotland. Things British had not wholly replaced things Scots; and, as Scott seems to advocate with Meg's triumph over the Well, this was not necessarily a bad thing. 'Mr. Mowbray [...] would [not] permit the existence of any house of entertainment on his estate, except that in the Aultoun, where Mrs. Dods reigns with undisputed sway, her temper

by no means improved either by time, or her arbitrary disposition by the total absence of competition.' (433)

In his presentations of older women, Scott is able to represent those aspects of Scottish society whose passing has adversely affected the integrity of Scotland itself. There is a sympathy for the cultural associations of even his fanatic older women which does not exist in either the younger women, or the older male characters. It is not insignificant that even the most fanatic of the older women, Elspeth Mucklebackit and Elspat MacTavish, are motivated by an honour which calls to mind that of Evan Dhu in *Waverley*. As the English gentlemen fail to understand the honour of a Highlander because it is a code incompatible with their society, so these women fail to comprehend that their code of conduct is no longer operative and no longer comprehensible within the new, British, society of their respective tales.

Some sympathy for their cultural loss comes because their tragic interference remains within the domestic sphere. Scott does not feel the need either to anachronise his presentation or to render it comedic as he does with those women whose attachment to things past is focused upon the political. He is able to neutralise his Jacobite older women as he is unable to do for the Jacobite ingenue by the simple expedient of making them merely sentimentally attached to the cause of their girlhood. As such, however anachronistic this might be, Scott is able doubly to neutralise the threat of Jacobitism, for it is not only non-viable within his novelistic political schema, but is the province within that schema of the young (intellectually immature) and the aged (whose recollections are clouded with sentiment). Those like Lady Margaret Bellenden and Mause Headrigg, who are participant in political events, must be made comedic by Scott to ensure that they do not become a threat to the masculine status quo. This, in conjunction with the extremes of behaviour seen in other aged *male* characters such as Baron Bradwardine, Oldbuck, and Sir Arthur Wardour, serves to undermine their roles as oral historians.

Those older female characters whom Scott need not subvert through extremes of fanaticism, nostalgia, or comedy are those older women who, with one exception, are

presented in novels whose social change is most reflective of the gradual change of Scott's own cultural context. Consequently, Scott is able to present the effects of these changes on the individual as a result of a progression from an exclusively Scottish cultural paradigm to the Scoto-British one of his present. Not all cultural changes are to the good. In the case of Lady Ashton, her appropriation of past cultural paradigm of female power, in conjunction with her usurpation of her husband's power, result in the destruction of the domestic society which should be her domain. Ursula Suddlechop, immoral though she is, does maintain a balance between her 'business' dealings, and her place in the community. There is not the loss of involvement with the folk that there is with Lady Ashton. Alison Wilson, despite the tumultuous changes in the society of *Old Mortality* also maintains that cultural integrity. Her changes, as Scott demonstrates, are not internal, but external. Meg Dods is presented by Scott as adhering to the cultural paradigm of female autonomy in the face of the enforced 'progress' and anglicisation, and feminisation of the society at the Well. She embodies the honest and noble virtues of an older, oral Scottish society; virtues whose passing from that society, I would suggest, Scott regrets.

In his presentation of the older women as products of a socio-cultural referent, Scott indicates those changes in expected female conduct which parallel the socio-political evolution of his constructed society. Through their association with an specifically Scottish tradition of female autonomy, Scott is also able to demonstrate some of the effects of anglicisation on Scottish society. In so doing, he demonstrates that the losses to domestic Scotland are as significant as those which affected institutional Scotland. In one novel, Scott makes the socio-cultural losses suffered by Scotland as a result of union of primary rather than secondary concern. It is the only novel which contains queen, ingenue, lasses and older women of all classes. That novel is also the one Scott novel possessed of a heroine rather than a hero, whose events are not the direct result of political interaction with the domestic, but in which political conflict is secondary to the domestic. *The Heart of Midlothian* is where my attention at last turns.

Chapter 7:

...and Jeanie Deans
The Heart of Midlothian

Within the period 1975-1990, *The Heart of Midlothian* was second only to *Waverley* in prompting critical response.[264] Since that date two Scott conferences have been held, and a survey of the papers given at these demonstrates the continuation of this trend. There are, I would suggest, a number of reasons for this scholarly interest: the ongoing debate over *The Heart of Midlothian*'s place in the hierarchy of the Scottish novels; the increased interest in feminist criticisms of Scott to which *The Heart of Midlothian*'s gynecentric plot lends itself; the unending analysis of Scott's historiography. What links these seemingly disparate critical interpretations is the same impetus which prompts me to set it apart - this novel, quite simply does not fit the Waverley formula. *The Heart of Midlothian* lacks an insipid hero like Edward Waverley or Henry Morton, whose initial indecision emphasises the novel's polarities, and whose ultimate decision demonstrates the rationality of one of those polarities. In fact, this Waverley novel lacks the great conflict between the Romantic and the Real, between the juvenile and the adult which so confuses the typical Waverley hero. There is never any doubt which side Jeanie Deans chooses; it is her decisiveness rather than a lack thereof which establishes the tensions of this plot. Almost by default, critical attention has been forced by the novel's peculiarities to focus on the reasons behind the overall success of this novel, and on its atypical hero(ine), Jeanie Deans.

Attention has been paid to Jeanie and to *The Heart of Midlothian* without taking into account the fact that the two are not inextricably linked. Unlike other Waverley novels, whose heroes can be omitted from critical discussions, it is virtually impossible to do so with Jeanie Deans. *The Heart of Midlothian* does not centre upon or exist in conjunction with a significant

---

[264]I take my data from comparisons of the entries for the respective Waverley novels in the index of Jill Rubenstein, *Sir Walter Scott: An Annotated Bibliography of Scholarship and Criticism 1975-1990*, Occasional Paper 11, (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, n.d. [1995]).

historic event, but is instead the story of an individual and her actions. It is ultimately a domestic novel, focused upon the female concerns of the family. Little wonder then, that its cast of principal characters is significantly weighted to the female. The acts which provide the impetus for Jeanie's journey belong to the province of woman - childbirth and suspected infanticide. Jeanie's journey is a success because of the assistance of women both en route and subsequent to her arrival in London. The voice of power to whom she must ultimately appeal is female. The first three volumes of *The Heart of Midlothian* belong to an older, oral, female tradition which the final volume, set as it is in Argyle's lands, does not:

> Through the heroism of his 'oral' heroine Jeanie, and also his wild woman, Madge, Scott appears to stress the humanity, and even wisdom, of traditional culture.
>
> And yet, ultimately, these characters are in some sense 'compromised', rejected or destroyed. The novel concludes with a vision of a peaceful and relatively stable Great Britain.[265]

The so-called problem volume of *Heart* presents the problems it does because the locus of the novel's action has changed. Scott's characters now are operating under the rules of a *British* Duke of Argyle.[266] Interestingly, Scott has altered the geography of Argyle's domain; in making Jeanie's home on an island rather than on the mainland as it is in reality, Scott is able to isolate his heroine physically as well as psychologically from the environment which allowed her the freedom to act overtly throughout the first three volumes. Now, the scene and the rules have changed, and those who appear in volume four (interestingly, only Jeanie and Effie) must act circumspectly if they are to act at all. It is not until this final volume, and Effie's reappearance as Lady Staunton, that this novel has an ingenue figure. It is at this point that the novel has an upper class young woman to adhere to the rigid code of conduct Scott establishes for such characters in other of his novels. To here, the code of conduct in

---

[265]Carol Anderson, 'The Power of Naming: Language, Identity and Betrayal in *The Heart of Midlothian*', in *Scott in Carnival*, ed. by J. H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993), pp. 189-201 (pp. 193-4).

[266]cf. Gary Kelly, *English Fiction of the Romantic Period 1789-1839*, Longman Literature In English Series, (London and New York: Longman, 1989) pp. 154-56. Kelly's discussion of Argyle quite rightly notes that he is Scott's idealised British noble. However, I would suggest that Kelly is incorrect in his assertion that Jeanie is taken to Knocktarlitie in her capacity as dairywoman; at Knocktarlitie, she is transformed from dairywoman in plaid to minister's wife in clothing contributed by Argyle's wife and daughters. More significant to my gynecentric reading of *The Heart of Midlothian* is Kelly's omission of Jeanie's inability to follow Argyle's direction in her interview with the Queen. See below, pp. 253-4.

operation has been an older one, based on an 'oral' Scottish tradition rather than upon a 'literate' Anglo-British tradition.

It is with this transference of cultural power from the female to the male, from a Scottish cultural referent to an anglicised, Scoto-British one that we appreciate in this novel the extent to which Scott achieved a narrative balance between the cultural paradigms of conduct he utilises in many of his societal constructions. Within the specifically Scottish cultural referent, Scott presents: female orality and its accompanying autonomy; Scots law; and the 'law' of the Kirk. In addition to the narrative predominance of these three codes of conduct is their interaction with, and ultimate submission to English law, and to the 'English' paradigm of female passivity and its accompanying circumspection.

While I will be adhering in this analysis to those categories established in prior chapters it is to be expected that, with the exception of Queen Caroline, the older women will belong wholly to the lower ranks of society. Without an ingenue, there is no reason for any of the (lower-class) younger women to have an upper-class mentor, mistress, or mother-figure as in other of the Waverley novels. The divisions between old/Scots and new/British cannot therefore be emphasised exclusively along generational lines because of the absence of an upper-middle class ingenue to serve as paradigm for this new, British society. The generational distinctions are less clearly defined, the focus on nationality becomes less polarised. The result of a less codified social construct are the broader categories of: Queen Caroline, older women, and younger women. The final category encompasses a progression from the wholly balladic/oral tradition-based Madge Wildfire, through Effie's origins as a ballad heroine who becomes, at personal cost, the ingenue this novel's first three volumes lacks, to Jeanie Deans, who replaces the questing Waverley hero in the first three volumes but who, unlike the Waverley hero, never is forced to change sides with the advent of a 'modern' or 'British' society.

The historic event around which *The Heart of Midlothian* is centred is the Porteous Riots. However, Scott alters the focus of these events so that Staunton's attempted liberation of Effie is central to it. Further feminising and domesticating his narrative, Scott

tells us that the riots are prompted by the decision of Queen Caroline, as 'regent of the kingdom during the absence of George II' to pardon Porteous. (44) While an historic oversimplification, it serves to establish both the gynecentricity of this novel, and the extent to which the Scots were not understood by the London government. In creating this perception for his reader, Scott subtly establishes the tension between Scottish and English cultural referents long before Jeanie crosses the Border and the reader openly encounters it. In addition, the fact that it is Caroline's action rather than that of 'Queen and Council' or of Parliament, indicates to the reader the power wielded by Caroline during her husband's reign. While seemingly an unimportant detail to the backdrop of the Porteous Riots, it becomes central to Jeanie's petition for Royal clemency for Effie, for we see that the ultimate source of power in this society is female. Symbolically, Scott underscores this through Staunton's adoption of female dress and the alias of Madge Wildfire: Caroline's adoption of male power through her regency is balanced by Staunton's adoption of female power in his attempt to affect Effie's fate. I would suggest that here Scott emphasises his perception of the differences in male and female power, for Staunton's direct attempt to overthrow the extant social structures is later countered by Jeanie's acknowledgement of their existence in her indirect and successful attempt.

This is demonstrated through Scott's choice of the individual to whom Jeanie initially goes, for Argyle is undoubtedly possessed of a great deal of power as a courtier. However, the Duke of Argyle's 'open opposition to the administration of Sir Robert Walpole' makes him out of favour with the royal family and therefore unable overtly to assist Jeanie. The pragmatism with which Caroline handles her political alliances, 'bear[ing] herself towards her political friends with such caution, as if there was a possibility of their one day being her enemies, and towards political opponents with the same degree of circumspection, as if they might again become friendly to her measures' permits continued contact with such as the Duke, allowing him to help Jeanie covertly - as is appropriate for a personal, feminine (and therefore unofficial) request. (380) This circumspection is the technique of a practised politician; technically possessed of no power in her own right as consort, and possessed only

of the limited power of a constitutional monarch when regent, Caroline nevertheless plays rival factions against each other, decreasing their power, and increasing her own in the end.

Scott goes to great lengths to demonstrate the power that Caroline does have, and the means by which she makes use of it. She is, at the outset, compared to Margaret of Anjou: 'Since Margaret of Anjou, no queen-consort had exercised such weight in the political affairs of England'. (380) Like Scott's Margaret, Caroline remains as consonant a character as she is because her appearance in the novel is a brief one. Scott can permit this queen to be overtly involved in politics because this is a novel concerned with female power and with the domestication of traditional male institutionalised power. She is not involved in the plot's romantic intrigues as are other of the queens consort; her interests, as Scott presents them, are not the traditionally feminine. Scott's admiration of Margaret is well known, and his comparison of Caroline to her is undoubtedly a compliment to her political abilities. Despite his own admiration for her intellect, Scott remains sufficiently aware that perceptions of acceptable female activity, and (perceived) deviations from that normative standard can affect women across society:

> With all the winning address of an elegant, and, according to the times, an accomplished woman, Queen Caroline possessed the masculine soul of the other sex. She was proud by nature....She loved the real possession of power rather than the show of it, and whatever she did herself that was either wise or popular, she always desired that the King should have the full credit as well as the advantage of the measure, conscious that, *by adding to his respectability, she was most likely to maintain her own*. (381, emphasis mine)

Scott's portrayal of Caroline is that of a politically aware woman who, rather than being constrained by her position within her society, is able to use that position to increase her power. She differs from other Queens Consort in that she is given the power of regent by her husband, and becomes, for that time, Queen *de facto* if not *de jure*. Still, she has the advantage of her gendered position to conceal the extent of her political machinations. 'If by any accident her correspondence with such persons [those out of favour] chanced to be observed or discovered, which she took all possible pains to prevent, it was represented as a mere intercourse of society, having no reference to politics.' (381) That societal intercourse is, of course, a feminine domain of letter-writing and invitations. Scott, in so doing, further

emphasises his understanding of the need for all women to move circumspectly when their conduct runs counter to that expected of them by their male-dominated and ordered society.

Caroline exercises the same rigid control over her domestic arrangements. Her use of her husband's mistress as attendant and confidante allows her to secure 'her power against the danger which might most have threatened it - the thwarting influence of an ambitious rival.' (382) Having shown his reader that Caroline makes full use of her position as Consort, Scott also takes care to demonstrate Caroline's awareness of the source of that power. Ultimately, she is as subject to her husband's favour as anyone. Losing his ear to another means the eventual loss of her power.

Jeanie's audience with the Queen is prefaced by this detailed description of the extent of Caroline's power. Scott's intention in crafting the scene thus is a clear one. The approach being taken by Argyle is unusual and unofficial, to say the least. Scott must, therefore, assure his reader that it is an effective means of securing Effie's pardon. The verbal parry and thrust in which Caroline and Argyle engage prior to Jeanie's speech serves to confirm the veracity of the description of Caroline's political ability which precedes it. This unofficial matter must needs be taken to the King unofficially; more importantly, this unorthodox method of access keeps this matter within the province of woman to which it has been relegated from the outset of the novel. The presentation of Effie's plight by Jeanie further underscores the difference between the societies of the Scottish and British capitals - the repartee in which the Duke engages is an essential part of the London (and, by implication, literate, British) life.[267] It is this contrast in verbal style, I would suggest, which prompts Caroline's '[t]his is eloquence.' (391)

Unlike Argyle, Jeanie is incapable of dissimulation. She tells her story directly, and the language in which she tells it is not that of polite society. Her Scots remains broad - there is no linguistic shift to accompany the class and cultural interaction with which this interview is marked. The Scots she speaks resonates with Biblical imagery on its own (a permutation of

---

[267]This is further emphasised by Scott with Effie's reappearance as Lady Staunton. See my discussion below for further analysis of this dichotomy.

the 'Golden Rule' appearing in her speech -'it isna what we hae dune for oursells, but what we hae dune for others') and in conjunction with the alliteration of the ballads 'sorrow for and with a sinning and a suffering creature.' (391) It is this resonance and probity which impress the Queen, rather than the plight of one Scots girl. The Biblical imagery and reference used by Jeanie in this interview underscore her personal integrity, and serve to facilitate the interview's successful outcome. Scott makes it apparent to his reader that the feelings of the Queen for the Scots and, specifically for the citizens of Edinburgh, are comparable to those of the Edinburghers for Caroline. Proud, and fully aware of the respect due her as Queen, Caroline cannot forgive the affront to her royal dignity brought about by the murder of Porteous. 'I have had enough of Scotch pardons', she tells Argyle, and goes so far as to create the potential for 'a discussion, in the course of which the Queen was likely to be hardened in her own opinion, until she became obliged, out of mere respect to consistency to let the criminal suffer.' (385, 387) I would suggest that Scott's construction of the scene as supportive of Caroline's power, through the final appeal to the King's justice, and the degree of deference to her position as Consort which prompt Caroline's promise that Jeanie 'shall not want my warm intercession with his Majesty.' (391)

The feelings of the Scots for Caroline have, of course, already been established through the conversation of 'one of the numerous groups who were painfully ascending the steep declivity of the West Bow' after Porteous's aborted hanging. (46) It is interesting to note that this group is composed of tradespeople - a seamstress, a rouping-wife, and a saddlemaker - whose trade has been affected by Union. The fact that the group includes women is a further indicator of the different social schema in operation. This is not post-Enlightenment Edinburgh, with its dancing classes, and promenades on Princes Street. Women are seen as playing an integral role in the economic life of the society, and as a result are cognisant of the changes in Scottish life since the Union of 1707.[268] Humorous though Mrs. Howden's recollection that 'I ken, when we had a king, and a chancellor, and

---

[268]cf. my discussion of the shift in female participation in types of trade from the mid-eighteenth century, pp. 27-8 above.

parliament men o' our ain, we *could aye peeble them wi' stanes when they werena gude bairns*' may be, she nevertheless reflects the prevailing sense of frustration over Scotland's lack of autonomy. She is not alone in this, as Miss Damahoy's reply that 'they hae taen away our parliament, and they hae oppressed our trade' shows. (46, emphasis mine) Here, Scott introduces the folk voice which throughout the novel serves to underscore the sense of community which has been lost through the anglicisation of Scottish society in the latter half of the eighteenth century. This folk voice, which recurs throughout *The Heart of Midlothian*, is used to different ends. Here, I would suggest that it is important to note that these are women who are old enough to remember first-hand what life in Scotland was like pre-1707. Their age and Scots speech mark them, like Lady Margaret Bellenden, as members of an era that will soon be no more. Neither appears to have offspring who could provide the bridge to the new, British age. As a result, their memories of an independent Scotland and the dissatisfaction with North Britain they bring will die with them thereby ensuring acceptance and appreciation of the greater good that is the Union.

Their alignment with what, for the purposes of this novel, serves as the bygone past - that of pre-Union Scotland - is emphasised by Scott still further, for the legality of Porteous's action is not a concern for these gossips. '"Discretion! [...] whan had Jock Porteous either grace, discretion, or gude manners? - I mind when his father" - [...] "And I," said Miss Damahoy, "mind when his mother" - [...] "And I," said Plumdamas, "mind when his wife."' (48) What is of concern to them is Jock Porteous as an individual. The legality or illegality of his action as determined by the pedantic Saddletree does not matter. '"I'll ne'er believe Scotland is Scotland ony mair, if our kindly Scots sit doun with the affront they hae gien us this day. It's not only the blude that is shed, but the blude that might hae been shed."' (50) In this lament for the past, when Scotland was autonomous, Scott interjects a marvellous pun on the Scots pronunciation of Queen Caroline's name. In so doing, he further emphasises the place these women have in the Scottish society which, if not already gone, is quickly

vanishing. Caroline becomes 'carline', derogatory Scots for an old woman, or a witch.[269] This is a society of personal accountability - where pebbles can be thrown at parliament, Queens can be spoken of as carlines, and where, were she a man, Mrs. Howden 'wad hae amends o' Jock Porteous, be the upshot what like o't, if a' the carles and carlines in England had sworn to the nay-say.' and Miss Damahoy 'would claw down the Tolbooth door wi' my nails [...] but I wad be at him.' (50) The orality (which, in Scott, serves to underscore a past which is past) of the Edinburgh of 1736 is underscored still further in Butler's caution to the ladies not 'to speak so loud' and in their reply: '"Speak!" exclaimed both the ladies together, "*there will be naething else spoken about frae the Weigh-house to the Water-gate*, till this is either ended or mended."' (50, emphasis mine) The voice of disaffected Scotland is placed in these characters' mouths; Scotland and its identity are here linked to its women. Scotland's qualities are presented as those of female orality, while the learned anglophone men are seen throughout as less active, sickly, and silenced.[270]

Mrs. Saddletree, a contemporary of the tradeswomen whom her husband has escorted from the Grassmarket, is as opinionated and as overt in her actions as her peers. As with many other Scott women, Mrs. Saddletree is described in relation to another character - in this instance her spouse - prior to her appearance. The woman Scott describes is somewhat viraginous:

> his wife, an active painstaking person, could, in his absence, make an admirable shift to please the customers and scold the journeymen. This good lady was in the habit of letting her husband take his way, and go on improving his stock of legal knowledge without interruption; but, as if in requital, she insisted upon having her own will in the domestic and commercial departments which he abandoned to her. (47)

---

[269]Many of the women identified as 'witches' in the Kirk-led witch hunts of the late seventeenth-century were themselves possessed of overt social power. That Caroline's political power serves as the impetus for Effie's social transformation underscores the 'miraculous' ends to which that real power is ultimately put. In articulating this pun, I would suggest that Scott demonstrates his perception of the social threat and the 'other(worldli)ness' of female power. cf. Christina Larner, *Enemies of God: The Witch-hunt in Scotland* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1981), pp. 51-2.

[270]cf. R. A. Houston, *Scottish Literacy and the Scottish Identity: Illiteracy and Society in Scotland and Northern England, 1600-1800*, (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985), pp. 57-67 for discussion of the marginalisation of illiterate women, and the associations of the oral with the female.

What is interesting to note about Scott's description of this harridan is that it is she who lets her husband go to the law courts. The impression conveyed upon close reading of the text is not that of the vindictive virago, but that of a woman in control of her household who allows her husband to cultivate his legal knowledge. In this marriage, I would suggest, Scott demonstrates the institutional relationship between Scotland and England, post-Union, in which Scotland is allowed to possess her institutional structures, but is effectively powerless in that possession.

Mrs. Saddletree's primary narrative purpose in the novel is not that of her peers. Vocal though she is on issues concerning her business and household, she remains silent on the Porteous issue, and does not comment directly upon the bygone autonomy of Scotland. Instead, she serves to introduce the plight of Effie Deans, her former shop-girl. In so doing, she comments upon the inhumanity of a law which presumes guilt of child-murder, and by implication, upon the inhumanity of the society which allows such presumptions. 'Then, if the law makes murders, [...] the law should be hanged for them; or if they wad hang a lawyer instead, the country wad find nae faut.' (57-8) It is the inhumanity of a society becoming dependant upon a codified standard of conduct - abstractions which do not consider the circumstances of an individual case as an older, purely oral society might.[271]

The irony is that this is a law imposed prior to Union after the packed 1689 General Assembly in an attempt to curtail the freer sexual attitudes of the Scots peasantry. Scott has Jeanie make the law's origins clear to Queen Caroline and, I would suggest, uses this as a means of demonstrating the extent of the Kirk's control over the Scottish people. I would suggest that this masculine institution, with its traditional control over sexuality and more stringent punishment of female fornicators, is here seen to appropriate traditional areas of female generative power. Mrs. Saddletree's ridicule of this law further emphasises her place in a truly Scottish society, for she can see that the laws of the Kirk (a Kirk whose language

---

[271]cf. Houston, pp. 202-9 for discussion of the authority given oral testimony in pre-literate, or transitional societies.

has always been English) are potentially as damaging to that society as is the imposition of political power from England itself.

It is as a product of this social tradition of orality and female power that Meg Murdockson must be approached. If the Lawnmarket triumvirate emblematise the positive aspects of female power in oral Scotland, Meg emblematises its most negative aspects. Mother to Madge Wildfire, we first encounter Meg after the Porteous Riots. She has come to gain Madge's release from the magistrates, and is described as 'an old woman of the lower rank, extremely haggard in look, and wretched in her appearance'. There is nothing in this initial description to prepare the reader for what follows. Meg has none of the expected respect for the figures of authority in front of her:

> 'And she went on muttering to herself with the *wayward spitefulness of age* - "They maun hae lordships and honours, nae doubt - set them up, the gutter-bloods! and deil a gentleman amang them." - Then again addressing the sitting magistrate, "Will *your honour* gie me back my puir crazy bairn? - *His* honour! - I hae kend the day when less wad ser'd him, the oe of a Campvere skipper."' (193, emphasis mine)

Here again Scott displays the greater freedom of voice given to a woman in this largely oral culture. Here too we see the beginnings of the erosion of the society which produced such a culture. The 'I kent his faither' mindset which both Meg and the Edinburgh tradeswomen exhibit should have a logical counter in 'my faither kens her'. That the magistrate does not know Meg, or indeed know of her, despite her knowledge of his parentage, is a further indicator of the loss of intimacy in Scottish society since the Union. Her identity must be provided him by an officer of the court - one who is closer to Meg in social standing. The class barriers which are here seen to be appearing in Scottish society were not in place when the 'oe of a Campvere skipper' became his honour, and I would suggest, denied his origins. Here we see Scott's association of traditional memory and folk-cultural identity with women, and the corresponding male desire to 'forget' that identity, to consign it to the margins of society and to the past.

Scott, through descriptions of her 'termagant voice', of the 'shrewish supplicant', and ultimately as 'the beldam screaming at the highest pitch of her cracked and mistuned voice', makes it clear to the reader that Meg is heir to a tradition of shrewish women with no respect

for authority which goes back to Noah's wife, Gill, or to the Wife of Bath. (193-4) Each description indicates that something is not quite right in Meg's world. This is made abundantly clear to the reader when Madge's comment that 'there were better days wi' us ance' prompts a reversal in Meg's conduct:

> Old Maggie's eyes had glistened with something like an expression of pleasure when she saw her daughter set at liberty. But either her natural affection, like that of the tigress, could not be displayed without a strain of ferocity, or *there was something in the ideas which Madge's speech awakened* that again stirred her cross and savage temper. (196, emphasis mine)

Such descriptions occur repeatedly when Meg is part of the action. She is presented as a warped and vindictive woman whose life has been ruined because of the ramifications her daughter's out-of-wedlock pregnancy have on both women.

It is in this aspect of Meg's life that Scott demonstrates his reliance on the ballad tradition for portions of *The Heart of Midlothian*. As the Murdocksons' story is revealed, we learn that Madge's mother was attempting to marry her to an old, but wealthy man in an attempt to spare Madge (and herself) the disgrace of an out-of-wedlock pregnancy. Balladic parallels to this storyline can be found in 'Fair Janet', whose heroine 'is the likest that bore a child'[272], and in C 66, 'Lord Ingram and Chiel Wyet'. In both balladic stories, however, the marriage to the 'auld carle' (317) occurs, and parental involvement beyond initiating the marriage, and ensuring its outcome is non-existent. Like the parents of 'Fair Janet' and 'Lord Ingram and Chiel Wyet', Meg favours the addresses of 'a wealthy suitor, [...] notwithstanding the objection of old age and deformity.' (318) Like Lady Maisry's mother, in the 'B' text of C 65, 'Lady Maisry', Meg is aware of her daughter's seduction: 'In came her mother,/Stepping on the floor:/"They are telling me, my daughter,/That you're so soon become a whore."' While Meg does not go as far as Maisry's family in 'kindl[ing]up a bold bonfire,/to burn her body in'[273], she nevertheless, 'to promote the advantageous match she had planned [...] had not hesitated to destroy the offspring.' (318)

---

[272]'64. Fair Janet' D text, in *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, ed by Francis James Child, 5 vols (New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 1882-98; repr. New York: Dover, 1965) II, pp. 100-11 (p. 107).
[273]Child, II, pp. 115-16.

Within the ballad tradition from which Scott borrows, Meg is an unscrupulous character. When that tradition is superimposed upon eighteenth-century Christian morality, with its expectations of female passivity, Meg becomes a totally evil character, outwith the standards of behaviour for all societies.[274] Her revenge against Staunton is nothing short of demonic. Unable to kill him because he was the first to suckle at her breast, she sets out to hurt him: Madge's child is dead; Effie, his beloved, will hang for child-murder; their child has disappeared. Meg consistently violates the social compact of all microcosms in which she participates: she is not a 'good' mother; she does not safeguard either child she delivers; she is not possessed of even the honour of thieves. Meg's power is not generative, it is destructive. Faced with these 'unnatural' acts, it is no wonder that the reader is unable to feel anything but relieved that Meg has been taken and hanged.

The young women whom Meg so totally wrongs are a much more plausible blonde/brunette pair than that of Jeanie and Effie suggested by Alexander Welsh. The stories of Madge Wildfire and, the reader initially believes, of Effie Deans are virtually identical. Both are seduced and made pregnant by Staunton/Robertson. Meg Murdockson, attendant at both deliveries, kills Madge's child and leaves Effie with the belief that her child is dead. Both lose their good name as a result of their relationship with Staunton. The lives of these characters thus far appear to follow the storyline of the false lover ballads. Madge, in fact, expresses this in her fashion, 'The form and the features, the speech and degree,/Of the man that true lover of mine shall be. But I need not ask that of the bonny Lady Moon - I ken that weel eneugh mysell - *true*-love though he wasna - But naebody shall sae that I ever tauld a word about the matter.' (183, emphasis mine)

As events unfold, we learn that it is only Madge who has, in fact, been betrayed by Staunton. An accident has prevented his acting to free Effie, although he would have turned himself in, and indeed gives Jeanie permission so to do, to clear her sister's name. I would suggest that this has more to do with the differences in social position between the members

---

[274]Note Meg's unwillingness to adhere even to the honour among thieves when she interferes with Jeanie's 'safe conduct'. (299-311)

of this triangle than has previously been credited. When he has his affair with Madge, Staunton is the 'Measter', and she is merely the 'beautiful but very giddy' daughter of 'the wife of a favourite servant of [his] father.' (343) Rarely do such relationships end successfully, for there is a whole tradition of seigneurial rights and empty promises of marriage underlying them. Effie, however, believes him to be Geordie Robertson the smuggler. As such, *she* is (technically) *his* social superior. Despite the popular support for smuggling and of smugglers in Scotland at this time, Geordie is nevertheless a criminal - who is more than he appears. There is precedent in the ballads on which Scott drew for such relationships ending successfully: the 'Beggar Laddie' in C 280 reveals himself to be 'a young knight', while the young Highlander in C 226 takes his beloved to a hovel appropriate to his presumed rank before declaring that he is, in fact, 'great Macdonald'.[275] Robertson/Staunton tells Jeanie that:

> I was firmly resolved to do her all the justice which marriage could do, so soon as I should be able to extricate myself from my unhappy course of life, and embrace some one more suited to my birth. I had *wild visions - visions of conducting her as if to some poor retreat, and introducing her at once to rank and fortune she never dreamt of.* (344-5, emphasis mine)[276]

Yet, for all that Effie's life ultimately resembles that of a ballad heroine, it is Madge Wildfire who is the true child of the oral tradition. As Carol Anderson has demonstrated, names and naming are integral to the structure of *The Heart of Midlothian*. The song Madge 'like[s]...the best o' a' is one 'Gentle George made on me lang syne' and it is from this that she takes her name. 'I am often singing it, and that's maybe the reason folk ca' me Madge Wildfire. I aye answer to the name, though it's no my ain, for what's the use of making a fash?' (320) Madge, we have already learned, has been called Wildfire '"ever since I was something better-..." (and something like melancholy dwelt on her features for a minute)-"But I canna mind when that was - it was lang syne, at ony rate, and I'll ne'er fash my thumb about it."' (172) Of course she does mind when that was, as the look of melancholy betrays.

---

[275]Child, V, p. 119; IV, p. 258.

[276]This type of ballad is unique to the Scottish tradition. cf. Roger deVere Renwick, *English Folk Poetry: Structures and Meaning*, (London: Bastford Academic and Educational, 1980), p. 34.

She has been 'Wildfire' rather than 'Murdockson' since the night George Staunton crafted the song for her. It was on that night, we are able to conjecture, that she became his lover. It was the night she 'went with him to Lockington wake, to see him act upon a stage [....] He might hae dune waur than married me that night as he promised.' (320) With that promise of marriage, Madge, like many a fallen woman before her, is willing to become George's lover. In so doing, she starts down a path which can only lead to her destruction. The minute George breaks his troth to her, she becomes like Fair Annet in C 73, whose betrothed leaves her for a woman approved of by his family, 'No, I will tak my mither's counsel,/And marrie me owt o hand;/And I will tak the nut-browne bride,/Fair Annet may leive the land'[277] or like the eponymous infanticides Mary Hamilton, ['But when she cam to the gallows-foot,/The tears blinded her ee.'] and The Cruel Mother ['"Whaten a place hae ye prepar'd for me?"/"Heaven's for us, but hell's for thee"'. (H text)][278]. The only paths Scott's character can take, according to the traditions on which he draws, are those of madness and/or of death.

Ultimately, Madge suffers both fates. While Madge is manic, Scott is able to make full use of his knowledge of the ballad tradition, for she often takes snatches of song to illustrate a given scenario. In so doing, he demonstrates the extent to which these ballads are known across the social spectrum; Ratton starts Madge off to warn Robertson of the danger of capture, for example. Madge's language while manic is also indicative of her orality. It is alliterative, and when not directly quoting the ballads flows from one idea to the next, much as a balladeer uses keywords to structure a song and move from scene to scene[279]. On her deathbed, Madge again returns to song to state her self-image. No longer Madge Wildfire, she requests that her face be 'turn[ed...] to the wa', that I may never answer to that name ony mair, and never see mair of a wicked world.' She has repudiated the name

---

[277]Child, II, pp. 181-99 (p. 183).

[278]The chosen text of '173. Mary Hamilton' is the I text, taken from Scott's *Minstrelsy*. The stanza quoted, Child tells us, is one of three 'in the first edition of the *Minstrelsy*, 1802, II, 154 from recitation'. Child, III, p. 392. '20. The Cruel Mother', Child, I, p. 223.

[279]See, for example, Madge's references to *Pilgrim's Progress*, and Jeanie's ability to extract the truth of Madge's relationship with the Stauntons in chapters 30 and 31.

given her by song, and instead sings 'songs [in which there was] something appropriate, though perhaps only obliquely or collaterally so, to her present situation.' The name which Madge seems to give herself on her deathbed is that of 'Proud Maisie', whose bridal bed is the grave. (418)

Like Madge, Effie uses song as a means of communication. When she returns from a tryst with Robertson, she is singing 'The elfin knight'.[280] The connotations of this particular ballad are twofold. First, and most obviously, that Effie has been with one not of her world. Second, to one familiar with the tradition, there is the irony of knowing that the lady in the ballad manages to meet the elfin knight's challenges, and the final verse of the ballad is 'My maidenhead I'll then keep still, / Let the elphin knight do what he will'. (B text)

Further evidence of Effie's affinity to an older, bygone tradition is found in narrative commentary. The narrator describes her as an 'untaught child of nature, whose good and evil seemed to flow rather from impulse than from reflection.' (194) The extent of the impulsiveness of this child of nature can be seen in her reflections following her father's diatribe against dancing. Rather than reveal her relationship with Robertson to Jeanie, Effie refuses to allow Jeanie to be 'mistress and mair', but resolves to abjure only the dancing to which her frivolous nature is drawn, rather than the dancing partner who is the greater danger to her morality.

In this resolution, we see the other tradition to which Effie owes part of her personality, for she lays 'a leaf in my Bible' and vows not to go back to the dancing. (106) Despite her natural gaiety, Effie is the daughter of David Deans. Where Madge's language is reminiscent in structure and rhythm of the ballads, Effie's (particularly after her arrest) recalls that of Scripture. She is the penitent sinner, who will accept her doom. Having the opportunity to escape during the Riots, she tells Robertson that it is '[b]etter tyne life, since tint is gude fame.' (72) She too, who reminds the Justices that 'we a' need forgiveness' and that she 'deserve[s] the warst frae man, and frae God too - But God is mair mercifu' to us than we are to each other.' As one would expect from the daughter of a Cameronian, Effie's

---

[280]'2. The Elfin Knight', Child, I, pp. 6-20 (p. 16).

religious belief is more that of the Old Testament than the New. She has done wrong, and must pay the price, a life for a life. Although she knows that she is innocent of infanticide, she believes that she has 'been the means of killing my greyheaded father', and must pay for that crime. (252)

Once pardoned, Effie returns to the headstrong behaviour which was the source of her initial grief. Three days she resides with her father at St. Leonard's, during which David 'tightened the bands of discipline, so as, in some degree, to gall the feelings, and aggravate the irritability of a spirit *naturally impatient and petulant, and now doubly so* from the sense of merited disgrace.' (447, emphasis mine) Effie has learned nothing from her ordeal. Her needs and desires must come first, and she flees with 'they who had done her maist wrong [and who] were now willing to do her what justice was in their power.' (448) Even her final conversation with Jeanie reflects this self-centredness. Effie has come to Argyleshire merely to 'see you gang by, or to hear the sound of your voice', and cannot come to the Lodge to see her father and Reuben because she 'maun follow my husband for better for worse.' (467)

It is subsequent to this scene that Effie ceases to be the ballad heroine she has been, and becomes instead the toast of London society. She is now no longer free to be the gregarious headstrong girl, but must instead adhere to the standards of polite, literate London. This change seems more abrupt when placed next to Jeanie's comparative stability as a Scots speaker. However, Effie has always been able to dissimulate, and her subterfuge is essential to her position (and, by implication, her husband's position) in their social circles. Jeanie's dislike of the 'tone of [...] the smothered degree of egotism' in Effie's letter is more than the fit of sisterly jealousy it has been credited as. (480) On a broader scale, it is the conflict between the Scottish Scot and the British one; between the adherent to the old, and the adapter to the new.

> Effie's essential weakness is not sexual passion; it is a rooted strain of self-will and deceit that David Deans himself has unwittingly fostered. [...] Effie's character is not really changed. she is still an egotist, still disregardful of the feelings of others, still primarily intent on pleasure, still gilding her selfishness with vivacity and charm, still acting a role, as in the days when she had deceived her father and her sister. But now she sees herself for

> what she is, and her self-knowledge leaves her neither proud nor happy in her social triumphs.[281]

While I would agree that this self-knowledge does occur, I would suggest that in spite of it, Effie becomes a success in London society because of her ability to dissimulate. Effie, as Lady Staunton, is a perfect example of the disparity which exists between the public and the private in London society. Because she is the 'daughter of a Cameronian cowfeeder', Effie is able to see the standards of the fashionable world for what they are:

> the cruel tone of light indifference with which persons in the fashionable world speak together on the most affecting subjects! To hear *my* guilt, *my* folly, *my* agony, the foibles and weaknesses of *my* friends - even your heroic exertions, Jeanie, spoken of in the drolling style which is the present tone in fashionable life - Scarce all that *I* formerly endured is equal to this state of irritation. (479, emphases mine)

However, even this clarity of vision does not prompt Effie to be concerned about anything but herself.[282]

The extent to which Effie has succeeded in submerging the individual in the persona of polite (public) society is demonstrated in her visit to the Manse. Scott indicates to his reader the changes which have taken place in Effie's personality through a number of descriptive clauses prior to giving this extended description of the changes which have occurred in the fifteen years since her imprisonment:

> Jeanie [...] was lost in amazement at the wonderful difference betwixt the helpless and despairing girl, whom she had seen stretched on a flock-bed in a dungeon, expecting a violent and disgraceful death, and last as a forlorn exile upon the midnight beach, with the elegant well-bred, beautiful woman before her. The *features [...] did not appear so extremely different, as the whole manner, expression, look, and bearing*. In outside show, Lady Staunton seemed completely a creature too soft and fair for sorrow to have touched; so much accustomed to have all her whims complied with by those around her, that she seemed to expect she should even be saved the trouble of forming them; and *so totally unacquainted with contradiction, that she did not even use the tone of self-will, since to breathe a wish was to have it fulfilled*. (501, emphases mine)

The transition between cowfeeder's daughter and Lady Staunton is as abrupt as that between volumes three and four of *Heart*, but to a certain extent, it is an intentionally abrupt

---

[281]Edgar Johnson, *Sir Walter Scott: the Great Unknown*, 2 vols (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1970), I, pp. 658, 661.
[282]cf. Kelly's discussion of society as a corruptive force in Romantic 'novels of manners, sentiment and emulation', pp. 42-48 (p. 42).

one. The changes in Effie's character, problematic though they are, do reflect the changes which occurred in Scottish society within the first two generations after the Union of 1707. Social and political survival necessitated adaptation, although the consequence of this adaptive denial of cultural origins was an ambiguous socio-cultural identity.

Effie, who starts as ballad heroine, ends as the novel's ingenue; subject to the dictates of polite society. I would suggest that this paradigmatic shift is due to Scott's deliberate juxtaposition of genres rather than to any structural flaws in the novel. The ballad heroine who marries above her station is supposed to have happiness as the reward for her fidelity. She is not meant to become subject to societal standards that run counter to those of her origins. Instead of being the adored bride of her 'Highland Laddie', Effie now must adhere to those expectations which dictate that a serene and placid self must be presented to society at all times.[283] There would be less difficulty accepting Effie's transformation had she been less balladic - had her ascent of the social ladder been the gradual one of Jeanie's daughter Femie, for example. Instead, Scott must punish Effie for her adultery and the illegitimate birth of her son (although, as he points out, 'he was indeed already a legitimate child *according to the law of Scotland,* by the subsequent marriage of his parents') because she is now subject to the standards of literary Britain rather than of oral Scotland. (511, emphasis mine) In so doing, I would suggest, Scott is demonstrating the cultural dissociation which accompanies Union, and which he continues to perceive as part of his social context. The magical transformation of Effie into 'ingenue', and her return to Scotland as Lady Staunton is not the result of a need to stretch the novel to four volumes, but is instead a deliberate exploration of the socio-cultural effects of Union on an individual who is representative of Scottish socio-cultural traditions.

The contrast between Effie's and Madge's fates is in part, the result of the different ballad traditions to which they ultimately belong. Effie's lover she believes to be her social

---

[283]See, for example, Mrs. Taylor's *Practical Hints to Young Females, On the Duties of a Wife , a Mother, and Mistress of a Family* (London: Taylor and Hessey, 1818). She advises that a wife should 'endeavour to perpetuate' her husband's 'placid and gentle' temper, for she will then have 'powerful incentive to imitation in observing the benign effects of such dispositions on yourself and others', p. 12. Effie, in living the lie created for her by Staunton, is endeavouring to do precisely this.

inferior; yet she leaves the life she had a great risk to herself, for his sake. In the best ballad tradition, she is rewarded for her fidelity by elevation to the status of Lady. Madge's lover is her social superior, who has no qualms about abandoning her once the inappropriateness of their liaison is known. Here, as with Effie's life subsequent to her marriage, Scott mixes the traditions on which he draws. Staunton should, according to the traditions of inconstant lover, regret his infidelity and either return to his lover or die of shame as a result of causing her death. Instead, he marries the second woman he wrongs, and becomes a hair-shirt wearing penitent. It is with this mixture or 'oral' and 'literate' or balladic and romantic traditions that Scott's narrative reflects the uneasy alliance between cultural paradigms seen in post-Union Scottish society: as with the Queens discussed in chapter two, Scott resolves such conflicts at the expense of the integrity of his application(s) of his referents.

Unlike Effie, and the Duke of Argyle, Scott never forces Jeanie to change her conduct to adhere to an externally-imposed standard of conduct. Her identity remains grounded within the Scottish socio-cultural referent used by Scott throughout *The Heart of Midlothian*:

> Jeanie Deans is the heroine of truth. She has no need to search for a father or an identity - her paternity and her selfhood are never in doubt. She is not concerned to define and locate her own situation in terms of literary analogues: that is left to Madge Wildfire. She is never found in disguise or decked out in clothes that shadow forth a different identity; the stress on her adherence to her Scottish dress and to such symbolic elements in that dress as her plaid and her maiden snood constitutes something more than the telling detail of a brilliantly realistic portrait[284]

That 'something more' that her adherence to things Scottish constitutes is Scott's belief in the positive aspects of Scottish culture and society as manifested through Jeanie. Jeanie is, and remains, the character of moderation in this social construct. Effie's sexual passion and emotional outbursts are typically feminine, while the qualities of moderation and reasoned behaviour found in Jeanie's character are typically masculine. This is not to say that Jeanie is the 'wavering' hero(ine) of this Waverley novel: she remains unchanged by her experiences, and is the catalyst for change in the lives of others.

---

[284]Jane Millgate, *Walter Scott: The Making of the Novelist*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1984), p. 153.

Like her sister, Jeanie has roots both in what Scott perceives to be Scotland's oral past, and in its religious heritage. Because Jeanie is presented by Scott as a more reasoned and reasoning personality than Effie, I would suggest that her associations with these two socio-cultural traditions will be less extreme. Jeanie, Scott tells us, tempers her beliefs with '[t]he plain matter-of-fact element'[285] in her personality which her sister's passionate nature lacks. This is not to say that Jeanie's moderation is the sign of a rational, enlightened disposition, for, as Scott explains to his reader:

> Witchcraft and demonology, as we have already had occasion to remark, were at this period believed in by almost all ranks, but more especially among the stricter classes of Presbyterians, whose government, when their party were at the head of the state, had been much sullied by their eagerness to inquire into and persecute these imaginary crimes. (156)

Unlike her sister and Madge Wildfire, Scott does not make direct parallels between Jeanie and paradigms of female orality: this characterisation is not a *product* of the ballad tradition. This does not mean that Scott dissociates her from Scotland's oral culture, for she is fully aware of the implications of her sister's use of the old Scotch song', and suggests that if her sister 'will learn fule sangs, ye might make a kinder use of them.' (194) Note that the songs Effie sings are foolish; Jeanie is aware of the power of words, but uses that power carefully.

Jeanie's religious beliefs predominate in her personality, as one might expect from the daughter of a Cameronian. According to those beliefs, lying is sinful, and an unacceptable means of saving Effie. Here again, we see Scott's placement of Jeanie as the character of moderation in his schema, for they are neither the histrionic, circumstantially affected beliefs of her sister, nor the dogmatic, unyielding beliefs of her father. Through Jeanie, I would suggest, Scott presents a domestication of the revolutionary values of Davie Deans, and a moderation of Effie's self-accountable conduct. The Calvinist belief in self-determination is integral to Scott's presentation of Jeanie; contributing significantly to her masculine moderation. However, and somewhat paradoxically, it is her feminine self-lessness, her concern with the domestic, which tempers the potentially revolutionary nature of her act. Jeanie is able to do as she does because her action is not an attempt to

---

[285]Walter Bagehot on Scott, *National Review* 1858, in *Scott: The Critical Heritage*, ed. by John O. Hayden, (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970), pp. 394-421, (p. 416).

challenge the extant power structure. This simple peasant girl is on a quest which is concerned with the domestic rather than with the public. Jeanie is not asking for political change, or for Scottish independence. Instead, she is asking for mercy for a sister who is innocent of infanticide.

Jeanie is a product of a society which is still reliant on the connections of kinship and the power of speech: both of which for Scott are associated with the female. She is fully aware of the power of all words, as her sensitivity to Effie's song, and to the nuances of Madge's speech demonstrate. Prior to Jeanie's departure for London, Scott makes this awareness explicit, explaining to Reuben that 'writing winna do it - a letter canna look, and pray, and beg, and beseech, as the human voice can do to the human heart. A letter's like the music that the ladies have for their spinets - naething but black scores, compared to the same tune played or sung. (283) As discussed above, it is precisely this power of speech which moves first Argyle and then Caroline to help Jeanie. Jeanie's speech is fluid, and it is eloquent, but it is not the wholly alliterative, repetitive, allusive speech of Madge and Effie.

What is significant about Jeanie's speech is its consistency as Scots speech. Jeanie is very much the moderate Waverley protagonist - neither the passionate ballad heroine nor the religious fanatic. Where she differs from that precedent of moderation is in her familial allegiance. The Cameronian cause is one that is long-dead, and has no bearing on the political environment of the day. One would expect that such would therefore make Jeanie more readily assimilated into the new, anglicising, society of Edinburgh and would mark her speech as it does Reuben's. Such expectations fail to mark the dichotomy which exists within the Scottish society Scott constructs within *The Heart of Midlothian*, never mind the quite obvious one which exists between Scotland and England. Jeanie's life as a cowfeeder's daughter is not one which requires contact with those elements of society for whom Union means interaction with England on a regular basis. In addition to the obvious class issue is the more important one of gender. As a woman, Jeanie is never going to participate fully, if at all, in those areas of Scottish society where knowledge and use of English were necessary: the Kirk (Reuben's careful, if anachronistic speech) and the law (all

of Effie's trial is conducted in English).[286] As a result, her speech can be consistent with her place within her society, as well as serving as an indicator of the source(s) of Jeanie's seemingly unusual degree of action and expression.

The standards of behaviour under which Jeanie is operating are neither those of polite society nor those of the novel. Instead, they are those of pre-Union Scotland, where greater interactive participation within society of members of all sexes and classes was the norm rather than the exception. Jeanie's request of Argyle, when seen in this context, is not at all presumptuous. Argyle's awareness of this dynamic of Scottish society is what prompts him initially to listen to Jeanie, and what prompts him to repay his grandfather's debt of honour by caring for Jeanie and assisting her in her quest. Within the context of either tradition, however, virtue such as hers is, of course, rewarded. The Scots lass is married to her beloved, and, more important from the anglicised (and by association, class-sensitised) Duke's perspective, is outfitted with a 'wardrobe of a young person in Jeanie's situation in life, the destined bride of a respectable clergyman.' (458-9) This wardrobe is not, however, that of a Scots peasant. In marrying Reuben Butler, Jeanie has begun an externally perceived ascent of the social ladder. She can remain the honest woman she is and can, in the polyglot world of Knocktarlitie, continue as a Scots speaker. She cannot, however, present an external appearance at odds with the position she occupies in that society: interestingly, it is the Duke who acknowledges his Scottishness at will, who makes Jeanie an indirect present of the clothing which is 'appropriate' to her new social status. With her marriage, Jeanie moves still further from the forthright girl encountered in the first three volumes. She is now playing a societal role, and must act accordingly. She is no longer one of the faceless masses, but has become, particularly in the world of Knocktarlitie, a person of significance.

---

[286]While by the 1798 infanticide trial of Janet Gray, the proceedings were conducted in English, it is highly unlikely that this would have been the case in 1736. I would suggest that here again, Scott is eliding the historic record to emphasise some of the benefits of 'North Britishness'; Erskine's defence of Gray relied in part on English common law, and served as an impetus to the passage in 1809 of an act limiting punishment for infanticide to no more than two years imprisonment. For full discussion of the Gray case in the context of infanticide in law and in lore, see Deborah Symonds's *The Re-Forming of Women's Culture: Scotland 1750-1830*, (Ann Arbor: University Microfilms International, 1985), pp. 176-88.

It is this fourth volume of *The Heart of Midlothian* which has proven problematic for the reader since its publication. I would suggest that much of its awkwardness arises from the fact that Scott is now having to operate under the conventions of a literate British society - once again the juxtaposition of genres and cultures causes him no end of difficulty. It is not insignificant that in this fourth volume, that not only is the breadth of feminine voices severely curtailed (only Jeanie and Effie appear at Knocktarlitie), but that what voice there is is suppressed by the shift in societal power structure that the relocation represents. Scott is no longer creating a society wherein women act overtly as full and equal partners. Instead, it is a patriarchy, governed by the Anglophone, London-based Dukes of Argyle. In addition, there is the small matter of the '45 which, given the Hanoverian allegiances of Argyle, must be addressed. The changes it brought to Scotland were hardly insignificant, and would surely have impacted upon the heritable jurisdiction at Knocktarlitie. By isolating Jeanie, and making an island where one does not exist, Scott manages to avoid the effect those societal changes which were brought about in the aftermath of Culloden would have had on his heroine.

Through the character of Jeanie Deans, Scott is presenting a picture of the gradual assimilation of Scots into Britain. Those characteristics which Scott continually emphasises in Jeanie: integrity, honesty, and courage are those seen in other Scott characters who successfully make the transition into a modern society. Jeanie differs from the Waverley heroes whose place she takes in that she does not undergo the process of maturation they do. I would suggest that this, as well as the reversal of the route of the normal Waverley hero is an indicator of Scott's own feelings about Scotland's role in Britain: Union is a beneficial thing for Scotland, but Scotland and its people are equally beneficial to Britain. The fact that it is a woman who carries this message both subverts and, to a knowledgeable reader, underscores it. Jeanie is, after all, merely a woman - incapable of much within the British world of the novel's initial readership. However, those characteristics she carries to 'Britain' are those of the *Scottish* domestic (and therefore feminine) world.

The Heart of Midlothian contains representatives of each group of female characters discussed above. As is typical in the Waverley novels, those characters who are unable to govern their passions, or to assimilate into the new world order do not live to see novel's end. The Edinburgh tradeswomen are sufficiently elderly that their survival into the new world is never a consideration. Madge and her mother belong totally to the older, oral, ballad culture of Scotland. There is no place for them in the polyglot world of Knocktarlitie, or in the increasingly cosmopolitan world of Edinburgh. Effie and Staunton are much the same, although they are able to put on a show of assimilation for several years. Ultimately, their passionate natures drive them away from the roles they have played in that society - Staunton killed by his own nature in the person of his son, and Effie retiring to the continental convent where Scott sends his unruly women. Only Jeanie has a future in the new Scotland. Interestingly, among Scott's protagonists it is only Jeanie Deans whose happy ending is explicitly delineated to the reader. I would suggest that there are two reasons for this. First, because Jeanie's quest is not concerned with the historic events which are playing out over the course of the novel. Because it centres on the domestic concerns of the family, it seems natural for the conclusion of Jeanie's quest to result in the explicit delineation of her personal happiness. Second, and more significantly, it is Jeanie whose children will become the North Britons of the future. It is Jeanie who produces a soldier, a lawyer and a Highland lady; the fates of her offspring further underscoring her role as the embodiment of the best in Scottish cultural virtues.

Conclusion

In Alan Massie's fictional version of the life of Sir Walter Scott, Scott provides this account of his relation with women and the roles he has given them in his own novels:

> I have never admired the uxorious man, for there are parts of a man's life which should properly remain separate from a woman's; and the uxorious man diminishes himself and denies a large part of his nature, but I contemn the bad, the careless, and the selfish husband utterly, and I trust I may acquit myself of this charge.
>
> Indeed I may go further. The time may come in this disjointed memoir, written to staunch the pain of these hours of grievous fortune, when I choose to talk, as I have ever shrunk from talking, about the works that have proceeded from my imagination; but I shall say this now. Critics have complained that my heroines are for the most part dull. So they are, I fear, plaguey dull. It is strange, for I have lived much of my life among fine ladies, ladies of quality; and am no great hand at depicting them in my novels. The reason is plain, though perhaps hidden from my critics. It is that I do not hear them talk. They do not speak to my imagination, and when a character fails to do that, the worlds lie leaden on the page. Yet when I happen on an old crone like Madge Wildfire or Meg Merrilees, my prose takes wing.
>
> [...] And then Jeanie Deans: her douce scrupulous Presbyterian voice conceals its warm humanity aneath a dour rectitude. When I was writing *The Heart of Midlothian*, her voice dinged in my lugs. Oh, Jeanie, you are worth a clutch of my fine ladies.[287]

Massie's account of Scott's women is both confirmed and challenged by the reading that this thesis has provided: there is no doubt that Scott's imagination works most powerfully when his 'ear' is engaged by the speech of his characters, and that his lower-class women, therefore, are more convincing - at least in terms of traditional, 'realistic' conceptions of character construction - than his upper-class women. Their speech gives them a specificity and an individuality often lacking in the 'polite' talk and limited scope for action of Scott's more genteel female characters. Jenny Rintherout's mobility serves, for example, as the impetus for Scott's presentation of lower-class female orality in *The Antiquary*, while Isabella Wardour's attempt at self-assertion results in her rescue by Lovel which serves to emphasise her passivity.

This disparity is illustrative not so much of the weaknesses in Scott's fiction in terms of traditional realist criteria but of the broad knowledge that Scott had of female society and of

---

[287]Allan Massie, *The Ragged Lion*, (London: Hutchinson, 1994), pp. 31-2.

the changes in Scottish society that resulted in modifications to and restrictions of the range of possibilities for self-expression open to women. As women's position in society came to be defined increasingly by the demands of a 'polite' society that defined its norms in terms of class-based, English values, the autonomy and assertiveness which Scott had found both in his working class female characters, and among the 'ladies' of an older Scottish society, were being eroded. Massie's attribution to Scott of a fondness for 'old crones' or for peasant women whose 'douce scrupulous Presbyterian voice conceals its warm humanity aneath a dour rectitude' indicates what the novels themselves tell us: that Scott saw in the process of social improvement both a constriction in the scope for the male heroic endeavour that he perceives in past ages and an equal reduction in the ability of women to achieve individuality in speech or action because of the external imposition on them of models of female behaviour.

The tradition of female autonomy which is integral to the Scottish ballad tradition can therefore be seen as providing models by which Scott was able to determine the distance between 'traditional' and 'modern' societal expectations of female conduct. Without an appreciation for a literary tradition which seems to be specifically Scottish, and for the socio-cultural - and especially the legal - context in which female activity, rather than feminine passivity, was the norm, we cannot fully appreciate the significance or the nuanced representations of women in the Waverley novels. To view them, as have past critics, in an Anglo-British cultural context is to doubly marginalise them: they are invisible both in terms of the gender expectations which critics have brought to the texts and in terms of the invisibility of the specific national context in which Scott places them. Female characters in Scott's novels often have a power that is itself a reflection of the economic independence and legal entitlement to decision-making of which women were possessed in seventeenth and eighteenth-century Scottish society. The passivity seen in what I have termed the 'ingenues' is a behaviour imposed from without, from an anglicised socio-cultural context, which suppresses the autonomy and activity that is evident in the ballad tradition. Scott's excision from *St. Ronan's Well* of explicit reference to Clara Mowbray's fornication *ante nup*, despite

its legality under Scots marriage law, and the narrative (and critical) tensions which result from this juxtaposition of cultural referents is perhaps the clearest example of the manner in which conflicting normative expectations of female conduct can result in critical misinterpretation. Rather than assuming the illegitimacy of the ballad paradigm on which Scott drew in the creation of many of his fictional females, we should perhaps recognise its centrality to Scott's socio-cultural context. The anglicisation of Scottish middle-class society did result in a gradual appropriation of normative feminine behaviours in that cross-section of Scottish society: it did not result in an instantaneous eradication of autonomous behaviour among women of that class.

In Scott's presentation of the ways in which the processes of social change affected women, further justification can be found for those critical views which seek to base their assessment of Scott in his ability accurately to present history as a complex totality. Scott's female characters contribute to the richness and the accuracy of his presentation of particular historical epochs, and without them the arguments in support of Scott's success as a realist writer would be much weaker. More importantly, however, Scott's use of his female characters adds to or intensifies those structural patterns which some critics have taken to represent the basis on which it is possible to argue for the coherence of his novels. Female figures, even when they are 'minor' characters in the overall plot structure, often play a key role in Scott's fiction in providing the variations through which particular themes are developed.

Scott can utilise his female characters to reflect the political polarities of the society he presents in a given novel: the effect of political turmoil on the domestic, female world adds 'realism' to the process of social change he explores in his fiction. *Waverley*'s Rose Bradwardine and Flora MacIvor, perhaps because of Scott's inexperience with the narrative process, serve both as symbol for the nationalistic associations of the Hanoverian and Jacobite causes (the English Rose, and Scottish 'lover' of the Stewart prince), and as emblem of the effect of political upheaval on the domestic world. Rose's home is destroyed, although the benevolence of the English Colonel Talbot and Edward Waverley effect its

restoration, while Flora loses her home and family, and all chance for fulfilment of her potentiality of motherhood. *Old Mortality*'s Lady Margaret Bellenden and Mause Headrigg serve to foreground the effect of fanaticism on the family. Lady Margaret's adherence to the Stewarts costs her Tillietudlem both during and after the Covenanting rebellions: her devotion to an ideal blinds her to the social changes which impact upon her society, and with greater immediacy, on her granddaughter, Edith. Mause's devotion to the tenets of the Covenanters results in the loss of the home with which she, as woman, 'should' concern herself; like Lady Margaret, her fanaticism interferes with the maternal duties which should be her primary concern. Through such character pairs, Scott is able to explore the domestic impact of the socio-historic process which is central to his fiction. His assertion that political moderation is essential to the modernisation of society is, as a result, supported by evidences of socio-cultural moderation at the domestic level.

In terms of historical realism and structural organisation, therefore, female figures are much more central to Scott's novels than has been recognised by most criticism. From the context in which I have placed his work, we can see that this is specifically attributable to the nature of the Scottish society from which Scott's work emerges. If, as Massie surmises, Scott did believe that Jeanie Deans was his greatest creation, this would do no more than justice to Scott's continuous engagement with the issue of women's roles in his social constructs, with the 'literary' traditions on which he drew in the creation of his fictional females, and with the organisation of plot in his novels. There is, however, another issue which can be seen in Scott's presentation of the feminine, which relates directly to the nature of his own society and to his political involvements therein. Scott, as we know, was deeply concerned to maintain and to strengthen the Union of Scotland with England; at the same time he was, famously, actively engaged in attempting to maintain Scotland's independent institutional and cultural identity. The extent to which Scott is credited with - or blamed for - the 'invention' of much that passes for Scottish identity in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries is evidence of his success in this endeavour.

At the 'heart' of this apparently split ideology there is the abiding fact of the 'Union', a political event which is imaged as a marriage between unequal partners of different genders. In the Union, Scotland, as the weaker partner, must play the feminine role, which is why, so often, Scott's male protagonists are English men (Edward Waverley, Darsie Latimer, Frank Osbaldistone) who have to confront the strangeness and alienness of Scotland in the form of the feminine. The strength of Scott's concern with his female characters derives, perhaps, from this identification that makes the survival of the 'feminine' the measure of the survival of 'national' identity itself. If the female characters are, like Diana Vernon, forced into a denial of the traditions from which they arise, traditions identified in literature, law, and custom with Scotland's difference from England, then Scotland herself will be submerged into an anglicised, alien, 'conduct book'. At the same time, if female autonomy is given too much scope - as in the case of Flora MacIvor or Helen MacGregor - then the 'Union' will be broken. The simultaneous maintenance of the independence and autonomy of the feminine and its limitation and containment, becomes the equivalent of the maintenance of the national identity itself.

The importance of the feminine in Scott, at this level, is evidenced through the influence that his construction of a 'gendered' Scottish identity has had in the context both of the 'Unionist Nationalism' of the nineteenth century and of a reassertion of an independent Scottish socio-political identity in the first half of the twentieth century. Writers throughout the period regularly have to find the 'heart' of Scottish identity in the female, whether by the adoption of a female persona from which to write (Fiona MacLeod) or through the construction of mythopoeic figures whose endurance and survival reflect the continuing power of the national consciousness (Gibbon's Chris Guthrie in *A Scots Quair*, Gunn's Dark Mhairi in *Butcher's Broom*). What these identifications draw on is the autonomy possessed by women in Scotland's politically autonomous past, what they dramatise is the concurrent loss of those autonomies, and what they assert is the ability - at least among lower class women - to retain in part that cultural autonomy and freedom of action which is reflective of the relative autonomy of Scottish culture within the United Kingdom. The anglicisation of

Scottish middle-class society did result in a gradual appropriation of English socially normative feminine behaviours in that portion of Scottish society: it did not result in an immediate eradication of autonomous behaviour among women across classes. In this context, Scott had good reason to have a greater interest in the gender-related retention of national characteristics by women than has previously been credited.

The pattern of this tension can perhaps be seen in Scott's relationship with the ballad 'literature' from which so many of his female archetypes derive. Unlike the conflict between fictional and historic writings, in which two forms of written, and therefore quasi-authoritative, modes of discourse may come into conflict, the distinction between oral and written narrative inevitably raises questions of authority. In a modern society, the authority of the printed text originates in the argued superiority of one particular version of a narrative over all others. In the case of the ballad tradition, however, it is the power to generate multiplicity rather than the power of an 'authored' and 'authorised' print version that is significant. The variants of text and theme found by collectors attest both to the oral-formulaic nature of song (re-) creation, and to the ways in which that re-created narrative may be adapted to respond to cultural expectations of what is considered acceptable conduct and action. Scott's amendment and 'correction' of the ballads which he anthologised seek to preserve the ballad tradition through acceptance and recognition of its removal from a living cultural environment in which these songs will be remade from singer to singer. The collected and printed ballads preserve the tradition only by setting new and strict limits on its autonomy of development. The ballads in Scott's collections therefore come to be reflections not of the tradition itself but of the collectors' perceptions of acceptability for their socio-cultural milieu - they are 'lasses' turned into 'ingenues'.

Work on ballad transmission has, as I have discussed elsewhere, indicated the gynecentric nature of this genre and we might speculate that the generic tensions which arise between the independence of the song tradition and the submissiveness of its printed versions is symbolic of the socio-cultural tensions in Scott's own society which forced him both to assert and to limit female autonomy in his novels. Rather than simply undermining

female orality with male literacy, as some critics have suggested Scott's practice as a collector has done, I would suggest that what Scott seeks is an interdependence; each mode of discourse affirming the other's validity, and 'supplementing' the other's weaknesses. In so doing, Scott enacts his belief in the interdependence of Scotland and England. To reflect either social norm without acknowledgement of the other would result in the isolation of the individual from the unified society that Scott seeks as the conclusion to his historical narratives. Male, institutional interaction with England (as represented by Argyle, Reuben's Anglicé speech, and to a lesser extent the 'oe of a Campvere skipper') results in an appropriation of normative English behaviours, while Scott's women continue to reflect what I have termed the ballad paradigm of female autonomy and to project a parallel autonomy for Scotland herself.

In addressing the women of the Waverley novels, and the socio-cultural referents of which they are representative, I have attempted to remove them from the critical margins to which they have been consigned. If the suggestions I have just offered are correct, then to fully grasp the nature and development of Scott's female figures may be central not only to the understanding of Scott's work but of the culture from which that work derived and the culture which resulted from the synthesis of masculine, authoritative text and feminine generative tradition.

Works Consulted

Primary Sources

Scott, Sir Walter, *The Abbot; Being a Sequel to The Monastery*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr 1886, xi.

---, *Anne of Geierstein; or, The Maiden of the Mist*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xxiii.

---, *The Antiquary*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh : Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, iii.

---, *The Betrothed; A Tale of the Crusaders* and *The Chronicles of the Canongate*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols. Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xxi.

---, *The Bride of Lammermoor*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, viii.

---, *Count Robert of Paris*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh, Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xxiv.

---, *The Fair Maid of Perth; or, St. Valentine's Day*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xxii.

---, *The Fortunes of Nigel*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, xiv.

---, *Guy Mannering; or, The Astrologer*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr, 1885, ii.

---, *The Heart of Midlothian*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr, 1886, vii.

---, *Ivanhoe A Romance*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, ix.

---, *Kenilworth*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, xii.

---, *A Legend of Montrose* and *The Black Dwarf*, Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, vi.

---, *The Monastery*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, x.

---, *Old Mortality*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, v.

---, *Peveril of the Peak*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xv.

---, *The Pirate*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, xiii.

---, *Quentin Durward*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr, 1887, xvi.

---, *Redgauntlet; A Tale of the Eighteenth Century* Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xviii.

---, *Rob Roy*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1886, iv.

---, *St. Ronan's Well*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xvii.

---, *The Surgeon's Daughter and Castle Dangerous*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols. Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xxv.

---, *The Talisman A Tale of the Crusaders* and *The Chronicles of the Canongate*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr. 1887, xx.

---, *Waverley; or, 'Tis Sixty Years Since*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr, 1885, i.

---, *Woodstock; or, The Cavalier A Tale of the year Sixteen Hundred and Fifty-one*. Centenary Edition, 25 vols, Edinburgh: Adam & Charles Black, 1871; repr 1887, xxi.

Bibliographies of Scott

Corson, James Clarkson, *A Bibliography of Sir Walter Scott: 1790-1840*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1943.

Rubenstein, Jill, *Sir Walter Scott: A Reference Guide*. Boston, MA: G.K. Hall, 1978.

---, *Sir Walter Scott: An Annotated Bibliography of Scholarship and Criticism 1975-1990*, Occasional Paper 11, Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, n.d. [1995].

Scott Criticism

Alexander, J. H. and David Hewitt, (eds.), *Scott and His Influence: The Papers of the Aberdeen Scott Conference, 1982*. Association for Scottish Literary Studies Occasional Papers: No. 6. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1983.

---, (eds.), *Scott in Carnival: Selected Papers from the Fourth International Scott Conference Edinburgh, 1991*. Association for Scottish Literary Studies. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993.

Allen, Walter, *Six Great Novelists: Defoe, Fielding, Scott, Dickens, Stevenson, Conrad*. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1955. 64-94.

Anderson, Carol. 'The Power of Naming: Language, Identity and Betrayal in *The Heart of Midlothian*', in J.H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (eds.), *Scott in Carnival: Selected Papers from the Fourth International Scott Conference Edinburgh, 1991*. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993, 189-201.

Anderson, James, *Sir Walter Scott and History: With Other Papers*. Edinburgh: The Edina Press, 1981.

Baker, Ernest A., *Edgeworth, Austen, Scott*. The History of the English Novel Volume 6, 11 vols, 1929; New York: Barnes & Noble, 1969, 122-226.

Beiderwell, Bruce, *Power and Punishment in Scott's Novels*. Athens and London: The University of Georgia Press, 1992.

Bold, Alan, (ed.), *Sir Walter Scott: The Long-Forgotten Melody*. London: Vision Press, 1983.

Buck, H. Michael, 'A Message in Her Madness: Socio-Political Bias in Scott's portrayal of Mad Clara Mowbray of *St. Ronan's Well*', *Studies in Scottish Literature* 24. (1989): 181-93.

Butler, Marilyn, *Romantics, Rebels and Reactionaries: English Literature and its Background 1760-1830*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP, 1981.

Cagidemetrio, Alide, 'A Plea for Fictional Histories and Old-Time "Jewesses"', in Werner Sollors, (ed.), *Invention of Ethnicity*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP, 1989, 14-43.

Calder, Angus and Jenni, *Scott*. New York: Arco, 1971.

Campbell, Ian, (ed.), *Nineteenth Century Scottish Fiction*. Manchester: Caracanet New Press, 1979.

Campbell, Ian and Peter Garside, (eds.), *Talking About Scott*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh Sir Walter Scott Club, 1994.

Chandler, James, 'The Historical Novel Goes to Hollywood: Scott Griffith and Film Epic Today', in Gene W. Ruoff, *The Romantics and Us: Essays on Literature and Culture*. New Brunswick, NJ and London: Rutgers UP, 1990, 237-73.

Colby, Robert A., '*Waverley*: Edward Waverley and the Fair Romance Reader', *Fiction With A Purpose: Major and Minor Nineteenth-Century Novels*. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1967. 28-65.

Cottom, Daniel, *The Civilized Imagination: A Study of Ann Radcliffe, Jane Austen, and Sir Walter Scott*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985.

---, 'Sir Walter Scott and the Spirit of the Novel', in G.A. Rosso and Daniel P. Watkins, (eds.), *Spirits of Fire: English Romantic Writers and Contemporary Historical Methods*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1990, 131-52.

Craig, David, *Scottish Literature and the Scottish People, 1680-1830*. London: Chatto & Windus, 1961.

Crawford, Thomas, *Walter Scott*. Scottish Writers Series No. 1. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1982.

Daiches, David, 'Scott's *Waverley* The Presence of the Author', in Ian Campbell, (ed.), *Nineteenth Century Scottish Fiction*. Manchester: Caracanet New Press, 1979, 3-17.

---, *Sir Walter Scott and His World*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1971.

Davies, Rick A., 'The Demon Lover Motif in *The Heart of Midlothian*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*. 16 (1981): 91-6.

Davies R.T. and B. G. Beatty, (eds.), *Literature of the Romantic Period, 1750-1850.* Liverpool: Liverpool UP, 1976.

Downs, Norton, 'Sir Walter Scott and Oral History', *Notes and Queries*. 28 (226)(4) Aug. 1981: 321-2.

Duncan, Ian, *Modern Romance and Transformations of the Novel: The Gothic, Scott, Dickens*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992.

Eagleton, Mary and David Pierce, *Attitudes to Class in the English Novel: From Walter Scott to David Storey*. London: Thames & Hudson, 1979.

Engel, Wilson F. III, 'Scott's *Anne of Geierstein*', *Explicator*. 40 (4) (1982): 28-30.

Ferris, Ina, *The Achievement of Literary Authority: Gender, History and the Waverley Novels*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1991.

Fleischman, Avrom, *The English Historical Novel: Walter Scott to Virginia Woolf*. Baltimore, MD and London: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1972. 3-101.

Fleischner, Jennifer B., 'Class, Character and Landscape in *Old Mortality*', *Scottish Literary Journal*. 9.2 (1982): 21-36.

Gordon, Robert C., *Under Which King?: A Study of the Scottish Waverley Novels*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1969.

Harris, R. W., *Romanticism and the Social Order 1780-1830*. London: Blandford Press, 1969. 233-262.

Hart, Francis R., *Scott's Novels: The Plotting of Historic Survival*. Charlottesville: UP of Virginia, 1966.

---, *The Scottish Novel: A Critical Survey*. London: John Murray, 1978.

Hayden, John O., (ed.), *Scott: The Critical Heritage*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970.

Hewitt, David, (ed.), *Scott on Himself: A Selection of the Autobiographical Writings of Sir Walter Scott*. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1981.

---, 'Walter Scott', in Douglas Gifford (ed.), *The History of Scottish Literature Volume 3*. 4 vols, gen. ed. Cairns Craig. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1989, 65-85.

Hillhouse, James T., *The Waverley Novels and their Critics*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1936.

Hogg, James, *Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott*. ed. by Douglas Mack. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1983.

Hollingworth, Brian, 'The Tragedy of Lucy Ashton, the *Bride of Lammermoor*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*.19 (1984): 94-105.

Jeffares, A. Norman, (ed.), *Scott's Mind and Art*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1969.

Johnson, Edgar, *Sir Walter Scott: The Great Unknown*. 2 vols. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1970.

Kelly, Gary, *English Fiction of the Romantic Period: 1789-1830*. London: Longman, 1989.

Kernohan, R.D., '"Will Ye No' Come Back Again?" Whatever Happened to Sir Walter Scott', *Contemporary Review*. 262.1528 (1993): 261-65.

Kerr, James, *Fiction Against History: Scott as Storyteller*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989.

Kestner, Joseph, 'Linguistic Transmission in Scott: *Waverley, Old Mortality, Rob Roy* and *Redgauntlet*', *The Wordsworth Circle*. 8.4 (1977): 333-48.

Lamont, Claire, 'Jacobite Songs as Intertexts in *Waverley* and *The Highland Widow*', in J. H. Alexander and David Hewitt (eds.), *Scott in Carnival: Selected Papers from the Fourth International Scott Conference Edinburgh, 1991*. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993, 110-22.

Lascelles, Mary, 'Jane Austen and Walter Scott: A Minor Point of Comparison', *Notions and Facts: Collected Criticism and Research*. London and Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972. 230-246.

McCracken-Flesher, Caroline, '*Pro Matria Mori*: Gendered Nationalism and Cultural Death in Scott's "The Highland Widow"', *Scottish Literary Journal*. 21.2 (1994): 69-78.

McMaster, Graham, *Scott and Society*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981.

MacQueen, John, *The Rise of the Historical Novel. The Enlightenment and Scottish Literature* 2. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1989.

Millgate, Jane, *Walter Scott: The Making of the Novelist*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1984.

Morgan, Susan, 'Old Heroes and a New Heroine in the Waverley Novels', *ELH*. 50.3 (1983): 559-85.

Nellist, Brian, 'Narrative Modes in the Waverley Novels', in R.T. Davies and B.G. Beatty, (eds.), *Literature of the Romantic Period: 1750-1850*. Liverpool: Liverpool UP, 1976, 56-71.

Oberhelman, David, 'Waverley, Genealogy, History: Scott's Romance of Fathers and Sons', *Nineteenth Century Contexts*. 15.1 (1991): 29-47.

Orr, Marilyn, 'Repetition, Reversal and the Gothic: *The Pirate* and *St. Ronan's Well*', *English Studies in Canada*. 16.2 (n.d.): 187-99.

---, 'Voices and Text: Scott the Storyteller, Scott the Novelist', *Scottish Literary Journal*. 16.2 (1989): 41-59.

Parsons, Coleman O., *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction: With chapters on the Supernatural in Scottish Literature*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1964.

Pittock, Murray G. H., 'Scott as Historiographer: The Case for Waverley', in J. H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (eds.), *Scott in Carnival: Selected Papers from the Fourth International Scott Conference Edinburgh, 1991*. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993, 145-53.

Praz, Mario, 'Sir Walter Scott', *The Hero in Eclipse in Victorian Fiction*. trans. by Angus Davidson, London: Oxford UP, 1956, 54-64.

Robertson, Fiona, *Legitimate Histories: Scott, Gothic and the Authorities of Fiction*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994.

Shaw, Harry E., *The Forms of Historical Fiction: Sir Walter Scott and His Successors*. London: Cornell UP, 1983.

Sutherland, John, *The Life of Walter Scott; A Critical Biography*. Oxford & Cambridge, MA: Blackwell, 1995.

Sutherland, Kathryn, 'Walter Scott's Highland Minstrelsy and his Correspondence with the Maclean Clephane Family', *Scottish Literary Journal*. 9.1 (1982): 48-66.

Symonds, Deborah Ann, *The Re -Forming of Women's Work and Culture: Scotland 1750-1830*. Diss. SUNY Binghamton, 1985. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI, 1992.

Tait, Margaret, 'The Cardboard Girls', *The Scott Newsletter*. 18 (Summer, 1991): 5.

Thompson, Jon, 'Sir Walter Scott and Madge Wildfire: Strategies of Containment in *The Heart of Midlothian*', *Literature and History*. 13.2 (1987): 187-99.

Truten, Jack, 'Folklore and Fakelore: Narrative Construction and Deconstruction in the Scottish Novels of Sir Walter Scott', in J. H. Alexander and David Hewitt, (eds.), *Scott In Carnival: Selected Papers from the Fourth International Scott Conference Edinburgh, 1991*. Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1993, 122-32.

Tulloch, Graham, *The Language of Walter Scott: A Study of Scottish and Period Language*. London: Andre Deutsch, 1980.

Valente, Joseph, 'Upon the Braes: History and Hermeneutics in *Waverley*', *Studies in Romanticism*. 25.2 (1986): 251-76.

Wallace, Tara Ghoshal, 'Walter Scott and Feminine Discourse; The Case of *St. Ronan's Well*', *Journal of Narrative Technique*. 19.2 (1989): 233-47.

Welsh, Alexander, *The Hero of the Waverley Novels*. New Haven, CT: Yale UP,

1963.

Williams, Ioan, *The Realist Novel in England: A Study in Development*. London: Macmillan, 1974.

Wilt, Judith, *Secret Leaves: The Novels of Sir Walter Scott*. London and Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.

Wittig, Kurt, 'High Water Mark: Walter Scott', *The Scottish Tradition in Literature*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1958. Westport, CT.: Greenwood Press, 1972., 221-38.

General Readings

Abrams, M. H., *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition*. New York: Oxford UP, 1953; repr. 1971.

Adburgham, Alison, *Silver Fork Society: Fashionable Life and Literature from 1814 to 1840*. London: Constable, 1983

Allan, David, *Virtue, Learning and the Scottish Enlightenment*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1993.

Andersen, Flemming G., Otto Holzapfel and Thomas Pettit, *The Ballad As Narrative: Studies in the Ballad Traditions of England, Scotland, Germany and Denmark*. Odense: Odense UP, 1982.

Andersen, Flemming G., 'From Tradition to Print: Ballads on Broadsides', in Flemming G. Andersen, Otto Holtzapfel and Thomas Pettit, *The Ballad As Narrative: Studies in the Ballad Traditions of England, Scotland, Germany and Denmark*. Odense: Odense UP, 1982, 39-58.

---, 'Technique, Text and Context: Formulaic Narrative Mode and the Question of Genre', in Joseph Harris (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 18-39.

Anna Comnena, *The Alexiad of Anna Comnena*. trans. by E.R.A. Sewter, Harmondsworth: Penguin Classics-Penguin, 1969.

Armstrong, Nancy, *Desire and Domestic Fiction: A Political History of the Novel*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987.

Armstrong, Nancy and Leonard Tennenhouse, eds., *The Ideology of Conduct: Essays on Literature and the History of Sexuality*. New York and London: Methuen, 1987.

Ash, Marinell, *The Strange Death of Scottish History*. Edinburgh: Ramsay Head Press, 1980.

Auerbach, Nina, *Woman and the Demon: The Life of a Victorian Myth*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1982.

Baker, Ronald L., 'The Image of Women in British Romantic and Humorous Ballads', *Midwestern Folklore*. 17.2 (1991): 125-30.

Bakhtin, M.M., *The Dialogic Imagination*. trans. by Caryl Emerson and Michael. Holquist, ed. by Michael Holquist, Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981.

Bann, Stephen, 'The Historical Composition of Place: Byron and Scott', *The Clothing of Clio: A Study of the Representation of History in Nineteenth Century Britain and France*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1984. 93-111.

Bauer Dale M. and Susan Jaret McKinstry, eds., *Feminism, Bakhtin and the Dialogic*. SUNY Series in Feminist Criticism and Theory. ed. by Michelle A. Massé. Albany: SUNY Press, 1991.

Bauman, Richard, *Story Performance and Event: Contextual Studies of Oral Narratives*. Cambridge Studies in Oral and Literate Culture 10. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1986.

Beasley, Jerry C., 'Life's Episodes: Story and Its Form in the Eighteenth Century', in Robert W. Uphaus, (ed.), *The Idea of the Novel in the Eighteenth Century*. East Lansing, MI: Colleagues Press, 1988, 21-45.

Bennett, Margaret, 'Balquhidder Revisited: Fairylore in the Scottish Highlands, 1690-1990', in Peter Narvaez, (ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991, 94-115.

---, *Scottish Customs From the Cradle to the Grave*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992.

Bongie, Laurence L., 'The Eighteenth Century Marian Controversy and an Unpublished Letter of David Hume', *Studies in Scottish Literature*. 1 (1963-4): 236-52.

Bowers, Bege K. and Barbara Brothers, eds., *Reading and Writing Women's Lives: A Study of the Novel of Manners*. Ann Arbor, MI and London: UMI Research Press, 1990.

Bright, William, 'Poetic Structure in Oral Narrative', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 171-84.

Brown, Mary Ellen, *Burns and Tradition*. London: Macmillan, 1984.

---, '"That Bards are Second-Sighted is nae Joke": The Orality of Burns's World and Work',*Studies in Scottish Literature*. 16 (1981): 208-16.

Brown, Mary Ellen and Sheila Douglas, 'Some Approaches to Scottish Ballad Study', *Lore and Language*. 3.4-5 (1981): 101-7.

Bruford, Alan, 'Trolls, Hillfolk, Finns and Picts: The Identity of the Good Neighbors in Orkney and Shetland', in Peter Narvaez, (ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991, 116-41.

Buchan, David, *The Ballad and the Folk*. London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972.

---, 'Ballads of Otherworld Beings', in Peter Narvaez, (ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991, 142-54.

---, ed., *Scottish Tradition: A Collection of Scottish Folk Literature*. London:

Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984.

---, 'Talerole Analysis and Child's Supernatural Ballads', in Joseph Harris, (ed.) *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Harvard English Studies 17. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 60-77.

Buckroyd, Julia, *The Life of James Sharp Archbishop of St. Andrews 1618-1679 A Political Biography*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1987.

Burns, John, 'Myths and Marvels', in Gavin Wallace and Randall Stevenson, (eds.) *The Scottish Novel Since the Seventies: New Visions, Old Dreams*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1993, 71-81.

Bushnell, Nelson S., *William Hamilton of Bangour: Poet and Jacobite*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1957.

Calder, Angus., 'The Enlightenment', in Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley, (eds.), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992, 31-50.

Cannadine, David and Simon Price, eds., *Rituals of Royalty: Power and Ceremonial in Traditional Societies*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge UP, 1987.

Carter, Ian, 'Marriage Patterns and Social Sectors in Scotland Before the Eighteenth Century', *Scottish Studies*. 17.1 (1973): 51-60.

Carter, Jennifer and Joan H. Pittock, eds., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1987.

Castle, Terry, *Masquerade and Civilization: The Carnivalesque in Eighteenth-Century English Culture and Fiction*. London: Methuen, 1986.

Chafe, Wallace L., 'Integration and Involvement In Speaking, Writing, and Oral Literature', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 35-54.

Chapman, Malcolm, *The Gaelic Vision in Scottish Culture*. London: Croom Helm; Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 1978.

Child, Francis James, ed., *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, 5 vols, New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 1882-88; repr. New York: Dover Publications, 1965.

Clark, Alice, *Working Life of Women in the Seventeenth Century*. London: Routledge & Sons, 1919. London & New York: Routledge 1992.

Coates, Paul, *The Realist Fantasy: Fiction and Reality Since Clarissa*. London: Macmillan, 1983.

Craik, Elizabeth M., ed., *Marriage and Property*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1984.

Crawford, Robert, *Devolving English Literature*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992.

Crawford, Thomas, ed., *Love, Labour and Liberty: the eighteenth century Scottish Lyric*. Cheadle: Carcanet Press, 1976.

---, *Society and the Lyric: a study of the Song Culture of eighteenth-century Scotland*.

Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1979.

Crosby, Christina, *The Ends of History: Victorians and "The Woman Question"*. London: Routledge, 1991.

Cruickshanks, Eveline, ed., *Ideology and Conspiracy: Aspects of Jacobitism 1689-1759*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1982.

Daiches, David, *Literature and Gentility in Scotland: The Alexander Lectures at the University of Toronto, 1980*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1982.

Davidoff, Lenore, and Catherine Hall, *Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class, 1780-1850*. London: Hutchinson, 1987.

Devine, T. M. and Rosalind Mitchison, eds., *People and Society in Scotland Vol. 1, 1760-1830*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1988.

Donaldson, William, 'Bonny Highland Laddie: the Making of a Myth', *Scottish Literary Journal*. 3.2 (1976): 30-50.

---,*The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988.

Donnachie, Ian and Christopher Whatley, eds., *The Manufacture of Scottish History*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992.

Dugaw, Dianne, *Warrior Women and Popular Balladry 1650-1850*. Cambridge Studies in 18th Century Literature and Thought 4. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989.

Dussinger, John A. '"The Language of Real Feeling": Internal Speech in the Jane Austen Novel', in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Khan, (eds.), *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 97-115.

Eagleton, Mary, ed., *Feminist Literary Criticism.* London: Longman, 1991.

Eagleton, Terry, *Literary Theory: An Introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1983.

Eberly, Susan Schoon, 'Fairies and the Folklore of Disability: Changelings, Hybrids, and the Solitary Fairy', in Peter Narvaez, (ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991, 227-50.

Elam, Diane, *Romancing the Postmodern*. London and New York: Routledge, 1992.

Fenton, Alexander, 'The People Below: Dougal Graham's Chapbooks as a Mirror of the Lower Classes in Eighteenth Century Scotland', in Alisoun Gardner-Medwin, *A Day Estivall: Essays on the Music, Poetry, and History of Scotland and England and Poems Previously Unpublished. In Honour of Helena Mennie Shire*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1990, 69-80.

Ferguson, Adam, *An Essay on the History of Civil Society - 1767*. ed. by Duncan Forbes, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1966.

Ferguson, William, *Scotland: 1689 to the Present*. The Edinburgh History of Scotland Volume 4. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1968; repr. Edinburgh:

Mercat Press, 1990.

Fielding, Penny, *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth Century Scottish Fiction*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996.

Finnegan, Ruth, *Oral Poetry: its Nature, Significance and Social Context*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge UP, 1977; repr. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1992.

Foley, John Miles, ed., *Oral Tradition in Literature: Interpretation in Context*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986.

Ford, Boris, ed., *The Romantic Age in Britain*. The Cambridge Cultural History Volume 6. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992.

Forster, E. M., *Aspects of the Novel*. London: Edward Arnold, 1927; repr. Aylesbury: Pelican-Penguin, 1971.

Forte, A.D.M., 'Some Aspects of the Law of Marriage in Scotland: 1500-1700', in Elizabeth M. Craik, (ed.), *Marriage and Property*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 104-18.

Freedman, Jean R., 'With Child: Illegitimate Pregnancy in Scottish Traditional Ballads', *Folklore Forum*. 24.1 (1991) 3-18.

Fritz, Paul and Richard Morton, eds. *Woman in the Eighteenth Century and Other Essays*. Toronto and Sarasota: Hakkert & Co., 1976.

Frye, Northrop, *The Secular Scripture: A Study of the Structure of Romance* Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1976.

Furman, Nelly, 'The Politics of Language: Beyond the Gender Principle?' in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Kahn, (eds.), *Making A Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 59-79.

Gardner-Medwin, Alisoun, 'A Ballad of the Battle of Otterburn: Scottish Folksong', in Alisoun Gardner-Medwin, (ed.), *A Day Estivall: Essays on the Music, Poetry, and History of Scotland and England and Poems Previously Unpublished. In Honour of Helena Mennie Shire*. Aberdeen, Aberdeen UP, 1990, 81-95.

--- ed., *A Day Estivall: Essays on the Music, Poetry, and History of Scotland and England and Poems Previously Unpublished. In Honour of Helena Mennie-Shire*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1990.

Gibbon, Edward, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*. ed. by J.B. Bury, Vol. 6, London: Methuen, 1902.

Gifford, Douglas, Introduction. *Neil M. Gunn & Lewis Grassic Gibbon*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1983, 1-11.

Gilbert, Sandra M. and Susan Gubar, *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth Century Literary Imagination*. New Haven, CT: Yale UP, 1979.

Gisborne, Thomas, M.A., *An Enquiry into the Duties of the Female Sex*. London: Cadell & Davies, 1797.

Graham, Henry Grey, *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*. London: A. & C. Black, 1928.

Greene, Gayle and Coppélia Kahn, 'Feminist Scholarship and the Social Construction of Woman', in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Kahn, (eds.), *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 1-36.

---, eds., *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London and New York: Methuen, 1985.

Hackett, Helen, *Virgin Mother, Maiden Queen: Elizabeth I and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*. London: Macmillan, 1995.

Hamilton, Elizabeth, *Letters Addressed to the Daughter of a Nobleman on the Formation of Religious and Moral Principle*. 2nd edn, 2 vols, London: Cadell & Davies, 1806.

Hamilton, Paul, *Historicism*. London and New York: Routledge, 1996.

Hardwick, Elizabeth, *Seduction and Betrayal*. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1974.

Harker, Dave, *Fakesong: The Manufacture of British "Folksong" 1700 to the Present Day*. Milton Keynes & Philadelphia, PA: Open University Press, 1985.

Harris, Joseph, (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Harvard English Studies 17. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991.

Heath, Shirley Brice, 'Protean Shapes in Literacy Events: Ever Shifting Oral and Literate Traditions', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 91-118.

Hendry, Joy, 'Snug in the Asylum of Taciturnity: Women's History in Scotland', in Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley (eds.), *The Manufacture of Scottish History*. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992, 125-42.

Hildyard, Angela and David R. Olson, 'On the Comprehension and Memory of Oral vs. Written Discourse', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Discourse: Exploring Orality and Literacy*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 19-34.

Hill, Bridget, ed., *Eighteenth Century Women: An Anthology*. London: Allen & Unwin, 1984.

---, *Women, Work, and Sexual Politics in Eighteenth Century England*. Oxford & New York: Blackwell, 1989.

Hobsbawm, E.J., *Bandits*. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1969.

Hobsbawm, Eric J. and Terence Ranger, *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983.

Hochman, Baruch, *Character in Literature*. Ithaca and London: Cornell UP, 1985.

Houston, R.A. and I.D. Whyte, eds., *Scottish Society, 1500-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989.

Houston, R.A., *Social Change in the Age of Enlightenment: Edinburgh: 1660-1760.* Oxford: Clarendon, 1994.

---, *Scottish Literacy and the Scottish Identity: Illiteracy and Scotiey in Scotland and Northern England, 1600-1800.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985.

---, 'Women in the Economy and Society of Scotland, 1500-1800', in R.A. Houston and I.D. Whyte, (eds.), *Scottish Society 1500-1800.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989, 118-47.

Howard, Isabella, Dowager Duchess of Carlisle, *Thoughts in the form of Maxims: Addressed to Young Ladies, on their First Establishment in the world.* 2nd edn, London: T. Cornell, 1790.

Hume, David, *History of England by Hume and Smollett: with a Continuation by The Rev. T. S. Hughes, B.D..* vol 5. London: A.J. Valpy, M.A., 1964.

Insh, George Pratt, *The Scottish Jacobite Movement. A Study in Economic and Social Forces.* Edinburgh: The Moray Press, 1952.

Jones, Charles, *A Language Suppressed: The Pronounciation of the Scots language in the 18th Century.* Edinburgh: John Donald, 1995.

Kaplan, Cora. 'Pandora's Box: Subjectivity, Class and Sexuality in Socialist Feminist Criticism', in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Kahn, (eds.), *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism.* London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 146-76.

Kaplan, Sydney Janet. 'Varieties of Feminist Criticism', in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Kahn, (eds.), *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism.* London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 37-58.

Kelly, Gary, *Women, Writing, and Revolution 1790-1827.* Oxford: Clarendon, 1993.

Kelsall, Helen and Keith Kelsall, *Scottish Lifestyle 300 Years Ago.* rev. edn, Aberdeen: Scottish Cultural Press, 1993.

Kidd, Colin, *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish whig historians and the creation of an Anglo-British identity, 1689-c1830.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993.

Kirkham, Margaret, *Jane Austen, Feminism and Fiction.* Brighton: The Harvester Press, 1983.

Klancher, Jon P., *The Making of the English Reading Audiences, 1790-1832.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987.

Lakoff, Robin Tolmach, 'Some of My Favorite Writers are Literate: The Mingling of Oral and Literate Strategies in Written Communication', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 239-60.

Landry, Donna, *The Muses of Resistance: Laboring-Class Women's Poetry in Britain, 1739-1796.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990.

Larner, Christina, *Enemies of God: The Witch-hunt in Scotland.* London: Chatto & Windus, 1981.

Lenman, Bruce, *Integration and Enlightenment*. Edward Arnold, 1981; repr. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1992.

Leneman, Leah, 'New Role for a Lost Cause: Lowland Romanticisation of the Jacobite Highlands', in Leah Leneman, (ed.), *Perspectives in Scottish Social History: Essays in Honour of Rosalind Mitchison*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988, 107-24.

---ed., *Perspectives in Scottish Social History: Essays in Honour of Rosalind Mitchison*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988.

Levine, George, *The Realistic Imagination: English Fiction From Frankenstein to Lady Chatterley*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1981.

Lukács, Georg, *The Historical Novel*. trans. by Hannah and Stanley Mitchell, Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 1963; repr. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983.

---, *Studies in European Realism: A Sociological Survey of the Writings of Balzac, Stendhal, Sola, Tolstoy, Gorki, and others*. trans. by Edight Bone, London: Hillway, 1950.

Lyle, Emily, 'Parity of Ignorance: Child's Judgment on "Sir Colin" and the Scottish Verdict "Not Proven"', in Joseph Harris, (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 109-15.

Lynch, Michael, ed., Introduction, *Mary Stewart Queen in Three Kingdoms*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1988, 1-29.

McCarthy, William B., 'The Americanization of Scottish Ballads: Counterevidence from the Southwest of Scotland', in Joseph Harris, (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 97-108.

---, *The Ballad Matrix: Personality, Milieu, and the Oral Tradition*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP, 1990.

MacLaren, A. Allan, ed., *Social Class in Scotland Past and Present*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1976.

McLynn, Frank, *Charles Edward Stuart A Tragedy in Many Acts*. London: Routledge, 1988.

---, *Crime and Punishment in Eighteenth-Century England*. London and New York: Routledge, 1989.

Manning, Susan, *The Puritan-Provincial Vision: Scottish and American Literature in the Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990.

Marshall, Rosalind, *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080-1980*. London: Collins Sons, 1983.

Martin, Wallace, *Recent Theorie of Narrative*. Ithaca, NY and London: Cornell UP, 1986.

Mellor, Anne K., *Romanticism & Gender*. New York and London: Routledge, Chapman and Hall, 1993.

---, 'Why Women Didn't Like Romanticism: The Views of Jane Austen and Mary Shelley', in Gene W. Ruoff, (ed.), *The Romantics and Us: Essays on Literature and Culture*. New Brunswick, NJ and London: Rutgers UP, 1990, 274-87.

Mills, Charles, *The History of Chivalry or knighthood and its times*, 2 vols, London: Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1825.

Minogue, Sally, (ed.), *Problems for Feminist Criticism*. London: Routledge, 1990.

Mitchison, Rosalind and Leah Lenemán, *Sexuality and Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780*. London and New York: Blackwell, 1989.

Moi, Toril, *Sexual/Textual Politics: Feminist Literary Theory*. London: Methuen, 1985.

Monod, Paul Kléber, *Jacobitism and the English People 1688-1788*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1989.

Munich, Adrienne, 'Notorious Signs, Feminist Criticism, and Literary Tradition', in Gayle Greene and Coppélia Kahn, (eds.), *Making A Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London and New York: Methuen, 1985, 238-59.

Munro, Joyce Underwood, 'The Invisible Made Visible: The Fairy Changeling as a Folk Articulation of Failure to Thrive in Infants and Children', in Peter Narvaez (ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991, 251-83.

Myers, Mitzi, 'The Dilemmas of Gender as Double-Voiced Narrative; Or, Maria Edgeworth Mothers the *Bildungsroman*', in Robert W. Uphaus, (ed.), *The Idea of The Novel in The Eighteenth Century*. East Lansing, MI: Colleagues Press, 1988, 67-96.

Narvaez, Peter, ed., *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland, 1991.

The New Female Instructor or Young Woman's Guide to Domestic Happiness. 1834. London: Rosters, 1988.

Newton, Judith Lowder, *Women, Power and Subversion: Social Strategies in British Fiction*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1981.

Nicolaisen, W.F.H., 'Names as Intertextual Devices', *Onomastica Canadiana*. 68.2 (1986): 58-66.

---, 'Names and Narratives', *Journal of American Folklore*. 97 (1984): 259-72.

---, 'Personal Names in Traditional Ballads: A Proposal for a Ballad Onomasticon', *Journal of American Folklore*. 94 (1981): 229-32.

Novak, Maximilian E., ed., *English Literature in the Age of Disguise*. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1977.

ÓDanachair, Caoímhin, 'Oral Tradition and the Printed Word', *Irish University Review*. 9 (1979): 31-41.

Ong, Walter J., S.J., 'Oral Residue in Tudor Prose Style', *PMLA*. 80 (1965): 145-54.

Parkinson, G. H. R., ed.; *Georg Lukács: The Man, His Work, and His Ideas.* London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970.

Pascal, Roy, 'Georg Lukács: the Concept of Totality', in G. H. R. Parkinson, (ed.), *Georg Lukács: The Man, His Work, and His Ideas*, London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970, 147-171.

Petrie, Sir Charles, *The Jacobite Movement The Last Phase 1716-1807.* London: Eyre & Spottiswoode, 1950.

Pittock, Murray G. H., *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present.* New York and London: Routledge, 1991.

---, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland.* Cambridge Studies in Eighteenth-Century English Literature and Thought 23, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994.

Plant, Marjorie, *The Domestic Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1952.

Polanyi, Livia, 'Literary Complexity in Everyday Storytelling', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 155-70.

Porter, James, ed., *The Ballad Image: Essays Presented to Bertrand Harris Bronson.* Center for the Study of Comparative Folklore & Mythology. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1983.

Preston, Cathy Lynn, '"The Tying of the Garter": Representations of the Female Rural Laborer in 17th-, 18th-, and 19th-Century English Bawdy Songs', *Journal of American Folklore.* 105.417 (1992): 315-41.

Rader, Margaret, 'Context in Written Language: The Case of Imaginative Fiction', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 185-98.

Reed, Toni, *Demon Lovers and Their Victims In British Fiction.* Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky, 1988.

Renwick, Roger deV., *English Folk Poetry: Structure and Meaning.* London: Batsford Academic and Educational, 1980.

Rieuwerts, Sigrid, 'The Historical Moorings of "The Gypsy Laddie": Johnny Faa and Lady Cassillis', in Joseph Harris, (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 78-96.

Robertson, William, D.D., *The History of Scotland During the Reigns of Queen Mary and of King James IV. till His Accession to the Crown of England. With a Review of the Scottish History previous to that Period; And an Appendix containing Original Papers.* Vol II. London: Strahan and Preston, 1806.

Rogers, Katharine M., *Feminism in Eighteenth-Century England.* Brighton: The Harvester Press, 1982.

Rosa, Matthew Whiting, *The Silver Fork School: Novels of Fashion Preceding* Vanity Fair. New York: Columbia UP, 1936.

Rosaldo, Michelle Zimbalist and Louise Lamphere, eds., *Woman, Culture and Society*. Stanford, CA: Stanford UP, 1974.

Rosso, G. A. and Daniel P. Watkins, eds., *Spirits of Fire: English Romantic Writers and Contemporary Historical Methods*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1990.

Ruoff, Gene W., ed., *The Romantics and Us: Essays on Literature and Culture*. New Brunswick, NJ and London: Rutgers UP, 1990.

Sabiston, Elizabeth Jean, *The Prison of Womanhood: Four Provincial Heroines in Nineteenth-Century Fiction*. London: Macmillan, 1987.

Sanderson, Elizabeth C., *Women and Work in Eighteenth-Century Edinburgh*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1996.

Shepard, Leslie, *The Broadside Ballad: A Study in Origins and Meaning*. London: Herbert Jenkins, 1962.

---, *The History of Street Literature*. Newton Abbot: David & Charles, 1973.

Shields, Hugh ed., *Ballad Research: The Stranger in Ballad Narrative and Other Topics: Proceedings of the Fifteenth International Conference of the Kommission für Volksdichtung of the Société Internationale d'Ethnolgie et de Folklore*. Dublin: Folk Music Society of Ireland/Cumann Cheol Tíre Eireann, 1986.

---, 'Popular Modes of Narration and the Popular Ballad', in Joseph Harris, (ed.), *The Ballad and Oral Literature*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991, 40-59.

Showalter, Elaine, *The Female Malady: Women, Madness, and English Culture, 1830-1980*. London: Virago, 1987.

---, ed., *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women, Literature, and Theory*. London: Virago, 1986.

Simpson, Kenneth, *The Protean Scot: The Crisis of Identity in Eighteenth Century Scottish Literature*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988.

Smith, Grahame, *The Novel and Society: Defoe to George Eliot*. London: Batsford Academic and Educational, 1984.

Smout, T. C., 'Aspects of Sexual Behaviour in Nineteenth Century Scotland', in A. Allan MacLaren, (ed.), *Social Class in Scotland: Past and Present*. Edinburgh: John Donald, n.d., 55-85.

Smout, T. C., and Sydney Wood, *Scottish Voices 1745-1960*. London: Collins Sons, 1990.

Sollors, Werner, *The Invention of Ethnicity*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP, 1989.

Spencer, Jane, *The Rise of the Woman Novelist: from Aphra Behn to Jane Austen*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1986.

Stafford, Fiona J., *The Sublime Savage: A Study of James Macpherson and The Poems of Ossian*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1988.

Stone, Lawrence, *The Family, Sex and Marriage in England 1500-1800.* abridged ed. New York: Colophon-Harper & Row, 1977; repr. 1979.

Storch, Robert D. ed., *Popular Culture and Custom in Nineteenth Century England.* London: Croom Helm; New York: St. Martin's Press, 1983.

Syndergaard, Larry, 'Realizations of the Feminine Self in Three Traditional Ballads from Scotland and Denmark', *The Michigan Academician.* 20.1 (1988): 85-100.

Tannen, Deborah, 'The Oral/Literate Continuum in Discourse', in Deborah Tannen, (ed.), *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982, 1-16.

--- ed., *Spoken and Written Language: Exploring Orality and Literacy.* Advances in Discourse Processes 9. gen. ed. Roy A. Freedle, Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1982.

---, *You Just Don't Understand: Women and Men in Conversation.* London: Virago, 1992.

Taylor, Eliza (Mrs.), *Practical Hints to young Females, on the Duties of a Wife, a Mother, and Mistress of a Family.* London: Taylor & Hessey, 1818.

Taylor, Gordon Rattray, *The Angel Makers: A Study in the Psychological Origins of Historical Change 1750-1830.* London: Heinemann, 1958.

Todd, Janet, *Feminist Literary History A Defence.* Cambridge: Polity, 1988.

Trevor-Roper, Hugh, 'The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland' in Eric J. Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983, 15-41.

Trudgill, Eric, *Madonnas and Magdalens: The Origins and Development of Victorian Sexual Attitudes.* London: Heinemann, 1976.

Uphaus, Robert W., ed., *The Ideal of the Novel in the Eighteenth Century.* East Lansing, MI: Colleauges Press, 1988.

Vincent, David, 'The Decline of the Oral Tradition in Popular Culture', in Robert D. Storch, (ed.), *Popular Culture and Custom in Nineteenth Century England .* London: Croom Helm; New York: St. Martin's, 1983, 20-47.

Wallace, Gavin and Randall Stevenson, (eds.), *The Scottish Novel Since the Seventies: New Visions Old Dreams.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1993.

Watt, Ian, *The Rise of the Novel: Studies in Defoe, Richardson, and Fielding.* London: Chatto & Windus, 1957.

Weisenheimer, Joel, 'Fiction and the Force of Example', in Robert W. Uphaus, (ed.), *The Idea of the Novel in the Eighteenth Century.* East Lansing, MI: Colleagues Press, 1988, 1-19.

Whyte, Ian D. and Kathleen A. Whyte, 'The Geographical Mobility of Women in Early Modern Scotland', in Leah Leneman, (ed.), *Perspectives in Scottish Social History: Essays in Honour of Rosalind Mitchison.* Aberdeen: Aberdeen UP, 1988, 83-106.

Williams, Merryn, *Women in the English Novel: 1800-1900*. London: Macmillan, 1984.

Wimberley, Lowry C., *Folklore in The English and Scottish Ballads*. New York: Ungar, 1929; repr. 1959.

Womack, Peter, *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1989.

The Young Lady's Parental Monitor: Containing I. Dr. Gregory's "Father's Legacy to His Daughters" II. Lady Pennington's "Unfortunate Mother's Advice to her Absent Daughters" III. Marchioness de Lambert's "Advice of a Mother to her Daughter". London: Joseph Wenman, 1790.